Claremont School of Theology

A Practical Theology of Christian Spiritual Formation: A Course for Evangelical Chinese American Seminaries

A Dissertation Submitted to
the Faculty of Education and Formation
in Candidacy for the Degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in Practical Theology

by

Dora Lau Wang

Claremont, California
May 2019

Copyright@2019 by Dora Lau Wang

All rights reserved

To Jesus Christ—Lover of my soul

In loving memory of my beloved husband

John Ling-Fai Wang (1942–2016)

A precious gift from God

To have and to hold

In sickness and in health

For the most memorable forty-six years of my life

Contents

Acknowledgments		vi
Abstract		1
Chapter 1	**Introduction: The Need and Approach of the Dissertation**	**4**
	Identifying the Problem	5
	Hypothesis and Structure of the Dissertation	18
	Empirical Methods and Original Contribution to Knowledge	21
	Scope and Limitations	24
Chapter 2	**The Descriptive-Empirical Task: What Is Going On?**	**26**
	Introduction: The Lived Experience of Chinese Immigrants	26
	Challenges and Responses in the Family	28
	Challenges and Responses in the Workplace	43
	A Survey on the Spiritual Needs of Chinese Immigrants	52
	Conclusion: A Challenge to Authentic Faith	63
Chapter 3	**The Interpretive Task: Why Is This Going On?**	**65**
	Introduction: Causes of Chinese Immigrants' Response to Challenges	65
	Cultural Tradition and Values of Chinese Immigrants	66
	Assimilation Theories on Immigrants in the N. American Context	79
	Historical Spiritual Heritage of the Evangelical Chinese Church	92
	Conclusion: Implications of Ministry Gaps	115
Chapter 4	**The Normative Task: What Ought to be Going On?**	**117**
	Introduction: Biblical Foundation on Christian Spiritual Formation	117
	Spiritual Formation of God's People by Yahweh	119
	Spiritual Formation of the Disciples by Jesus Christ	144
	Spiritual Formation of Christians by the Holy Spirit	157
	Conclusion: Implications for Life Transformation	168

Chapter 5 The Pragmatic Task: How Might We Respond? 170

Introduction: Ignatian Spirituality 170

Major Characteristics of Ignatian Spirituality 176

Centrality of Scripture in Ignatian Spirituality 180

Relevance of the Jesuits' Mission to the Chinese People 187

The Road to Transformation 191

Conclusion: Why Practice Ignatian Spirituality 209

Chapter 6 A Field Test of the Dissertation 215

Introduction: A Seminary Course 215

The Course Syllabus 216

Classroom Instruction and Schedule 220

Silent Retreat and Schedule 233

Chapter 7 Results and Assessments 247

Introduction: Students, Course, and Assessment Criteria 247

Student Evaluation of Classroom Instructions 251

Student Evaluation of the Silent Retreat 253

The Researcher's Evaluation of Student Assignments 255

The Researcher's Assessment of the Course 260

Conclusion 263

Bibliography 269

Appendices 277

Acknowledgments

Taking up the pursuit of a PhD at retirement age has been the most challenging journey in my life academically, emotionally, and spiritually. I am most grateful to China Evangelical Seminary North America (CESNA) for supporting me throughout the process of this endeavor: President Dr. Katheryn Leung, who first invited me to teach spiritual formation courses years ago despite my inadequacies; Dr. Anita Meng Liu, the faculty person who invited me to serve on the spiritual formation curriculum committee; academic Dean Dr. Gee Lowe, who has given me the opportunity to teach spiritual formation courses in the last couple of years, and the permission to offer this course as a field test of my dissertation; and finally, the seminarians who enthusiastically participated in the course and gave me valuable feedback.

For the five years of my studies at Claremont, I am indebted to Professors Frank Rogers and Andrew Dreitcer for the excellent courses they taught me in spiritual formation, their academic guidance throughout the process of my labor for the qualifying exams and the dissertation, and their understanding and emotional support while I was going through the pain and loss of my beloved husband John Wang to brain cancer in 2016.

Last but not the least, my gratitude goes to my church family, especially Yan Zhang, Koral Lam, and Jane Lee for helping me in unique ways; and who along with my God-children Rene Chee, Kay Tong, Harry Chen, Heidi Xu, and Victor Wong, have given me prayer and emotional support during the four months of John's illness and in subsequent years of my academic pursuit amidst grieving, without which I could hardly have persevered to the end of this difficult journey!

A PRACTICAL THEOLOGY OF CHRISTIAN SPIRITUAL FORMATION:
A COURSE FOR EVANGELICAL CHINESE AMERICAN SEMINARIES

By Dora Wang

ABSTRACT

This dissertation explores the contemporary need for spiritual formation of first-generation Chinese American Christians. The concern arises from direct observation of such Christians, and from published research on the empirically validated phenomenon of "mass conversion" of North American Chinese immigrants to evangelical Christianity in the last three decades, and yet their "low retention" in our Chinese American churches, as verified by an empirical study that followed up on baptismal candidates in a Chinese American church in California. This suggests that while the *evangelistic* efforts of churches and college campus ministries are effective, their *spiritual formation ministries* are inadequate and urgently need to be strengthened.

The hypothesis of this dissertation is that a course on *A Practical Theology of Christian Spiritual Formation* that applies Richard Osmer's four-task approach to practical theology can motivate and equip evangelical Chinese American seminarians to develop more effective spiritual formation ministries by instructing them on Chinese American Christians' need for spiritual formation and, through a silent retreat, by briefly letting them experience spiritual formation for themselves.

In this setting, the first of Osmer's tasks that asks, "What is going on?" explores the lived experience of Chinese Americans and the literature on the topic, and surveys one hundred Chinese American Christians in seven evangelical Chinese American churches to confirm that there is inconsistency between their Christian faith and practice.

The second task of practical theology that attempts to answer the question "Why is this going on?" here explores major causes of such inconsistencies between avowed faith and actual practice, and attempts to discover such Christians' misinterpretation or superficial understanding of Confucian philosophy, their eager assimilation into the mainstream North American society to gain wealth and status though hindered by discriminations, and the inadequacy of the Chinese American Church's culture to remedy whatever has created the ministry gaps for effective nurturing of these Christians' new-found faith.

The third practical theological task that attempts to answer the question "What ought to be going on?" explores the biblical foundation on which the evangelical Chinese American Church professes her faith and develops her ministries. The study reveals that despite the failures of God's people to live up to their covenant obligations, God's covenant faithfulness prevails; by looking to Jesus (2 Cor 3:18; He 12:2) through the indwelling Holy Spirit, Christians are progressively transformed into Christ's image and live out the authentic Christian life.

The fourth task that attempts to answer the question "How might we respond?" explores how the understanding and practice of Ignatian spirituality with its focus on the meditation of Christ's life through Scripture and prayer might fill the ministry gaps of the evangelical Chinese American Church to nurture her people toward spiritual maturity.

Finally, an integration of Osmer's 4-task interdisciplinary approach to doing practical theology of spiritual formation culminated in the development and field-testing at an evangelical Chinese American Seminary of a seminary course based on the contents of this dissertation, which consists of classroom instruction followed by an Ignatian-style silent retreat.

The student evaluations and the researcher's evaluation of student achievement in course assignments affirm the stated hypothesis of this dissertation.

Chapter 1

Introduction: The Need for and Approach of the Dissertation

I am a Chinese American who immigrated from Hong Kong to the United States with my parents and siblings and started my first year of High School in Los Angeles. A few years after my graduation from college, I was called to vocational Christian ministry. After a few years of confirming the calling, and upon completion of my first seminary degree in Religious Education (MRE), in 1984 I began serving on the pastoral staff of my home church in Los Angeles. Between serving on the pastoral staff of two more evangelical Chinese American churches and receiving further seminary training in Biblical Studies (MAR), and in OT Genre and Religious Education (DMin), I served in pastoral ministry for a total of thirty years before my official retirement in 2014.

Since the 1990s, I have observed through my own and my pastoral associates' experiences that the membership makeup of Chinese American churches in North America has changed rather rapidly from being mostly immigrants from Taiwan and Hong Kong to being those mostly from Mainland China, until at the turn of the twenty-first century the latter became a majority. I have also noticed that while the number of baptismal candidates in these churches has greatly increased since then, their drop-out rate has also been high. Even for those who continue to stay in the local churches, their spiritual development has been very slow. However, as I tried to verify my observations in the literature, all I found is information on the so-called "mass conversion" of Mainland Chinese immigrants and scholars to Christianity in

North America, and some possible causes of the phenomenon, but those studies have not mentioned their retention rate in the local churches.

Identifying the Problem

Since the late twentieth century, scholars have noted the striking phenomenon of mass conversion of Mainland Chinese immigrants and scholars to evangelical Christianity in North America. In an article by Chinese American sociologist Professor Fenggang Yang and his colleague Joseph Tamney, "mass conversion" is described as "the phenomenon of religious conversion happening to many individuals in a society within a relatively short time."[1] Since this mass conversion of Chinese immigrants to Christianity has been so widely recognized, the causes of such a phenomenon have become the focus of research of Chinese immigrants in sociology.

Having served for the last thirteen years of my pastoral ministry among Mainland Chinese immigrants, especially working directly with the young adult fellowship in the last eight, I have witnessed the mass conversion of such Chinese immigrants on the one hand; but have also noticed their slow spiritual development and low retention rate in the local churches on the other. It seems clear that while evangelical Chinese churches and college campus ministries in North America have been doing well in their evangelistic outreach efforts, attracting Chinese immigrants and foreign students into the life of the Christian communities, their discipleship or spiritual formation ministries to help new converts to grow in faith and keep them actively involved in the local churches have been strikingly inadequate.

[1] Fenggang Yang and Joseph B. Tamney, "Exploring Mass Conversion to Christianity among the Chinese: An Introduction," *Sociology of Religion* 67, no. 2 (2006): 126.

A Literature Review on Mass Conversion

The seminal article that lays the foundation for future works on the mass conversion to Christianity of Chinese immigrants and scholars from Mainland China is "Chinese Conversion to Evangelical Christianity: The Importance of Social and Cultural Contexts," published in 1998 by Fenggang Yang,[2] Professor of Sociology and Director of the Center on Religion and Chinese Society at Purdue University.[3] To answer his own research question "Why do immigrants abandon their traditional religion and convert to Protestant Christianity?" Yang proposes three factors, which he orders in a way that reflects his sense of their significance: first, "social and cultural changes in China in the process of coerced modernization"; second, "identity reconstruction…in a pluralist modern society"; and third, "institutional factors" of Chinese American churches that reach out to them.[4] Yang describes "coerced modernization," the foremost factor accounting for the mass conversion, as "a process of turbulence and suffering, full of wars, political turmoil, and cultural interruptions and destruction," during which "Western liberalism, social Darwinism, Marxism-Leninism," etc. were adopted as social experiments.[5] A significant result of this coerced modernization is "chain migration"—people wandering from Mainland China to Taiwan or Hong Kong, then to the United States as refugees, students, or immigrants.[6] The great hardships of such chain migration led to the flash point of the 1989 Tiananmen Square tragedy, when the democratic student movement in Beijing was

[2] Fenggang Yang, "Chinese Conversion to Evangelical Christianity: The Importance of Social and Cultural Contexts," *Sociology of Religion* 59, no. 3 (1998): 237-257.

[3] "Faculty Directory: Fenggang Yang," Purdue University, accessed 10/14/2016, https://www.cla.purdue.edu/sociology/directory/.

[4] Yang, "Chinese Conversion," 237.

[5] Ibid., 248.

[6] Ibid., 248–249.

crushed by the Chinese government, prompting Chinese immigrants and political dissidents to seek permanence or eternity as promised by Christianity.[7]

Yang's research methodologies consist of an in-depth ethnography over a two-year period of the Chinese Christian Church of Greater Washington, D.C., visits of all 20 Chinese churches in the region, personal attendance at Sunday services, life-history interviews of pastors and lay leaders, a collection of over a hundred personal testimonies, and reading of Chinese Christian magazines.[8] Scholars like Yang have been so overwhelmed by the mass conversion phenomenon of Chinese immigrants that the problem of low retention rates has escaped their attention.

Particularly notable in Fenggang Yang's seminal work are his academic, cultural, religious, and personal background, and the passion with which he writes about the mass conversion of Chinese immigrants in the United States. Born and raised in Mainland China, Yang came to the United States in January 1989 as a visiting scholar to gather materials for teaching Christianity at the People's University of China in Beijing.[9] Then the Tiananmen Massacre broke out on June 4, 1989, which became "the last stroke in smashing Communist idealism or disillusion among Chinese intellectuals," and changed the course of Yang's life journey.[10] Instead of returning to teaching in China at the end of the year as originally planned, he registered as a graduate student in sociology in the Fall of 1989, became a Christian, and was baptized into the fellowship of the Chinese Christian Church of Greater Washington, D.C. in

[7] Yang, "Chinese Conversion," 249-250.

[8] Ibid., 239.

[9] Fenggang Yang, *Chinese Christians in America: Conversion, Assimilation, and Adhesive Identities* (University Park, PA: the Pennsylvania State University Press, 1999), 1.

[10] Ibid., 205.

1992, stayed in the US under the Chinese Student Protection Act initiated in the same year, and continues his academic studies and professional life in the US to this day.[11]

The publication of Yang's seminal article was followed by his first book, *Chinese Christians in America: Conversion, Assimilation, and Adhesive Identities*,[12] published in the following year (1999) which, among other issues, includes additional insights on the cause of the mass conversion of Chinese immigrants, such as Christianity's compatibility with Confucianism, as they both regard love and filial piety (*ren* 仁 and *xiao* 孝 in Confucianism) as essential virtues.[13] Yet he concludes that Christianity provides an additional incentive to Chinese immigrants, because biblical faith lays the foundation for the moral principles of Confucianism, for only when one has received the love of God can one truly love others.[14] Again, his book makes no mention of the slow spiritual growth of Christians or that they are leaving his church or other churches in the Greater Washington D.C. region at this time.

A couple of years later in 2001, two articles published by Yang and Helen Rose Ebaugh, "Transformations in New Immigrant Religions and Their Global Implications"[15] and "Religion and Ethnicity Among New Immigrants: The Impact of Majority/Minority Status in Home and Host Countries,"[16] once again do not mention this change in religious zeal. One of the three changes in new immigrant religions addressed in the former article is evangelicalism being

[11] Yang, *Chinese Christians in America*, 205.
[12] Ibid.
[13] Ibid., 148–149.
[14] Ibid., 153.
[15] Fenggang Yang and Helen Rose Ebaugh, "Transformations in New Immigrant Religions and their Global Implications," *American Sociological Review* 66, no. 2 (Apr 2001), 269–288.
[16] Fenggang Yang and Helen Rose Ebaugh, "Religion and Ethnicity Among New Immigrants: The Impact of Majority/Minority Status in Home and Host Countries," *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* 40, no. 3 (2001), 367–378.

more attractive than liberal theology to immigrants due to their need for certainty, eternity, and absoluteness given that they live in an uncertain, changing, and pluralistic modern society.[17] Among other causes, the latter article alludes to the Sinicizing of Christianity by the church introducing Chinese language school for children, Chinese food, Chinese festivals, etc. as strategic means to get Chinese immigrants into the church.[18] Again, both articles overwhelmingly describe Chinese immigrants being attracted to Christianity to the neglect of the slow spiritual growth or abandonment of faith among many converts.

However, in the same year (2001), about a decade after the beginning of the mass conversion of Chinese immigrants and scholars in North America, Edwin Su published a book in Chinese [Overseas Mainland Chinese Ministry] that did point out the problem of slow spiritual growth and low retention of scholars from Mainland China post-conversion.[19] Su, founder of the *Overseas Campus Magazine*, an evangelistic Chinese publication focused on overseas mainland Chinese scholars, laments that while Chinese scholars coming to faith and college campus fellowships established for them have obviously increased in number since the 1990s, many believers (including those baptized) abandon their faith once they move away from their churches or campus fellowships; and that even if they stay, their knowledge of the truth and their transformation in values and perspectives in life remain limited.[20]

Seemingly unaware of their slow spiritual growth and low retention rate, but influenced by Yang's publications, other social scientists in the first decade of the twenty-first century

[17] Yang and Ebaugh, "Transformations," 281.
[18] Yang and Ebaugh, "Religion and Ethnicity," 373.
[19] Edwin Su 蘇文峰, Haiwai Zhongguo Xueren Shigong *海外中國學人事工* [Overseas Mainland Chinese Ministry] (Lomita, CA: Overseas Campus Magazine, 2001), 41.
[20] Ibid.

continued to explore the causes of Chinese immigrants' conversion to Christianity in North America. For example, Nanlai Cao's article, "The Church as a Surrogate Family for Working Class Immigrant Chinese Youth: An Ethnography of Segmented Assimilation," attributes the cause of mass conversion to the "emotionally open culture of the church" that provides a supportive context for the working-class immigrant Chinese youth as they adapt to the challenging new environment.[21] Yuting Wang's article, "More Than Evangelical and Ethnic: The Ecological Factor in Chinese Conversion to Christianity in the United States," attributes conversions and church affiliations of students and scholars from Mainland China to the local contexts, as evidenced by the various kinds of churches they attend, that are not limited to evangelical ones but include, for example, Jehovah's Witness, Catholic, Presbyterian, and Baptist churches usually depending on the church or denomination to which their friends or professors belong.[22] As before, there is no mention in either one of the articles about the length of time those converts continue to stay in the local churches, since the articles' main focus is conversion, not retention.

In an article published in 2006 by Yang and his colleague Tamney, "Exploring Mass Conversion to Christianity Among the Chinese: An Introduction," the authors make reference to a collection of three other articles in the same issue of the journal relevant to the conversion to Christianity among different segments of the Chinese population in the United States, from Mainland Chinese foreign students to second generation Chinese American college students.[23]

[21] Nanlai Cao, "The Church as a Surrogate Family for Working Class Immigrant Chinese Youth: An Ethnography of Segmented Assimilation," *Sociology of Religion* 66, no. 2 (2005): 183.

[22] Yuting Wang, "More Than Evangelical and Ethnic: The Ecological Factor in Chinese Conversion to Christianity in the United States," *Sociology of Religion* 67, no. 2 (2006): 179, 188–189.

[23] Yang and Tamney, 126.

The paper by Brian Hall that focuses on Chinese American college students, attributes the cause of conversion both to various "openness factors," such as the collapse of traditional culture that makes it possible for barriers to be removed so foreign students may adopt Christianity in their pursuit of new meaning systems; and to "receptivity factors," such as Christians helping others to cope with problems of daily life without expecting rewards, and having in common the values of Confucius and conservative Christians.[24] The paper by Xuefeng Zhang attributes the conversion of the Chinese to the substantial resources Chinese and American Christians expended in their evangelistic outreach efforts.[25] Lastly, the paper by Yuting Wang and Fenggang Yang, in addition to noting the openness and receptivity factors, and the "coerced modernization" of China mentioned in Yang's seminal paper in 1998, also addresses the perception of the relatively recent economic policies of China as increasingly materialistic and selfish, which makes the Christian practice of rendering help without expecting a reward a symbol of a loving and kind community that is appealing to people coming from Chinese societies.[26] The focus of all these papers is again the causes of conversion; there is no mention of new Christians' continued growth in faith or their retention in the church community.

Since mass conversion of Chinese immigrants to Christianity was so phenomenal, research interests from the time of Yang's seminal work in 1998 until his latest work on the topic in 2006 have been so focused on the causes of the mass conversion phenomenon that none of Yang's, his colleagues', and other authors' papers published in English journals have mentioned anything about the slow spiritual growth or low retention of the converts. However,

[24] Yang and Tamney, 127–128.
[25] Ibid., 127–128.
[26] Ibid. 127.

it is not difficult to postulate possible reasons why many Chinese immigrants and scholars abandon their Christian faith. One has only to look at the reasons for their conversion. For example, if "openness factors" such as social and cultural changes in the process of coerced modernization are the most important cause for the mass conversion of the early generation that left China around the time of the 1989 Tiananmen Square tragedy, then years after they have settled down in North America, when the challenges of wars and suffering, chain-migration, and political turbulence have faded from their memories, there is not the same need to hold on to their Christian faith unless it has already taken root in their hearts. If "receptivity factors" such as rendering helps to newcomers from China are the primary reasons for the conversion of the younger generation of foreign students and immigrants, once they are settled and have little need for such help or have moved away from the churches and campuses where they were converted, they may abandon their Christian faith, unless it has already taken root in their hearts. Those who are attracted to the Christian faith due to its compatibility with Confucianism or to the Sinicizing of Christianity may easily become so-called "Cultural Christians" without deep faith—unless, again, faith has already taken root in their hearts. Therefore, it is important to disciple them at an early stage of their conversion, and to continue to do so until they become mature Christians.

Low Retention in the Evangelical Chinese American Church:

Research interest in the mass conversion of Chinese immigrants and scholars seems to have declined in the last decade, but research on the retention of Chinese converts in America has hardly begun among scholars in the field, although the problem has been noticed in the

Chinese Christian community for years, as brought up in Su's publication in 2001.[27] Given this lack of information, I conducted a ten-year study (from Christmas 2006 to Summer 2016) on the retention of Chinese immigrant baptismal candidates at a Mandarin-speaking congregation at an evangelical Chinese American church in Southern California of about 250 members. The church offers a twelve-session adult Sunday school Baptism class that all baptismal candidates must attend and at which they must give a public testimony of salvation before they are baptized. Baptisms are conducted three times a year (Easter, Summer, and Christmas), and classes are held for twelve weeks prior to the respective baptisms.

The ten-year baptismal candidate follow-up study was conducted in 2017, with the assistance of the current Baptism Class lead teacher and the Pastor, both of whom had been a part of the teaching team throughout the ten years. We went through the baptism records and identified where each one of the candidates is currently in terms of his or her church attendance, physical location, and other information as listed in Appendix A, and the results are tabulated below:

Table 1. Retention of Baptismal Candidates

Male: 73 Female: 115	Active / Inactive		Moved Away			Dropped / Deceased / Unknown		
			China / US / Other			out of faith		
Attending Church X	50	24				10	9	45
Not Attending Church X	23	3	13	34	3	3		21
Total: 188	73=39%	27=14%				13=7%	9=5%	66=35%

Source: Baptism records of Church X

The results show a total of 188 candidates—73 male and 115 female—who were baptized between Christmas 2006 and summer 2016, averaging 18-plus persons each year. Of

[27] Su, 41.

the 188, 50 (27 percent) of them have moved away, either to China, to Hong Kong or Taiwan, to other states in the US, or to other campuses of the same church. Of these 188, whether they attend Church X or not, only 73 (39 percent) are still actively attending any church, meaning regularly attending worship and usually also one other ministry such as Fellowship; 27 (14 percent) are inactive, meaning irregularly attending worship or one other ministry. Apart from these two categories, 13 (7 percent) are known to have dropped out of faith, 9 (5 percent) are deceased, and the status of 66 (35 percent) is unknown. Since the pastor involved in this Follow-up Study has kept close contact (at least for the first two years) even with people who have moved away, and they are usually happy to inform her if they are actively attending or serving in another church, "unknown" would probably mean no longer attending a church, have lost contact, or have dropped out of the life of faith. In other words, less than half of all these 188 once-baptized Christians are still actively attending or serving in any church. Since this church takes considerable care in preparing members for baptism and in caring for them after baptism, other Chinese American churches probably cannot or do not do much better. This suggests that pastors and leaders of the evangelical faith community must become better equipped to evaluate their current ministries and develop more relevant and effective discipleship or spiritual formation ministries that address the spiritual needs of Chinese immigrants and scholars after baptism, especially during the first few years when they are more motivated to learn and grow as Christians, and so are more likely to remain active in their faith and churches.

The Winter 2017 issue of the quarterly bilingual magazine *Ambassadors Communique*, published by the Ambassadors for Christ (AFC), a Chinese Christian organization that focuses on

reaching Chinese intellectuals for Christ, affirms the need to disciple graduates before they leave campus and launch into Chinese American churches, as it reports on its evangelism and discipleship efforts among Chinese students on college campuses over the years. A Symposium held in September 2017 at AFC's headquarters in Paradise, PA, attended by forty veteran campus workers from thirteen states and five missionary organizations (Overseas Campus, China Outreach Ministries, Christian Witness Center, Chicago Chinese Christian Missions, and Ambassadors for Christ) presents a brief survey of the campus-based Chinese Bible Study movement in America since the 1950s to the present, and discusses today's challenges and opportunities as well as future strategies of campus ministry. [28] One of the urgent needs identified by the Associate Director of Discipleship and Training Ministry of the AFC is to equip graduates as they become launched into the professional world and Chinese American churches, often in a totally new location, wherever their jobs take them, by offering programs such as one-day topical seminars, three-day/two-night retreats, short-term training groups, experience-based learning opportunities, online reading groups, and integrated biblical counseling and discipleship training.[29] However, most of such short-term training programs focus more on the head than on the heart, and the local Chinese American churches often lack resources such as young adult fellowship groups, pastors, and leaders to help their newly baptized members make a smooth transition from campus to church life so that they can continue to grow in their new-found faith.

[28] "A Brief Survey of Campus-based Chinese Bible Study Movement in America," *Ambassadors Communique* 52, no. 2 (Winter 2017), 5–7.

[29] Tsun-En Lu, "A Special Training for Young Graduates and Professionals," *Ambassadors Communique* 52, no. 2 (Winter, 2017), 17.

Current Spiritual Formation Focus in Chinese American Seminaries:

A strategic place to start equipping pastors and potential pastors to lead Chinese American congregations toward spiritual maturity is the evangelical Chinese American seminaries, where most of the seminarians are trained to serve Mandarin speaking congregations in the predominantly evangelical Chinese American churches. Currently, there are four ATS-accredited evangelical Chinese American seminaries in North America,[30] but their curriculum tends to focus on biblical and theological studies to the neglect of spiritual formation, although three of the four seminaries do offer spiritual formation courses that are required of their seminarians. Since their spiritual formation courses and the faculty members teaching them can also be accessed online, information on how their seminarians are equipped in spiritual formation can readily be gathered.

In one of the three seminaries, students in their various Master's degree programs are required to take the only two-unit course offered, entitled *Spiritual Formation/ Foundation of Christian Ministries*, which covers a wide range of topics, such as the Holy Spirit's role in spiritual formation, the biblical foundation of spiritual formation, knowing oneself, spiritual development, the pastor's character, servant leadership, spiritual disciplines in community, and prayer.[31] The professor who teaches this course is the Interim President of the Seminary. He received his PhD in Old Testament from an evangelical Christian university in North America,

[30] Logos Evangelical Seminary, China Evangelical Seminary North America, Christian Witness Theological Seminary, and International Theological Seminary.

[31] "CWTS Catalog," accessed 9/22/17, https://www.cwts.edu/intro-of-cwts/catalog/.

has two Chinese publications including a commentary on Isaiah, and a book on how current events relate to the Kingdom of Heaven.[32]

Another evangelical Chinese American seminary requires seminarians in its various Master and DMin programs to take a three-unit course in Spiritual Formation, which includes a one-unit practicum.[33] The seminary Chancellor teaching this course is a Professor of Practical Theology and occupies an Endowed Chair of Spiritual Formation. He received his PhD and DMiss from an evangelical seminary in North America. Two of his Chinese publications are on church growth, and one on healing ministry.[34]

The third evangelical Chinese American seminary offers five different three-unit courses in spiritual formation, of which students in the MDiv program are required to take three courses, and students in the various Master's degree programs are to take two; the titles of the five courses are: *Biblical Foundation of Spiritual Formation*, *Understanding Yourself and Wholistic Development*, *Lifelong Spiritual Formation of Spiritual Leaders*, *Christian Spiritual Heritage and Practice*, and *Spiritual Formation in Community*.[35] Unlike the other two seminaries, these courses are taught by a variety of professors who are interested in spiritual formation but have specialized in other fields, such as ethics, theology, Christian counseling,

[32] "Faculty Profile: Lu Shaochang," Logos Evangelical Seminary, accessed 9/22/17, https://www.cwts.edu/structure-and-personnel/faculty/#p2.

[33] "Logos Evangelical Seminary," accessed 9/22/17, https://www.les.edu/admission-zh/all-program-zh/.

[34] "Faculty Profile—Felix Liu," Logos Evangelical Seminary, accessed 9/22/17, https://www.les.edu/about-logos-en/faculty/.

[35] "CESNA MDiv Course Curriculum," China Evangelical Seminary North America, accessed 9/22/17, http://casite-766252.cloudaccess.net/zh/become-student/2017-05-23-21-07-17/m-div-ch.html; "CESNA MTS Course Curriculum," China Evangelical Seminary North America, accessed 9/22/17; http://casite-766252.cloudaccess.net/zh/become-student/2017-05-23-21-07-17/m-t-s-ch.html; "CESNA MCS Course Curriculum," China Evangelical Seminary North America, accessed 9/22/17, http://casite-766252.cloudaccess.net/zh/become-student/2017-05-23-21-07-17/m-c-s-ch.html.

Church history and theology—with the exception of one adjunct instructor who has been trained in Christian education and spiritual formation.

As evident from the above review of courses offered and professors teaching them in the three Chinese American seminaries, Christian spiritual formation is recognized as essential for the training of seminarians. However, perhaps due to the lack of professors trained in the field, courses offered are kept to the minimum, especially in the first two seminaries. Topics covered usually focus on biblical foundation and the pastor's character development, emphases typical of Chinese evangelical Christianity but limited in their capacity to lead people toward spiritual maturity. In addition, the theological and mental aspect of spiritual formation is often emphasized to the neglect of the experiential and emotional. Judging from the course titles, there also seems to be a lack of integration of the contextual, historical, biblical, and methodological perspectives in the spiritual formation courses the seminaries offer.

Hypothesis and Structure of the Dissertation

A seminary course on *A Practical Theology of Christian Spiritual Formation* that applies Richard Osmer's four-task approach to doing practical theology has the potential to motivate and equip evangelical Chinese American seminarians to develop more effective spiritual formation ministries by instructing them on Chinese American Christians' need for spiritual formation and, through a silent retreat, by briefly letting them experience spiritual formation for themselves.

This dissertation that intends to motivate and equip seminarians to develop and lead spiritual formation ministries in their current and future Chinese American churches follows the

same structure of Osmer's four-fold tasks by answering four questions:[36] What is going on (the descriptive-empirical task)? Why is this going on (the interpretive task)? What ought to be going on (the normative task)? How might we respond (the pragmatic task)?

Chapter 1 introduces and explains the focus of my dissertation by first describing the phenomenon of "mass conversion" of Chinese immigrants to Christianity in North America as validated by a literature review, and these immigrants' "low retention" in the evangelical Chinese American Church as validated by empirical research (Appendix A). Together, this leads me to identify the urgent need to strengthen the Church's spiritual formation ministries to ensure that the Church's qualitative spiritual growth matches her quantitative growth. After stating the hypothesis of how the design of a seminary course has the potential of motivating and equipping Chinese American seminarians to address that need, the chapter describes various empirical methods and their original contribution to knowledge. The chapter closes with a brief discussion of the scope and limitations of this dissertation.

Chapter 2 answers the question of the descriptive-empirical task by reviewing the literature on the lived experience of Chinese Americans in North America to understand some major challenges they are facing in the family and in the workplace, and their responses to those challenges. The results of my empirical research (Appendices B1, B2, and B3) highlights certain inconsistencies between the new-found faith and the day-to-day practice of Chinese American Christians; and is followed by a discussion on the challenge to authentic faith.

[36] Richard Robert Osmer, *Practical Theology: An Introduction* (Cambridge, UK: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing, 2008), 4.

Chapter 3 answers the question of the interpretive task by identifying and analyzing both the Chinese cultural values and assimilation theories that explain possible causes of first generation evangelical Chinese Christians' responses to challenges discussed in Chapter 2, and the religious heritage of the evangelical Chinese American Church that inadequately challenges their inconsistencies between faith and practice, and so affects the ways in which ministries are conducted that may or may not contribute to the spiritual formation of its congregation. The chapter presents a tabulation of the current ministries of several ambitious evangelical Chinese churches in North America (Table 2 and 3) to show the kinds and quantities of ministries offered; and concludes with a discussion on the implications of ministry gaps for the spiritual formation of her people.

Chapter 4 answers the question of the normative task by exploring and analyzing the biblical foundation for spiritual formation. It begins by looking at how God the Father establishes relationship with God's people as revealed in selected texts of the Pentateuch, the Prophetic literature, and the Psalms; followed by how Christ the Son of God and Son of Man demonstrates to his disciples the demands of authentic discipleship as revealed in the Gospel of Mark; and how the Holy Spirit empowers Christ in his earthly life as analogous to how the Holy Spirit empowers and transforms the lives of Christians as revealed in selected passages in the Gospel of John, Luke-Acts, and the Epistles. The chapter concludes with a discussion on the implications for evangelical Chinese American Christians of the transformation of their lives.

Chapter 5 answers the question of the pragmatic task by proposing Ignatian spirituality for filling the ministry gaps of the evangelical Chinese American Church. Topics covered include the major characteristics and centrality of Scripture in Ignatian spirituality, the historical

relevance of the Jesuits to the Chinese people, and the road to transformation through the various Ignatian Spiritual Exercises and prayer practices. The chapter concludes with a discussion on the implications for filling the ministry gaps in the evangelical Chinese American Church to enhance the life transformation of her people toward Christian maturity.

Chapter 6 is a detailed description of how the seminary course "A Practical Theology of Christian Spiritual Formation" was conducted at China Evangelical Seminary North America, following Osmer's four-task approach to practical theology as applied to Christian spiritual formation. A field test of the dissertation's proposed solution to the identified problem, this course included thirty hours of classroom instruction time and student group discussions followed by a three-day four-night Ignatian silent retreat.

Chapter 7 is an analytical assessment of the results of the seminary course by means of two sets of student evaluations: one on the classroom instruction (Table 5) and another one on the silent retreat (Table 6); and the Researcher's evaluation of student assignments (Table 7) and of the course based on how well the course objective was achieved.

Empirical Methods and Original Contributions to Knowledge

This dissertation's major original contribution is the design of the seminary course *A Practical Theology of Christian Spiritual Formation for the Evangelical Chinese American Church* that aims to motivate and equip Chinese American seminarians to lead their current and future Chinese immigrant congregations toward spiritual maturity. Though it serves as a field test of this dissertation, it is also developed from the cumulative results of the literature research along with the hermeneutical, and empirical studies explored in the previous chapters that also include other original contributions to knowledge.

In Chapter 1, an original contribution to knowledge is the empirical study on the follow-up of baptismal candidates from 2006 Christmas baptism to 2016 Summer baptism (Appendix A) of an ambitious Chinese American church in Southern California, 75 to 95 percent of whose various Mandarin congregations on six campuses are from Mainland China. The objective of the follow-up study is to discover where each of the candidates is by the end of 2017, the results of which confirm the phenomenon of "low retention rate" alongside the "mass conversion" of Chinese Immigrants in the evangelical Chinese American Church.

In Chapter 2, an original contribution to knowledge is the empirical study achieved by way of a survey, a survey undertaken with the help of seminarians and pastors from seven evangelical Chinese American churches of one hundred first-generation Chinese immigrants who have become Christians within the last ten years through the evangelistic outreach efforts of Chinese American churches and College Campus ministries. The survey explores the motivations for their coming to church and being baptized, their current involvement in church ministries, and how they are living out their faith before God and significant others in their various contexts and in their stewardship (Appendices B1, B2, B3). The objective is to discover the spiritual needs of first-generation Chinese immigrants in evangelical Chinese American churches.

In Chapter 3, an original contribution to knowledge is the analyses of the Sunday bulletins and annual calendars gathered from six ambitious evangelical Chinese American churches in California, to identify the kinds of spiritual formation ministries provided by their respective Mandarin congregations to promote continued spiritual growth beyond baptism. A sample of each of their Sunday bulletins that list their regular weekly ministries (Table 2), and

their 2017 annual calendars that reveal all church events during the year (Table 3) were collected and tabulated. The objective was to discover how the lives and ministries of three significant evangelical Chinese leaders at the turn of the twentieth century might have affected today's Chinese American Church in terms of the kinds of ministries offered and the ways they are conducted, as well as possible gaps that need to be filled for spiritual formation ministries to be more relevant and effective.

In Chapter 5, an original contribution is attempted by justifying the use of Ignatian spirituality and practices for the evangelical Chinese American Church (CAC). The CAC has always been skeptical of Catholic traditions, and Ignatian spirituality is a part of the Catholic treasure that Protestant Christians have rejected from the time of the Reformation. Yet in the last couple of decades, Ignatian retreats and spiritual exercises have been becoming more popular among evangelical Chinese Christians who are trying them out and finding them helpful to their spiritual growth. An attempt is made to justify the CAC using Ignatian spirituality on the bases of the centrality of Scripture underlying both its foundation principles and spiritual exercises, and the Jesuit missions' historical contributions to and relationship with the Chinese people.

Finally, the main contribution to knowledge is the seminary course preliminarily developed for this dissertation as described in Chapter 1. It is a one-week intensive four-unit course entitled *A Practical Theology of Christian Spiritual Formation* taught in March 2018 at the China Evangelical Seminary North America, followed by a weekend retreat at the Prince of Peace Abbey in San Diego (See Appendix C for the course description, and Appendix D for the daily student-led Classroom Discussion guide).

Scope and Limitations

To address the need for spiritual formation of Chinese American Christians is obviously a much more complicated task than a single seminary course can fulfill. A significant and urgent issue that is beyond the scope of this dissertation is the desperate need for more Mainland Chinese pastors and leaders, especially women. A close examination of the *Southern California Los Angeles Area Chinese Churches, Parachurch Organizations, and Ministers Directory of 2015–2016* reveals that only 2 percent of Christian workers (including pastors, seminary professors, and parachurch organization leaders) are from Mainland China.[37] Even if that percentage were doubled, taking into consideration perhaps their lack of participation in association activities, these workers still represent less than 5 percent of the total ministry work force among the 530 coworkers listed in the directory, while at a conservative estimate 80 to 90 percent of most Mandarin-speaking Chinese congregations are from Mainland China. Appendix B1—Survey by Life Stages—shows that China being the country of origin of those surveyed ranges from 81 percent (if all "No" response indicate "not from China") to 90 percent (if all "No" responses indicate a person is from China). The directory also reveals a lack of women in ministry available to disciple female converts, for they represent only 13 percent of the total ministry workforce,[38] while approximately 50 to60 percent of the Mandarin-speaking Chinese congregations are women (Table 1 Retention of Baptismal Candidates at Church X shows 61 percent of 188 candidates are female; Appendix B3: A Survey by Gender shows that 53 percent of 100 candidates are female).

[37] *Southern California Los Angeles Area Chinese Churches, Parachurch Organizations, and Ministers Directory of 2015 – 2016* (Los Angeles: Greater Los Angeles Chinese Ministerial Association, 2015), 57–101.

[38] Ibid.

In applying Richard Osmer's four-task approach to the development of a seminary course, this dissertation is also limited in that it only touches the tip of the iceberg on each of the four tasks. Further research must be conducted for each task to be adequately explored. For the first task, additional information from more churches must be gathered, such as the rate of and reasons for the low retention of Chinese immigrants and recent graduates; how pastors and leaders who originate from Mainland China might better meet the spiritual needs of church members of similar background, and how women pastors might better care for and disciple women members. For the second task, more relevant sociological theories, cultural values, and historical studies of indigenous Chinese spiritualities may be drawn to discover the impacts they have on the DNA of evangelical Chinese American churches, in terms of how they develop their discipleship or spiritual formation ministries, and how Chinese immigrants live out their Christian faith today. For the third task, additional biblical and theological perspectives may be more thoroughly explored to understand how spiritual formation takes place in a Christian's life, and to identify relevant biblical standards by which to evaluate and discover gaps in the current spiritual formation ministries of Chinese American churches. And lastly, for the fourth task, what other Christian heritage of spiritualities besides that of the Ignatian may be explored to cultivate the faith of evangelical Chinese Christians; and how the biblical stance of the various schools of spirituality may be applied and defended for Chinese American pastors to embrace and practice in their own lives, as well as to develop spiritual formation ministries and lead their congregations toward spiritual maturity.

Chapter 2

The Descriptive Empirical Task: What Is Going On?

Introduction: The Lived Experience of Chinese Immigrants in North America

Chapter 1 has demonstrated that despite the "mass conversion" of Chinese immigrants in North America to evangelical Christianity, their retention in the evangelical Chinese American Church remains low. To keep new converts in the local churches and to help them continue to mature in their faith and become contributing members in the Church community and the world, there is therefore a need to enhance the spiritual formation ministries for such immigrant converts. The proposed strategy to address this issue is to develop a seminary course on *A Practical Theology of Christian Spiritual Formation* by applying Richard Osmer's four task practical theological approach to Christian spiritual formation. Such formation will equip seminarians in evangelical Chinese American seminaries to take a first step in developing more effective spiritual formation ministries by which to lead their current and/or future congregations toward Christian maturity. This chapter takes up Richard Osmer's descriptive-empirical task, the first of his four tasks, by asking the question, "What is going on?"[39] Tis question aims at understanding the challenges that first-generation Chinese immigrants, including Christians, are facing in their daily lives, and how Christians' responses to these challenges affect their faith. The results from the researcher's observations, from literature research, and from the survey of one hundred Christians in the Mandarin congregations of seven evangelical Chinese American churches confirm that there are inconsistencies between

[39] Osmer, 4.

their professed Christian faith and the ways they respond to challenges in their lived experience in the home and in the workplace. These inconsistencies affect not only the emotional well-being of their children, but also make them (and particularly those who are mothers) anxious themselves. Such inconsistencies also become a major hindrance to their Christian growth and to their responsibility toward the larger community and the world.

There is a wide range of literature on the lived experience of Chinese immigrants. I focus only on literature on factors that contribute to the growth or hindrance to their newfound Christian faith, which in turn relies on my general observations from my experience as a pastor of a couple of Chinese American churches that ministered primarily to first-generation immigrants from Mainland China during the last couple of decades, and having worked directly with young adults in the last eight years of my ministry from 2008 to 2014. Apparently, the most pressing issue hindering the spiritual growth of most Mainland Chinese immigrants is their obsession with the academic achievement of their children! For those who become Christians in the young adult life stage, especially those still single, their focus is on acquiring Bible knowledge either corporately in an adult Sunday School or Fellowship in which Bible study is the main weekly activity, or personally in their own quiet time. As a result, many of them finish reading the Bible through for the first time within the first couple of years, and then are often put to "work" in the various ministries or even in positions of leadership, often as soon as they are baptized. But once they are married and start their own families, or for those who become Christians after they are married and have children, their focus immediately turns to raising children and preparing them for academic success beginning when they are still preschoolers. From then on, they see Sunday school as an activity primarily for children, and the topics of

their Fellowship meetings also begin to change to those related to marriage and parenting rather than spiritual growth and formation. For parents of adolescents, their regular conversations focus around preparing their children for elite colleges, ideally Harvard! Although career-related topics are also popular in the workshops and fellowship meetings that Chinese American churches offer to their own people as well as for outreach purposes, their concern for work does not seem to hinder their church participation as much as their concern for their children's academic achievements does. For example, many parents participate in church ministries despite their busy work schedule, some taking church life as a much-needed break from their professional life, but they prevent their children from participating in church ministries when those are in conflict with their academic pursuits, such as preparation for the SAT, or with any activity that is considered as being an extra-curricular "credit" for their children's college admissions package, such as various kinds of sports, music, or academic activities and competitions.

Challenges and Responses in the Family

To verify and to make sense of the above observations, a couple of books published in the current decade and three journal articles addressing the challenges and responses in the Chinese American families have been selected for literature review in this section. While there are many more books and articles relevant to the topic, these resources, written by experts either in the academic field or in the field of bi-cultural Chinese American parenting, seem to explain adequately and make sense of the observations from the researcher's pastoral experience among Chinese immigrants in evangelical Chinese American churches in the last couple of decades.

The first book selected on Chinese American parenting is the most controversial one in the current decade, and has led to some of the hottest global parenting debates—*Battle Hymn of the Tiger Mother* by Amy Chua, John M. Duff Professor of Law at Yale Law School.[40] On one of its un-numbered front pages, the publisher introduces the book as "A bestseller of the *New York Times*, the *Wall Street Journal*, the *Washington Post*, the *Los Angeles Times*, the *Chicago Tribune*, the *Boston Globe*, and around the world"; and cites a couple of reviews by the Chicago Tribune and by *the New York Times Book Review* respectively as follows:

> *Battle Hymn of the Tiger Mother* hit the parenting hot button, but also a lot more, including people's complicated feelings about ambition, intellectualism, high culture, the Ivy League, strong women, and America's standing in a world where China is ascendant. Chua's conviction that hard work leads to inner confidence is a resonant one.
>
> Amy Chua argues that western parenting tries to respect and nurture children's individuality, while Chinese parents typically believe that arming children with skills, strong work habits, and inner confidence prepares them best for the future. Here Chua chronicles her iron-willed decision to raise her daughters, Sophia and Lulu, the Chinese way—and the remarkable, sometimes heartbreaking results her choice inspires. Achingly honest and profoundly challenging, *Battle Hymn of the Tiger Mother* is one of the most talked-about books of our times.

As recounted in her own memoir, Amy Chua was born in the US of first-generation immigrant parents from China, whose father came to pursue graduate studies, obtained his PhD in less than two years, became an assistant professor at Purdue University, and then eventually a professor at UC Berkeley.[41] She and her siblings were required to speak Chinese at home, were drilled in math and piano every afternoon, were never allowed to sleep over at friends' houses, and were expected to bring home perfect report cards without so much as one A-. The book tells of how, after having attended her awards ceremony in which Amy won

[40] Amy Chua, *Battle Hymn of the Tiger Mother* (New York: Penguin Books, 2011).
[41] Ibid., 16–17.

second place in a history contest while another student won the Kiwanis prize for best all-around student, Amy's father said to her, "Never, never disgrace me like that again!"[42]

Determined to raise her two daughters the Chinese way, she followed her father's strict parenting by forbidding them from going on sleep-overs, watching TV or playing computer games, choosing their own extracurricular activities, playing an instrument other than piano or violin (one daughter plays piano and the other violin), skipping a single day without practicing (not even when they were sick or on vacation), getting any grade less than an A, and not beiing the number one student in every subject except gym and drama.[43] Once when one of her daughters was second on a multiplication speed test, Chua made her do twenty practice tests of a hundred problems each every night the following week. She came in first every time after that.[44]

The following are some of the conclusions about the Chinese parenting approach that Chua has drawn from her own experience as well as from her study of other Chinese mothers' parenting practice: 1) schoolwork always comes first; 2) A- is a bad grade; 3) your children must be two years ahead of their classmates in math; 4) the only activities permitted are those in which your children can eventually win a medal, and that medal must be gold.[45] In the book she also reports on a study of fifty Western mothers and forty-eight Chinese immigrant mothers, in which the former express that "stressing academic success is not good for children" and that "parents need to foster the idea that learning is fun"—with which practically none of the

[42] Chua, 16.
[43] Ibid., 3–4, 89.
[44] Ibid., 70.
[45] Ibid., 5.

Chinese mothers agree. Instead, most of the latter believe that their children can be "the best" students in class, that "academic achievement reflects successful parenting," so that if children do not excel at school, "the parents are not doing their job"; and that other studies show Chinese parents spend about ten times as long as their Western counterparts every day tending to their children's academic activities.[46] Finally, probably totally foreign and inconceivable to Westerners is that Chinese parents believe that their children owe them everything, so the children must repay the parents by obeying them and making every effort to make their parents proud of them; and that since parents know what is best for their children, they can override their children's desires and choices.[47]

However, while proud of her Chinese parenting style, Chua finally admits her struggles in the process, as stated on the front cover of her book: "It was supposed to be a story of how Chinese parents are better at raising kids than Western ones. But instead, it's about a bitter clash of cultures, a fleeting taste of glory, and how I was humbled by a thirteen-year-old," as illustrated in the Afterword of this bitter clash of culture with her daughter:[48]

> Recently, in a fleeting moment of my former audacity, I told Lulu that she had to learn the Tchaikovsky violin concerto, which she's always loved but which is famously difficult. Her eyes opened wide, then she said in mock horror, "OMG, SHE'S BACK!!" She added, "Sorry, Mommy. I told you, I'm only playing violin for fun now. You'd better get that crazy idea out of your head, because there is NO.WAY.EVER."

Linda Hu and John X. Wang proposed a gentler and supposedly holistic approach to Chinese-American parenting. In the second book selected for this literature review, *The*

[46] Chua, 5
[47] Ibid., 53.
[48] Ibid., 239.

Chinese-American Method: Raising Our Children with the Best of Both Worlds,[49] they documented their personal experience of raising their two daughters. While not experts in the field by academic standards, these two authors and the book represent a voice of wisdom and determination to raise their children with the best of both the Chinese and the American value systems, as reflected in the subtitle. The authors are a typical first-generation Chinese immigrant couple—both having received their Bachelor's degrees in China; the husband having established himself in the scientific applications and development of computer technology in the US after obtaining his PhD from New York University, the wife having established herself in the children and family education consulting field in the US, eventually becoming the founding president of an Ivy Track college preparation and application consulting service.[50] Although Hu and Wang may not agree with Chua's extreme Chinese parenting style, they probably resonate with her mentality that academic success is the main goal for their children's lives, toward which parents must do their best to help them reach. The "success story" of Hu and Wang's parenting method that tries to take advantage of the best of both the Chinese and the American cultures well illustrates this mentality and effort. It is also a "success story" because both of their daughters were admitted to Harvard (along with acceptances from many other Ivy League schools and top universities in the US), which was to them a dream come true, and solid evidence that they had raised their children correctly.[51]

[49] Linda Hu and John X. Wang, *The Chinese-American Method: Raising Our Children with the Best of Both Worlds*, trans. Fanny Wang and Kathy Wang (n.p.: Trafford, 2013).

[50] "Editorial Review About the Author," Amazon, accessed 7/26/18, https://www.amazon.com/CHINESE-AMERICAN-METHOD-RAISING-CHILDREN-WORLDS/dp/1466973668/ref=sr_1_1?ie=UTF8&qid=1532646333&sr=8-1&keywords=the+chinese+american+method/.

[51] Hu and Wang, 7.

The couple made the move from Utah to New York when their daughters were still in elementary school, for they believed the East Coast to be more conducive to their children's academic development, primarily because of the locations there of many prestigious universities such as Harvard, MIT, Princeton, Yale, and Columbia.[52] Therefore, using the Chinese educational philosophy as the foundation, as typical Chinese parents do, they dedicated themselves whole-heartedly and relentlessly to their children's education, motivating and guiding them to strive for academic excellence, alongside promoting the Chinese family cultural values of strong bonding and caring relationships with each other.[53] On the other hand, they also recognized the great values and educational philosophy of the American culture that focuses on their children's balanced development, paying attention to things such as autonomy, teamwork, leadership, creativity, and dedication to community service; so they also did their best to inspire, encourage, and develop the same values in their children besides guiding them to reach their full potential in their academic pursuits, so that they might become well-rounded people, inheriting the best of both cultures as truly Chinese Americans.[54] But of course, without acknowledging this explicitly in their writing, these American values also happen to be qualities elite universities look for in the admission of what they consider to be brilliant students; and Hu and Wang had certainly done their homework to make sure they knew the exact requirements of each prestigious college they sought out for their daughters![55]

[52] Hu and Wang, 91.
[53] Ibid., 19.
[54] Ibid., 19–20.
[55] Ibid., 224–225.

To be successful in the United States, Hu and Wang believe that Chinese-American students face a lot more challenges than students of the mainstream or of other ethnic groups in American society. For example: the admission standards for most elite colleges demand that Asian-American students' average SAT scores be at least 100 points higher than non-Asian-American students to be accepted; therefore, Asian students must put in extra effort to get top grades and be academically competitive.[56] Their findings can be supported by a lawsuit filed against Harvard University for discriminating against Asian Americans, as reported by a recent *Time* magazine article that noted that the University "assigns a lower 'personal ratings' score to Asian American applicants as a group, who otherwise out performs other racial groups in academics and extracurriculars."[57]

To supplement the personal experience and philosophy on Chinese American parenting of Chua and Hu and Wang, three journal articles provide expertise on the effect of Chinese immigrants' parenting styles from academic research in related fields. Two of the journal articles selected are "Our Child Doesn't Talk to Us Anymore"[58] and "Doing Well vs. Feeling Well"[59] by Chinese American educational psychologist Desiree Baolian Qin, who received her EdD in Human Development & Psychology from Harvard University, and her research on mental health of high-achieving Asian American students has been covered by media outlets in the US (*New York Times*), UK (*BBC World News*), Australia, and many Asian countries.[60] Currently

[56] Hu and Wang, 28–30.

[57] Katie Reilly, "With Harvard on trial, so is affirmative action," *Time* (October 29, 2018), 8.

[58] Desiree Baolian Qin, "Our Child Doesn't Talk to Us Anymore," *Anthropology & Education Quarterly* 37, issue 2 (2006), 162-179.

[59] Desiree Baolian Qin, "Doing Well vs. Feeling Well: Understanding Family Dynamics and the Psychological Adjustment of Chinese Immigrant Adolescents," *Journal of Youth Adolescence* 37 (2008): 22–35.

[60] "Human Development and Family Studies," Michigan State University, accessed 10/14/2016, https://hdfs.msu.edu/people/faculty/qin-desiree-baolian-edd.

Associate Professor in the Department of Human Development and Family Studies at Michigan State University, Qin is also Associate Editor of the *Journal of Adolescent Research*, and teaches course on theories of human development, immigrant families, and globalization.[61] The February 6, 2012 issue of *Asian Scientist* describes well her research findings in contrast to Amy Chua's Tiger Mom parenting style:

> When Amy Chua released her memoir *Battle Hymn of the Tiger Mother* last year, detailing her hardline parenting techniques and suggesting that these are responsible for the academic success of Asian children in the West, it raised…suspicions that such a parenting style might impinge on a child's psychological well-being. Now, such concerns have been validated by China-born Assistant Professor Desiree Baolian Qin of Michigan State University, whose research has found that high-achieving Chinese-American students were more depressed and anxious, had lower self-esteem, and experienced more conflict with their parents than their Caucasian peers.

The third journal article selected is "Living up to Expectations: The Strengths and Challenges Experienced by Chinese Canadian Students" by Catherine Costigan and her colleagues.[62] Costigan, currently Associate Professor of Psychology at the University of Victoria, received her PhD from Michigan State University.[63] Her article discusses many challenges that Chinese immigrant families have in common with those in Qin's articles, but it also provides additional insights on challenges that immigrant students face in terms of conflicting cultures, motivations for high academic achievements, and the parental expectations imposed on them, which she attributes to the deep-rooted Confucian Chinese culture that sees learning as "the

[61] "Human Development and Family Studies," Michigan State University, accessed 10/14/2016, https://hdfs.msu.edu/people/faculty/qin-desiree-baolian-edd.

[62] Catherine L. Costigan, Josephine M. Hua, and Tina F. Su, "Living up to Expectations: The Strengths and Challenges Experienced by Chinese Canadian Students," *Canadian Journal of School Psychology* 25, no. 3 (2010): 223–245.

[63] "Catherine Costigan," University of Victoria, accessed 10/15/2016, https://www.uvic.ca/socialsciences/psychology/people/faculty-directory/costigancatherine.php.

pathway to becoming a good, competent, moral person who is deserving of respect";[64] and how such expectations often result in negative psychological effects on the students and their relationships with others.[65]

The research data and analyses of Qin's first article, "Our Child Doesn't Talk to Us Anymore," is based on a five-year Longitudinal Immigrant Student Adaptation (LISA) study co-directed by Carola and Marcelo Suarez-Orozco beginning in 1997, to examine immigrant adolescents' academic engagement and psychosocial adjustment.[66] From her interviews with seventeen Chinese immigrant students every year and with their parents in the first and final years in the five-year period, Qin selected two sample families to explain why and how various developmental, immigration-related, and cultural factors have contributed to growing signs of alienation between parents and children in twelve of seventeen families of diverse socioeconomic backgrounds.[67] The two sample families selected are the Lai and the Zhen families: the former representing the middle class, with both parents having high levels of education and holding professional jobs; while the latter representing the working class, with both parents having limited education and holding service jobs.[68]

Li, the only son of the Lais, was the top student in his suburban high school class of primarily white students, and his parents had high hopes of him entering an elite university, with a major in the natural sciences, preferably in medicine, as the field was considered prestigious and financially stable, and Li used to admire his parents and share most of their

[64] Costagan, Hua, and Su, 227.

[65] Ibid., 234.

[66] Qin, "Our Child Doesn't Talk to Us Anymore," 164; "Doing Well vs. Feeling Well," 24, citing Carola Suarez-Orozco and Marcelo Suarez-Orozco, *Children of Immigration* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2001).

[67] Qin, "Our Child Doesn't Talk to Us Anymore," 162.

[68] Ibid., 165–166.

aspirations.[69] However, after a summer's internship in his state's governor's office, Li became interested in politics and the social sciences, particularly journalism, which became a cause of conflicts in the family.[70] He also increasingly felt the pressure to perform well academically, for his parents would "feel sad and not talk to him" when he failed to do so.[71] Toward the end of the five-year study, the parents complained that, influenced by American culture, Li disagreed with them in just about everything, communicated with them less and less, but became increasingly involved in school activities.[72] On the other hand, Li complained that his parents "did not understand his struggles growing up in another country," and so he did not tell them about his "dating a white girl."[73]

The Zhen family lived in a two-bedroom apartment in Boston's Chinatown where Ling, one of the three daughters, was attending an urban middle school when she first began participating in the study.[74] The parents worked long hours and came home when their daughters were already in bed, so the family had dinner together only about once a week; yet, they still enjoyed a harmonious relationship with each other.[75] Over time, Ling became less engaged in school, was bullied by other students, had occasional arguments with girlfriends, and worried about her English not being good enough.[76] However, she was unable to communicate with her mother, because growing up in a foreign country made it difficult for Ling to build up a sufficient vocabulary in her mother tongue to express emotions, and she did

[69] Qin, "Our Child Doesn't Talk to Us Anymore," 166-167.
[70] Ibid., 167.
[71] Ibid.
[72] Ibid.
[73] Ibid.
[74] Ibid., 168.
[75] Ibid.
[76] Ibid.

not feel close enough to her father to communicate with him, because he had separated from his wife and daughters for eight years before the family reunited.[77] Her father complained that the daughters played on the computer and watched TV a lot, and had different values than those of their parents and other children in China; while Ling complained that her parents had little time for her and felt intensely that they did not really care about her.[78]

In her analyses of the challenges Chinese immigrant families are facing, Qin identifies three major contributing factors to the growing alienation between parents and children as demonstrated in the two cases. First, there is the developmental factor when children reach adolescence, for they begin to form their own identities, assert their independence from their parents, and turn toward their peers for support.[79] Second, there are immigration-induced factors that especially impact working-class families: extended parent-child separations that leads to estrangement between them; lack of time together due to the parents' long working hours which result in parents and children living in different worlds; and language barriers, as children gradually gain proficiency in English while losing their mother tongue.[80] Third, there is also the cultural factor of the clash of Chinese and American parenting styles that widens the gap between parents and children, e.g. the hierarchical Chinese parental role in their children's education and in the control of their future, as ingrained in the deeply-rooted Confucian culture of filial piety that demands children to honor, respect, and be obedient to their parents.[81] As a result, despite their awareness of living in America, parents still expect their children to behave

[77] Qin, "Our Child Doesn't Talk to Us Anymore," 168.
[78] Ibid., 169.
[79] Ibid., 170.
[80] Ibid., 171.
[81] Ibid., 172.

like those in China, thus contributing to the "parallel dual frame of reference"—parents comparing their children to the more obedient children in China, and children comparing their parents to the more relaxed and less controlling parents in America,[82] as seen in the Zhen family. Another perceived feature of the Confucian Chinese culture is the high academic pressure for achievement that parents impose on their children, which contributes to the decrease in the children's emotional affinity toward their parents and their reluctance to communicate with them as a form of "passive rebellion,"[83] as evident in the Lai family.

Qin documents a number of studies and statistics that show alarming signs of psychological and social mal-adjustments of Asian American adolescents: the Commonwealth Fund Survey in 1998 reported a higher percentage of depressive symptoms among Asian American girls (30 percent) in grades 5 to 11 than those of other ethnic groups (22 percent among Whites; 17 percent among Blacks; and 27 percent among Hispanics), which supports the earlier findings of National Health Statistics in 1995 and 1997 that report a higher rate of depressive symptoms and suicide among Asian American women of ages fifteen to twenty-four than those in other ethnic groups (White, Black, and Hispanic).[84] Similarly, other reports reveal Asian American boys as experiencing lower psychological functioning, as measured by levels of depression, anxiety, and self-esteem, in comparison to their White, Black, and Hispanic peers.[85] The National Health Statistics report in 2001 revealed that while suicide is the third leading

[82] Qin, "Our Child Doesn't Talk to Us Anymore," 172–73.
[83] Ibid., 174.
[84] Qin, "Doing Well vs. Feeling Well," 23.
[85] Ibid.

cause of death among all young people ages fifteen to twenty-four, it is the second leading cause (following unintentional injuries) among Asian Americans.[86]

In view of such reports of poor psychological and social adjustments among Asian American adolescents despite their exceptionally high educational achievements, Qins set out to explore the causes of what she calls the "achievement/adjustment paradox" (high academic achievement but poor psychological and social adjustment), as reported in her second article "Doing Well vs. Feeling Well."[87] Since the majority of Asian American children live in families in which one or both of their parents are immigrants, she draws her data for this second article from a subset consisting of thirty-eight Chinese immigrant students of the whole Chinese sample in the same five-year Longitudinal Immigrant Student Adaptation (LISA) study as cited in her earlier article "Our Child Doesn't Talk to Us Anymore."[88] In this study, Qin compares the family dynamics of two groups of academically high-performing adolescents (with a grade point average of 3.76 and above)—one "distressed" (eighteen students) and the other "non-distressed" (twenty students)—to discover some possible causes of the achievement/adjustment paradox of the distressed group of Chinese immigrant adolescents.[89] Methods used for data collection include structured student interviews in the first, second and final years, and parent interviews in the first and final years, ethnographic observations, reviews of school records, and teacher interviews, and data analysis as guided by grounded theory that considers "the complexities of students' lived experiences in their unique social

[86] Qin, "Doing Well vs. Feeling Well," 23.
[87] Ibid., 22.
[88] Ibid., 24–25.
[89] Ibid.

contexts."[90] The specific family dynamic issues studied the two groups are "parenting after migration," "parent-child communication," and "parental expectations."[91]

While both groups of parents experienced similar migration challenges, the parents of the two groups adopted different modes of parenting: those of the distressed adolescents continued to follow the traditional Chinese parenting of "strict control," monitoring their children's daily activities without considering the developmental needs of their adolescent children and the changing cultural context, as did parents of the non-distressed adolescents.[92] In terms of communication, parents of the distressed adolescents held on to the hierarchical relations and roles, expecting children to listen without talking back or challenging their opinions; whereas parents of the non-distressed adolescents attempted to understand their children's social and emotional needs, and valued open communication that promotes mutual understanding and trust.[93] The parental expectations of the two groups were also drastically different. Parents of the distressed group put a lot of pressure on their children regarding academic achievement without paying attention to other aspects of development. Their children complained that their parents had only two or three things to say, such as "Is your homework done?" "Any exams?" and "How did you do on the exam?"[94] On the other hand, education was far from being the only focus of most parents of the non-distressed group, as they expressed concerns such as making progress, becoming moral and noble people, having a purpose in life, etc., and most of their children felt more relaxed about schooling, and reported

[90] Qin, "Doing Well vs. Feeling Well," 25.
[91] Ibid., 27 & 31.
[92] Ibid., 31.
[93] Ibid., 28 &30.
[94] Ibid., 29.

having more freedom to choose their career paths and fewer conflicts with their parents over education-related issues.[95]

The last article, "Living up to Expectations" by Catherine Costigan et al., reports the following three conclusions about their research. First, the Confucian Chinese culture has cultivated in the students a quiet and attentive listening attitude as a way to show respect to teachers, and a reluctance to share opinions or competencies (unless asked) as a way to express humility.[96] Such an attitude and behavior contrast with those of the North American culture that values qualities such as assertiveness, active questioning and spontaneity, and so creates psychological stress on Chinese students in the classroom.[97] The fact that classmates might perceive the behaviors of Chinese students as being inhibited or conforming makes it difficult for the Chinese students to fit in and develop meaningful peer relationships, and can or even make them vulnerable to being bullied in school.[98]

Second, Chinese parents impose all kinds of pressure on their children to motivate them to achieve high academic standards. They consider: high achievement to be a matter of human effort, so all it takes is hard work; achievement in school to be a way of bringing honor to the family; and becoming a good and moral person worthy of respect to be the result of education.[99] Before migrating, such parents tell their children that education is the major motivation for their immigration in order to improve their future economic standing; after migration, to compensate for their perceived disadvantage or discrimination, children are told

[95] Qin, "Doing Well vs. Feeling Well," 31.
[96] Costigan, Hua, and Su, 230.
[97] Ibid.
[98] Ibid.
[99] Ibid., 227.

they need to out-perform the American majority in society for upward mobility to happen.[100] Keenly aware of and trying to live up to their parents' aspirations, many Chinese immigrant students feel pressured to make straight A's, which negatively affects not only their own emotional life, but also their interpersonal relationships, as it contributes to negative feelings and harassment from non-Chinese peers for such qualities as being "too smart."[101]

Third, the model minority stereotype of Chinese students' superior academic achievement as recognized and expected by teachers and peers contributes not only to their own emotional distress, it also imposes distress on other Chinese students who are not high achievers, leading to their feelings of shame and failure, their hesitancy to seek help, and their becoming depressed and isolated from high achiever Chinese peers whose parents may pressure them to socialize only with other high achievers.[102] Some first-generation Chinese immigrant adolescents may even become invisible or be perceived as inferior, and be separated from peers to attend English as Second Language classes, which may also contribute to the high rate of peer discrimination, such as name calling, social exclusion, teasing, and harassment, among Chinese students.[103]

Challenges and Responses in the Workplace

Besides the challenges Chinese immigrants face in the family, they also experience challenges in their career development in the North American society that greatly impact their self-identity, relationship with their own families and with the people of their host country. To

[100] Costigan, Hua, and Su, 228, 232.
[101] Ibid., 234, 237.
[102] Ibid., 235.
[103] Ibid., 229, 237.

understand the challenges they are encountering in the workplace, I selected the article "Career Barriers for Chinese Immigrants in the United States" by Chinese American psychologist Frederick T. L. Leong and his colleague Mei Tang,[104] and the article "Career Development of Chinese Canadian Professional Immigrants" by Chinese American Charles Chen and his colleague Julie Hong.[105] Frederick T.L. Leong, the lead author of the first article is Professor of Psychology and Psychiatry at Michigan State University, also the editor-in-chief of the *Encyclopedia of Counseling* and the *APA Handbook of Multicultural Psychology*, the founding editor of *the Asian American Journal of Psychology*, and lead editor of the *Handbook of Asian American Psychology*, 2nd Edition.[106] Leong received his PhD in Psychology from the University of Maryland, and is currently also director of the Consortium for Multicultural Psychology Research, its primary mission being "to generate and apply psychological science to increase our understanding of multicultural issues in both domestic and international contexts."[107] Because of his extensive academic research experience in the field of Asian American psychology as well as in multicultural psychology, his article has contributed much to the understanding of challenges that Chinese immigrants face in career development in the United States, challenges from the larger macrosystem to the microsystem. Charles P. Chen, lead author of the second article, is Professor of Counselling Psychology and a Canada Research Chair (CRC) in Life Career Development at the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education (OISE)

[104] Frederick T. L. Leong and Mei Tang, "Career Barriers for Chinese Immigrants in the United States," *The Career Development Quarterly* 64 (2016): 259–271.

[105] Charles P. Chen and Julie Wai Ling Hong, "Career Development of Chinese Canadian Professional Immigrants," *The Career Development Quarterly* 64 (2016): 272–286.

[106] "Frederick T.L. Leong," American Psychological Association, accessed 10/15/2016, http://www.apa.org/pi/oema/resources/ethnicity-health/psychologists/frederick-leong.aspx.

[107] "Consortium for Multicultural Psychology Research," Michigan State University, accessed 11/27/2016, http://psychology.psy.msu.edu/cmpr/.

at the University of Toronto.[108] He was awarded the prestigious Fellow of Canadian Psychological Association honor in 2014 in recognition of his more than two decades of contributions to knowledge-building and knowledge-enhancement.[109] Chen is a respected authority nationally and internationally in the field of vocational and career psychology, whose research focuses on "studying people's vocational and career development in various contexts throughout their lifespan."[110]

Since the dominant ethnic group in both the United States and Canada are White European, and most of the Chinese immigrants in the last couple of decades are from Mainland China, career challenges for these immigrants covered in the two articles have much in common. However, each of the articles also points out specific challenges that may be unique in their respective contexts, or that may happen to different members to varying degrees in both contexts. Similar characteristics of Chinese immigrants reported in both countries include: becoming the second largest immigrant or minority group (2010 in US and 2014 in Canada);[111] more likely than the native-born Chinese or the White majority to have a college or higher degree, but still limited in English proficiency;[112] and feeling that they are barely accepted by or able to integrate into their respective host countries,[113] for they have experienced discriminations for various reasons and by various peoples in their respective contexts.

[108] "Charles Chen," University of Toronto, accessed 7/30/2018, https://www.oise.utoronto.ca/aphd/Home/Faculty_and_Staff/Faculty/1512/Charles_Chen.html

[109] "Canadian Psychological Association elects Charles P. Chen to prestigious Fellow honor," Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, accessed 8/1/2018, https://www.oise.utoronto.ca/oise/News/charles_chen_elected_fellow_of_cpa.html.

[110] Ibid.

[111] Leong and Tang, 260; Chen and Hong, 272.

[112] Chen and Hong, 275–77.

[113] Leong and Tang, 261; Chen and Hong, 276.

Leong and Tang, researchers in the US context, adopt an ecological model for studying career barriers for Chinese immigrants, which is an integration of Bogardus' social distance theory (1933) and Bronfenbrenner's classic bioecological systems theory of human development (1977 & 1979).[114] The social distance theory documents the varying degrees of social distance between the dominant US White majority and the ethnic minority groups, measured by social attitude (of acceptance and welcome) of the former toward the latter as follows: acceptance 1) to live in my country, 2) to live in my neighborhood, 3) several families to live in my neighborhood, 4) to work alongside me in an office, 5) to be friends with me, and 6) to marry me.[115] Of the thirty-six ethnic groups studied in 1933, the Chinese were among the top ten groups to have the greatest social distance from the dominant White majority; thus the dominant majority considers them difficult to assimilate into American society and designates as being "perpetual foreigners" who are on their own.[116] Using Bronfenbrenner's five levels of ecological contexts to career development of Chinese immigrants, Leong and Tang discuss barriers from the larger macrosystem to the microsystem, i.e. from the societal, through the community, school, and workplace, to the family system.[117]

At the societal level, Chinese immigrants often experience career barriers as a result of ethnic stereotyping, prejudice, and discrimination.[118] Xenophobic attitudes toward Chinese migrant workers are testified to by the Chinese Exclusion Act of 1882 (US National Archives and Records Administration, 2007), and toward Asian American's academic and economic

[114] Leong and Tang, 259.
[115] Ibid., 261.
[116] Ibid.
[117] Ibid., 259.
[118] Ibid., 261.

achievements as testified to by the rise of the "model minority myth" dating back to 1966.[119] As long as this attitude continues, China's rise as an economic power rivaling that of the US in the recent decade will be taken by some European Americans as a threat to their livelihood.[120] Besides resentments from the dominant majority, Chinese immigrants' dedication, productivity, and extraordinary work ethic, as portrayed in a cartoon as handling multiple tasks with eight arms like an octopus, often result in backlash from other coworkers who feel intimidated by them.[121]

At the community level, while engaging in community events can help build a sense of belonging and can make it easier for acculturation into American society to occur, because of a lack of confidence in interacting with the mainstream culture or perceived language barrier, Chinese immigrants often have not taken advantage of such participation.[122] A sample of first- (adult immigrant) and 1.5 (adolescent immigrant) generation Chinese Americans has reported perceiving themselves as having great difficulties in obtaining jobs because of racial barriers.[123] The experience of community discrimination and racism has kept many new immigrants in Chinatown, partly for fear of rejection by the mainstream, and partly to have access to much needed resources in terms of social support, jobs, and preferred food.[124] The lack of role models in the Chinese community has also prevented some working-class immigrants from

[119] Leong and Tang, 262.
[120] Ibid., 261–62.
[121] Ibid., 262.
[122] Ibid., 263.
[123] Ibid., 264.
[124] Ibid.

exploring career aspirations and possibilities other than those that provide for the basic necessities of life.[125]

At the school level, one of the challenges is the lack of familiarity or experience with the American educational system, such as the use of the discussion method, which makes it difficult for students who are used to the lecture method to participate actively in the classroom.[126] Another challenge is the stereotyping and discrimination by teachers and peers, due in part to the "model minority myth," which generalizes the high academic achievement of Asian Americans to the neglect of the individual student's unique needs. This kind of stereotyping and racial discrimination can continue in the college setting.[127]

In the workplace, Chinese immigrants are still victims of stereotyping and racial discrimination; as a result, they are subject to bullying, harassment, and even violence, as in the case of Vincent Chin who, mistaken as Japanese, was killed in 1982 by two autoworkers in Detroit, out of resentment toward the Japanese auto industry that had taken away their jobs.[128] Chinese immigrants also encounter occupational segregation into the narrow range of STEM fields, i.e. science, technology, engineering and mathematics.[129] In addition, they are often considered unsuitable for advancing into managerial roles, due to their perceived lack of "social poise, assertiveness, and leadership skills," and so are often told to stay in technical roles as their best contribution to the company, since they are performing so well in such roles.[130]

[125] Leong and Tang, 264.
[126] Ibid., 264–265.
[127] Ibid.
[128] Ibid., 266.
[129] Ibid.
[130] Ibid., 267.

In the family, Chinese immigrants face challenges that affect their decision and performance regarding their career choices. Most parents of Chinese immigrants have high expectations for their children to achieve career success, and want their career aspirations to be in line with the demands of the labor market. As a consequence, these parents put tremendous pressure on their children to enter stereotyped occupations in the STEM fields.[131] Another challenge for the adult immigrants is to find a job that allows them to make a living to support their family rather than to find one that allows them to actualize their potential and talents, or one that is consistent with their educational levels and pre-migration work experience.[132]

Similar but from a different perspective, researchers Chen and Hong in their Canadian context explore six major career-related barriers for Chinese Canadian professional immigrants in their resettlement process, and propose helpful strategies to address these barriers.[133] The six barriers are: migration-related stressors, language proficiency, cultural nuances and knowledge, discrimination and prejudice, credentials from foreign countries not being recognized, and family separation and fragmentation.[134] The first three career-related barriers are common experience due to the immigrants' own difficulties in adjusting to living in a foreign country; the next two are caused by the societal attitude of the host country; and the last one concerning the family arises as a result of the first five barriers. These barriers or settlement and adjustment difficulties in the process of migration, which hinder them from

[131] Leong and Tang, 265.
[132] Ibid., 263.
[133] Chen and Hong, 273.
[134] Ibid., 272.

gaining desirable employment and advancement, negatively affect their vocational, psychological, and even physical well-being.[135]

The three migration-related stressors of the first barrier are: giving up the old and establishing new social networks; moving from one socioeconomic status to another, usually involving downward mobility; and adjusting from an old familiar cultural system to a new and unfamiliar one.[136] The next barrier is English language proficiency, because advanced skills such as presentations, negotiations, conflict resolution, etc. are required of employees in most professional fields in North America.[137] The third barrier, related to language proficiency, is the difficult and frustrating task of not only speaking the language, but also having the cultural knowledge of its nuances, which often involve nonverbal cues such as eye contact, body language, basic etiquette, etc., which can create insecurity and anxiety in interpersonal settings in work and social environments.[138] The lack of language proficiency and cultural knowledge and nuances can be perceived as a form of discrimination that may lead to immigrants feeling they are never able to integrate into the host country despite their best efforts.[139]

The following two related barriers that Chinese immigrants experience are societal attitudes they come across as they seek employment in the host country: prejudice and discrimination, and foreign credentials often not being recognized.[140] Prejudice and discrimination remain mostly invisible but evident in terms of getting employed, earning the same wages as the usually higher-paid local employees, and getting promoted to upper

[135] Chen and Hong, 274.
[136] Ibid., 275.
[137] Ibid.
[138] Ibid., 276.
[139] Ibid.
[140] Ibid., 277–278.

management or executive positions.[141] Such prejudice and discrimination happen to Chinese immigrants despite their higher levels of education than the natives, e.g. according to the 2001 Statistics Canada, 32 percent of Chinese immigrants versus 16 percent of the Canadian population hold a university degree.[142] Yet, one in four Chinese immigrants lives below the poverty line (Statistics Canada, 2005a, 2006); and many are at higher risk of unemployment, underemployment, or being trapped in subsistence jobs within their own ethnic community.[143] These phenomena are often attributed to the discrediting of foreign educational degrees and the lack of host country experience.[144]

Due to such multiple layers of institutional barriers or glass ceilings that prevent Chinese immigrants from acquiring employment equivalent to their pre-migration professional status, many professionals temporarily or permanently move back to their home countries to continue working in their pre-migration occupational fields.[145] As a result of one or both parents returning to work in their home countries and leaving their children behind in the host country, satellite families are created, in which redistribution of roles and responsibilities are necessary, and grief, loss, and isolation are deeply felt due to the absence and separation of family members.[146]

Since the way in which immigrants attach to the career roles they play over the course of their lives makes a great impact on their personal self-worth and identity, the central issue

[141] Chen and Hong, 277.
[142] Ibid.
[143] Ibid., 277–278.
[144] Ibid.
[145] Ibid., 278.
[146] Ibid.

becomes how this self-worth and identity are related to their experience in the host country.[147] If changes in social status and social role due to unemployment or underemployment happen, inevitably altering their assessment of their own ability and place in society, the immigrants must decide at some point to cope with the loss by selecting another career path that seems to offer them a good balance between preserving their social self-concept and what is feasible and attainable.[148]

Research on Chinese immigrants in the workplace reveals the multiple stresses first-generation Chinese Christians go through in their careers, such as being victims of the glass ceiling and discrimination, not feeling they belong to their adopted country, and always struggling with problems of language barriers, etc. These personally frustrating experiences may prompt them to put pressure on their children to excel academically so that the children will not have to experience the kind of discrimination the parents do.

A Survey on the Spiritual Needs of Chinese Christians in North America

To understand more specifically the impact that lived experience such as that revealed by the above literature review has on Chinese Christians in North America, a survey was conducted primarily in California. It explored the spiritual needs of Chinese immigrants in evangelical Chinese American churches in terms of how well they are living out their Christian faith as measured by their self-reported church ministry participation as well as in their relationships with significant people in the various contexts and aspects of their daily lives. The survey forms (Appendix B) were distributed beginning in April 2017 by pastors or seminarians

[147] Chen and Hong, 279–280.
[148] Ibid., 280.

serving in Chinese American churches, collected back in December 2017, and a total of one hundred of those adequately filled out were used in the tabulations and analyses as presented in the following.

Results of Part A of the survey (**Appendix B1**), consisting of basic information tabulated from the one hundred persons surveyed, show that 83 percent came from China versus 6 percent from Taiwan, 3 percent from other places, and 8 percent giving no answer; and that most of them attended independent churches (57 percent) rather than denominational churches (35 percent). Ministries common to evangelical Chinese American churches and offered by these churches included worship, prayer, Bible study, fellowship, foreign missions, local evangelism, youth, and children's ministries. Due to the increase in new immigrants over the last three decades, ministries such as help settling in, job referrals, childcare, citizen classes, English tutoring, etc. are provided by some of these churches, with the highest percentage of them offering English tutoring, which reflects the perceived need for academic pursuit and career placement for new immigrants. In terms of motivation for attending churches: out of the 165 responses from the 100 surveyed (some chose more than one reason), the largest number of people—45—mentioned a sincere search for truth; followed by 34 as meeting spiritual needs, 30 curiosity about Christianity, 24 as responding to an invitation, 19 as meeting social and cultural needs, and 11 as meeting material needs.

Apart from the above general information, the survey results (Appendices B1–B3) reveal how they live out their faith in terms of participation in ministries (Part A) and in terms of significant relationships in the various contexts and aspects of their daily lives (Part B). Three sets of data were tabulated and analyzed, all intended to reveal their spiritual needs from

different perspectives. The first set of data tabulated by the three life stages as indicated on the survey form—ages 18–34, 35–64, and 65 or above, intended to find out how the various life stages—young adult, adult, and senior, impact the ways in which people live out their Christian faith, and the tabulations are recorded in **Appendix B1**: A Comparison of Survey Responses on Spiritual Needs by Life Stages. The second set tabulated by number of years since their conversion—less than 3 years, -5 years, and 6-10 years, intended to discover the kind of progress they had made in their faith journeys from the time of their conversion to Christianity, and those tabulations are recorded in **Appendix B2**: A Comparison of Survey Responses on Spiritual Needs by Years of Conversion. The third set tabulated by gender intended to find out the difference gender makes as these Chinese Americans attempt to live out their faith, so that spiritual needs and challenges unique to men and to women might be identified, and those tabulations are recorded in **Appendix B3**: A Comparison of Survey Responses on Spiritual Needs by Gender. For each set of data, the tabulation of percentage in their participation in ministries is based on the total number of people involved in each category measured, such as the specific life stage, years since conversion, or gender; while the tabulation of percentage in living out their faith in their significant relationships in the various contexts and aspects of daily lives is based on the total number of "Good" responses out of the total number of "Good," "Fair," and "Poor" responses to each specific category measured.

Spiritual Needs by Life Stages (Appendix B1):

This first set of data consists of 54 young adults (26 males and 28 females) ages 18 to 34; 40 adults (19 males and 21 females) ages 35 to 65; and 6 seniors (2 males and 4 females) over 65 years of age. In terms of attendance, Worship remains consistent around 65 percent for all

three age groups, and Prayer in the high 50s percentile in the first two groups and high-60s percentile in the senior group. The most apparent difference is in Fellowship and Bible Study attendance in the adult group: while 80 percent of young adults and 100 percent of seniors attend Fellowship, and 70 percent young adults and over 80 percent of seniors attend Bible Study, the attendance of adults dropped to 45 percent in Fellowship and 60 percent in Bible Study over time. Apparently, other than a decrease in the perceived need for community support and Bible knowledge in their spiritual growth, the adult group is comparatively more preoccupied with family life and/or career advancement, while the young adults, being singles or young couples, and the retired seniors have more time and energy to participate by attending the two ministries. However, for all three age groups, their participation is primarily in ministries for their own spiritual growth; a much lower percentage is found involved in service to others, such as ministries to youth, children, and immigrants.

There is a definite increase in ministry involvement over the life stages from young adults to adults, to seniors, both in ministries of service to others (54 young adults taking 22 ministry roles, 40 adults taking 18, and 6 seniors taking 7) as well as in taking leadership positions in ministries for both their own spiritual growth as well as for service to others (54 young adults taking 35 positions, 40 adults taking 35, and 6 seniors taking 14 positions of leadership). This increase in involvement over the life stages may also be explained by another factor—the number of years as Christians: with a higher percentage of younger Christians less than 3 years among the young adults—26 percent versus 18 percent among the adults, and none among the seniors; and an increasing percentage of older Christians as the groups progress in life stages: those who have been Christians between 3 and 5 years—26 percent and

25 percent respectively among young adults and adults, but 33 percent among seniors; those who have been Christians for 6 years and more—43 percent among young adults, 55 percent among adults, and 67 percent among seniors. In other words, ministry leadership increases as they progress in life stage maturity as well as in spiritual age as Christians. However, the percentage tabulation of seniors may not be an accurate picture of reality, since there are only 6 respondents, and 3 of them have been Christians for over 10 years; therefore, they are excluded in the following ratings on how they live out their faith in terms of relationships, contexts, and other aspects. Although there are also those who have been Christians for over 10 years in the other two groups, they do not affect the percentage as much as they do the senior group due to the much larger number of young adults (54) and adults (40).

It is significant that while both young adults and adults rated quite high ("Good") in their relationship with God (60 percent and 54 percent respectively), in the context of Church (65 percent and 70 percent respectively), and in their character (58 percent and 59 percent respectively), such implications of spirituality do not seem to translate into their day to day living, as is reflected in their lower ratings of relationships with significant people in the various contexts and aspects of their lives. For example, the lowest "Good" rating of relationship for young adults and adults is with their bosses—only 27 percent and 4 percent respectively, and the rating is only a little higher with their children at 50 percent and 47 percent respectively, but both the relationships with their bosses and with their children obviously trail behind their 60 percent and 54 percent relationship with God respectively. The adults' improved relationship with their bosses over that of young adults may be due to the latter's difficult adjustments in the early years at work; but their relationships with their children remain stable

(50 percent and 47 percent respectively). In terms of context, the lowest "Good" rating for young adults and adults is with the world at 25 percent and 28 percent, and with society at 40 percent and 30 percent respectively; ratings that trail far behind that of the Church at 65 percent and 70 percent respectively. In other aspects, the lowest "Good" ratings of young adults and adults are in social justice at 23 percent and 18 percent respectively, followed by stewardship of money at 23 percent and 29 percent respectively, in contrast to their "Good" ratings at 58 percent and 59 percent respectively in regards to character.

In comparing the responses by life stages above, there is little indication of a consistent progression in terms of their significant relationships in the various contexts and other aspects of their daily lives, although there is obvious progression in terms of their participation and leadership in ministries. By contrast, their high "Good" ratings of living out their faith in relationship with God, in the context of the church, and in their character do not seem to carry over to affect their relationships with their bosses and their children, in the contexts of society and the world, and in the areas of social justice and stewardship. This raises the question of whether such increasing involvements in ministries and leadership corresponds to genuine Christian spiritual growth as they mature through life. Pastoral leaders in the evangelical Chinese American Church must not equate ministry participation with spiritual growth; rather, they must work to cultivate authentic faith.

Spiritual Needs by Years of Conversion (Appendix B2):

Since this survey is interested in the spiritual needs of those who have been Christians within the last ten years, the data of 19 persons (including 6 who gave no answer) who have been Christians for over 10 years are excluded from all tabulations of this second set of data.

Aiming at discovering the kind of progress made in their faith journey, it compares the self-ratings of three groups of respondents—30 who have been Christian less than 3 years, 24 who have been Christian for 3 to 5 years, and 27 who have been Christian for 6 to 10 years. In terms of their ministry attendance, the highest rating for all three groups is Fellowship attendance, but it declines slightly over the three periods of conversion, from 87 percent to 83 percent to 81 percent respectively, indicating a decrease in interest or in the perceived need for community support and encouragement. Worship attendance remains constant at 67 percent for those within the first 5 years since conversion and increases slightly to 70 percent for those over 5 years since conversion, revealing the perception of the importance or obligation of worship attendance among evangelical Chinese American Christians. Bible Study attendance increases slightly from 63 percent among young Christians of less than 3 years to 67 percent among those who have been Christian for over 3 years, indicating the high regard for Bible Study in general over the years as Christians.

While participation in service ministries to others is much less than that in ministries for their own spiritual growth, there is a definite increase in participation in service ministries as they grow in their years of conversion, from 30 persons taking 7 ministry roles in the first group (less than 3 years), to 24 persons taking 10 roles in the second group (3 to 5 years), and to 27 persons taking 20 roles in the third group (5 to 10 years) in service ministries such as youth, children, and immigrants. The progress is even more obvious when taking up leadership positions both for ministries for their own growth and those for service to others, from a total of 30 persons taking 8 leadership positions in the first group (less than 3 years), to 24 persons

taking 10 positions in the second group (3 to 5 years), and to 27 persons taking 24 positions in the third group (5 to 10 years).

However, in terms of living out their faith in relationships in the various contexts and other aspects of their daily lives, the rating is found to be most favorable for the youngest Christians of less than 3 years, especially in comparison with those who have been Christians for 3 to 5 years. The respondents of the first group (less than 3 years) rated their best relationship with God at 70 percent, but the self-ratings decline to 57 percent and 56 percent respectively for the second (3 to 5 years) and the third (over 5 years) groups. Such a decline in relationship with God seems to correlate directly with the decline in their relationships with people. For example, the first group rated as the poorest their relationship with their boss (at 47 percent, declining to 25 percent and 29 percent respectively for the second and the third groups); next poorest was the relationship with their children (at 50 percent for the first group, declining to 25 percent for the second, yet rising to 56 percent for the third group). The highest ratings for living out their faith were found in the context of the church (at 82 percent for the first group, but declining to 59 percent and 56 percent respectively for the second and the third groups); the lowest ratings for living out their faith was in the context of the world (at 30 percent and 32 percent for the first and second groups respectively, declining to 27 percent for the third group); the next lowest rating of 50 percent was at work for the first group, declining to 38 percent and 40 percent respectively for the second and the third groups. The highest ratings of living out their faith in other respects was for character (at 78 percent for the first group, declining to 45 percent and 52 percent respectively for the second and third groups); the

lowest ratings for living out their faith were for social justice (at 21 percent for the first group, rising slightly to 25 percent and 29 percent respectively for the second and the third groups).

In comparing the responses of the three groups by their years since conversion, those who had been Christians for less than 3 years rated highest in living out their faith in almost every respect than their older counterparts, while those had been Christians for 3 to 5 years rated much lower in almost every respect. Although those who had been Christians for 6 to 10 years usually improve in relationship over Christians for 3 to 5 years, they still rated lower than the youngest Christians in living out their faith! It is therefore reasonable to postulate that first, the window of opportunity for discipling Christians is during the first three years after their conversion when they are still enthusiastic about their new-found faith; second, the lowest retention rate or highest drop-out rate probably occurs around 3 to 5 years of their faith journey as Christians; and third, the definite increase in participation and leadership in ministries the longer they become Christians do not seem to contribute to growth in their faith in terms of relationships with significant people in the various contexts and aspects of their lives. To the contrary, the increasing involvement in ministries the longer they become Christians may create a false perception to themselves and to Church leaders of genuine spiritual growth. Pastoral leaders of the Church must be aware of the danger of such a false perception; and put people in ministry roles and leadership positions only according to their levels of spiritual maturity and as required by the respective ministries.

Spiritual Needs by Gender (Appendix B3):

The third set of data with 42 male and 45 female survey respondents who have been Christians for 10 years or less aims at discovering how gender affects the way they live out their

faith, so that spiritual needs and challenges unique to men and to women may be identified. In terms of attendance in ministries, the highest combined percentage of respondents is found in Worship—70 percent male and 58 percent female; followed by Fellowship—55 percent male and 69 percent female; Prayer—67 percent male and 51 percent female; and Bible Study—64 percent male and 51 percent female. It is interesting to note that consistently 12–16 percent more men than women attend the various church ministries for spiritual growth except Fellowship, which is attended by 14 percent more women than men. Few men and women, especially men, participate in ministries of service to others such as youth and children, and various kinds of immigrant ministries—42 men participate in only 12 ministry roles while 45 women participate in 25 ministry roles. In terms of ministry leadership, men take up 18 out of 19 leadership positions in ministries for spiritual growth such as Worship, Fellowship, Prayer, and Bible Study; but only 1 out of 19 leadership positions in ministries for service to others. Apparently, men are more interested in leadership roles in the public realm in which they are recognized, but much less so in the private realm in service to others. On the other hand, women take up 14 out of 23 leadership positions in ministries for spiritual growth; 9 out of 23 leadership positions in ministries for service to others, which reflects the more nurturing characteristics of women than men.

In terms of relationships in the various contexts and aspects of daily lives, the highest "Good" rating of significant relationships is God at 66 percent versus 57 percent for men and women respectively; and the lowest "Good" rating is Boss at 40 percent versus 28 percent for men and women respectively; the next lowest "Good" rating being Children at 55 percent versus 37 percent by men and women respectively. Both men and women rated most highly in

living out their faith in the context of the church at 60 percent versus 56 percent respectively; and lowest in the World at 31 percent versus 27 percent respectively. Men and women also gave the highest self-ratings in terms of their Character at 64 percent versus 56 percent respectively; and lowest in Social Justice at 16 percent versus 32 percent respectively.

It is significant to note that men responded more positively than women in all relationships, with the greatest discrepancies found between their ratings of "Good" relationships with Spouse (68 percent by men versus 34 percent by women) and with Children (55 percent by men versus 37 percent by women), meaning 34 percent and 18 percent respectively lower ratings by women than by men, which correspond to the 10 percent discrepancy of their ratings of living out their faith in the Home—51 percent by men versus 41 percent by women. There is also a discrepancy between men and women regarding their ratings of Boss and Work at 12 percent and 7 percent respectively. The only significant discrepancies of higher ratings by women than by men are in Social Justice: 32 percent versus 16 percent respectively; and in stewardship of Time and Money: 36 percent and 34 percent respectively by women versus 16 percent and 26 percent by men.

Comparing the responses of men and women reveals that women in general are not only under more pressure than men in marriage and in parenting, they are experiencing a more difficult time than men even in the workplace. These responses imply the possibility that in double-income families, which is the case in most Chinese immigrant families, the women carry a heavier load and experience more stress than men, especially with the demands of parenting children toward high academic achievements, a role usually taken for granted as being the

mothers' responsibility on top of their professions that are often just as demanding as their husbands'.

Conclusion: A Challenge to Authentic Faith

This chapter set out to explore the lived experience of first-generation Chinese immigrants in North America and how their responses to challenges they face in the family and in the workplace affect their new-found Christian faith. A tentative conclusion drawn from my own observation based on two decades of ministering directly and indirectly with them is that their obsession with the academic achievement of their children is "the factor" or at least "one of the major factors" that significantly impacts their value system and hinders their spiritual growth. To verify and to understand the phenomenon further, relevant literature research in various sociological fields are carried out. The result of understanding their challenges and responses experienced in the family leads to the discovery that the traditional Chinese parenting style accounts for their deteriorating parent-child relationship as well as their adolescent children's poor psychological and sociological adjustments. The result of understanding their challenges and responses in the workplace leads to the discovery of various frustrations that first-generation immigrants experience, which may very well have caused them to put pressure on their children to excel academically, so that they may have a more successful professional future and are subject to less discrimination in society than their parents are.

To find out more specifically how their lived experience as verified by the literature review affects the way first-generation Chinese Christians in North America live out their faith, a survey has been conducted of 100 first-generation Chinese American Christians in terms of

their ministry participation and leadership as well as their relationship with significant people in their lives; and three sets of data have been collected, tabulated, and analyzed. Results from all three sets of data consistently show that no matter how you break down the groups—by life stages, by years of conversion, or by genders—the various groups of respondents rated very high if not the highest in their relationship with God, but rated very low, if not the lowest, in their relationship with their Boss and with their Children. They rated very high if not the highest in living out their faith in the context of church but very low if not the lowest in the context of the World and Society. They rated very high if not the highest in Character, but very low if not the lowest, in Social Justice and in Stewardship of Money. Is it possible that their increasingly active participation in Worship, Fellowship, Prayer, and Bible Study, and their perceived good relationship with God, their good experience at Church, and their high regard for personal Character give them the false assurance that all is well with their spiritual life? This then raises the question of the authenticity of their Christian faith, as their perceived spiritual well-being does not carry over to impact their relationships with their Children at Home, with their Boss at Work, with their stewardship of Money, or with victims of injustice in the larger Society and in the World! In the light of the urgent need to cultivate authentic faith among first-generation Chinese Americans, major root causes of their inconsistencies between faith and practice must be explored, which is the focus of the next chapter.

Chapter 3

The Interpretive Task: Why Is This Going On?

Introduction: Causes of Chinese Immigrants' Response to Challenges

The descriptive task in chapter 2 documenting Chinese immigrants' responses to challenges in their lived experience in the home and in the workplace, and a survey of 100 first-generation Chinese immigrants who have become Christians together reveal an obvious inconsistency between their belief and practice in terms of their various relationships and responsibility toward the larger community and the world. It then leads to Osmer's next question "Why is this going on?" regarding the interpretive task, which aims at drawing from theories and research findings in interdisciplinary fields to understand some of the major root causes behind their response to challenges that has brought about such an inconsistency between their belief and practice.

The three most relevant fields to be explored in this chapter are: first, the deep-rooted cultural tradition and values from the Confucian philosophy that the first-generation Chinese immigrants consciously or unconsciously carry with them from their home country; second, the sociological assimilation theories that explain the attitudes and behaviors of Chinese immigrants in pursuing the American dream in the host country; and third, the historical spiritual heritage of the evangelical Chinese Church as affected by the lives and ministries of three well-respected spiritualities in the kinds of ministries offered and ways they are conducted that help or hinder the immigrants' spiritual growth in their Christian faith. A preliminary understanding of these three interdisciplinary fields reveals that while Chinese

immigrants have been positively affected by the Confucian Chinese culture, by the process of assimilation into the American society, and by the evangelical Chinese Church heritage, it is their misinterpretation and superficial application of Confucian philosophy, along with their over-eager concerns about their and their children's assimilation into the mainstream North American society that is hindered by discrimination that may have led to Chinese immigrants' preoccupation with their children's academic achievements; and that the evangelical Chinese American Church is inadequate at challenging their inconsistencies and in providing the church culture and spiritual formation ministries for discipling them.

Cultural Tradition and Values of Chinese Immigrants

A Literature Review:

The oldest and most revered philosophy of China's cultural values and classical tradition is Confucianism.[149] Three books written in English by renowned scholars of Confucian studies have been selected to try to understand the classical Confucian philosophy that explains why Chinese immigrants place so much emphasis and effort on education. The first one, *Confucianism*, by Paul R. Goldin, Professor and Chair of the Department of East Asian Languages and Civilizations at the University of Pennsylvania, presents a concise overview of the tradition, with special focus on Confucius' sayings from authoritative primary and secondary sources.[150] The second one is *An Introduction to Confucianism* by Xinzhong Yao, a Chinese scholar with doctorates from the People's University of China, Beijing and from the University of Wales, the Department Chair of Theology and Religious Studies at the University of Wales, and the author

[149] Paul R. Goldin, *Confucianism* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 2011), 1.
[150] Ibid., back cover.

of five books including *Confucianism and Christianity*, who employs both traditional and contemporary scholarship to present a "rounded account of Confucian thought, ethics, ritual and spirituality."[151] The lead author of the third book, *Confucianism: A Short Introduction*, is John H. Berthrong, Director of the Institute for Dialogue Among Religious Traditions and Assistant Professor of Comparative Religion in the School of Theology at Boston University. This book offers a "fascinating insight, not only into the intellectual and scholarly aspects of Confucianism, but also into the nature of belief, culture and society in a living philosophical tradition."[152]

On Confucius and Confucianism:

Based on Chinese tradition 儒家 the doctrine/tradition of scholars originated long before the time of Confucius. Subsequently Confucianism was formulated and propagated as the pathway to peace and harmony by Confucius (551–479 BCE) and his disciples, most prominent among them Mengzi (372–289 BCE) and Zunzi (313-238?).[153] Confucianism was introduced to the Western world in the sixteenth century by the Italian Jesuit Matteo Ricci (1552–1610) and his fellow Jesuit missionaries, who were responsible for the origin of the very name "Confucius," a Latinization of his Chinese title "Kong Fuzi" 孔夫子, meaning "Revered Master Kong."[154] Ricci was also known for his devotion to the studies of the Confucian classics, and was credited for the translation into Latin of the Confucian Classic *Four Books*.[155]

[151] Xinzhong Yao, *An Introduction to Confucianism* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2000), back cover.

[152] John H. and Evelyn Nagai Berthrong, *Confucianism: A Short Introduction* (2000; repr., Oxford, UK: Oneworld Publications, 2004), back cover.

[153] Yao, xiv, 7, and 17.

[154] Goldin, 4; Yao, 1 and 16.

[155] Yao, 238.

As for Confucius' life, very little is known of it, other than the tradition that he may have served as Master of Justice in his home state of Lu; that it was out of frustration with his ruler who would not listen to his advice that he took a trip to the various states to search for old records of early sage kings; that during this trip he attracted dozens of disciples who wanted to learn from him; and that he lived to be over seventy years of age.[156] He was famous for being the first private teacher and "Teacher of the Ten thousand Generations," because he was willing to teach anyone who was eager to learn, regardless of their social ranking, at a time when only sons of nobles who had government connections could be recruited to attend schools run by the states.[157] Confucius did not leave behind any written work, although the redaction of several canonical texts were unconvincingly attributed to him; however, after his death, his disciples selected for posterity's sake what they considered to be the most important sayings they could remember from their encounters with him, and produced the *Analects*, meaning "selected" sayings, the first fifteen chapters of which Goldin regards as the most authoritative sayings of Confucius.[158]

On Virtue and Ritual:

The so-called Way of Confucianism is structured around three ultimate powers of the universe, the origin of all things: 'Heaven generates them; earth nourishes them; and humans perfect them.' These are also presented as three modes of the same Way: the Way of Heaven, the Way of the Earth, and the Way of Humans.[159] As heaven is conceived to be the "ultimate

[156] Goldin, 12; Berthrong, 46–47.
[157] Berthrong, 46.
[158] Goldin, 8 and 11.
[159] Yao, 139.

principle of transcendence" and the "embodiment and source of moral virtues," those who follow the Way of Heaven lead a virtuous life, and will be endowed by Heaven with honors such as humaneness, righteousness, and sincerity. If these are sought after first, then honors endowed by humans, such as positions and ranks in the government, will follow naturally.[160] Just as Heaven is above the earth, so "the sovereign is placed over his ministers and subjects, parents over their children, and a husband over his wife."[161] The Way of Humans is the way of moral life that can be achieved by preserving their hearts and minds through "self-cultivation" and "education."[162]

Confucianism believes that humans are endowed by Heaven to have a heart for the Way, which provides the foundation and resources for them to be good; therefore, they are responsible for the transformation of their own characters by engaging in self-cultivation of their hearts and minds, and are not to blame others or the external circumstances for their moral failures.[163] According to Goldin's understanding of Confucianism, moral self-cultivation is a process of "reflection on one's own behavior and concerted improvement where it is found lacking"; and by so perfecting oneself, "one also contributes to the project of perfecting the world."[164] Confucius holds that humans have the potential to be good through self-cultivation and to know how to become good by observing and meditating on heavenly principles manifested in nature, society, and individuals, and by mastering the classics to live by the rules of propriety.[165] Then every intention of the heart and every action in daily life is in full

[160] Yao, 147–148.
[161] Ibid., 148.
[162] Ibid., 153–154.
[163] Ibid., 157.
[164] Goldin, 5.
[165] Yao, 158.

agreement with the Way of Heaven, the achievement of which enables a person to "follow whatever his heart desires, but never go beyond the boundaries of the Way" (*Analects*, 2:4).[166]

The cornerstone of Confucian ethics is *shu*, meaning reciprocity. Similar to Jesus' Golden Rule, it is about placing oneself in others' position: "What you yourself do not desire, do not do to others" (*Analects* 15:23), and this one should practice in every area of one's life.[167] *Shu* is also the one thing that Confucius considered connects all virtues that govern external behaviors, as expressed in "rituals" or "rites."[168] Though commonly understood as codes of conduct, Confucius distinguished between rituals and rites as follows:[169]

> If you guide them with legislation, and unify them with punishments, then the people will avoid the punishments but have no conscience. If you guide them with virtue, and unify them with ritual, then they will have a conscience; moreover, they will correct themselves. (*Analects* 2.3)

Take the example of a traffic light. Even a wicked person stops at the red light, but doing so has nothing to do with his/her internal morality or virtue, for that person does it only to avoid punishment; but internal virtue expressed in external ritual can help in moral self-cultivation.[170] Therefore, in Confucius' view, ritual is best understood as "embodied virtue, the thoughtful somatic expression of basic moral principles" and "the sum total of all the moral calculations that a thinking Confucian must go through before acting."[171]

On Learning and Examination:

[166] Yao, 158.
[167] Goldin, 15–16.
[168] Ibid., 19.
[169] Ibid., 20.
[170] Ibid., 21.
[171] Ibid., 22.

In the Confucian tradition, the superiority of knowledge as a means of self-cultivation and moral development is well expressed in the text of the *Great Learning*, which holds that the investigation and understanding of "the underlying pattern of the cosmos by studying the rhythms and correspondences of things in nature" leads to the attainment of knowledge, by which a person can make his intentions sincere. As a result of that, he can rectify his heart, and in turn he can cultivate himself 修身, then he can regulate his family 齊家, then he can order his state 治國, and consequently the world will be at peace 平天下.[172] In other words, the attainment of knowledge is not for the sake of gaining fame or status in the world for oneself, but for the sake of becoming a better person from one's heart internally to one's conduct externally, then extending one's moral influence to regulate the family, the state, leading ultimately to peace in the world.

While learning and education are highly regarded in the Confucian tradition, one of the most important concepts that can be drawn from Confucius' teaching is often neglected by people who understand his emphasis on the importance of education being that worldly success is not the ultimate goal in life; rather, for Confucius the aim of education is "faithfulness to the task and a balanced personality."[173] As in Confucius' conception education should result in the cultivation of the "noble man," he made the following contrasts between the "noble man" and the "petty man": "The noble man is persuaded by righteousness; the petty man is persuaded by profit" (Analects 4.16); and "The noble man contemplates virtue; the petty man contemplates territory" (Analects 4:11).[174] It is apparent also in Goldin's summary of Confucius'

[172] Goldin, 33.
[173] Berthrong, 66.
[174] Goldin, 118–119.

view of an ideal man: “He loves learning, lives up to his words, and thinks about his relationships with others, and acts accordingly”[175] which, along with other direct sayings of Confucius, implies that learning leads to right character, right relationship with people, and right behaviors in accordance with the acquired knowledge, while worldly successes never seem to be part of his equation, for the latter only makes one a “petty man,” who is persuaded by “profit” and contemplates “territory.” The *Analects* records as follows Confucius’ miniature autobiography of how he became a noble man by beginning with learning:[176]

> The Master said, “At fifteen, I made learning my aspiration. At thirty, I was established. At forty, I was not deluded. At fifty, I knew Heaven’s Mandate. At sixty, my ear was compliant. At seventy, I could follow the desires of my heart without overstepping the bounds.” (*Analects* 2.4)

The idea that learning and education lead to worldly success may have originated from the establishment of the imperial civil service examinations as a method to select imperial officials. The institution of examinations occurred during the Han Dynasty (206 BCE – 220 CE) when in 130s BCE, the Han Emperor Wu made the Confucian texts the official orthodoxy. This lasted until 1905 CE when the imperial civil service examinations system based on Confucian teachings was abolished and replaced by modern Western education.[177] That means the institution of examinations lasted over two thousand years!

By the time of the Song dynasty (960 CE – 1279 CE), the imperial examinations in three levels, open to all men, became the norm and key to social advancement, because those who passed the first district level examinations were accepted to the honorable literati class; those

[175] Goldin, 120.
[176] Ibid., 116.
[177] Berthrong, 49.

who passed the second provincial level would gain official employment; and the names of scholars who successfully passed the final national level of examinations would be presented to the emperor for imperial services.[178] Although this imperial civil service examination institution had long since been abolished, examinations on the provincial and national levels as a way to climb the social ladder of worldly success remain a reality even to this day both in Mainland China and perhaps to a lesser degree in other Chinese Diaspora such as Singapore, where the Chinese people are in the majority of government leadership. The keen academic competitive spirit is apparent in the widespread practice of schools in Mainland China that makes public students' class ranking from the first to the last in every single subject, which explains why Tiger Mom wants her daughters to be number one in every subject.

Although for centuries since Confucius, the Chinese people have tried to get into the cultural elite class and gain worldly success by passing examinations, this was never the original intention of Confucius or his immediate followers. Self-cultivation through education was meant to impact the family, then the state, then the rest of the world. Long before Han Emperor Wu, Confucius (551–479 BCE) had already begun advising this ruler, and his followers kept telling later rulers that they needed the cultural elite to help them rule and that they were obligated to listen to the cultural elite's advice.[179] The *Analects* tells of an incident in which one of his disciples, using an analogy, confronted Confucius for teaching on the sidelines instead of expanding his influence by entering the political arena, "There is a beautiful jade here. Should we enclose it in a case and store it, or should we seek a good price and sell it?" Confucius

[178] Berthrong, 78.
[179] Ibid.

answered, “Sell it! Sell it! I am waiting for the right price” (*Analects* 9:12). What he meant was that while he welcomed the opportunity to serve in the government, he would keep himself off the labor market until his services were appreciated.[180]

On Filial Piety and Expostulation:

Before Confucius, filial piety had to do showing reverence to one’s ancestors by offering sacrifices on their behalf. Confucius and his disciples radically reinterpreted filial piety to mean reverence of parents not only after their death, but while they were still living.[181] For Confucius said, “What is ‘filial’ nowadays refers to the ability to feed one’s parents. Even dogs and horses can be fed. If one is not reverent, wherein lies the difference?” (*Analects* 2:7)[182] In the Chinese culture, with moral development beginning in the family, and “filial piety” being the apex of family virtues, the metaphor extends to the larger society, and the emperor, referred to as the “Son of Heaven,” is likened to the father of the country.[183] Filial piety is meant to be practiced from the highest ruler to the lowliest people in society, for it is taken for granted that “he who loves his parents does not dare to hate others; he who reverences his parents does not dare to act contemptuously toward others”; and “if the highest ruler is the Son of Heaven, the *Classic of Filial Piety* teaches that common people are obligated to follow the Way of Heaven.”[184] The primary purpose of filial training was to “prepare children for an independent moral life of their own,” not to justify either parents’ excessive control over their children or children’s

[180] Goldin, 29–30.
[181] Ibid., 34.
[182] Ibid.
[183] Ibid.; Berthrong, 57.
[184] Berthrong, 58–59.

subordination to their parents.[185] Indeed, the *Canon of Filial Piety* 1, in circulation by the third century BCE, records Confucius' words to Master Zeng as follows:[186]

> Filial piety is the root of virtue and the origin of instruction. You received your self, your body, your hair, and your skin from your mother and father: not daring to destroy or injure these gifts is the beginning of filial piety. Establishing oneself, practicing the Way, and displaying one's name unto later generations in order to manifest one's mother and father is the end of filial piety. The beginning of filial piety is serving one's parents; the middle is serving one's ruler; the end is establishing oneself.

Therefore, it is one's own virtuous life and not mindless service that brings the greatest honor and glory to one's parents. This understanding obligates the children even to confront their parents respectfully if they fall into unrighteousness, as instructed by Confucius in the *Canon of Filial Piety* 15:

> The Son of Heaven had seven ministers to expostulate with him…. The feudal lords had five ministers…. The grand masters had three ministers…. If a father has a son to expostulate with him, he will not fall into unrighteousness. Thus, whenever there is unrighteousness, a son cannot but expostulate with his father….

However, Confucius recognized that expostulating with parents was an extremely difficult task, so he warned the son, "acting as a son" to remain respectful and not to disobey when his parents do not listen to his advice, but to "toil and not complain" (*Analects* 4:18).[187] In other words, Confucius does not allow a son to take his parents' wrongdoings as reasons for him to stop showing filial respect; instead the son is to endure his lot; hence "toil and not complain."[188]

On Authority and Responsibility:

[185] Goldin, 35.
[186] Ibid.
[187] Ibid.
[188] Ibid., 28.

Regarding the rulers' or the government's authority and responsibility, and the citizens' obligation toward them, the Confucian tradition persistently reminds those in authority that "heaven hears as the people hear, heaven speaks as the people speak" and that "the only thing that heaven wants to hear is good reports from the people about the ruler."[189] The Chinese character for "government" derives from the word for "correction," and indeed Confucius regarded government as an agent of moral correction, and the ruler's behavior as exemplary for his subjects. For Confucius said of the ruler, "If he himself is rectified, his will is carried out even if he does not command it; if he himself is not rectified, his will is not followed even if he does command it" (*Analects* 13.6).[190]

Another famous remark Confucius made regarding what he considered to be appropriate behavior primarily for those in authority was that, "The Lord acts as a lord, the minister as a minister, the father as a father, the son as a son" (*Analects* 12.11). In short, people must act in accordance with their social status, such that the lord or ruler is obligated to live up to the moral demands of his position as a ruler, so that a worthy role model may be demonstrated for his subjects to follow in their own moral self-cultivation.[191] If the ruler fails to live up to such moral demands, similar to the son's responsibility to his father portrayed above, his ministers have the responsibility to expostulate with him, so that he does not "lose the world" even if he is about to "act without the Way" (*Canon of Filial Piety* 15).[192]

[189] Berthrong, 49.
[190] Goldin, 23.
[191] Ibid., 25.
[192] Ibid., 36.

It is also the Confucian belief that the ruler's only claim to Heaven's Mandate is "a just, harmonious, and peaceful social order"; therefore, Mencius, a prominent disciple, justified the famous Confucian right of revolt that when a ruler becomes unjust or tyrannical, the people have the right to replace him with a better ruler.[193]

Relevance of Confucianism to Chinese Immigrants:

From the above discussion of the four major aspects of Confucianism—virtue and ritual, learning and examination, filial piety and expostulation, and authority and responsibility—it is apparent that while Chinese immigrants are proud of their deep-rooted Confucian culture, they often hold on to only an external form of the philosophy while missing its essence, and it is this that has led to their failures in applying Confucianism appropriately to their lives.

On virtue and ritual: It is common for Chinese immigrants to have a high view on moral character and make conscientious efforts to cultivate it, which is the reason for the high self-rating on their own character. However, they may not consciously prioritize the pursuit of such moral character over the pursuit of position and rank in society, as advised by the Confucian Way. In addition, the complexity and busy-ness of contemporary American life make it difficult for Chinese immigrants to reflect and meditate for the cultivation of their hearts—the inner intention and motives of their outward actions—as Confucius advocates. They also tend to accept rather easily the hierarchy of ruler over subordinates, parents over children, and husband over wife, which sometimes results in imposing unreasonable demands on those below them in the hierarchy, particular in our case, their children.

[193] Berthrong, 49.

On Learning and Examinations: Learning is another aspect of Confucian culture to whose external form Chinese immigrants hold while overlooking its essence. The over 2000-year, deep-rooted imperial civil service examination institution has brought about the obsessive and excessive emphasis on acquiring knowledge and striving for excellent performance or being number one on examinations without understanding Confucius' goal of education as being self-cultivation and moral development rather than gaining fame or climbing the social ladder of worldly success. Given the priority of moral development in the Confucian tradition being from the self to the family, to the state, then to the world, and given the overwhelming effort already spent on the family, Chinese immigrants have little energy left for the development of the larger society; hence the overall lack of involvement in the community, especially in the work of social justice.

On Filial Piety and Expostulation: This is another aspect of the Confucian culture that has been gravely misunderstood, misinterpreted, and misapplied by the Chinese people. While the practice of filial piety is honorable, the purpose for doing so is often neglected. According to Confucius, the purpose of filial piety is preparing children for independent moral life, rather than giving parents excessive control over their children's life and career choices, or just for the sake of submitting children to their authority. Even less acceptable to Chinese parents is to be shown disapproval by their children when they themselves are going the wrong way, leaving their demands on children totally unchecked.

On Authority and Responsibility: Given the deep-rooted respect for authority as prescribed by the Confucian culture, the abusive use of power is common among authorities on the top of the hierarchical structures, whether it be in the family, the church, the workplace, or

the community. Chinese immigrants are hardly aware of the Confucian teaching on their right and responsibility to protest and to fight against injustices. That is probably the reason why in the Survey of Chinese Immigrants' lived experience, among the lowest self-ratings in terms of living out their Christian faith is in society and in the world.

Assimilation Theories on Immigrants in the North American Context

Apart from Confucianism that Chinese immigrants bring with them from their home country, another field to be explored as relevant to their attitude and behavior in the context of their host country is that of assimilation theories.

A Literature Review:

Sociology Professors Alba and Nee define "theory" as "the approximately true description of the underlying causes of what one seeks to explain."[194] Since immigrants from different parts of the world come to North America at various times, bringing with them vastly different cultures, and since they are variously received by mainstream American society, the social conditions of which change over time; so too must a "true description" of the underlying causes of their behaviors and attitudes be multiple. This section explores some underlying sociological causes for Mainland Chinese immigrants' responses to the challenges of living in North America during the last three decades since the 1990s. To that end, various sociological theories and their proponents in contemporary society relevant to Chinese immigrants are selected for the study. For a general background study on immigrants' assimilation process to America life, Milton M. Gordon's classic work *Assimilation in American Life* is chosen, because it

[194] Richard Alba and Victor Nee, *Remaking the American Mainstream: Assimilation and Contemporary Immigration* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2003), 9.

is recognized as "the first full-scale sociological survey of the assimilation of minority groups in America."[195] The author of this winner of two national awards, and of one of the most widely cited books in the field of racial and ethnic group relations, Gordon received his PhD from Columbia University, had been on the faculties of the University of Pennsylvania, Haverford College, and Wellesley College, and is now Professor Emeritus of Sociology at the University of Massachusetts, Amherst.[196]

A more recent work on the systematic treatment of assimilation since the mid-1960s, and also winner of two book awards, is *Remaking the American Mainstream: Assimilation and Contemporary Immigration* by Richard Alba and Victor Nee.[197] Due to the fact that the landmark Immigration Act of 1965 unexpectedly caused extensive chain migration from Asia through the family reunification option and changed the racial and ethnic composition of major cities and regions of America, Alba and Nee propose a new assimilation theory that understands contemporary assimilation in America not as a linear process of ethnic obliteration that the classical assimilation theory perceives, but as one in which minority and majority cultures converge, causing changes not only among immigrants but among American society as well.[198] The book is selected not only for its understanding of the new assimilation theory that reflects the contemporary immigrant phenomenon, but also because it includes research and discussion on the convergence in the average socioeconomic life chances of US-born

[195] Milton M. Gordon, *Assimilation in American Life: The Role of Race, Religion, and National Origins* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1964), back cover.

[196] "Milton M. Gordon," John Simon Guggenheim Memorial Foundation, accessed 9/25/2018, https://www.gf.org/fellows/all-fellows/milton-m-gordon/.

[197] Alba and Nee, back cover.

[198] Ibid., 35–36.

descendants of Chinese immigrants.[199] The two authors, Richard Alba and Victor Nee, are Professors of Sociology at the State University of New York and at Cornell University respectively.

A couple of journal articles published in the last decade have also been selected for this study due to the relevance of various views and theories as applied to the achievements of first-generation immigrants from Asia and their native-born children, which partially explains the reasons for the Chinese American's preoccupation with their children's education discussed in Chapter 2. One of the articles, "Have Asian American Men Achieved Labor Market Parity with White Men?" by Chang Hwan Kim, Assistant Professor of Sociology at the University of Kansas, and Arthur Sakamoto, Professor of Sociology at the University of Texas at Austin, discusses the relevance of the racialized hierarchy view, the demographic heterogeneity approach, assimilation theory, and segmented assimilation theory as applied to Asian American men's achievement of labor market parity with White men.[200] Kim's research interests include inequality, racial/ethnic relations, and statistics; and Professor Sakamoto's research interests include social stratification, labor markets, and racial/ethnic relations.[201] The other article, "Confucius or Mozart? Community Cultural Wealth and Upward Mobility Among Children of Chinese Immigrants" by Wei-Ting Lee, PhD in Sociology and Education from The Graduate Center, City University of New York, applies the Community Cultural Wealth Model, in contrast to the segmented assimilation theory, to explain the minority culture of mobility among

[199] Alba and Nee, 78–83, 90–94.

[200] Chang Hwan Kim and Arthur Sakamoto, "Have Asian American Men Achieved Labor Market Parity with White Men?" *American Sociological Review* 75, no. 6 (December 2010), 934–957.

[201] Ibid., 957.

children of Chinese immigrants in a Chinese community in a New York City borough of Queens.[202]

Classic Assimilation Theory:

Milton Gordon's classic work *Assimilation in American Life* presents three historic ideological tendencies of the assimilation of immigrants into the American way of life, namely "Anglo-conformity," which demands a complete renunciation of the immigrants' ancestral cultures to adopt the core values of the Anglo-Saxon culture; "melting pot," which favors a blending of the various immigrant ancestral cultures with that of the Anglo-Saxon into a new indigenous American culture; and "cultural pluralism," which postulates the preservation of a significant part of the cultural and communal life of the newer immigrants within the context of American citizenship and political economic integration into American society.[203] The common attitude of the "Anglo-conformity" ideology ranges from racial superiority of the Anglo-Saxon to a lack of opposition toward immigrants regardless of their ancestral origins, so long as they and their descendants adopt the dominant Anglo-Saxon cultural patterns in America.[204] The so-called "melting pot" ideology that favors a blending together culturally and biologically (through intermarriage) in the political pot to form a distinctly new product is in reality primarily the melting of non-English immigrants who lose their group identity and transform their cultural heritage into Anglo-Saxon patterns of the dominant English colonists within the three major religious groups: Protestants, Catholics, and Jews.[205] The presumed goal of "cultural pluralism" is

[202] Wei-Ting Lu, "Confucius or Mozart? Community Cultural Wealth and Upward Mobility Among Children of Chinese Immigrants," *Qualitative Sociology* 36, no. 3 (2013), 303–321.

[203] Gordon, 85.

[204] Ibid., 88.

[205] Ibid., 119–129.

"to maintain enough sub-societal separation to guarantee the continuance of the ethnic cultural tradition and the existence of the group," while still carrying out "standard responsibilities to the general American civic life."[206] To Gordon, however, it is more accurate to understand the dominant sociological condition in America as "structural pluralism" rather than "cultural pluralism," because of the structural separation of ethnic groups (separation into various ethnic social cliques, clubs, and institutions), partly due to the prejudices of the majority and partly due to the ethnic groups' desire to maintain their own communal subculture, which may come to a point of being "dysfunctional," which in turn sets up the conditions for ethnic prejudice to grow and flourish.[207]

In this classic work, Gordon lists seven basic subprocesses for identifying the immigrants' assimilation to the host society as follows:[208] 1) change of cultural patterns to those of the host society—acculturation, cultural or behavioral assimilation; 2) large-scale entrance into cliques, clubs, and institutions of host society at a primary level—structural assimilation; 3) large-scale intermarriage—marital assimilation; 4) development of a sense of personhood based exclusively on the host society—identification assimilation; 5) absence of prejudice—attitudinal reception assimilation; 6) absence of discrimination—behavioral reception assimilation; and 7) absence of value and power conflict—civil assimilation. Of these seven subprocesses, Gordon regards structural assimilation to be the keystone of assimilation, because once it takes place, all other types of assimilation automatically follow: the immigrants' large-scale entrance into the social cliques, clubs, and institutions of the host society at the primary group level leads to

[206] Gordon, 158.
[207] Ibid., 235–237.
[208] Ibid., 70–71.

intermarriages; and once marital assimilation takes place, the immigrants lose their ethnic identity; then prejudice and discrimination are typically no longer be a problem, since their descendants become indistinguishable from members of the host society.[209] While the ethnic groups in America tend to stay within their own ethnic group and social class for most of their intimate primary relations, and interact with impersonal secondary group, Gordon hypothesizes that intellectuals—characteristically found in the professions such as college professors, scholars, musicians, artists, etc.,— tend to form sub-social structures of their own, making possible frequent equal-status intimate interactions in their primary group relations, which typically leads to the reduction of prejudice between members of the host society and those of the minority ethnic groups.[210]

New Assimilation Theory:

Given the reality of a more racially diverse mainstream due to the large-scale immigration of Asians in recent decades since the landmark Immigration Act of 1965, which caused the change in the racial and ethnic composition of the American society, Alba and Nee find it necessary to provide new ways of theorizing assimilation.[211] Recognizing ethnicity as essentially a "social boundary," and assimilation as a form of "ethnic change" that may happen to ethnic groups on both sides of the social boundary, they theorize the new assimilation as "the decline of an ethnic distinction and its corollary cultural and social differences," with "decline" meaning that a person's ethnic origins become "less and less relevant in relation to the members of another ethnic group" (not limited to the ethnic majority), for members on

[209] Gordon, 80–81.
[210] Ibid., 224, 234–235.
[211] Alba and Nee, 9–10, 37.

both sides of the boundary consider themselves increasingly similar in terms of other critical factors such as social class.[212] They also cite the prevalence of intermarriage between Whites and Asian Americans as well as the incorporation into the American mainstream of cultural practices and cuisine from East Asia as examples of such a decline of ethnic distinction and social differences.[213]

Along with such a decline, Alba and Nee also report the growing convergence in the average socioeconomic life chances of ethnic groups in comparison with those of the earlier groups of immigrants, with the attainments of some US-born Asian Americans surpassing even those of the average White Americans.[214] One of such growing convergences that are the result of achievement in education can be demonstrated from the 1990 census that compares the percentage of native Chinese Americans born in 1916-1925 with those born in 1956-1965 who have completed four or more years of college education.[215] For men, it grew from 26 percent to 58 percent respectively, and for women, from 14 percent to 61 percent respectively; which were higher than White Americans born over the same two periods: from 15 percent to 25 percent respectively for men, and from 10 percent to 25 percent respectively for women.[216] However, as the researchers rightly point out, such growing convergence in life chances does not necessarily carry over to the absence of discrimination; for there is a wage gap between native-born Whites and Asian Americans with the same educational and occupational

[212] Alba and Nee, 11.
[213] Ibid., 13.
[214] Ibid., 78.
[215] Ibid., 79.
[216] Ibid.

achievements, as well as a glass ceiling that limits the upward mobility of Chinese and Japanese to the highest management levels in the mainstream American corporations.[217]

Other Contemporary Assimilation Theories:

To explain the result of their research findings that Asian American men earn 8 percent less than their White American counterparts, Kim and Sakamoto have explored and applied the Racialized Hierarchy View, the Demographic Heterogeneity Approach, the Assimilation Theory, and the Segmented Assimilation Theory, as presented their findings in their article "Have Asian American Men Achieved Labor Market Parity with White men?"

The approach that best explains their findings is the **Demographic Heterogeneity Approach**, on which Kim and Sakamoto build to investigate additional measures of educational attainment such as field of study, quality of education, cost of living in different regions across the United States, and to distinguish the immigration status of the various groups of Asian Americans in relation to their schooling in the US education system: the US-born who have received their entire education in the US, the 1.0 first generation mature adult immigrants who may have already finished college education abroad before coming to the US, the 1.25 generation immigrants who have come to the US after having completed high school education, and the 1.5 generation adolescent immigrants who have had their high school education in the US.[218] Regarding their educational attainment, all Asian Americans are more likely than Whites to have professional or PhD degrees and to major in the STEM fields (Science, Technology,

[217] Alba and Nee, 81
[218] Kim and Sakamoto, 939.

Engineering, and Math); and except for the first generation immigrants, they are significantly more likely than Whites to have graduated from a research university.[219]

However, despite such higher educational attainment, US-born Asian American men are still making 8 percent lower wages than White men (mean earnings of $69,895 versus $72,438 respectively), although there is no apparent disadvantage before controlling for region of residence; the 1.25 generation Asian American men are earning 11 percent less than their White counterparts after controlling for field of study; the 1.0 first generation Asian American men have the largest earning gap in comparison with White men; and it is only the 1.5 generation Asian American men who tend to earn more than White men, but this can be explained by their field of study, college type, and region of residence.[220] Regions of residence must be factored into the comparison due to the vast difference in costs of living across the states: all Asian American groups are more likely than Whites to live on the West Coast, particularly in states such as California and Hawaii, and 1.0 Asian Americans are more likely than Whites to live on the East Coast in states such as New York, New Jersey, and Pennsylvania, the regions that have the highest cost of living.[221]

The findings of Kim and Sakamoto also confirm the **Racialized Hierarchy View** in the sense that the apparent Asian Americans' socioeconomic parity with White Americans is only due to their higher attainment in education, an evident of their disadvantage due to systematic prejudice and discrimination, which is especially true of the 1.25 generation immigrants.[222]

[219] Kim and Sakamoto, 942.
[220] Ibid., 951, 942.
[221] Ibid., 942.
[222] Ibid., 934, 953.

Their research also finds to be relevant the **Classical Assimilation Theory** that predicts the increase in the immigrants' socioeconomic attainment according to the extent of assimilation and length of time they live in the US, in that the greatest disadvantage is found among Asian Americans of the 1.0 first generation whose college degrees from foreign countries are generally devalued as being of lower quality than those from the US in terms of institutional resources, followed by the 1.25 generation Asian Americans who may lack the fluent English-language skills that the 1.0 first generation Asian Americans have.[223] The **Segmented Assimilation Theory** that suggests immigrants' selective retention of cultural values such as a strong work ethic and saving their money may better equip them for socioeconomic upward mobility is most consistent with the finding that the 1.5 generation Asian Americans have an advantage over their White and US-born Asian American counterparts due to their selection of the STEM fields of study over the financially less profitable fields such as education, arts, the humanities, and social services, which are more likely chosen by Whites and US-born Asian Americans.[224]

Community Cultural Wealth Model:

As theorized by Wei-ting Lee in the article "Confucius or Mozart? Community Cultural Wealth and Upward Mobility Among children of Chinese Immigrants," the model proposes that the upwardly mobile immigrant minorities over time develop new cultural strategies as they encounter the mainstream society of their host country. It describes how this new strategy of community cultural wealth, utilizing high cultural capital in Western classical music, better

[223] Kim and Sakamoto, 936–37, 939, 954.
[224] Ibid., 937, 954.

explains Chinese immigrants' upward social and educational mobility than the immigrant community institutions' promotion of traditional ethnic values such as the Confucian culture to ensure educational success, as implied by the Segmented Assimilation Theory.[225]

Lee argues that the Chinese traditional culture, which emphasizes academic performance alone and utilizes standardized entrance exams as the only mechanism to qualify students for higher education, does not adequately explain how it might equip immigrant children for success in the American education system.[226] By contrast, the community cultural wealth model practiced by a Chinese community in New York City borough of Queens, utilizing the community-based high cultural strategy of establishing Mozart Music Schools, prepares immigrant children, both from middle- and working-class families, for admission to prestigious colleges.[227] Lee reports of how the owner of one such music school connects with the globally recognized British music credentialing program and establishes ties to local orchestras and pre-college programs in the city's prestigious conservatories to provide opportunities for students' advancement in music education, although music teachers who want to inspire students' love for music often express frustration over the latter's greater concern for passing music exams than for cultivating an interest in music.[228]

Through information networks provided by these music school environments, immigrants learn about how music education can be "a promising cultural investment and a practical strategy" for elite college admission.[229] The Mozart School is therefore not only a

[225] Lee, 303, 307.
[226] Ibid., 305, 310.
[227] Ibid., 303.
[228] Ibid., 312–313.
[229] Ibid., 310–311.

collective strategy to acquire high culture, it is also a minority culture of social and educational mobility that helps immigrant families to manage their inter-class and interracial relationships, and helps their children to develop a high classical music competence that sets them apart from the academic achievement alone that all Asian students attain, thus demonstrating to others their well roundedness instead of being labeled dismissively as a "bookworm."[230]

Relevance of Assimilation Theories to Chinese Immigrants:

Classic Assimilation Theory: Gordon sees the dominant sociological condition in America as "structural pluralism"—separation into various ethnic social cliques, clubs, which is still true today half a century after his time. This condition is well reflected among the first- generation Chinese immigrants who have become Christians in North America, for they tend to stay comfortably close to one another within the four walls of the local evangelical Chinese church, partly because of the prejudices of the majority and partly because of the immigrants' desire to maintain their own communal subculture. While in the twenty-first-century multiethnic, racially diverse mainstream American society such a condition may no longer be seen as "dysfunctional" as Gordon claims, it can certainly become "dysfunctional" in the spiritual sense of failing to live out Christ's love toward people, which is apparent from the results of the survey on Chinese immigrants in Chapter 2, in which they rated very high if not the highest self-rating in terms of living out their faith in their relationship with God and in the context of the church, but very low if not the lowest in their relationship with their boss in the context of the workplace, and with their children at home.

[230] Lee, 316.

New Assimilation Theory: This theory reveals that systematic discrimination against Asian Americans still exists in terms of wage gaps and glass ceilings despite the decline of social differences in the multiethnic, racially diverse contemporary society and convergence in life chances due to Asian American's higher educational achievements. This social condition may have prompted the first-generation Chinese immigrants' drive for their native-born children to attain exceptional academic success and reach socioeconomic parity with Whites in their North American host society. However, the fact that academic success is always a goal that Chinese parents impose on their children, whether Chinese are in a minority in a society where they are discriminated against or a majority in which they may discriminate against others, makes it necessary to attribute the cause to the more natural human tendency or hidden agenda to seek wealth, power, and fame for themselves as well as for their children.

Other Contemporary Assimilation Theories: Consistent with findings of the above New Assimilation Theory but with additional controlled factors, the Demographic Heterogeneity Approach renders a more accurate result in revealing the 8 percent wage gap between native-born Asian American men and their White counterparts, and 11 percent lower earnings of the 1.25 generation Asian American men than White men in the labor market. This may reinforce a highly likely cause of Chinese immigrants' control of their US-born children not only for exceptional academic success, but also to enter the STEM or professional fields that warrant high and stable financial rewards. As a result of such pressure, it is not uncommon for US-born children to give their bachelor's degree diplomas to their parents as a sign of their fulfillment of filial piety, then go on to pursue other professions that better match their passions and talents.

Community Cultural Wealth Model: The model that seems best at explaining the phenomenon of how Chinese parents like Tiger Mom as well as the Hu and Wang couple put in such enormous effort to make sure their children not only work hard to excel in their academic studies, but also play a musical instrument such as the violin or the piano is the Community Cultural Wealth Model. It thus combines high cultural capital in both the Chinese Confucian tradition as well as in Western classical music to ensure their outstanding, well-rounded children's admission to America's elite colleges, preferably Harvard.

Historical Spiritual Heritage of the Evangelical Chinese Church

This section explores the historical heritage of the evangelical Chinese Church by studying the spirituality and impact of three indigenous evangelical Chinese Christian leaders—Dora Yu, Mingdao Wang, and Watchman Nee—on the evangelical Chinese American Church today: first, how their spirituality was formed by their family and religious contexts; second, what their responses to major challenges in life reveals about their spirituality; and third, how their spirituality as demonstrated in their lives and in their works have made positive and negative impacts on the spirituality and ministries of the evangelical Chinese Christian Church in North America today, resulting, I suggest, in ministry gaps that must be filled in order for spiritual transformation to take place in the lives of the church's people.

A Literature Review:

Due to the limited literary resources, especially in English, on two of the three persons, only major works on each of them have been selected for this study. The biography in Chinese

on Dora Yu [Dora Yu—Harbinger of Christian Church Revival in 20thcentury China][231] is a well-documented and widely cited work authored by Chinese American historian Silas Wu, Emeritus Professor at Boston College, who received one of his Master degrees in History from Yale University; a PhD in Chinese and Japanese History from Columbia University, and had been History of Professor at Boston College since his graduation, and an associate with the East Asian Research Center at Harvard's Fairbanks Center.[232] This book is an invaluable contribution to the Chinese Church, because the story of Dora Yu was almost buried in history. She was rarely mentioned, except for in passing that her preaching was responsible for the conversion and calling of Watchman Nee to Christian ministry. We are indebted to Wu's tireless "detective" effort in recovering her story. He has included in this book episodes drawn from Yu's own 1916 publication, *God's Dealing with Dora Yu*, and has also contributed a chapter on her in *Gospel Bearers, Gender Barriers*.[233]

For Mingdao Wang, the most significant primary source and extensively cited work is his own autobiography on the first fifty years of his life. Arthur Reynolds translated it into English, and titled it *A Stone Made Smooth*.[234] The latter part of his story continues in *Acquainted with Grief: Wang Mingdao's Stand for the Persecuted Church in China* by Thomas Alan Harvey, a

[231] Silas Wu 吳秀良, Yucidu: ershi shiji zhongguo jiaohui fuxing de xianqu *余慈度：廿世纪中國教會復興的先驅* [Dora Yu—Harbinger of Christian Church Revival in 20thcentury China] (Boston, MA: Pishon River Publications, 2000).

[232] Anthony P. Cammarota, "Faculty Profile: History Professor Wu Reveals Background," Boston College Libraries, accessed 10/2/2017, https://newspapers.bc.edu/cgi-bin/bostonsh?a=d&d=bcheights19830207.2.28.

[233] Silas H.L. Wu, "Dora Yu (1873–1931): Foremost Female Evangelist in Twentieth-Century Chinese Revivalism," in *Gospel Bearers, Gender Barriers*, ed. Dana Robert, 85–98 (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2002), 87.

[234] Ming-dao Wong, *A Stone Made Smooth: Wong Ming-Dao*, trans. Arthur Reynolds (Southampton, UK: Mayflower Christian Books, 1981).

faculty member at Trinity Theological College in Singapore;[235] and in *The Long Road to Freedom: The Story of Wang Mingdao* by Stephen Wang.[236] Stephen was a teenage convert of Wang's ministry; called to ministry upon graduation from Yenching University in China, he was arrested along with Wang in 1955, released for a while, then spent the next twenty-one years in labor camps until 1979; came to the US as a visiting scholar, and two years later, planted and pastored the Toronto China Bible Church until he retired in 1996.[237]

Angus Kinnear, author of Nee's biography *Watchman Nee: Against the Tide*, who had been a mission hospital doctor in India for twenty years, confessed to "a revolution in his own Christian life after having spent two months with Watchman Nee in 1938."[238] Another biography *My Unforgettable Memories: Watchman Nee and Shanghai Local Church*, discloses Nee's six decades-long scandal, was written by Lily Hsu, an insider and eye-witness of his trial in 1956 when she was a youth leader of Nee's Shanghai Local Church at Shanghai Christian Assembly (SCA).[239] Hsu had wandered away from the church for twenty-four years due to disillusionment regarding Nee's failures, but her faith was restored in 1980. She came to the US in 1981 to complete her clinical training, then practiced as a pediatric neurologist in LA until she retired in 2006.[240]

Their Faith Journey in the Family and Religious Contexts:

[235] Thomas Alan Harvey, *Acquainted with Grief: Wang Mingdao's Stand for the Persecuted Church in China* (Grand Rapids, MI: Brazos Press, 2002), back flap.

[236] Stephen Wang, *The Long Road to Freedom: The Story of Wang Mingdao*, (Kent, TN: Sovereign World Ltd., 2002).

[237] Wang, *The Long Road to Freedom*, 5.

[238] Angus Kinnear, *Against the Tide: The Story of Watchman Nee* (Carol Stream, IL: Tyndale House Publishers, Inc., 1978), back cover.

[239] Lily M. Hsu with Dana Roberts, *My Unforgettable Memories: Watchman Nee & Shanghai Local Church* (n.p.: Xulon Press, 2013), xix–xx.

[240] Hsu and Robert, *My Unforgettable Memories*, back cover.

Since all three of these Chinese Christian leaders lived around the same historical period in China, they shared a common historical/cultural/political context that is crucial for understanding how they were exposed to the Christian faith and how their spirituality was nurtured. Beginning in the mid-nineteenth century, Britain was the leading Western power to engage China with her Asian colonies through the opium trade, which resulted in the opening of Chinese ports and easier access for Western missionaries.[241] The positive effect of this easier access was the building of churches and schools, thus bringing Chinese families such as the Yus, the Nees, and the Wangs into the Christian faith. The negative effect was the linking of Christianity with Western Imperial power,[242] which eventually led to the Boxer Rebellion in 1900–1901, the slaughtering 231 missionaries along with 4,000 Protestants and 30,000 Catholics.[243]

In 1905, the last Empress Cixi of the Qing dynasty abolished the traditional Confucian civil service examination system that had been practiced for over two thousand years, and opted for public education, which made missionary schools a valuable option.[244] Confucian restrictions against women taking public leadership had also been softened by that time due to civil unrest and Western influence, while conservative reactions against modernist theology had not yet reached a consensus regarding gender roles.[245] Such developments made possible the one-generation window of opportunity for woman leaders such as Dora Yu, who enjoyed an

[241] Mark A Noll and Carolyn Nystrom, "Dora Yu/Yu Cidu: 1873–1931," in *Clouds of Witnesses: Christian Voices from Africa and Asia*, 187–200 (Downers Grove, IL: IVP Books, 2011), 195.

[242] Ibid.; Harvey, 12.

[243] Harvey, 12.

[244] Noll and Nystrom, "Dora Yu," 196.

[245] Ibid., 199.

elite status of being highly educated and of leading a public preaching and teaching ministry formerly accepting only men.[246]

Although all three leaders were brought up in Christian homes, Yu was the only one who had solidly nurtured spiritually in her family. Born in 1873, her father being a minister of an American Presbyterian Church, Yu had established an intimate relationship with God since childhood, as she described in her testimony: "As far as I can remember I scarcely ever forgot to pray [ever] since I knew how to pray by myself; Christ was a very real Person to me, and I loved him"; and she often referred to her "intimate dialogue with God"— although she confessed that she frequently disobeyed God's will.[247] An unforgettable event that became impressed upon her heart as an analogy of Christ seeking the lost was her own lost and found experience on a nature ramble through the fields at age two— to the considerable distress of her father searching for her.[248] Perhaps due to her sense of relationship with God since childhood, there was no indication of her having had a single "conversion" moment as had Wang and Nee. Yu was affected by learning about John Wesley's revival and holiness theology while attending Southern Methodist Medical School for eight years since the age of fifteen, and by serving as a Southern Methodist missionary to Korea for seven years during which she was also exposed to writings of the British Keswick Holiness Movement, such as Andrew Murray's *Abide in Christ*.[249] This influence was evident in her preaching of a deep personal holiness and constant surrender

[246] Noll and Nystrom, "Dora Yu," 199.
[247] Wu, "Dora Yu," 87.
[248] Noll and Nystrom, "Dora Yu," 191.
[249] Wu, Yucidu, 92; Kalun Leung 梁家麟, Huaren chuandao yu fengxing budaojia *華人傳道與奮興佈道家* [Evangelists and Revivalists of Modern China] (Hong Kong: Christianity and Chinese Culture Research Center of Alliance Bible Seminary, 1999), 132.

to the will of God,[250] and in her lifelong practice of dealing with sin, as stated in *God's Dealing with Dora Yu*: "No one knows the true innermost experiences…the deep-seated sins and weakness, which God's grace alone can overcome."[251]

Among the three persons explored here, Mingdao Wang was the only victim of the Boxer Rebellion. A month after he was born in Beijing in 1901, his father Doctor Wang hung himself in fear of an imminent death when he saw from the Legation Quarter where foreigners and Chinese Christians were taking refuge that the Boxers and Government soldiers were about to force their way into the Legation.[252] When the Allied Expeditionary Force arrived and the Boxers scattered, refugees in the Legation were able to return home; however, now that his father was dead, Wang's mother with her new-born baby and her daughter could no longer return to their home in the Methodist Hospital compound where Doctor Wang used to work.[253] Fortunately, with indemnity received from the church paid by the government, she bought a house, rented out some rooms, and used the rental income to raise her family.[254] Perhaps due to his knowledge about his father's death since childhood, between the ages of six and nine Wang constantly asked questions about "death" and the meaning of human life, but could not accept the inevitability of death.[255] At age nine, Wang was enrolled into a primary school established by the London Mission, which offered chapel services, Bible classes, prayer meetings, worship services, and Sunday school.[256] Despite such abundant religious exposures,

[250] Noll and Nystrom, "Dora Yu," 197.
[251] Wu, Yucidu, 92.
[252] Wong, 2–3; Harvey, 13.
[253] Wong, 3–4; Harvey, 13-14.
[254] Wong, 4; Harvey, 14.
[255] Wong, 7–8.
[256] Ibid., 9, 18–19.

he considered his life chaotic, unintelligible, confused, "without faith, without purpose, without hope,"[257] until he was led to Christ at age fourteen by a fellow student three grades ahead of him.[258] After conversion, the brother also discipled him, showing him how to worship, pray, undertake Bible study, and daily examination of conscience and diary journaling, etc.,[259] which began to transform him, so he was baptized the following Easter, and resolved to be a good Christian.[260]

Watchman Nee was born in 1903 to a third-generation Christian family in Foochow, China,[261] but he did not receive much spiritual nourishment, because the faith of his mother had been on the decline, and her discipline of children had become impatient and unjust.[262] On one occasion, she gave the seventeen-year-old Nee a harsh beating, only to find out later that he was innocent.[263] A month later, after she had accepted Christ at one of Dora Yu's evangelistic meetings, she went home and confessed to Nee that she had wrongly disciplined him.[264] Nee refused to forgive her but, impressed by her confession, Nee went with her to Yu's evangelistic meeting the very next day, accepted Christ, and dedicated himself to full-time Christian service at the same meeting.[265]

In the formative years since his conversion in 1920, several women—Dora Yu and Margaret Barber in person, and Jessie Penn-Lewis by her writing—made a particularly strong

[257] Wong, 19.
[258] Ibid., 13; Harvey, 14.
[259] Wong, 21.
[260] Ibid.
[261] Mae Elise Cannon, *Just Spirituality: How Faith Practices Fuel Social Action* (Downers Grove, IL: IVP Books, 2013), 59.
[262] Ibid., 36–37.
[263] Ibid., 37.
[264] Ibid., 40.
[265] Kinnear, 40.

impact on his spiritual growth besides his own reading of Scripture and of numerous devotional classics. Three months after Nee had accepted Christ, he went to Shanghai to receive training in Yu's Bible school, and learned from her life example to trust only God for his needs, and to let God's Word speak to his heart rather than just to his head.[266] Upon hia return to Foochow, he was re-baptized the following Easter by a former Anglican missionary, Margaret E. Barber.[267] Then for more than a year, Barber discipled him along with a group of newly baptized Christians.[268] According to Hsu, he was able to synthesize the thoughts of great masters in Christian devotional theology and express them in his own unique ways.[269] Being influenced by the writings of Penn-Lewis of South Wales, his three-volume masterpiece *The Spiritual Man* was mainly drawn from her writings that stressed the centrality of the Cross of Christ. The similarities were so strong that one of Nee's earliest coworkers considered *The Spiritual Man* to be Penn-Lewis' words translated into Chinese!

Their Responses to Major Challenges in Life:

Both Yu and Wang's responses to challenges in life seem to reflect a holiness spirituality. This they demonstrated by a thorough confession of sins and a total submission to God's will—although at times it took God's orchestrating of circumstances to compel them to yield. The only difference between the two was in the way God's will was affirmed: Yu was prompted by the Holy Spirit, while Wang sought affirmation in Scripture. Nee certainly faced more severe challenges than the other two, and his responses in the first ten years after his conversion were

[266] Kinnear, 44.
[267] Ibid., 46, 51.
[268] Hsu, 35.
[269] Ibid., 36.

consistent with his beliefs, reflecting a holiness spirituality demonstrated by a thorough confession of sins much as Yu and Wang had. However, beginning in the 1930s, soon after the passing away of his spiritual mentor Barber in 1929, and Yu in 1931, his responses to challenges, contrary to those of Yu and Wang, demonstrated an inconsistent spirituality between belief and practice, or perhaps more appropriately described as a counterfeit spirituality.

Emotionally, within two years of starting medical school, both of Yu's parents passed away, making her feel there was no home to which she could return.[270] She developed an intimate relationship with Josephine P. Campbell, who took care of her like her own child.[271] Upon graduation from medical school Yu, accepted Campbell's invitation to go with her to Korea as missionaries, which she in retrospect, regarded as a mistake, because she had not sought God's will on the matter.[272] While in medical school, she fell in love and planned to get married at age nineteen, but she broke the engagement shortly before the wedding when she realized that she did not care about a married life, but wanted to serve God whole-heartedly.[273] However, her heart was not at rest until her fiancé's family agreed to this new course of action, which she took as God's approval.[274]

Physically, Yu had become seriously ill before the end of her first year serving as a missionary in Korea, did not recover the whole time she was there, and during the last two years even attempted suicide twice due to severe insomnia without effective medication.[275] By

[270] Wu, Yucidu, 58.
[271] Ibid., 78; Wu, "Dora Yu," 89.
[272] Noll and Nystrom, "Dora Yu," 192.
[273] Ibid., 191–192.
[274] Ibid., 192.
[275] Ibid., 193; Wu, Yucidu, 99.

reflecting on God's dealings with her through illnesses, she concluded that it was a spiritual battle, because she was disobedient both in going to Korea, and in refusing to leave when God called her, so she felt that it took near-death illnesses to compel her to return to China and to realize that it was better to obey than to sacrifice by doing great ministries in Korea.[276]

Spiritually, the most significant challenge to her faith was her eager search for repeated mystical experiences she had tasted once when being filled with the Holy Spirit;[277] when this search failed, she came to accept that while the experience was helpful for her spiritual empowerment, she was in no position to manipulate the Holy Spirit to do her will,[278] and that she should content herself with pursuing a life of holiness by relying on God's grace through intimate union with Christ and by constantly dealing with her sins.[279]

Wang's first major challenge came when he felt called to be a preacher at a time he was pursuing the path to becoming a highly recognized politician. In his opinion, to be a preacher would be to serve in an inferior capacity.[280] Through a couple of illnesses and the relocation of the university preparatory courses to a distant province after the first year, he felt God was orchestrating circumstances to compel him to give up his ambition of becoming a politician, and even to give up his university studies, since he could not bear to leave his widowed mother.[281] When he was about to take his life out of a sense of utter disappointment, God's comfort came to him through His Word: "If we live, we live to the Lord, and if we die, we die to the Lord; so then, whether we live or whether we die, we are the Lord's" (Rom 14:8) and "With everlasting

[276] Wu, Yucidu, 88.
[277] Noll and Nystrom, "Dora Yu," 192.
[278] Wu, Yucidu, 86.
[279] Wu, "Dora Yu," 97.
[280] Wong, 32–33.
[281] Ibid., 34–38.

love I will have compassion on you…, my steadfast love shall not depart from you" (Isa 54:8, 10).[282]

Instead of continuing in the university preparatory course, he took up a teaching position at a Presbyterian School, where the next challenge awaited him soon after he had committed himself to the task of transforming the hearts of his students.[283] A teacher who had introduced baptism by immersion to the students was expelled from school; but finding scriptural support for its practice, Wang and five other students followed suit, and were also expelled from school, which meant for Wang the forfeiting of the scholarship promised by the principal for his future theological education in England.[284] When he returned home and was ridiculed by his relatives and friends for losing a teaching job over such a matter as baptism by immersion, he rebelled against God, angry and frustrated that he had had to suffer for his obedience to Him, and was led to the promise in 1 Corinthians 10:13 that God would not allow him to be tempted above what he could bear, but that He would give him an escape route that would allow Wang to bear whatever he had to do.[285] Without a proper job, he did the best he could to get by doing household chores such as cooking, washing dishes, laundry, etc.; but through reading how God had sent Moses into the desert to tend sheep for forty years, he began to accept lowly chores as being as important as preaching, and believed that God had to cure him of his longing for "greatness" before he could be entrusted with Christian ministry.[286] Having gone through such humbling challenges, his ministry finally began to take off. Initially in

[282] Wong, 39.
[283] Ibid., 47–49.
[284] Ibid., 57–64.
[285] Ibid., 66–68.
[286] Ibid., 75–76.

1924 he gathered believers in his home in 1924; by 1936 up to eight hundred of them were meeting in a church building. They called the church "The Christian Tabernacle."[287]

The next two major challenges in his life were political in nature. When the Communists took over China in 1949, a national meeting of Christians was held in Beijing, and Wang was invited to attend, but he declined.[288] As it turned out, the main purpose of the meeting was to promote the Three-Self Movement (being self-supporting, self-governing, and self-propagating) by rallying Chinese Christians behind the banner of anti-imperialism and patriotism, in order to strengthen the leadership of the newly established Communist government through rooting out and eliminating reactionaries.[289] A weapon used to do so was the accusation meetings, in which they criticized "imperialists" hidden in the Church.[290] Wang rejected the accusation meetings, and due to his continuous refusal to participate in the Three-Self Movement, in 1955 Wang and his wife were arrested and imprisoned, and interrogated day and night; the interrogator insisted that opposing the Three-Self Movement was a crime, so in a moment of confusion, Wang admitted he had committed the crime.[291] The interrogators threatened to shoot him if would not confess other crimes that they guided him to "confess," which he eventually did.[292] After five months, he was persuaded to give up his faith and, desiring very much to be released, he finally confessed in 1956 that he had given up his faith, because God had not answered his prayer.[293] In the next few months, he was guided to write and rewrite his

[287] Harvey, 41.
[288] Ibid., 20–21.
[289] Ibid., 22–23.
[290] Ibid., 25.
[291] Ibid., 94–95.
[292] Wang, 100–101.
[293] Ibid., 108.

confession until it was satisfactory to the officials; then after reading his confession in front of 103 Three Self leaders, he and his wife were released from prison and went home.[294]

After they were released, feeling deeply pained and remorseful that he had failed his people, he would not attend services or preach.[295] Since Wang would not fulfill his promise to join the Three-Self Movement, Wang and his wife were both arrested again a couple years later, and were sentenced to prison, fifteen years for his wife and life for Wang.[296] But this sentence prompted Wang to recall Micah 7:7–9: "But as for me, I watch in hope for the Lord…; my God will hear me…. Because I have sinned against him, I will bear the Lord's wrath, until he pleads my case."[297] Now realizing that judgment had come from God for his many lies, all his former complaints about God not answering his prayer and fears were gone, and peace returned.[298] He began to retell his story, confessing that he had lied because he was afraid of himself being shot, and afraid of his wife dying in prison, etc., so he fabricated crimes he had never committed, save his actual opposition to the Three-Self Church.[299] In 1979, after having been imprisoned for twenty-two years, Wang was released from prison due to the death of Mao and the re-establishment of Sino-American diplomatic relationship, and pressures from human rights organizations.[300] He died in 1991, and is acknowledged as "the spiritual father of the modern-day Church in China" by leaders of the fast-growing Church today.[301]

[294] Mark A. Noll and Carolyn Nystrom, "Wang Mingdao: 1900–1991: Imprisoned by Choice," in *Clouds of Witnesses: Christian Voices from Africa & Asia*, 247–263 (Downers Grove, IL: IVP Books, 2011), 258–259.

[295] Wang, 136–141.

[296] Noll and Nystrom, "Wang Mingdao," 259.

[297] Ibid.

[298] Wang, 169.

[299] Ibid., 170–171.

[300] Noll and Nystrom, "Wang Mingdao," 260–261.

[301] Wang, 7.

The major challenge Watchman Nee faced before the 1930s was a health issue: being diagnosed with tuberculosis and expected to live for only a few more months.[302] In agony over God apparently saying "No" to all his great plans, he began to examine his ambitions, motives, and actions, and confessed all sins that might have brought about this illness, and then sat down to write his masterpiece *The Spiritual Man*, which was published in 1928.[303] During the writing process, he experienced a miraculous recovery after people had gathered and prayed in a three-day vigil on his behalf; trusting the verses: "By faith you stand" (2 Cor 1:24), "Walk by faith" (2 Cor 5:7), and "Everything is possible for one who believes" (Mk 9:23), he got up, walked down the stairs, and pronounced to the people praying the news of his healing.[304]

After 1930s, his responses to challenges were entirely different! The first challenge was his stepping into his brother's business—the China Biological and Chemical Laboratories (CBC), and took charge of it in 1939, with the purpose, as he told others, of financially supporting his coworkers.[305] But from the consequences of this business undertaking, a deeper problem with his character and spirituality was revealed. Within two years of Nee taking over the CBC's establishment, six general managers and the board of directors resigned. One coworker described his problem as having "manipulated against the conscience of the Christian workers and of evading taxation, illegal huge profits, even selling faked drugs…. The salary of the believers was very low."[306] By the end of 1942, Kinnear reported that as Nee's image in the eyes

[302] Kinnear, 61.
[303] Ibid., 92, 98.
[304] Cannon, 61.
[305] Hsu, 198; Kinnear, 163.
[306] Hsu, 181.

of the elders became increasingly tarnished, they suspended his preaching ministry at his Shanghai Christian Assembly (SCA).[307]

However, Hsu reported a more serious problem being responsible for the suspension of his ministry. In 1942, many brothers working at CBC brought their grievances to the house of Nee's right-hand female coworker Yuanru Li.[308] Shocked by her housemate's unusual utterance, "Chop him a thousand times," Li probed her resentment further and learned that Nee had raped her eight or nine years earlier.[309] After confirming with Nee that it was true, Li reported to the elders, who suspended Nee from preaching for six years.[310] The next year, Nee wrote to the leaders of SCA asking that his name be removed from the church, which they never did; instead they restored him to full fellowship in 1948 after his confession and repentance before the elders.[311] Even so, he abstained from communion for over ten years, although he continued to encouraged others to take communion.[312]

The final challenge came in 1950, when the newly established communist government announced the Laws of Land Reform, and Nee, based on his understanding that temples and churches were waived from the Reform, initiated "The Guling Signature Drive" among all his Local Church members in China to appeal for exemption from the Land Reform of his family property for training purposes.[313] Since he was able to submit about 20,000 signatures within a month from the time of the announcement, an investigation of the Local Churches was

[307] Hsu, 165.
[308] Ibid., 182
[309] Ibid.
[310] Ibid., 182–183.
[311] Kinnear, 180.
[312] Hsu, 205.
[313] Ibid., 188.

initiated.[314] In the same year, the "Three-Self Patriotic Movement" (TSPM) called for all churches to motivate Christians to sign up in support of the "Christian Manifesto" that aimed at purging imperialism and its plot to use religion against the new government.[315] Nee submitted an additional 10,000 signatures originally collected for the Guling Drive, to show his proactive submission to the TSPM.[316] As a result, the names of the believers and the demographic and geographic distribution of all the Local Churches in China were disclosed to the Communist government, and the believers were labeled and persecuted as "Watchmen Nee Counter-revolutionary Gang members."[317]

At the trial of Watchman Nee in 1956, 12 SCA representatives (including Hsu) were notified they should attend, and witnessed Nee answering "Yes" to all accusations with their accompanying criminal evidence,[318] along with pornographic books signed by him, and a voluntary document admitting he had visited prostitutes on multiple occasions, had had a long-term relationship with a "white Russian prostitute," and that he had raped two female coworkers and his adopted daughter.[319] Declared of having committed "counter-revolutionary activities under the camouflage of religion," he was sentenced to 15 years in prison instead of a death penalty due to "leniency to the confessed."[320] He died in 1972 after having been incarcerated for 20 years.[321]

Their Impact on the Evangelical Chinese Christian Church:

[314] Hsu, 189.
[315] Harvey, 164.
[316] Ibid., 195.
[317] Ibid., 196.
[318] Hsu, 135–136.
[319] Ibid., 122-123.
[320] Ibid., 136.
[321] Kinnear, 237.

Dora Yu, recognized as a pioneer Chinese woman evangelist and revivalist role model, emphasized total submission to God's training through circumstances and heeding the inner voice of the Holy Spirit, the use of spiritual gifts under the control of Christ's life and love, abiding in Christ, and unceasing prayer.[322] These emphases made her messages powerful and impactful to those who attended her revival meetings. Besides Nee, who accepted Christ and dedicated himself to Christian ministry at one of her meetings,[323] a new generation of dynamic male evangelists and revivalists emerged from her revival ministry, replacing the first generation of female evangelists and revivalists who receded from public ministries after the epic year 1927.[324]

Although some of the thousands of people who had been affected by Wang's teaching, preaching, and writing before his imprisonment joined the Three Self Church or gave up their faith, most of them held firm to their faith convictions and formed small, self-governing, self-supporting, and self-propagating churches underground,[325] which burst forth as soon as the Cultural Revolution in China was over, testifying to the resilience of Chinese believers as a result of Wang's life. This in turn led to the mass conversion of Chinese Christians in recent decades, both in China and overseas.[326] Most of the practices of the Christian Tabernacle that he founded in the 1930s were followed by future evangelical Chinese churches in China, Southeast Asia, even in North America, e.g. the centrality of Bible preaching, and "change in one's manner of life" as evidence of regeneration necessary for baptism, etc.[327] Because of Wang's own life

[322] Kinnear, 137–143.
[323] Wu, Yucidu, 138–143.
[324] Ibid., 98.
[325] Noll and Nystrom, "Wang Mingdao," 262.
[326] Ibid.
[327] Harvey, 42; Wong, 127–131.

example and his emphasis on the faith and moral life of believers, many evangelical Chinese churches then and now have held to the priority of belief and integrity over spiritual gifts, power, knowledge, and learning as criteria for church workers (2 Pet 1:5–7 and Eph 4:1).[328]

Considered the largest of the indigenous movements in China of his time, the Little Flock (Local Church) was the most significant impact Watchman Nee had made as a result of his evangelistic crusades, which was founded in the late 1920s, but had established nearly 1,000 local churches, totaling 90,000 followers by 1949.[329] Under his influence, evangelical Chinese churches then and now have also taken seriously the doctrine of salvation and "being born-again" in their preaching and teaching; adult baptism by immersion; priesthood of believers—involving laymen in leading worship and ministries; observance of the Lord's Table by born-again Christians only; pursuit of intimate relationship with God due to his popularization of *The Practice of the Presence of God* by Brother Lawrence, *Sweet Smelling Myrrh* by Madam Guyon, and *The Streams of the Desert* by L. B. Cowman.[330] An unfortunate legacy that has impacted the evangelical Chinese churches then and now was his depriving women of leadership in the church, despite the fact that he was converted and dedicated his life to Christian service through a woman's preaching, baptized and mentored by a woman missionary, and depended on several woman coworkers in the founding of the Shanghai Christian Assembly and in his literature publications.

According to Hsu, when all Nee's criminal records were disclosed, many church members, herself included, felt extremely shameful, and their faith collapsed; feeling cheated

[328] Harvey, 42–43.
[329] Hsu, 58.
[330] Ibid., 37, 40, 49.

by Nee and in anguish, Hsu dropped out of church for over twenty years.[331] After the court hearing, although an excommunication document was sent to all the Local Churches in China, it was hardly made known to the congregations, as one member of the Suzhou Church said, "The excommunication of Watchman Nee was not announced because nobody wanted to discuss that issue. We just avoided spreading the news as much as we could."[332] Even now, after over half a century, in China and abroad, and especially within local churches, many believers still regard that accounts of the sexual immorality of Nee were fabricated.[333] Hsu's evidence as presented in her book *My Unforgettable Memories* seems most convincing as a first-hand witness of crucial events in Nee's life, and her arguments in support of her evidence are as follows:[334]

> After the exposure of the corrupted private life of Nee, not one of the coworkers of the Local Church has stood up to defend Nee. None of the SCA leaders expressed any suspicion about the evidences since then. For the past half century up to this day, as far as I know, there has not been any solid, convincing defense of Nee published by those who truly knew him…. Nee's own confession, as well as the confession of his victims, made for a strong case for his serious problem.

Perhaps he knew that the only way to stop his sexual addiction was to be locked up in prison! But because he had disclosed the demographic and geographic distribution of his local churches and members, many of them were executed, imprisoned, or lost their faith! Last, but not least, his unquestioned authority in church leadership had set the pace for future leaders in his local churches and in other Chinese churches to follow suit. Such blind submission probably led to

[331] Hsu, 112, 127–128.
[332] Ibid., 138.
[333] Ibid., 120.
[334] Ibid.

the cover-up of his scandals for over half a century. Despite today's "Me Too" movement, very little is spoken of Nee's or other church leaders' scandals, although they are known to be alive in the evangelical Chinese Christian circle.

While the spirituality of the three leaders have had their unique influence on the Chinese Church, the following four convictions they held in common seem to have made the most lasting impact on the evangelical Chinese Christian communities over the century.

First, the centrality of Bible study in the formation of one's spirituality. According to her biographer Wu, Yu was the first Christian woman to found a Bible school to help those who needed "a deeper work of the Holy Spirit to lead a practical living out of the Truth, to equip them more fully for the great service of leading others to Christ."[335] Kinnear remarked of Nee's casual comment that he read through the New Testament once a month.[336] Wang's autobiography told of his interest in Bible reading ever since his conversion,[337] and his citing of biblical texts to affirm God's will in crises and in decision making.

In today's evangelical Chinese Christian communities, book-by-book inductive Bible study is the most popular activity in Church and College Campus fellowships, exegetical preaching is the most highly regarded kind of preaching in worship services, reading through the Bible (for some even once a year) is preferred for most personal devotion, and seeking of God's will must be confirmed by Scripture texts. However, more attention is paid to gaining Bible knowledge than on transformation of life, and issues hindering spiritual growth, bordering

[335] Wu, "Dora Yu," 94.
[336] Kinnear, 110.
[337] Wong, 21.

on idolatry, or affecting consistency in living out the Christian faith as discussed in Chapter 2 are hardly challenged at all through preaching or teaching of the Word.

Second, self-examination and confession of sins as essential for establishing an intimate relationship with God. Yu told the pastor who visited her toward the end of her life that she became more sensitive to sin, confessing the most minute sins that formerly she would not have recognized as sins,[338] thus reflecting her holiness spirituality throughout her life. Wang's autobiography is also filled with confessions, readily admitting his seeing the sins of others as parallel to those in his own heart, although theirs were manifest while his were hidden.[339] For Nee, besides the time he was diagnosed with tuberculosis when he eagerly examined his actions, motives, and ambitions to see if he had given grounds for God's displeasure, the lyrics of the many hymns he composed reflect the inner struggles and pains in the depth of his soul.[340]

With their evangelical Chinese Church heritage and Confucian moral values, most Chinese Christians today are sensitive to sins in their own as well as in others' lives. However, while it is easy to develop a judgmental attitude toward others, confession of one's own sins seems to be emphasized only in each person's conversion experience but not much after it. Preaching and teaching are often rather moralistic, without a dual foundation of God's holiness and God's grace.

Third, the caution on mystical or charismatic experience, despite the fact that they have all had some mystical encounters. Yu learned from her own experience that the Holy Spirit was

[338] Leung, 135.
[339] Wong, 55–56.
[340] Hsu, 224–227.

not to be manipulated to do her will.[341] For Wang, the brother who re-baptized him and his students by immersion emphasized speaking in tongues as the only evidence of being filled with the Holy Spirit. However, not sensing any change in his heart when led to speak in tongues by the repeated cry of 'Hallelujah', Wang preferred to consider the time of his confession of sins and being in full submission to God's will as his experience of being filled with the Holy Spirit, and regarded the repeated cry of 'Hallelujah' as a human manufacture of tongues.[342] While Nee had witnessed and experienced the excitement of tongues and healings in revival meetings, he warned against what he considered to be such addictive activities, for they "compelled merely an ever-increasing dosage."[343]

Today, evangelical Chinese Church leaders are so sensitive to and suspicious of all mystical and charismatic tendencies that they often neglect the power and the abiding presence and transformation of the Holy Spirit in preaching, teaching, and personal experience. As a result, most evangelical Christians are ignorant or unaware of the movements of the Holy Spirit in their daily lives, such that their limited knowledge of the Holy Spirit remains in their heads only, without having any significant impact on their lives.

Fourth, the highly productive ministries of the three catalysts as demonstrated: in Yu's revival meetings that raised up a generation of dynamic evangelists and preachers; in Wang's preaching and teaching that produced disciples who kept the underground church alive and striving after 30 years of persecution in China; and in Nee's evangelistic crusades that gave rise to local churches worldwide. These left a legacy of a very busy evangelical Chinese Church, with

[341] Wu, Yucidu, 86.
[342] Wong, 65.
[343] Kinnear, 135.

Table 2—Weekly Ministries of Six Mandarin-speaking Congregations

	#1	#2	#3	#4	#5	#6
Worship Attendance	**~250**	**~250**	**~100**	**~100**	**~300**	**~60**
Adult Sunday school class	3	3	1	2	3	2
Fellowship/Small Group	18	22	1	5	16	2
Prayer Meeting	2	1	1	1	2	1
Praise Team/Choir Practice	1	1				
Team/Group/Leaders' Meeting			1		1	
Sports Ministry	1			2	2	
One-time Special Meeting	3	3	7	5		1
One-time Special Training			1	2		1
Total Number of Weekly Meetings:	**28**	**30**	**12**	**17**	**24**	**7**

Source: Ministry data taken from one 2017 Sunday bulletin each of the six Chinese American churches in California

Table 3. All-Church Events Relevant to their respective Six Mandarin-speaking Congregations

	#1	#2	#3	#4	#5	#6
Worship Attendance	**~250**	**~250**	**~100**	**~100**	**~300**	**~60**
Church Anniversary	1	1	1			1
Good Friday Service	1	1	1	1	1	1
Baptism Service	3	3	3	2	2	1
Seminary/Theological Seminar	2	2	2			1
Local Evangelistic Outreach	3	12		4	1	4
Mission Education/Conference	3	5	1	1	2	2
Music Event	2	1		3	1	
Short Term Mission	4	7			1	2
Church/Leaders' Retreat	1	1			1	4
Leaders' Appreciation Meals	1			2		1
Children's Musical	2				1	
Joint Prayer Meeting	12	12				
Christian Ed/VBS/Leadership Training	5	4	5	4	5	3
Women's Special Meeting				2	2	
Church Member Meeting			12	12	1	
Coworker/Deacon/Elder Meeting	12	12	12	12	12	12
Parents'/Leaders' Meeting					3	
New Member/Comer Reception	4			2		
Thanksgiving/Christmas Meal	1	1		2	1	4
Total Number of Annual Special Events:	**57**	**62**	**40**	**44**	**34**	**36**

Source: Ministry data taken from the 2017 Annual Calendars of the six Chinese American churches in California

the perception of *"busy-ness" as a mark of "spirituality."* Such busy-ness can be observed from a random sampling of one Sunday bulletin each from six prominent Chinese American churches in California, which shows their regular weekly ministries (Table 2), and from each church's 2017 annual calendar that shows her all-church ministries that are relevant to the Mandarin congregation (Table 3). It is apparent that on top of the people's preoccupation with their children's academic achievement and their own professions, Chinese Christians of first-generation immigrants, especially church leaders, are involved in many ministries of their respective churches packed schedules. It is therefore highly unlikely that they will have the time to examine their hearts' true condition and discover inconsistencies between their beliefs and practices.

Conclusion: Implications of Ministry Gaps

To understand the causes that account for such inconsistencies between belief and practice of first-generation Chinese immigrants in North America, three most relevant interdisciplinary fields have been explored in this chapter. A preliminary understanding of these fields reveals that while Chinese immigrants have been positively affected by the Confucian Chinese culture, their relative success in assimilating into the American society, and the evangelical Chinese Church heritage, it is their misinterpretation or superficial understanding of Confucian philosophy, along with their eager concerns over realizing the American dream of full assimilation into the mainstream North American society but hindered by discrimination that may have led to their preoccupation with their children's academic achievements; and that the evangelical Chinese American Church is inadequate in providing the church culture and spiritual formation ministries for discipling them.

As a result of such an inadequacy in addressing the Chinese immigrants' spiritual needs, at least four major ministry gaps are left to be filled in order to cultivate in evangelical Chinese Christians an authentic faith brings consistency between their beliefs and practices. First, the sin of idolatry—anything that replaces the sovereignty of God in one's life—must be brought to surface, challenged, and confessed as an on-going spiritual discipline, with full assurance of God's grace and forgiveness. Second, Bible Study must go beyond head knowledge to interactive experiential encounter with God in Christ. Third, the evangelical Chinese Church must trim back regular and special "religious" activities to make room for her people to establish intimate relationship with God through the practice of solitude and guided spiritual exercises. And fourth, evangelical Chinese Christians must be taught, convicted, and be led to heighten their awareness of the presence and movement of the indwelling Holy Spirit in their daily lives.

Chapter 4

The Normative Task: What Ought to be Going On?

Introduction: Biblical Foundation on Christian Spiritual Formation

The previous chapter that answered the question "Why is this going on?" of Osmer's interpretive task dealt with three main factors that have led to North American Chinese immigrants' preoccupation with their children's academic achievements to such an extent that their value system and behaviors border on idolatry, revealing an internal attitude and external life-style inconsistent with the Christian faith that they profess. Having discussed the three main factors—namely, the misinterpretation or superficial application of the Confucian philosophy; their eager concern over full assimilation into the North American mainstream society; and the inadequacy of the evangelical Chinese American Church to provide the church culture and ministries that address their spiritual needs, chapter 4 now attempts to answer the next question: "What ought to be going on?" which requires laying a solid biblical foundation of spiritual formation on which the evangelical Chinese Church professes her faith and develops her spiritual formation ministries.

This chapter attempts to discover how the Triune God—the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit—engage in the tasks of spiritual formation of God's peoples through the ages. Unless otherwise noted, Scripture quotations in chapters 4 and 5 are from the New Revised Standard version of the Bible (NRS). Since this topic covers a wide range of biblical resources, literature review will be engaged as the sub-topics are discussed. The one exception is Barbara

E. Bowe's *Biblical Foundations of Spirituality: Touching a Finger to the Flame*,[344] which covers biblical foundation of Christian Spiritual Formation through the whole Scripture; hence it will be cited throughout this chapter.

Bowe received both her Master and Doctoral degrees in New Testament and Christian Origins from Harvard University, and is currently Professor of New Testament at the Catholic Theological Union in Chicago, where she teaches courses in biblical studies and early Christianity and serves as director of the Biblical Spirituality Program.[345] Her colleague Dianne Bergant of Catholic Theological Union describes her book as follows:[346]

> With her remarkable study of biblical spirituality, Barbara Bowe has not only 'touched our fingers to the flame,' but has exposed us to the smoldering potential of the biblical tradition. Unlike books of this genre which concentrate on one biblical testament, her work encompasses salient themes from both of them. This is not merely a summary of the material it is a serious yet eminently readably study of it. It captures the essence of the various authors' thinking; and uncovers its contemporary relevance.

The first section of this chapter covers how Yahweh establishes intimate covenant relationship, first with humankind in general, then with Israel specifically, as revealed in the Pentateuch, the Prophetic literature, and the Psalms. The second section focuses on how Jesus Christ establishes intimate covenant relationship with and inspires his disciples to follow him on the way of the cross as revealed in the Gospel of Mark. The third section deals with how the Holy Spirit indwells and transforms Christians into the image of Christ analogous to how the Holy Spirit indwelled and empowered Jesus as he lived out his earthly life and carried out his mission in obedience to, dependence on, and in union with his heavenly Father.

[344] Barbara Bowe, *Biblical Foundations of Spirituality: Touching a Finger to the Flame* (Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc., 2003).

[345] Ibid., 221.

[346] Ibid., back cover.

A preliminary study of the above spiritual formation process through the ages demonstrates that despite the constant failures of the covenant people to live up to the covenant demands of obedience to and dependence on God for holy living, the triune God's covenant faithfulness and sovereign will ultimately prevail: blessing people with God's own presence in renewed covenant relationship, climaxed at the end times when Christ is revealed, because they will be like him, for they will see him as he is (1 Jn 3:2b), and that "He will dwell with them; they will be his peoples, and God himself will be with them" (Re 21:3).

Spiritual Formation of God's People by Yahweh

Spiritual formation of God's people began with the Creator God's initiation of covenant relationship with humankind, then with Israel, blessing them with God's own presence and leading them toward living out their covenant stipulations. The process of how the covenant people were led to live out this relationship in the presence of the holy God is revealed in the Pentateuch, the Prophetic literature, and the Psalms.

In the Pentateuch:

There is no better reason found in the biblical account for God to pursue such an intimate relationship with people than the fact that humankind was made in the image of God (Gn 1:26–27). While the context in Genesis does not give any definition of the "image of God," images in the ancient Near East are thought to represent the presence of someone (often the royal king) who is physically absent,[347] which implies humankind's royal status of being the representative of the Creator God's presence in the world. The popular views among the early

[347] Stanley Grenz, "Jesus as the Imago Dei: Image-of-God Christology and the Non-Linear Linearity of Theology," *Journal of the Evangelical Theological Society* 47, no. 4 (Dec 2004), 621.

Greek church fathers regard being created in God's image as entailing certain kinds of similarity, e.g. physical, mental, spiritual, etc. between humankind and God,[348] such as the human power of reasoning being superior to irrational animals to have dominion over God's creation as proposed by Augustine.[349]

Among contemporary scholars, a couple of them have presented insightful meaning and implications of humankind being made in the image of God. One is Meredith Kline, former professor of Old Testament at Westminster Theological Seminary, Philadelphia, Gordon-Conwell Theological Seminary, and Westminster Seminary California.[350] Based on humankind being made in the "image" and "likeness" of God (Gn 1:26), and Adam's son Seth being in his father Adam's "likeness" and "image" (Gn 5:3), Kline regards the two terms used to describe the father/son relationship of Adam and Seth as being analogous to the father/son relationship between God and humankind, and idea further affirmed in Luke 3:38 which speaks of Seth being "the son of Adam, [who is] the son of God," and of Jesus being the Son of God (Lk 1:35)[351] and the "image" of the invisible God (Col 1:15).

The other scholar is Michael Guinan. After receiving his PhD in Semitic Languages and Literatures from the Catholic University of America in 1972 and having taught for more than forty years at Franciscan School of Theology, Guinan is currently professor Emeritus of Old Testament and professor emeritus of Semitic languages, specializing in biblical spirituality.[352] He

[348] Grenz, 621.

[349] Jack Mahoney, "Evolution, Altruism, and the Image of God," *Theological Studies* 71, no. 3 (Sept 2010), 678.

[350] Meredith Kline, *Kingdom Prologue: Genesis Foundations for a Covenantal Worldview* (Eugene, OR: Wipf and Stock Publishers, 2006), back cover.

[351] Ibid., 45.

[352] "Michael Guinan, Professor Emeritus of Old Testament, Professor Emeritus of Semitic Languages," Franciscan School of Theology, accessed 9/15/2018, http://www.fst.edu/faculty-staff/michael-guinan-ofm/.

spells out two implications of humankind's sonship relationship with the Creator God. First, humankind in God's image must reflect God who comes first, with whom the image bearer is "tightly bound in relationship," accepting our creaturely limitation and dependence on the loving and life-giving heavenly Father.[353] Second, humankind must live out the role of an image-bearer by "doing exactly what we have seen God doing," sharing God's dominion—a royal activity, to maintain an orderly realm in which human beings can live in harmony and right relationship with God, with one another, and with nature by being "life-giving, peace-making and justice-doing."[354]

Bernard Och, Director of the B'nai B'rith Hillel Foundation at Haifa University and the Technion,[355] regards the creation of humankind in the image of God as more than a statement about human nature, but instead as one that describes the unique position of humankind vis-à-vis God, such that humankind can enter into a relationship with God and be God's counterpart on earth.[356] Niehaus, agreeing with Kline's idea of the parent/child relationship between God and humankind made in the image of God, proposes that "covenant" and "family" are bound together in creation, an idea that is rooted in God's mind.[357] He finds such "kinship" terms as "love," "brotherhood," "fatherhood," and "sonship" being used in the second millennium BCE international treaties to characterize "covenant relations" between parties. In light of this, he proposes that all humankind lives under the "Adamic covenant," and is accountable to God as

[353] Michael D. Guinan, *The Pentateuch*. Message of Biblical Spirituality 1 (Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 1990), 24.

[354] Ibid., 25–26.

[355] Bernard Och, "Creation and Redemption: Toward a Theology of Creation," *Judaism* 44, no. 2 (Spring 1995), 226.

[356] Ibid., 228.

[357] Jeffrey J. Niehaus, "Covenant: An Idea in the Mind of God," *Journal of the Evangelical Theological Society* 52, no. 2 (Jun 2009), 225, 228.

God's own children.[358] Within such a covenant relation, God being the Creator in Genesis 1:1 also implies that God is Suzerain over all, for "creator gods in the ancient Near East were understood to be universal suzerains, from whom all other heavenly and earthly authority derived."[359]

Shortly after the description in Genesis 1 and 2 of God's creation of humankind, male and female, in God's own image and likeness, of how the first couple Adam and Eve are placed in a garden, and of how they enjoy the presence and harmonious relationship with their Creator God, with each other, and with the world, comes the Fall and the punishment as a sad consequence of their disobedience to God (Gn 3:6, cf. Gn 2:17). Och insists that God's prohibition against eat of the Tree of the Knowledge of Good and Evil in the garden is not to deprive humankind of acquisition of knowledge but to "establish the boundaries of human existence"; because humankind is destined to actualize qualities such as creativity, freedom, and dominion as bearer of the image of God, but "only within the Divine appointed parameters of finiteness and creatureliness"; therefore, the sin of humankind is the unwillingness to live within such boundaries and acknowledge human finiteness and creaturely dependence on the Creator God.[360]

"Covenant" language in Scripture appears first in reference to God's establishment of relationship with Noah and his descendants, and with every living creature that is with him in the ark (Gn 6:18–19); the term is repeated seven times in Genesis 9 alone (Gen 9:9–17). As Blenkinsopp points out, all humankind and all living creations are the recipients of this Noahic

[358] Niehaus, 227–228.
[359] Ibid., 231.
[360] Och, 229.

Covenant, as revealed in Genesis 9: "I establish my covenant with you, that never again shall all flesh be cut off by the waters of a flood…. When the bow is in the clouds, I will see it and remember the everlasting covenant between God and every living creature of all flesh that is on the earth" (vv. 11–16), along with its prohibition and command, "Whoever sheds the blood of a human, by a human shall that person's blood be shed; for in his own image God made humankind. And you, be fruitful and multiply, abound on the earth and multiply in it" (vv. 6–7).[361] Due to the reiteration of the words about humankind being made in the image of God and the blessing of procreation, some scholars regard the Noahic Covenant as a renewal covenant of the Adamic Covenant.[362] Similarly, Och sees Noah as being chosen by God to reinstate the original creation blessings, for the flood story marks the beginning of a new creation based on God's covenant with Noah, which is the restoration of the Adamic covenant as a historical counterpart to the "creational Imago Dei," both expressing the nearness of and unique relationship with God.[363]

The creation story and the flood story demonstrate that, as Och puts it, "God is the Lord of the universal history, the Lord of the cosmos. Everything that subsequently transpires between humanity and God, and between Israel and God stands in this broad context."[364] In contrast to the Noahic covenant, by which God reinstitutes the creational blessing of procreation and the ongoing structure of nature, the Abrahamic covenant signifies God's reestablishment of the original creational relationship with humankind based on "Divine

[361] Joseph Blenkinsopp, "Abraham as Paradigm in the Priestly History in Genesis," *Journal of Biblical Literature* 128, no. 2 (2009), 240.

[362] Niehaus, 236.

[363] Och, 231.

[364] Ibid., 227.

command and human obedience."[365] Abraham is chosen out of the land of confusion and chaos of the Tower of Babel, to "father a people whose mission will be the reunification of humankind through acceptance of Divine authority and obedience to Divine command."[366] He is now placed on a road (from Haran to Canaan) that leads to the land of reconciliation and reunification with God, for the original relationship broken by Adam's disloyalty and disobedience is now restored by Abraham's trust and obedience.[367] Therefore, God blesses Abraham with a great name, land, and descendants, that he may serve as the mediator of blessings all the families of the earth, as revealed in God's calling: "Go from your country…and your father's house to the land that I will show you. I will make of you a great nation, and I will bless you, and make your name great, so that…in you all the families of the earth shall be blessed" (Gn 12:1–3).[368]

In summary, the Book of Genesis tells of "God as the Lord of universal history, the Lord of the cosmos,"[369] who establishes covenant relationship with humankind made in God's own image on the one hand, and of humankind's sin and God's consequential punishment of death—broken relationships on all levels: with God, with one another, and with the earth[370] on the other. However, despite humankind's rejection of being God's image-bearer by becoming death-giving and injustice-doing," God's last word is one of grace and blessing: Eve is named the "mother of all the living" (Gn 3:20); Noah and his family, extending to some of the animals, become the source of new life on earth; and after the wickedness of the Tower of Babel event,

[365] Och, 232.
[366] Ibid., 232.
[367] Ibid., 233.
[368] Ibid., 232.
[369] Ibid., 227.
[370] Guinan, 27–28.

the call of Abraham ushers in a new beginning of God's prevailing will of life and blessing to all humankind.[371]

The Book of Exodus records God's deliverance of the descendants of Abraham— the children of Israel—from oppression and slavery and of God's establishing covenant relationship with them. In response to the oppressed people's pain and groaning cry for release, God said, "I have observed the misery of my people…; I have heard their cry…. Indeed, I know their sufferings, and I have come down to deliver them from the Egyptians, and to bring them up out of that land to…a land flowing with milk and honey…" (Ex 3:7–8). So, the Lord delivered the people of Israel from the slavery and oppression of Pharaoh, the god of Egypt, through the hands of Moses, with the mighty works of the ten plagues and salvation at the Sea (Ex 7:14–11:10, and 12:37–15:22). When the people gained their freedom, they were led to Mount Sinai, where they had their very first experience of God's presence (a theophany) and received the covenant law of the Ten Commandments as the Lord established covenant relationship with them, by which they were adopted into Yahweh's family, with their lives under the control of Yahweh, who became their God and they became Yahweh's children (Ex 6:7).[372] The covenant law consists of two parts, the first was to be faithful to Yahweh as stated in the first commandment, "I am the Lord your God, who brought you out of the land of Egypt, out of the house of slavery; you shall have no other gods before me" (Ex 20:2), meaning that the Yahweh God they worshipped was to be the ultimate source of their values and behavior, for to worship other false gods, i.e. forsaking the covenant, would be idolatry,[373] deserving the death penalty

[371] Guinan, 30–31.
[372] Ibid., 56–62.
[373] Ibid., 63.

(Ex 22:20). The second part was how the covenant people were to treat each other with love and justice as an outflowing of their wholehearted worship of Yahweh, in contrast to social injustice as an outflowing of idolatry, especially toward those easily exploited, such as the poor, the widow and orphan, and the alien without legal rights, as Israel was reminded of their alien experience in Egypt (Ex 22:21–25).[374]

After explaining to Israel the stipulations of the Ten Commandments and their implications, Yahweh expressed the desire to live among them, as Yahweh said to Moses, "And I have them make me a sanctuary, so that I may dwell among them" (Ex 25:8); which was followed by instructions for the construction of the tabernacle (Ex 25–31).[375] But before the construction began, the people sinned against Yahweh by making and worshiping a golden calf, and brought about Yahweh's announcement that an angel would go with them in Yahweh's place, lest they be destroyed by Yahweh's holy presence (Ex 33:2–3).[376] The making of the golden calf, similar to the eating of the forbidden fruit, is another example of humankind's attempt to break the boundaries of creaturely existence, refusing to acknowledge human finiteness and creaturely dependence on God, which is a violation of the Creator/creature relationship.[377] But at the plea of Moses, "If your presence will not go, do not carry us up from here. For how shall it be known that I have found favor in your sight, I and your people, unless you go with us…," Yahweh consented and declared, "My presence will go with you, and I will give you rest" (Ex 33:14). As Och describes it, this is a reaffirmation of Yahweh's presence

[374] Guinan, 64–65.

[375] Gordon D. Fee, *Paul, the Spirit, and the People of God* (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson Publishers, Inc., 1996), 11.

[376] Ibid.

[377] Och, 241.

among a "stiff-necked," sinful people, for while Israel may violate the covenant stipulations, Yahweh chooses to be faithful to the covenant established at Sinai, and not to change the divine plan of making Israel a channel of Yahweh's blessing to humankind.[378] The events of Exodus climaxed at the glory of the Lord entering the tabernacle, symbolizing Yahweh's presence among the covenant people of Israel (Ex 40:34–38).

Yahweh's holy presence among the covenant people demands that they be holy, as the Book of Leviticus tells of Yahweh's repeated command, "You shall be holy, for I the Lord your God am holy" (Lv 19:2; repeated in 11:44–45; 20:7, 26). Positively, holiness implies "attachment to" God in holy living—acknowledging Yahweh alone as the Holy One, to be manifested also in right relationships with others; negatively, it implies "separation from" what is unholy, unclean, impure, and sinful.[379] The following verses continue to explain these positive and negative implications: "You shall each revere your mother and father, and you shall keep my sabbaths: I am the Lord your God. Do not turn to idols or make cast images for yourselves: I am the Lord your God" (Lv 19:3–4). Similar to the stipulations of the Ten Commandments, acknowledging Yahweh alone as the Holy One affects one's relationships with others, beginning with honoring parents, then in solidarity with other people by keeping sabbath rest to be shared by all, including children, slaves, aliens and even livestock (Ex 20:10; 23:12; Dt 5:14).[380] Negatively, acknowledging Yahweh alone as the Holy One also implies not turning to idols and images, besides separating from people, things, and circumstances that are unholy, unclean, impure,

[378] Och, 242.
[379] Guinan, 75–76.
[380] Ibid., 78.

and sinful, as commanded in Leviticus 11:1–16:34.[381] Toward the end of the Book, Yahweh reiterates the covenant promise: “I will place my dwelling in your midst, and I shall not abhor you. And I will walk among you, and will be your God, and you shall be my people,” (Lv 26:11-12) as well as punishments that follow from not keeping the Commandments in grateful response to Yahweh’s deliverance of them from slavery in Egypt.

The Book of Numbers recounts Yahweh’s training the rebellious children of Israel to be faithful to their covenant relationship as they journeyed through the wilderness. They were given Yahweh’s command to set up the tabernacle to encamp at the covering of the cloud over the tabernacle, and to set out on their journey at the lifting of the cloud (Nu 9:15–18), symbolizing Yahweh’s presence and leading of the people through the wilderness. After having spent a year on Mount Horeb where the Lord established covenant relationship with them, the cloud lifted from the tabernacle for the first time, signaling the Lord’s command that it was the time for them to get moving into the wilderness, as recorded in Deuteronomy many years later: “You have stayed long enough at this mountain. Resume your journey and go into the hill country…as well as into the neighboring regions…the land of the Canaanites…and take possession of the land that I swore to your ancestors…and to their descendants after them" (Dt 1:6–8). As Guinan puts it, the Israelites were not allowed to settle down too long on their journey, for the “God of the Bible is a God who calls us continually out of security and comfort into unknown and risky futures.”[382] Numbers also records numerous times the people of Israel were disciplined by the Lord: e.g. when they complained about not having food other than

[381] Guinan, 76.
[382] Ibid., 86.

manna, the Lord was angry and struck them with severe plagues that killed many of them (Nu 11; 21:4–9); when, upon hearing the negative report of ten of the spies, even grumbled about returning to Egypt despite having witnessed many signs and wonders the Lord had performed, Yahweh announced the punishment of their dying in the desert instead of entering the land (Nu 14); and when they complained of not having water, and Moses, instead of speaking to the rock for water as commanded by the Lord, struck the rock, and brought upon himself and Aaron the same punishment of not being allowed to enter the Promised Land (Nu 20:1–13).

Finally, Deuteronomy, the last book of the Pentateuch, reminds and exhorts the children of Israel to be faithful to their covenant with the Lord, who had been faithful in delivering them out of slavery and oppression in Egypt (Dt 6:12), and despite their rebelliousness throughout the journey (Dt 9:7), had cared for them for forty years as they journeyed through wilderness (Dt 8:2); therefore, they were told not to forget the Lord by disobeying the Ten Commandments (Dt 8:11), especially by worshiping other gods (Dt 6:13–15; 9:12). The Lord's blessing and curse were set before them: if they obeyed the covenant commandments by loving and serving the Lord, they would possess and enjoy the land richly blessed and cared for by the Lord for a long time to come; but if they disobeyed by turning to and worshiping other gods, the opposite would be true, and they would perish from the land (Dt 11 and 28).

As Bowe summarizes, the covenant theme is built into the literary structure of the Pentateuch: focusing on the promise made with Abraham (Gn 12:1–3; 15:5–7, 18–21 and 17) and with Israel (Ex 6:7–8), and on the Ten Commandments (Ex 20:2-17 and Dt 5:6–21) that constitute the heart of the covenant and lay the foundation for communal cohesion and holy living in the presence of the holy God, who promised to protect and care for the vassals, and

the latter in turn would pledge their allegiance to Yahweh, and be bound by the stipulations of the covenant to protect widows, orphans, aliens, and the poor (Ex 19:5–6; Lev 19:1–2; 26:12).[383] This covenant theme is a relational theme, expressing how through the covenant God Yahweh establishes an intimate relationship with Israel, which impacts their relationship with people as well. It is within this intimate loving relationship that Yahweh nurtures the faith of the covenant people toward living out their royal status as image-bearers of the living God.

In the Prophetic Literature:

Before they entered the promised land, Moses' successor Joshua summoned the people saying, "Choose this day whom you will serve, whether the gods your ancestors served in the region beyond the River or the gods of the Amorites in whose land you are living; but as for me and my household, we will serve the Lord" (Jos 24:15). Such choosing meant making authentic spirituality a daily choice and commitment to aligning themselves with Yahweh by faithfully living out the values and stipulations of the covenant and contending with "other gods"—forces opposed to the ways of God.[384] In the beginning of their life in the promised land, the early judges whom the Lord raised up to lead them in the fight against their enemies were still faithful to the Lord, as demonstrated by Gideon's words in response to the people's request to make him and his son and grandson rulers over them: "I will not rule over you, and my son will not rule over you; the Lord will rule over you" (Jdg 8:22).

But with the decline of the judges and the rise of the Monarchy, despite Yahweh's eternal covenant made with the house of King David (2 Sm 7:12–16), instead of pledging

[383] Bowe, 70–72.
[384] Ibid., 76.

covenant allegiance to Yahweh, Israel was now bound politically by covenant allegiance to their kings (2 Sm 5:3). This king would rule over them like those in the nations, as Yahweh had forewarned them through the prophet Samuel, telling them that such kings would "exact forced labor, expropriate land, implore heavy taxes…require absolute submission."[385] Therefore, concurrent with the time of the monarchy, prophets were called by Yahweh to speak to kings and peoples alike to challenge covenant violators and nurture covenant faith, as the prophet Jeremiah conveys Yahweh's demand of his role: "See, today I appoint you over nations and over kingdoms, to pluck up and to pull down, to destroy and to overthrow, to build and to plant" (Jr 1:10).[386] In other words, prophets are channels through which Yahweh used to guard or maintain covenant relationship with the people of Israel.

While Israel were often found to reject Yahweh's rule, Yahweh remained faithful to the covenant. His loving actions towards Israel since the time of Exodus to their return to their homeland after the exile, may be summarized by Margaret Parker's four metaphorical image clusters or vivid word pictures—images of spousal relationships, animals, vineyards, and drinking of wine that prophets employed to convey Yahweh's messages in four Acts.[387] Parker teaches at New College in Berkeley, where she received her Master's degree in Biblical Studies on imaginative strategies for Bible teachers to help students appreciate the literary power of scripture.[388] These four image clusters are very helpful in summarizing the major content of the prophetic messages; but instead of covering all four image clusters, in the following I

[385] Bowe, 79.
[386] Ibid., 84.
[387] Margaret Parker, "Exploring Four Persistent Prophet Images," *Bible Review* 6, no. 5 (1990): 39.
[388] Margaret Parker, "Exploring Four Persistent Prophet Images," Biblical Archaeology Society Online Archive, accessed 9/21/2018, https://www-baslibrary-org.dtl.idm.oclc.org/bible-review/6/5/8.

summarize the one that focuses on spousal relationship, supplemented by other scholars' explanations.

Act 1—Covenant Relationship: When Israel were delivered from their bondage in Egypt, Yahweh initiated the covenant relationship by playing the role of the suitor lover, like a bridegroom delighting in Israel, whom he had chosen to love and upon whom he lavished all kinds of gifts to make her the lovely bride, as described by the prophet Ezekiel:[389]

> I passed by you…; you were at the age for love. I spread the edge of my cloak over you and covered your nakedness: I pledged myself to you and entered into a covenant with you, says the Lord God, and you became mine. Then I bathed you…. I clothed you…. I adorned you with ornaments…and a beautiful crown upon your head…. You grew exceedingly beautiful, fit to be a queen (Eze 16:8–13).

Blessed with the presence of Yahweh (symbolized by the Tabernacle), the people of Israel were led through the wilderness until they reached the Promised Land, where the Tabernacle was replaced by Solomon's Temple, and the same glory as that over the Tabernacle (Ex 40) filled the Temple (1 Kgs 8:1–11) in Jerusalem, the place chosen for Yahweh's Name to dwell.[390]

Act 2—Israel's Rebellion: Israelites' violation of covenant commandments—idolatry against Yahweh and injustice against people, refers primarily to the period from their settling in the Promised Land to the time of the Exile. While Yahweh's bride was chosen to enjoy intimate relationship with the Lord, she was soon to turn to worshiping idols in violation of the very first of the Ten Commandments as the Prophet Jeremiah conveyed of Yahweh's word:

> She saw that for all the adulteries of that faithless one, Israel, I had sent her away with a decree of divorce; yet her false sister Judah did not fear, but she too went and played the whore. Because she took her whoredom so lightly, she polluted the land, committing adultery with stone and tree (Jr 3:8–9).

[389] Parker, 40–41.
[390] Fee, 11.

Not only did Israel violate covenant relationship toward Yahweh, they also violated covenant relationship toward easy victims of exploitation living among them, as the Prophet Isaiah protested on behalf of Yahweh: "Your princes are rebels and companions of thieves. Everyone loves a bribe and runs after gifts. They do not defend the orphan, and the widow's cause does not come before them" (Is 1:23). They were not mindful of the passionate concerns of the Lord despite having been reminded repeatedly of this prior to their entering Canaan: "[The Lord] executes justice for the orphan and the widow, and loves the strangers, providing them food and clothing. You shall also love the stranger, for you were strangers in the land of Egypt" (Dt 10:18–19); and "You shall not deprive a resident alien or an orphan of justice; you shall not take a widow's garment in pledge. Remember that you were a slave in Egypt and the Lord your God redeemed you from there; therefore, I command you to do this" (Dt 24:17–18).

Act 3—Yahweh's Punishment: As the prophetic voice of Ezekiel and others made clear: terrible and just consequences would follow Israel's rebellion against Yahweh:[391]

> Because…of all your abominable idols, and because of the blood of your children that you gave to them, therefore, I will gather all your lovers…I will deliver you into their hands…; they shall strip you of your clothes and take your beautiful objects and leave you naked and bare (Eze 16:36–37, 39).

Parker explains that "nakedness" often figures in the imagery of punishment (Jr 13:25–26), as in the shameful exposure of the harlot's nakedness, and the carcasses of victims of war, plague, and famine who are left unburied and exposed to be devoured by wild animals (Jr 7:33).[392] Because of Israel's failure to keep the commandments, they forfeited Yahweh's presence in their midst, as results of which the temple in Jerusalem was destroyed, the people were carried

[391] Parker, 42.
[392] Ibid., 43.

away in captivity, and those who remained were no longer distinguished by the presence of the living God among them.[393] Ezekiel vividly describes of the departure of the "glory of the Lord" from the Temple in Jerusalem as follows: "Then the glory of the Lord went out from the threshold of the house and stopped above the cherubim. The cherubim lifted up their wings and rose up from the earth in my sight as they went out with the wheels beside them…" (Eze 10:18-19).[394]

Act 4—Yahweh's Restoration of Israel: As Parker points out, Yahweh does not allow Israel's rebellion to have the last word, but plans for the return of a remnant from the exile like a second exodus:[395]

> Therefore, I will now allure her, and bring her into the wilderness, and speak tenderly to her…. There she shall respond as in the days of her youth…when she came out of the land of Egypt…. And I will take you for my wife forever; I will take you for my wife in righteousness and in justice, in steadfast love, and in mercy. (Ho 2:14-15, 19)
>
> Do not fear…; for…the disgrace of your widowhood you will remember no more. For your Maker is your husband…the Holy One of Israel is your Redeemer…. For a brief moment I abandoned you, but with great compassion I will gather you. In overflowing wrath for a moment…, but with everlasting love I will have compassion on you…" (Is 54:4–8).

Claus Westermann, renowned Old Testament scholar, describes as follows how Yahweh suffered along with Israel as she underwent her well-deserved suffering:[396]

> That God has turned once again to his people is shown in that he suffers under the judgment that he has had to bring upon them: "For a long time I have held my peace, I have kept still and restrained myself" (Is 42:14). Thus, the suffering that Yahweh has had to bring upon his people, and that he himself finds heavy, breaks forth in the lament of

[393] Fee, 12
[394] Ibid., 13.
[395] Parker, 43.
[396] Westermann, *Prophetic Oracles of Salvation in the Old Testament* (Louisville, KY: Westminster/John Knox Press, 1991), 40–41.

> the people, "How long?" When God turns again to his people they are liberated, gathered together, and brought home.

The New Covenant: In addition to Yahweh's restoration of Israel at the end of the exile when a remnant will be returning home like a second exodus as described in Act 4, Yahweh promises through the prophet Jeremiah of establishing with Israel a "new covenant"—the only occurrence of this in the Old Testament:

> The days are surely coming…when I will make a new covenant with the house of Israel and the house of Judah. It will not be like the covenant that I made with their ancestors when I took them by the hand to bring them out of the land of Egypt—a covenant that they broke, though I was their husband…. But this is the covenant that I will make with the house of Israel after those days…I will put my law within them, and I will write it on their hearts; and I will be their God, and they shall be my people. No longer shall they teach one another, or say to each other, "Know the Lord," for they shall all know me, from the least of them to the greatest…for I will forgive their iniquity and remember their sin no more (Jr 31:31–34).

Apparently, in the original context of this prophecy, the promise speaks explicitly about a "transformed remnant" from a "reunited Israel" in which everyone, from the least to the greatest of the people, will experience forgiveness of sins resulting in a true knowledge of God, as the law would be internalized in the human heart.[397] However, while the context in Jeremiah speaks of the Lord's promise of a restored national Israel under the Davidic king— "Only if I had not established my covenant with…the ordinances of heaven and earth, would I reject the offspring of Jacob and of my servant David and not choose any of his descendants as rulers over the offspring of Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob" (Jr 33:25–26)— Derouchie rightly points out that as a "prophet to the nations" (Jr 1:5), Jeremiah prophesied that the new covenant post-exilic community would include a transformed remnant from both an ethnic reunified Israel and non-

[397] Jason S. Derouchie, "Counting Stars with Abraham and the Prophets: New Covenant Ecclesiology in Old Testament Perspective," *Journal of the Evangelical Theological Society* 58, no. 3 (2015), 462.

Israelite "nations," because following Israel's return to the land, transformed people from the nations would gather in the reunified Israel under the presence of the Lord:[398]

> At that time Jerusalem shall be called the throne of the Lord, and all nations shall gather to it, to the presence of the Lord in Jerusalem, and they shall no longer stubbornly follow their own evil will. In those days the house of Judah shall join the house of Israel, and together they shall come from the land of the north to the land that I gave your ancestors for a heritage (Jr 3:17–18).

Then the following text anticipates the fulfillment of the Abrahamic blessing overflowing to the nations because of Israel's loyalty: "If you return…to me, if you remove your abominations from my presence, and do not waver, and if you swear, 'As the Lord lives!' in truth, in justice, and in uprightness, then nations shall be blessed by him, and by him they shall boast (Jr 4:1–2).[399] In regards to the prophecy that "they shall all know me, from the least of them to the greatest," Brueggemann suggests that it implies a "common, shared access to this knowledge of God" and that in "crucial matter of connection to God, the least and the greatest stand on equal footing. No one has superior…access, and no one lacks what is required."[400] The familiar verse from *pirke Aboth*—a collection of rabbinic maxims and sayings from the third century BCE, amplified and extended through succeeding generations as "traditions of the elders," which became part of the Mishnah in 219 CE[401]— is cited by Rhymer: "When two sit and there are…words of Torah, the Shechinah rests between them, as it is said, 'Then they that feared the Lord spoke one with one another…,'" to suggest that "there was a tradition within Judaism where unmediated access to Torah was encouraged."[402]

[398] Derouchie, 462.

[399] Ibid., 463.

[400] David Rhymer, "Jeremiah 31:31–34," *Interpretation* 59, no. 3 (July 2005), 295.

[401] "Pirke Aboth-Encyclopedia of the Bible," Bible Gateway, accessed 12/21/2018, https://www.biblegateway.com/resources/encyclopedia-of-the-bible/Pirke-Aboth.

[402] Rhymer, 295.

However, some scholars question the fulfillment of the "new covenant" as referring to the post-exilic remnant community, because it presents a direct challenge to the post-exilic culture as epitomized in Nehemiah 8, which suggests that the teaching of the Torah was the dominant feature of religious life.[403] For when the book of the law of Moses was brought and read by Ezra before the assembly, the people not only heard the word, they were helped by the Levites to understand the law, which was contrary to Jeremiah's prophecy that the Lord would put the law in their hearts, and that "no longer shall they teach one another" (Jr 31:33–34).[404] Apparently, the new covenant transformation anticipated by Jeremiah was at best partially realized during the post-exilic era; and as Derouchie suggests, it is in Christ that the new covenant is enacted, thus marking "a redemptive-historical shift from an age of promise to an age of fulfillment," which explains why "the writer of Hebrews so naturally applies the new covenant promises of Jeremiah 31:31–34 to the church (He 8:6–10)," within which both ethnic Jews and Gentile nations are included.[405] The Church Era (from the time of the outpouring of the Holy Spirit at Pentecost to the time Christ comes again) also fulfills Jeremiah's prophecy that the Lord would put the law in the hearts of people, so that they would no longer teach one another, because the Holy Spirit would indwell Christ's disciples forever (Jn 14:16), and would bring to remembrance and teach all that Christ had taught them (Jn 14:26), bear witness along with them (Jn 15:26), and guide them into all truth (Jn 16:13).

In the Psalms:

[403] Rhymer, 294.
[404] Ibid., 294–295.
[405] Derouchie, 464, 474–475.

While Israel has been in constant rebellion against Yahweh, Yahweh does not cease nurturing their faith through the Psalms as a "school of prayer," tutoring them in the language of prayer, so that by praying the Psalms, "one learns new ways to imagine oneself, to relate to others and to God, and to live one's life, thus gaining insights to the spiritual processes encountered on one's life journey."[406] As Yahweh led the psalmists through a whole spectrum of human conditions, they brought their joy and sorrow, hope and fear, longing and gratitude, solace and lament before the Lord in prayer, thereby experienced a deepening relationship with their covenant God.[407] John Endres describes the psalms as the "mirror of life" as they seem to share "the analogy of human experience," reflecting the psalmists' relationship with God.[408] There were shouts of praise: "Clap your hands, all you peoples; shout to God with loud songs of joy. For the Lord, the Most High, is awesome, a great king over all the earth" (Ps 47:1–2); groanings in desperation: "Help, O Lord, for there is no longer anyone who is godly; the faithful have disappeared from humankind" (Ps 12:1); even cries of vengeance: "Happy shall they be who take your little ones and dash them against the rock" (Ps 137:9)![409]

Walter Brueggemann, Professor of Old Testament at Columbia Theological Seminary (1986-2003) and currently William Marcellus McPheeters professor emeritus of Old Testament at Columbia, is author of over one hundred books. His best-known work is perhaps that on the Psalms.[410] Brueggemann explores the movement of the Psalms from the first to the last in his

[406] Westermann, 121; John C. Endres, "Psalms and Spirituality in the 21st Century," *Interpretation* 56, no. 2 (Apr 2002): 150, 154.

[407] Bowe, 122; Endres, 154.

[408] Endres, 149-150.

[409] Bowe, 122–123.

[410] "Walter Brueggemann Biography," Walter Brueggemann, accessed 1/2/2019, https://www.walterbrueggemann.com/about/.

article “Bounded by Obedience and Praise: The Psalms as Canon,” to make sense of the theological intentionality of the Book of Psalms as a whole.[411] This also reveals how the spirituality of Israel was shaped by their covenant relationship with Yahweh in the process. Brueggemann explains that Psalm 1, with its theme of obedience, was intentionally placed as the preface to the Book of Psalms and reflects the “didactic piety of the post-exilic period when the book was put into final form,” suggesting the rest of the psalms be read from the perspective of “Torah obedience.”[412] This first psalm is a portrayal of how those who live in obedience to Torah enjoy the outcome of a blessed life; but those who fail to do so are like chaff that is blown away, a metaphor suggesting the exile and revealing the psalm’s likely intention to evoke “a community of trusting, joyous obedience” to the Torah.[413] Brueggemann then proceeds to explain that Psalm 150, intentionally placed at the end, is a psalm that simply offers unending praises to God without giving any reason or motivation for praise as other psalms of praise do. This, he says, reveals that “Israel’s life with God when lived faithfully, ends in glad, unconditional praise, completely…focused on God.”[414] In other words, “the canonical shape of the collection of the Psalms” asserts that “life lived in Israel’s covenant” begins with Torah obedience and ends with doxology—unconditional praise of Yahweh, i.e. moves from duty to delight![415]

To move from duty to delight as Israel prays from Psalm 1 to Psalm 150, Brueggemann proposes a way through “candor about suffering and gratitude about hope” by selecting two

[411] Walter Brueggemann, “Bounded by Obedience and Praise: The Psalms as Canon,” *Journal for the Study of the Old Testament* 50 (1991), 64.

[412] Ibid.

[413] Ibid., 65–66.

[414] Ibid., 67–68.

[415] Ibid., 68.

types of psalms: the Psalm of Lament and the Hymn of Trust toward either end of Psalms 1 and 150 respectively, to reflect the reality of human life that seems to make the promise of Torah obedience futile and the unconditional praise inconceivable![416] For an illustration of the two types of psalms, I select Psalm 44 as a Psalm of Lament (in place of Brueggemann's Psalm 25) and Psalm 103 as a Hymn of Trust, with additional comments by others.

A mode of prayer with great capacity to shape Israel's faith but neglected in our contemporary Western world is the lament. It has given form to Israel's worst experiences in life as they present their cases to the covenant God who alone is able to ease their suffering,[417] and it is sometimes uttered along with a plea for vengeance, which reveals their willingness to abandon personal retaliation but to entrust the whole matter to God's hand.[418] As Endres observes, articulating such vengeance is a call for restitution, although God's desires do not always match the psalmists'.[419] Psalm 44 begins with a recollection of salvation history, referring to the conquest of Canaan as well as to personal history by the mighty hand of God (vv. 1–3), followed by a confession of faith and trust as did their ancestors (vv. 4-8). Then it proceeds to a lament over their present tragic defeat, rejection (vv. 9–12) and humiliation (vv. 13–16), followed by a reflection and assertion of their own covenant faithfulness (vv. 17–22). Starting with another plea for deliverance (v. 23), the psalmist raises further complaints against Yahweh for being silent to their sufferings (vv. 24–25).[420] Finally, contrary to an earlier plea for

[416] Brueggemann, 72.

[417] Bowe, 123

[418] Sheila Carney, "God Damn God: A Reflection on Expressing Anger in Prayer," *Biblical Theology Bulletin* 13 (1983), 116.

[419] Endres, 152.

[420] James Luther Mays, *Psalms*, Interpretation: A Bible Commentary for Teaching and Preaching (Louisville, KY: John Knox Press, 1994), 176.

deliverance based on their own faithfulness (v. 23), the last plea for deliverance is based on Yahweh's steadfast love (v. 26).

Therefore, in the process of candid lament that starts by giving full expression to suffering, rage, humiliation, and disappointment, the people of God protest against the first Psalm's simplistic theological affirmations of blessings for the obedient, but toward the end of the Psalm, the people come to acknowledge that ultimately they cannot rely on their own faithfulness, but can appeal only to God's steadfast love for their deliverance. And in case deliverance does not come, as James Boice puts it, "the love of God is of such quality that even the terrible defeats of the present moment are not without a purpose and will not, even in the worst extremity, sever the believing one from God."[421] Therefore Yahweh, through the "school of prayer" cultivates in God's people a faith that honestly deals with human emotions by providing a "safe framework for the ventilation of feelings of loss, confusion, outrage—an experience which takes place within, supported by, and blessed by the community."[422]

According to Brueggemann, the candor of suffering expressed in the psalm of lament moves toward a gratitude rooted in hope that Yahweh's *hesed* steadfast love will prevail, as Psalm 103, a psalm of trust clearly demonstrates.[423] The psalmist alludes to two kinds of human problems that challenge the simplicity of Psalm 1 as does the psalm of lament: first, the guilty in Psalm 103 do not perish despite the fact that their *sin* violates the moral standard of Psalm 1; and second, *death* violates the same moral standard, but it comes upon both the wicked as well

[421] James Montgomery Boice, *Psalms* 3 vols. (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 1996), 378.
[422] Carney, 119.
[423] Brueggemann, 75.

as the righteous.[424] In Psalm 103, although sin is acknowledged, Yahweh "does not deal with us according to our sins, nor repay us according to our iniquities" (v. 10), for Yahweh's steadfast love is offered to "those who fear him," the obedient ones of Psalm 1.[425] Psalm 103 also addresses the problem of death and finitude: although the righteous die just as the wicked ones of Psalm 1 do, again Yahweh's steadfast love and sovereign attentiveness is offered to those who fear him—the obedient ones of Psalm 1, as the psalmist affirms:

> For he knows how we were made; he remembers that we are dust…; their days are like grass; they flourish like a flower of the field…. But the steadfast love of the Lord is from everlasting to everlasting on those who fear him, and his righteousness to children's children, to those who keep his covenant and remember to do his commandments (Ps 103:14–18).

Therefore, moving beyond the simplicity of Psalm 1, the Psalter gives hope to Yahweh's covenant people by leading them through the crisis of fidelity into the reality of Yahweh's steadfast love as repeatedly expressed in Psalm 103: "who redeems your life from the Pit, who crowns you with steadfast love and mercy" (v. 4); "The Lord is merciful and gracious, slow to anger and abounding in steadfast love" (v. 8); "For as the heavens are high above the earth, so great is his steadfast love toward those who fear him" (v. 11); and "But the steadfast love of the Lord is from everlasting to everlasting on those who fear him…" (v. 17).[426]

Finally, Brueggemann proposes Psalm 73, a Psalm of Thanksgiving, as the "pivot of the canonical structure of the Psalter," because of its "dramatic theological movement" or transformation from *hesed* doubted of the Psalm of Lament (Ps 44) to *hesed* trusted of the

[424] Brueggemann, 75–76.
[425] Ibid., 76.
[426] Ibid., 77.

Hymn of Trust (Ps 103).[427] Psalm 73 begins with the declaration: "Truly God is good to the upright, to those who are pure in heart," which affirms the simple conviction of Psalm 1 that the obedient are blessed; but immediately from verses 2–12, the Psalmist protests against this affirmation, for the wicked not only do not perish, they increasingly prosper despite their wickedness![428] So the Psalmist, in a moment of discouragement and disappointment, is tempted to abandon the moral structure of Torah obedience as the Psalmist draws the conclusion that "all in vain I have kept my heart clean and washed my hands in innocence" (v. 13).[429] But the Psalm pivots on verse 17: "until I went into the sanctuary of God; then I perceived their end," when the Psalmist re-perceives reality by reaffirming the simple piety of Psalm 1, that the wicked will perish (vv. 18–20); and also re-perceives oneself as being stupid and ignorant toward God: "When my soul was embittered, when I was pricked in heart, I was stupid and ignorant; I was like a brute beast toward you" (vv. 21–22).[430] Finally, the Psalmist declares the discernment that face-to-face trustful communion with God is all that matters (vv. 23–26):[431]

> Nevertheless, I am continually with you; you hold my right hand. You guide me with your counsel, and afterward you will receive me with honor. Whom have I in heaven but you? And there is nothing on earth that I desire other than you. My flesh and my heart may fail, but God is the strength of my heart and my portion forever.

While the wicked enjoy the blessings promised to the righteous in Psalm 1, the God of long-term fidelity is present, caring, powerful, and attentive toward the faithful as affirmed by verse

[427] Brueggemann, 81.
[428] Ibid., 84.
[429] Ibid.
[430] Ibid., 85.
[431] Ibid., 85–86.

26 that Yahweh is the 'portion' of the psalmist, thus advocating the radical faith that communion with God is all that matters, as the Psalmist declares at the end: "But for me it is good to be near God" (v. 28). Therefore, through the School of prayer, the people Israel were led to enjoy Yahweh's presence from Torah obedience through lament in suffering, thanksgiving despite set back, trust in Yahweh's steadfast love, and finally to unconditional praise, as they lived in covenant relationship with Yahweh throughout their lives.

Spiritual Formation of Disciples by Jesus Christ

Introduction: Since the beginning of creation, God has always desired to establish intimate relationship with humankind made in God's own image. Even after the Fall, God continued to pursue such a communion, as demonstrated by Yahweh's presence (theophany) and initiation of covenant relationship with Abraham, with the people of Israel, with David, and eventually climaxed in sending his unique Son Jesus Christ to the world. He came in fulfillment of the prophetic word of the Lord's renewed presence, as Malachi proclaims, "And the Lord whom you seek will suddenly come to his temple…" (Mal 3:1); and as the Gospel of John testifies, "And the Word became flesh and lived (literally, "camp in a tent") among us, and we have seen his glory, the glory as of a father's only son, full of grace and truth" (Jn 1:14).

Generally recognized as the first canonical gospel composed, and more so than the other gospels, the Gospel of Mark focuses on discipleship—the spiritual formation of the disciples— as the first mission Jesus took upon himself when he began his ministry. A "disciple" is "someone who stands in relation to another as pupil, and is instructed by that person,"[432]

[432] P. Nepper-Christiansen, "μαθητὴς" in *Exegetical Dictionary of the New Testament* vol. 2, eds. Horst Balz and Gerhard Schneider, 372–74 (Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1991), 372.

who is then his or her "teacher." Appearing 261 times in the New Testament, the word "disciple" refers primarily to a person who follows Jesus.[433] The calling of disciples to follow after him reveals the self-understanding of Jesus, who sees the "embodiment of the breaking in of the new kingdom of God in his own person,"[434] as demonstrated by his calling of two sets of brothers to follow him (1:16–20) right after his proclamation, "The time is fulfilled, and the kingdom of God has come near, repent, and believe in the good news" (1:15). Jesus proclaims the good news of God as the nearness of the kingdom of God's reign; then he calls for repentance and faith to that good news. Mark tells the story of how these two sets of brothers dropped their nets and left their boats (i.e. turned from their former way of life toward the person of Jesus) to engage in a discipleship process for the cause of the kingdom.[435]

However, there was a conflict between Jesus' messianic expectation and that of the Jewish people of his time (his disciples included): while the latter expected a Davidic, political Messiah as promised in 2 Samuel 7:12–13, one who would liberate them from Roman suppression, Jesus expected the Messiah of God to go through extreme humiliation and suffering based on Isaiah 53 (8:31; 9:31; 10:33–34) before his exaltation as prophesied in Daniel 7:13–14 (13:26; 14:62).[436] Such contrasting expectations explain why his disciples had a difficult time accepting his having to go through suffering and death as the Davidic Messiah. Based on Narry Santos' presentation of the authority motif that fits into the disciples' messianic

[433] Nepper-Christiansen, 372.

[434] Hans Weder, trans. Dennis Martin, "Disciple, Discipleship," *The Anchor Bible Dictionary*, vol. 2 (1991), 208.

[435] Joel B. Green, *The Way of the Cross: Following Jesus in the Gospel of Mark* (Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock Publisher, 2009), 52–53.

[436] Hans F. Bayer, A *Theology of Mark: The Dynamic between Christology and Authentic Discipleship*. (Phillipsburg, NJ: P & R Publishing, 2012), 43.

expectations in the first half of Mark (1:1–8:21) and the Servanthood motif in the second half of Mark (8:22–16:8) that fits into an essential part of Jesus' expectations,[437] the Gospel of Mark presents a discipleship process that demonstrates Jesus' identity as the Son of God "Authority" motif and a discipleship process that demonstrates Jesus' identity as the Son of Man "Servanthood" motif.

Following Christ, the Son of God "Authority" Motif in Discipleship:

The Gospel of Mark begins with the author's proclamation: "The beginning of the gospel of Jesus Christ, the Son of God" (1:1), which reveals the identity of Jesus against the backdrop of Isaiah's prophecy: the coming of John the Baptist (1:2–8; Isa 40:3–5); confirmed by God at his baptism, with the descending of the Holy Spirit upon him and the voice from heaven testifying, "You are my Son, the Beloved; with you I am well pleased" (1:9–11; Isa 42:1).

Jesus' Authoritative Calling and Mission: As most scholars agree, successful discipleship always starts with Jesus' initiation in calling, followed by the disciples' immediate positive response in abandoning their families and possessions to his unexpected calling.[438] When Jesus called the first two sets of brothers, Simon and Andrew, and James and John, "Follow me and I will make you fish for people," they left behind their nets, boat, father and hired men to follow Jesus (1:16–20). Apparently, to accept the call to discipleship requires the letting go of their "tools of trade"—nets and boats, "servants"—a sign of success and authority (with men under their control), and a radical break from the family and family tradition; in other words, they are to

[437] Narry F. Santos, *Slave of All: The Paradox of Authority and Servanthood in the Gospel of Mark*, Journal for the Study of the New Testament Supplement Series 237 (New York: Sheffield Academic Press, 2003), 59.

[438] H. F. Peacock, "Discipleship in the Gospel of Mark," *Review and Expositor* 75 (1978): 557; Martin Hengel, *The Charismatic Leader and His Followers* (Eugene, OR: Wipf and Stock Publishers, 2005), 61.

leave behind everything considered essential for "human success."[439] And as Weder puts it, "the movement to discipleship is categorized as "social up-rootedness," for it requires "renunciation of possessions, abandonment of social ties, and existence as a wandering charismatic."[440]

The story in Mark 3:13–19 reveals the nature and authority of Jesus' call of the Twelve disciples to be "apostles"—envoys sent on his mission:

> He went up the mountain and called to him those whom he wanted, and they came to him. And he appointed twelve, whom he also named apostles, to be with him, and to be sent out to proclaim the message, and to have authority to cast out demons. So he appointed the twelve: Simon (to whom he gave the name Peter); James son of Zebedee and John the brother of James (to whom he gave the name Boanerges, that is, Sons of Thunder); and…Judas Iscariot, who betrayed him.

Again, there is the emphasis on Jesus' initiative, for he called only those whom "he wanted," as well as the emphasis on the immediate, wordless response of his followers, who "came to him" (v.13).[441] To explain the significance of "to be with him," H.F. Peacock describes it as the privilege of an intimate relationship and of journeying with Jesus, being given the opportunity to many private instructions in the home.[442] Eugene La Verdiere sees the main concern as being for the disciples to make the commitment to be with Jesus wherever he goes, even to the way of the cross in Jerusalem, and the commitment to the cause of the kingdom of God as Jesus does.[443] Green regards the primary call is not so much to doing great works for but to sharing life with Jesus: joining him on his way—walking, eating and drinking with him, listening to him,

[439] Francis J. Moloney, "The Vocation of the Disciples in the Gospel of Mark," *Salesianum* 43 (1978): 502–503.

[440] Weder, 209.

[441] Moloney, "The Vocation," 509.

[442] Peacock, 558.

[443] Eugene La Verdiere, *The Beginning of the Gospel: Introducing the Gospel According to Mark*, vol. 1 (Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 1999), 82, 154.

sharing hospitality as well as rejection with him, which leads to *being sent out* by him; for only by such communion with Jesus can they be empowered to proclaim the message of God's kingdom and to battle with evil forces.[444] Martin Hengel regards Jesus' call to discipleship as a call into "a community of life and destiny with Jesus," initiating them into service for the cause of God's kingdom by sharing Jesus' mission and authority, and becoming not only his messengers, but also his fellow-workers.[445]

Having been called and constituted as "apostles," the Twelve were sent out in pairs on their apostolic mission, given the authority and power over unclean spirits, and were instructed not to bring along anything other than essentials for their journey, such as a staff, a pair of sandals, and a tunic, but to rely on the hospitality provided by those who would welcome them into their homes to hear the proclamation of the kingdom message. Sure enough, as they followed the master's instructions, they were successful in fulfilling his mission, as the author summarizes: "So they went out and proclaimed that all should repent. They cast out many demons and anointed with oil many who were sick and cured them" (6:12–13). Through this mission endeavor, the disciples learned to live and work in total dependence on God's provision of their daily needs through those who were receptive to the Gospel, and on the authority of Jesus the messianic Son of God to cast out demons and heal the sick. At the end of their mission trip, they reported to Jesus that like Jesus they had proclaimed powerfully the good news of the kingdom of God not in words alone, but also in deeds.[446]

[444] Green, 59.
[445] Hengel, 75, 87–88.
[446] La Verdiere, vol. 1, 169.

Jesus' Authoritative Teaching and Mighty Work: Throughout the first half of Mark, besides Jesus' authoritative calling and mission, the process of discipleship also focuses on the disciples' observation of Jesus' authoritative teaching and mighty work in amazement as they journeyed with their master, for every instance that Mark reports of the people expressing amazement over Jesus' teaching and mighty work, the disciples were included and present among them.[447] They witnessed Jesus' authoritative teaching in the Synagogue in Capernaum, and all were "astounded, for he taught them as one having authority, and not as the scribes" (1:22). After Jesus had expelled an unclean spirit, the people were all "amazed" and kept on asking one another, "What is this? A new teaching—with authority! He commands even the unclean spirits, and they obey him" (1:27). When Jesus made the paralytic pick up his mat and walk in the presence of all those who were there listening to Jesus' preaching, the audience was "amazed" and glorified God saying, "We have never seen anything like this!" (2:12). When Jesus raised Jairus' twelve-year-old daughter from the dead in the privacy of her room, her parents, along with Jesus' disciples Peter, James, and John were there to witness the miracle, and they were overcome with "amazement" when the girl got up and began to walk about (5:42). When Jesus healed the deaf and mute man, the people were "astounded beyond measure, saying, 'He has done everything well; he even makes the deaf to hear and the mute to speak'" (7:37).

There were also occasions when Jesus' mighty works were performed directly for the disciples, which made them reflect on the identity of Jesus. On the night after having witnessed Jesus calming the storm at sea, the disciples were filled with "great awe" and said to one

[447] James M. Dawsey, *Peter's Last Sermon: Identity and Discipleship in the Gospel of Mark* (Macon, GA: Mercer University Press, 2010), 39.

another, “Who then is this, that even the wind and the sea obey him” (4:41)? On another occasion while the disciples were straining at the oars against the wind, Jesus walked on water toward them, and as soon as he got into the boat with them, the wind stopped; again, Mark reports that the disciples were utterly “astounded” (6:51).

Even on occasions when unclean spirits acknowledged Jesus as the Son of God, the disciples were present to witness the authority and power of Jesus over evil spirits, e.g. a man with an unclean spirit in the synagogue at Capernaum cried out, “What have you to do with us, Jesus of Nazareth? Have you come to destroy us? I know who you are, the Holy One of God” (1:24); and as the author reports: “Whenever the unclean spirits saw him, they fell down before him and shouted, ‘You are the Son of God’” (3:11). They also heard the man with an unclean spirit in the country of the Gerasenes, who ran over and bowed before Jesus, shouting at the top of his voice, “What have you to do with me, Jesus, Son of the Most High God? I adjure you by God, do not torment me” (5:6–7).

However, despite having listened to Jesus’ authoritative teachings on the coming kingdom and having witnessed his mighty works that signaled the kingdom’s arrival by exercising his power in healing the sick, his authority over unclean spirits, and over elements of nature, even over death,[448] Jesus had expressed on several occasions his disappointment over his disciples’ lack of faith and understanding. For example, after telling the parable of the Sower, when the disciples asked him in private about its meaning, Jesus said, “Do you not understand this parable? Then how will you understand all the parables?” (4:13); after calming the storm, He said to them, "Why are you afraid? Have you still no faith?" (4:40). The author

[448] Dawsey, 51.

has also made the comment about the disciples when they were astounded over Jesus walking on water, "for they did not understand about the loaves, but their hearts were hardened" (6:52). Finally, at the end of the first half of the Book of Mark, when the disciples discussed not having brought bread to the boat and misunderstood Jesus' comment about the yeast, Jesus said to them, "Why are you talking about having no bread? Do you still not perceive or understand? Are your hearts hardened? Do you have eyes, and fail to see? Do you have ears, and fail to hear…? Do you not yet understand?" (8:17–21).

Following Christ, the Son of Man "Servanthood" Motif in Discipleship:

The disciples' lack of faith and understanding of Jesus' identity calls for a new dimensions of discipleship,[449] which Jesus presents to his disciples during the "journey from the villages of Caesarea Philippi to Jerusalem."[450] Most scholars of the Gospel of Mark agree that this new dimension of discipleship (8:27–10:45) is marked by three discourses of Jesus' passion prediction and instruction to his disciples, and framed by the healing of the blind man in two stages (8:22–26) preceding it and the healing of the blind Bartimaeus (10:46-–2) following it as an *inclusio*,[451] for blindness is a common symbol for the lack of understanding and its recovery for the opening of the mind.[452] Since disciples have witnessed and personally experienced enough of the evidence to see Jesus as the messianic Son of God in the "Authority" motif in the first half of Mark, ; yet without a clue to Jesus as the messianic Son of Man in the

[449] Green, 67.

[450] E. Best, *Following Jesus: Discipleship in the Gospel of Mark*, Journal for the Study of the New Testament Supplement Series vol. 4 (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1982), 15.

[451] Best, 15; Paul J. Achtemeier, "And he followed him: Miracles and Discipleship in Mark 10:46–52," *Semeia* 11 (1978): 132; U. C. von Wahlde, "Discipleship: The Authority that Serves," *Biblische Zeitschrift* 29 (1985), 66; Eugene La Verdiere, *The Beginning of the Gospel: Introducing the Gospel According to Mark*, vol. 2 (Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 1999), 11; Green, 35.

[452] Best, 134.

"Servanthood" motif, it is fitting that the second half of the Gospel begins with the story of the blind man who needs a second touch. E. Best regards the emphasis in this episode of healing in 8:22–26 as symbolic of restoring sight to the disciples, because it is the only healing of the blind that is not immediately complete, and it makes perfect sense with reference to the disciples who have not yet attained full understanding of Christ.[453] Laying hands on the blind man and asking the question, "Do you see anything?" recalls Jesus' former question to his disciples, "Do you have eyes and fail to see?" (8:18).[454]

Sandwiched between the two stories of the healing of the two blind men is the central new-dimension discipleship section (8:27–10:45) that records the discipleship process during which Jesus demonstrates to the disciples the "Servanthood" motif of himself as the messianic Son of Man on his way to Golgotha. Mark presents this section on the way of the cross with three discipleship discourses of similar structure: prophetic announcement of Jesus Son of Man's passion and resurrection (8:31; 9:31; 10:32–34); the disciples' misunderstanding and inappropriate responses (8:32b; 9:32–34; 10:35–38); and Jesus' corrective teaching on the way of the cross (8:33–9:1; 9:35–50; 10:38–40, 42–45).[455] The themes of the three discourses may be entitled respectively: Total Commitment, True Greatness, and Authentic Power as requirements of discipleship.

Total Commitment (8:31-38): After Peter's confession that Jesus Christ is the Messiah, the new-dimension discipleship begins with Jesus introducing to them the Son of Man "Servanthood" motif by making his prophetic announcement that "the Son of Man must undergo great

[453] Best, 135.
[454] La Verdiere, vol. 2, 24.
[455] von Wahlde, 66; La Verdiere, vol. 2, 11.

suffering, and be rejected by the elders, the chief priests, and the scribes, and be killed, and after three days rise again" (8:31). But set against the backdrop of the disciples' experience in following Jesus the Son of God in the first half of Mark, great suffering and all that Jesus talks about seems shocking to Peter: Where is the miracle worker now—the one who healed the sick, stilled the storm, walked on water, and raised a dead girl to life; the teacher whose authoritative teaching amazed everyone; who even controlled demonic forces?[456] In his ignorance, Peter began to "rebuke" Jesus (v.32) for talking about the Son of Man having to suffer (v.31–32); then Jesus "rebuked" Peter for setting his mind on human things rather than on divine things (v.33).[457] After having rebuked Peter, Jesus began to teach them about what it takes to follow him: "If any want to become my followers, let them deny themselves and take up their cross and follow me" (v.34), which draws the closest connection between the way of the cross for the Messianic Son of Man and the way of the cross for the Messiah's followers.[458] Dominic points out that of the three imperatives "deny" (ἀπαρνησάσθω) themselves, "take up" (ἀράτω) the cross, and "follow" (ἀκολουθείτω) Jesus, the main emphasis is on "follow," because the first two (in the aorist tense) express a single, though decisive act, while the third (in the present imperative tense) expresses a continuous act, that means following Christ is a permanent way of life.[459] Green, considering persecution or martyrdom a real possibility for the disciples at the time and in the future, regards the language of 8:34–38 as reminding the disciples of a "courtroom scene, in which they might be called upon to decide whether to save

[456] Green, 37 and 40; Dawsey, 38–39.
[457] Green, 41.
[458] Ibid.
[459] A. P. Dominic, "The Threefold Call," *Reformed Review* 40 (1981), 288.

or to lose their lives (v.35): to declare loyalty to Jesus would mean denying themselves in an ultimate way (v.34); otherwise, they may turn away in shame from him and from the gospel (v.38).[460] In other words, following Jesus demands a total commitment of one's life for the cause of the kingdom of God as Jesus did, who died "a slave's death alone on the cross."[461]

True Greatness (9:30–37): The second new dimension of discipleship also begins with Jesus making his prophetic announcement of his passion and resurrection while traveling through Galilee: "The Son of Man is to be betrayed into human hands, and they will kill him, and three days after being killed, he will rise again" (9:31). Again, it is followed by the disciples' misunderstanding and inappropriate responses. As the narrator affirms, the disciples did not understand what Jesus was talking about but were afraid to ask him, for on their way they were arguing with one another about who was the greatest (9:32–34)! When they became silent upon Jesus' question of what they were arguing about on the way, Jesus began to teach them about true greatness by taking a little child in his arms and saying to them, "Whoever welcomes one such child in my name welcomes me, and whoever welcomes me welcomes not me but the one who sent me" (9:35–37). The "Servanthood" motif requires Jesus' disciples to reorient their thinking about status and honor, as H. Fleddermann explains: to welcome a child in Jesus' name is "to enter a faith-community with him, with Jesus and the One who sent him by serving the child, which is contrary to the status-seeking of the disciples.[462] From Jesus' perspective, the greatest honor is to "welcome a child," i.e. to extend respectful service to one who is

[460] Green, 70–71, 77.

[461] Dawsey, 95.

[462] H. Fleddermann, "The Discipleship Discourse (Mark 9:33-50)," *Catholic Biblical Quarterly* 43 (1981), 63-64.

powerless, without status, and whom society at large overlooks; in other words, "true greatness" is achieved by "giving yourself in service to one from whom you cannot receive benefit in return."[463] The motive for such service is to do it "in the name of Christ," so that by serving the child, you would have served Jesus, and not only Jesus, but the Father also; therefore, this is a reversal of human value system: by welcoming the least significant, you welcome the most significant.[464]

Authentic Power (10:32–45): The third new dimension of discipleship begins again with Jesus making his prophetic announcement of his passion and resurrection for the third time, saying,

> "See, we are going up to Jerusalem, and the Son of Man will be handed over to the chief priests and the scribes, and they will condemn him to death; then they will hand him over to the Gentiles; they will mock him, and spit upon him, and flog him, and kill him; and after three days he will rise again" (10:33–34).

The pronouncement is immediately followed by the disciples' misunderstanding of and inappropriate response, as two of his closest disciples (James and John) came to Jesus asking ambitiously for positions of power and honor beside him in his glory (10:37), which aroused the anger of the rest of the disciples (10:41), revealing the latter's competitive spirit and desire for the same positions of power and honor as did the other two disciples. Sensing that all his teachings on the way of the cross had fallen on deaf ears, Jesus redirected their attention to suffering and calamity, and reminded them of their inevitable sharing of his own suffering and destiny as his followers (10:38–40).[465] So he began to teach the whole group on authentic power (10:42–46):

[463] Green, 74–75.
[464] von Wahlde, 55.
[465] Green, 42.

> "You know that among the Gentiles those whom they recognize as their rulers lord it over them, and their great ones are tyrants over them. But it is not so among you; but whoever wishes to become great among you must be your servant, and whoever wishes to be first among you must be slave of all. For the Son of Man came not to be served but to serve, and to give his life a ransom for many."

Here, by stating the climatic statement of his identity and mission, "The Son of Man came not to be served but to serve, and to give his life a ransom for many" that demonstrates his own life example of embracing service rather than power, Jesus redefined for them authentic power as service.[466] Using "slave language," he again turned the earthly perspective and value system upside down, and asserted that power and honor among God's people depend not on making their authority felt, but on making their service felt in carrying out the will of others as slaves do.[467]

The new dimension of discipleship in the three discourses is fittingly closed by the story of the restoration of sight to Bartimaeus, which occurs at a point where Jesus was about to leave Jericho and to enter Jerusalem on his way to the cross (10:46–50), for at the end of the story, after the blind man has regained his sight, Bartimaeus is presented as a disciple following Jesus the messianic Son of Man on the way to his passion in Jerusalem.[468]

As Peacock describes it, the Book of Mark seems to have set up "a series of basic ideals for discipleship," then deliberately shows that "the disciples fail every one of the tests," because a radical break with the past for a radical new way of life is "ideal," but discipleship is "present reality."[469] To Moloney, the person of Jesus and the way of the Cross seem

[466] Green, 42.
[467] Dominic, 285.
[468] La Verdiere, vol. 2, 19–20.
[469] Peacock, 561–562.

"mysteriously outside human comprehension"; yet, "despite their lack of understanding, the association with the person, the mission and the destiny of Jesus has been entrusted to them."[470] Therefore, Moloney concludes, the heart of Mark's message is that in the process of following the way of the Cross, Jesus' disciples may never succeed in their responses to the call to lose themselves "in turning the values of the world upside down"; nevertheless, as they live through "the mystery of failure," they need to depend radically upon "the greater mystery of the love and power of God"[471] alone. So, the good news of the Gospel turns out to be "good news about God," the overcomer of all imaginable failures, in and through His Son Jesus Christ.[472]

Spiritual Formation of Christians by the Holy Spirit

Introduction:

The coming and the indwelling of the Holy Spirit in the establishment of the new covenant has long been promised, as Jeremiah prophesied:

> The days are surely coming, says the Lord, when I will make a new covenant with the house of Israel and the house of Judah. It will not be like the covenant that I made with their ancestors when I took them by the hand to bring them out of the land of Egypt…. But this is the covenant that I will make with the house of Israel…: I will put my law within them, and I will write it on their hearts; and I will be their God, and they shall be my people. No longer shall they teach one another, or say to each other, "Know the Lord," for they shall all know me, from the least of them to the greatest…for I will forgive their iniquity and remember their sin no more (Jr 31:31–34).

And Ezekiel prophesied about the Holy Spirit's presence and transformation of the heart in God's people:

[470] Moloney, "Vocation," 492.

[471] Ibid., 515.

[472] Francis J. Moloney, *Mark: Storyteller, Interpreter, Evangelist* (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson Publishers, 2004), 196.

> "A new heart I will give you, and a new spirit I will put within you; and I will remove from your body the heart of stone and give you a heart of flesh. I will put my spirit within you, and make you follow my statutes and be careful to observe my ordinances" (Eze 36:26-27).

As Gordon Fee proposes, these prophetic messages convey the idea that by the Holy Spirit coming into the life of God's people individually and corporately in the Church Era, God's promise is being fulfilled in three ways: 1) the "new spirit" makes possible the replacement of the heart of stone with a new heart of flesh; 2) the "new spirit" is God's own Spirit who enables God's people to follow God's commands; and 3) God's Spirit means the life-giving presence of God.[473] As stated previously (p. 137), the Church Era also fulfills Jeremiah's prophecy that the Lord would put the law in the hearts of people, so that no longer shall they teach one another, because the Holy Spirit would indwell Christ's disciples forever (Jn 14:16), and would bring to remembrance and teach all that Christ had taught them (Jn 14:26), bear witness along with them (Jn 15:26), and guide them into all truth (Jn 16:13).

A study on the spiritual formation of Christians by the Holy Spirit in the New Testament era must first explore the role and impact of the indwelling Holy Spirit on the life and mission of Jesus Christ, because the Gospels testify that Jesus was indwelled and empowered by the Holy Spirit to live his life in obedience and dependence on God, and to carry out his mission as he was sent by the heavenly Father. In the same way, Christians who are to be conformed to the image of Christ must rely on the Holy Spirit for empowerment to live out Christ's life and to carry out his mission. Therefore, the role and impact of the indwelling Holy Spirit on the life and mission of Christ's disciples would be analogous to that on the life and mission of Jesus.

[473] Fee, 16.

The Indwelling of the Holy Spirit in Jesus Christ:

The Gospel of Luke reveals that throughout Jesus' earthly life from his birth to his death on the cross, he was indwelled by the Holy Spirit, and that Jesus demonstrated his interactive communication with his heavenly Father in the Spirit through his lifestyle of prayer and reflection on Scripture. The Gospel of John reveals Jesus' sonship relationship with God in the Spirit by his total obedience and dependence on the heavenly Father for his mission in words and in deeds.

<u>As evident throughout Jesus' Life</u>: The Gospel of Luke is unique in recording the Holy Spirit's role during critical junctures of Jesus' life. At his birth, Luke tells of an angel appearing and saying to Mary, "The Holy Spirit will come upon you, and the power of the Most High will overshadow you; therefore the child to be born will be holy; he will be called Son of God" (Lk 1:35). At his baptism, Luke narrates of the event: "When Jesus also had been baptized and was praying, the heaven was opened, and the Holy Spirit descended upon him in bodily form like a dove" (Lk 3:21), and immediately after his baptism, "full of the Holy Spirit," he returned from the Jordan and was led by the Holy Spirit to the wilderness for forty days, fasting and being tempted by the devil (Lk 4:1–2; Mt 4:1–2; Mk 1:12–13). Afterwards, Jesus, being "filled with the power of the Spirit, returned to Galilee, and a report about him spread through all the surrounding country" (Lk 4:14). Finally, at the end of his earthly life when on the cross, he committed the Spirit back to his heavenly Father, as Luke records: "'Father, into your hands I commend my spirit.' Having said this, he breathed his last" (Lk 23:46).

The Gospel of Luke also expresses the idea that Jesus abides in his heavenly Father through the Holy Spirit by his lifestyle of contemplative prayer and by his reflection on the

Scriptures. Although it is not explicitly stated that he has reflected on Scripture, it is evident that he did so, as in the case of his applying Isaiah's prophetic words to himself when he declared his mission statement at the synagogue in his hometown Nazareth: "'The Spirit of the Lord is upon me, because he has anointed me to bring good news to the poor. He has sent me to proclaim release to the captives and recovery of sight to the blind, to let the oppressed go free, to proclaim the year of the Lord's favor;' then he said to them, 'Today this scripture has been fulfilled in your hearing'" (Lk 4:18–19, 21). And his last cry from the cross, as uniquely recorded by Luke, "Father, into your hands I commend my spirit" (Lk 23:46), is an echo of Psalm 31:5—a prayer and praise in severe distress.[474] Apparently, Jesus has memorized and meditated on the Psalms and the Prophets to the extent that he was able to apply them to his own life, even in his distress to the last breath on the cross!

Jesus' lifestyle of prayer was also his way of connecting with his heavenly Father through the indwelling Spirit. As Roth points out, the Lucan Jesus is a pray*er* who regards prayer as an integral part of his life and ministry, and of who he is as the obedient and dependent Son of God.[475] He prays in lonely places (5:16) and on mountains (9:28); in ordinary times (5:16; 11:1a) and at pivotal moments such as baptism and transfiguration (3:21; 9:28–29); in solitude (5:16; 6:12a) and in community (22:17–19; 24:30); in joy (10:21) and in anguish (22:41–44); briefly in blessing food (9:16) and in overnight seeking guidance for the selection of the twelve disciples (6:12b).[476] He prays for himself (22:42) and for others, including Peter who denies him

[474] Willard M. Swartley, "Jesus and Believers at Pray," *Vision* (Fall, 2006), 12.
[475] S. John Roth, "Jesus the Pray-er," *Currents in Theology and Mission* 33, no. 6 (December 2006), 488.
[476] Ibid., 493.

(22:31–32) and those who nail him to the cross (23:34).[477] He prays upon entering the ministry beginning at his baptism (3:21) and as he blesses his disciples before ascending into heaven at the close of his earthly ministry (24:50–51); and he consistently addresses the prayer to his heavenly "Father."[478] All these features give the impression that Jesus engages in a lifestyle of prayer—connecting through the indwelling Spirit to his heavenly Father at any time and in any place. Such prayers, scattered throughout the Gospel of Luke, reflect his authentic and spontaneous communication with God over real issues and questions.[479] It is interesting to note that Jesus does not begin to teach his disciples how to pray until they ask him,[480] which means they must have been observing and, impressed by his lifestyle of prayer, they now want it for themselves.

As evident in his sonship with God: Jesus, in his incarnation as the Son of God, perceives his own life and ministry as one marked by a total obedience and dependence on the powerful presence of his heavenly Father through the Holy Spirit, as presented in the Gospel of John. John reports Jesus' own words about his life-giving words as being empowered by the Holy Spirit, "He whom God has sent speaks the words of God, for he gives the Spirit without measure" (3:34); and "It is the spirit that gives life…. The words that I have spoken to you are spirit and life" (6:63). He repeatedly acknowledges that his words are not his own but that they have come from his Father who sent him: "My teaching is not mine but his who sent me" (7:16); "I speak these things as the

[477] I. Howard Marshall, "Jesus—Example and Teacher of Prayer in the Synoptic Gospels," in *Into God's Presence: Prayer in the New Testament*, 113–31, ed. Richard N. Longenecker (Grand Rapids, MI: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing, 2001), 120.

[478] Roth, 493.

[479] N. T. Wright, "The Lord's Prayer as a Paradigm of Christian Prayer," in *Into God's Presence: Prayer in the New Testament*, 132–54, ed. Richard N. Longenecker (Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2001), 133.

[480] Roth, 488.

Father instructed me" (8:28); "I declare what I have seen in the Father's presence (8:38); "I have not spoken on my own, but the Father who sent me has himself given me a commandment about what to say" (12:49); "The words that I say to you I do not speak on my own; but the Father who dwells in me does his works" (14:10); "These words you hear are not my own; they belong to the Father who sent me" (14:24); In other words, he only teaches or speaks what he has heard or seen in his Father's presence or what his Father has taught or commanded him.

Jesus also claims that he can do nothing by himself, but only what he sees his Father doing, or as commanded by him: "the Son can do nothing on his own, but only what he sees the Father doing; for whatever the Father does, the Son does likewise" (5:19); "I do as the Father has commanded me" (14:31); and "I have come down from heaven, not to do my own will, but the will of him who sent me" (6:38). And he says of his judgment: "I can do nothing on my own. As I hear, I judge; and my judgment is just, because I seek to do not my own will but the will of him who sent me (5:30); and "I judge no one. Yet even if I do judge, my judgment is valid; for it is not I alone who judge, but I and the Father who sent me" (8:15–16). Even with his own life, he submits it totally to his Father's will: "No one takes it from me, but I lay it down of my own accord. I have power to lay it down, and I have power to take it up again. I have received this command from my Father" (10:18).

As Jesus claims that his actions are patterned after or as commanded by his heavenly Father, he is able to live out his life not only in loving relationship with and in obedient sonship dependence on his heavenly Father, but also in loving relationship with and in humble service

to his disciples, as demonstrated by his stooping down as a lowliest household slave to wash their feet at the last supper as portrayed in John 13:1–5:[481]

> Now before the festival of the Passover, Jesus knew that his hour had come to depart from this world and go to the Father. Having loved his own who were in the world, he loved them to the end…. And during supper Jesus, knowing that the Father had given all things into his hands, and that he had come from God and was going to God, got up from the table, took off his outer robe, and tied a towel around himself. Then he poured water into a basin and began to wash the disciples' feet and to wipe them with the towel that was tied around him.

In that sacred moment when Jesus knew that his time of departure from this world to return to the Father has come; yet, out of love for his disciples "to the end," relinquishing status and power, he performs this act of service to his disciples![482] John 13:4–5 renders a slow-motion portrayal of his posture as a slave: he got up from the table, took off his robe, tied a towel around his waist, poured water into a basin, one by one he began to wash the disciples' feet, then he wiped them with the towel tied around him. After an exchange of dialogue with Peter, the narrator closes with Jesus' explanation of his intention by the act of foot-washing in John 13:12–17:

> "Do you know what I have done to you? You call me Teacher and Lord—and you are right, for that is what I am. So, if I, your Lord and Teacher, have washed your feet, you also ought to wash one another's feet. For I have set you an example, that you also should do as I have done to you. Very truly, I tell you, servants are not greater than their master, nor are messengers greater than the one who sent them. If you know these things, you are blessed if you do them.

This episode demonstrates to Jesus' disciples in word and in deed what it takes to follow him—a calling for them to be "a human community of foot-washers!"[483] Therefore, Jesus Christ lives

[481] Bowe, 147–148.
[482] Ibid.
[483] Ibid., 148.

out the full meaning of humankind made in the divine image as an obedient and dependent Son to his heavenly Father and a humble servant to God's people, and become the preeminent, "first-born" of a new humanity to be conformed to His image![484]

The Indwelling of the Holy Spirit in Christ's Disciples:

The New Testament presents Jesus as "the image of the invisible God" (Col 1:15) in that he is "God's glory" and God's "exact imprint," i.e. the reflection of God's glory and the exact imprint of God's very being" (He 1:3a); so that because of Christ's death and redemption of humankind on the cross, Christians are "predestined to be conformed to the image of his Son, in order that he might be the firstborn within a large family" (Ro 8:29). God's intention is that this firstborn Son Jesus Christ be preeminent within a "new humanity" that, renewed and conformed to His image, becomes the "eschatological community of glorified saints," which is "the ultimate defining moment for the Genesis account of the creation of humankind in the image of God."[485]

To be a part of this large family and loving community, Jesus' disciples must "abide in him" as he commanded them to do so as an act of obedient and loving dependence just as he abides in his heavenly Father as an act of sonship obedient and loving dependence on his Father who loves him:

> I am the vine, you are the branches. Those who abide in me and I in them bear much fruit, because apart from me you can do nothing…. If you abide in me, and my words abide in you, ask for whatever you wish, and it will be done for you. My Father is glorified by this, that you bear much fruit and become my disciples. As the Father has loved me, so I have loved you; abide in my love. If you keep my commandments, you

[484] Grenz, 623.
[485] Ibid.

> will abide in my love, just as I have kept my Father's commandments and abide in his love (Jn 15:5–10).

The word "abide" implies the complete and continued dependence, permanence and intimate relationship between Jesus and his disciples, as patterned after the Father-Son relationship between God and Jesus.[486] It also implies keeping his commandments by the power of the Holy Spirit, for Jesus promised them that he would send the Holy Spirit to be with them forever (Jn 14:16), who would bring to remembrance and teach all that he had taught them (Jn 14:26), bear witness along with them (Jn 15:26), and guide them into all truth (Jn 16:13).[487]

Kostenberger brings out another significant analogy, noting that the Holy Spirit's relationship with Jesus' disciples is analogous to the Holy Spirit's relationship with Jesus during his earthly ministry, e.g. Jesus promised his disciples that the Triune God (Father, Son and Holy Spirit) would indwell them, "And I will ask the Father, and he will give you another Advocate, to be with you forever" and "Those who love me will keep my word, and my Father will love them, and we will come to them and make our home with them" (Jn 14:16, 23), just as the Holy Spirit and the Father indwell Jesus, as testified by John the Baptist and Jesus himself respectively, "I saw the Spirit descending from heaven like a dove, and it remained on him," and "the Father who dwells in me does his works (Jn 1:32; 14:10). Because of the disciples' vital union with Christ (Jn 14:23; 15:5; 17:23, 26), Jesus' God becomes their God; Jesus' Father, their Father; and Jesus' Spirit, their Spirit (Jn 20:17, 20).[488]

[486] Bowe, 145; Craig Keener, *Gospel of John: A Commentary*, vol. 2 (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson Publishers, 2003), 999.

[487] Andreas J. Kostenberger and Scott R. Swain, *Father, Son and Spirit: The Trinity and John's Gospel*, New Studies in Biblical Theology 24 (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 2008), 98.

[488] Ibid.

Just as God was present with the disciples through Jesus before the risen Christ returned to heaven, God would be present with them through the indwelling Holy Spirit in this New Era to continue the mission of Jesus on earth, as his disciples were told, “The one who believes in me will also do the works that I do and, in fact, will do greater works than these, because I am going to the Father” (Jn 14:12); and “it is to your advantage that I go away, for if I do not go away, the Advocate will not come to you; but if I go, I will send him to you” (Jn 16:7).[489] Jesus implies that by the power of the Holy Spirit, the disciples will be able to do even greater works than he did. In obedience to the risen Lord’s command before he ascended to heaven: “But you will receive power when the Holy Spirit has come upon you; and you will be my witnesses in Jerusalem, in all Judea and Samaria, and to the ends of the earth" (Ac 1:8), the early Christians launched their mission in the power of the Holy Spirit beginning from Jerusalem after the promised outpouring of the Holy Spirit on the Day of Pentecost when they were “constantly devoting themselves to prayer” (Ac 1:14).

Significant leaders such as Stephen are described by Luke as being men “full of faith and the Holy Spirit,” empowered to do great wonders and signs among the people and given wisdom in defending his faith (Ac 6:5, 8–10). While he was being stoned to death, Stephen, “filled with the Holy Spirit,” gazed into heaven and saw “the glory of God and Jesus standing at the right hand of God”; then he prayed, “Lord Jesus, receive my spirit” as Jesus did on the cross. And falling on his knees right before he died, Stephen cried out in a loud voice, “Lord do not hold this sin against them” (7:55, 59–60), again as Jesus prayed for those who nailed him to the

[489] Kostenberger and Swain, 98.

cross (Lk 23:34). It is evident that by the power of the indwelled Holy Spirit, Stephen was able to live out Christ's life.

Paul (9:17) and Barnabas (11:24) are also described as being "filled with the Holy Spirit" and "full of the Holy Spirit" respectively. The Book of Acts testifies to the Holy Spirit's role in leading them to launch the Lord's Gospel mission to the Gentiles. When the Antioch church leaders were worshiping the Lord and fasting, the Holy Spirit said, "Set apart for me Barnabas and Saul for the work to which I have called them"; as a result of which Barnabas and Saul were sent out as missionary by the Holy Spirit (13:2–4).[490] As they launched their first mission trip, the author Luke again describes Paul as being "filled with the Holy Spirit" (13:9); and after they were persecuted at Iconium and driven out of the region, the two of them, having been faithful and used by God despite rejection, are still described as being "filled with joy and with the Holy Spirit" (13:50–52)![491] On one occasion, the Holy Spirit forbade them to go to Asia, then stopped them again from going to Bithynia, but through the vision of a Macedonia man's plea, led them to Macedonia instead (16:6–10).[492] Despite warning by the Holy Spirit of imprisonment and persecutions awaiting him in Jerusalem (20:23; 21:11), the Apostle Paul continued to move on to fulfill his calling toward the ultimate goal of the final redemption of the whole world, as stated in Romans 8:18-23:

> I consider that the sufferings of the present time are not worth comparing with the glory about to be revealed to us. For the creation waits with eager longing for the revealing of the children of God…and not only the creation, but we ourselves, who have the first

[490] Darrell L. Bock, *A Theology of Luke and Acts: Biblical Theology of the New Testament* (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2012), 224.

[491] Ibid.

[492] Ibid.

> fruits of the Spirit, groan inwardly while we wait for adoption, the redemption of our bodies.

Conclusion: Implications for Christian Life Transformation

Despite Israel's rebelliousness and failure to meet the covenant demands of being holy in the presence of Yahweh, Yahweh remained faithful to the covenant by being present with them and nurturing their faith through the prophets and through the School of Prayer, and by promising them a renewal of the covenant. Similarly, despite the failures of the disciples to meet the high demands of discipleship, Jesus continued to be with them through the indwelling Holy Spirit, who empowered them in living out Christ's life and in carrying out his mission to the ends of the world. As Grenz concludes:[493]

> The new humanity provides the climax to the entire salvation-historical story and becomes the ultimate defining moment for the Genesis account of the creation of humankind in the image of God…., This new humanity shares in the divine image through being 'in Christ,' as stated in 2 Cor 3:18: "And all of us, with unveiled faces, seeing the glory of the Lord as though reflected in a mirror, are being transformed into the same image from one degree of glory to another; for this comes from the Lord, the Spirit."

The Apostle Paul's word in 2 Corinthians 3:18 provides a clue to the continuous transformation process of Christ's disciples toward Christlikeness. Contrasting the veil on Moses' face that hinders the Israelites from gazing at the fading glory of the old covenant (3:13), this veil is now removed by Christ (3:14) under the new covenant, so that by looking to the glory of the Lord in the mirror of the Gospel, Christians are "being transformed" continuously by the Spirit into the image of Christ "from glory to glory," i.e. in progressively increasing glory. As Greek scholar William D. Mounce explains it, such "transformation"

[493] Grenz, 623.

expressed by the present middle participle (κατοπτριζόμενοι) with its original meaning "looking into a mirror," came to mean "gazing upon," or "contemplating on,"[494] and the object of this looking, gazing, or contemplating is the glory of the Lord. In other words, by gazing upon or contemplating on the glory of the Lord, we are continuously being transformed into his image.[495] Similarly, the author of Hebrews encourages Christians to run the race of the Christian life by "looking to Jesus the pioneer and perfecter of our faith, who for the sake of the joy that was set before him endured the cross, disregarding its shame, and has taken his seat at the right hand of the throne of God" (He 12:2). It is this key to Christian life transformation—looking to Jesus, gazing upon the glory of the Lord—that is precisely the approach and focus of Ignatian Spirituality in the next chapter.

[494] William D. Mounce, *Basics of Biblical Greek: Grammar* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan Publishing House, 1993), 239.

[495] Ibid.

Chapter 5

The Pragmatic Task: How Might We Respond?

Introduction: Ignatian Spirituality

Having answered the question of Osmer's Normative task: "What ought to be going on?" by exploring the biblical foundation of Christian spiritual formation to discover how the Triune God—the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit engages in the tasks of spiritual formation of God's peoples through the ages, the last of Osmer's question is that of the Pragmatic task: "How might we respond?" Chapter 5 explores how the practice of Ignatian spirituality might fill the gaps of spiritual formation ministries in today's evangelical Chinese American Church. Ignatian spirituality is selected among other spiritual practices primarily because it has much in common with the evangelical protestant Christian faith, such as our common historical heritage of spirituality; both traditions believe in the fallen nature of humankind and the need for God's grace through faith in Jesus for our salvation and spiritual growth; and both are convicted of the essential of Scripture and prayer in our spiritual practices, etc. But since Ignatian spirituality is new to most evangelical Christians, and there has always been a distrust of the Catholic tradition, its major characteristics, the centrality of Scripture in its foundation principles and central aspects of *Spiritual Exercises*, the Jesuits' historical relevance to the Chinese people, as well as how it works for the transformation of life to the image of Christ must be introduced systematically as follows, with further elaboration on the justification of employing Ignatian spirituality in the conclusion of this chapter. The results of this preliminary study of Ignatian spirituality reveal that its emphasis on the practice of solitude, its *Spiritual Exercises* that

focuses on the life of Christ, its holistic prayer practices through Scripture, its Jesuit mission has gained the respect of the Chinese people, and its emphasis on the presence of God in daily living have the potential of filling the gaps in the spiritual formation ministries of the evangelical Chinese American Church for the transformation of life to the image of Christ.

A Literature Review:

There are many good books on Ignatian Spirituality, but only four Jesuit authors and their respective publications cited more extensively in this chapter are selected for this review. Joseph Allen Tetlow:[496] Born in New Orleans in 1930, Tetlow completed licentiates in both philosophy and theology at the Pontifical Faculties, and his doctoral work in American social and intellectual history at Brown University focusing on the development of American Catholic spirituality. Currently the director of Montserrat Jesuit Retreat House in Lake Dallas, Texas, where he gives retreats and workshops, Tetlow has served as Professor of Theology at St. Louis University, founding executive secretary of the US Jesuit Conference in Washington, D.C., and President of the Jesuit School of Theology at Berkeley. Tetlow's book *Ignatius Loyola: Spiritual Exercises* describes Ignatius and his signature work on the *Spiritual Exercises*, and another work of his *Making Choices in Christ*, a compendium of the foundational theology of Christian decision-making, is valuable for an understanding of the Ignatian discernment concepts and process.

[496] "Joseph Allen Tetlow," Ignatian Spirituality, accessed 9/22/2017, http://www.ignatianspirituality.com/ignatian-voices/21st-century-ignatian-voices/joseph-tetlow-sj.

James Martin:[497] Martin is a Jesuit priest, author, and editor at large of *America*, the national Catholic magazine. The book selected to discuss in depth in this chapter is *The Jesuit Guide to (Almost) Everything: A spirituality for Real Life*, a New York Times bestseller, a number one bestseller in Catholic books, and the recipient of a 2010 Christopher Award, and which, as the subtitle suggests, is very resourceful in covering "almost everything" about Ignatian spirituality and its various practices. It was translated into Chinese in 2015 and therefore can be a valuable textbook resource for teaching Ignatian Spirituality at Chinese American seminaries. Martin entered the Society of Jesus in August 1988, and he began graduate theology studies at the Weston Jesuit School of Theology (now Boston College), where he received his MDiv in 1998 and ThM in 1999. After completing his Jesuit studies, he was ordained a Catholic priest in 1999.
Timothy M. Gallagher:[498] Recognized as "America's preeminent writer on Ignatian spiritual direction and discernment," Gallagher currently holds the St. Ignatius Chair for Spiritual Formation at St. John Vianney Theological Seminary in Denver. He was ordained in 1979 as a member of the Oblates of the Virgin Mary. Having obtained his doctorate in 1983 from the Pontifical Gregorian University, he has taught at St. John's Seminary and Our lady of Grace Seminary, both in Boston. He has served many years in international ministries of retreats, spiritual direction, and teaching about the spiritual life, and has written eight books on Ignatian discernment and prayer, one of which—*Discerning the Will of God: An Ignatian Guide to Christian Decision Making*—is an excellent resource on discernment used in this Chapter.

[497] "Father James Martin," Facebook, accessed 9/22/17, https://www.facebook.com/pg/FrJamesMartin/about/?ref=page_internal.

[498] "Fr. Timothy M. Gallagher," Fr. Timothy M. Gallagher, accessed 1/2/2019, https://www.frtimothygallagher.org/.

Kevin O'Brien:[499] He is a published scholar in Jesuit history and spirituality and Jesuit higher education. His award-winning book, *The Ignatian Adventure: Experiencing the Spiritual Exercises of Saint Ignatius in Daily Life*, is a very good resource for a twenty-first-century understanding of the Ignatian *Spiritual Exercises* because his translation of some of the more difficult terms and exercises are also user-friendly and applicable. O'Brien joined the faculty of Santa Clara University after serving eight years at Georgetown University. A former lawyer, he joined the Society of Jesus in 1996. In the course of his ten-year formation as a Jesuit, he received his MA in Philosophy from Fordham University, and his MDiv and a Licentiate in Sacred Theology from the Weston Jesuit School of Theology at Boston College. O'Brien was ordained to the priesthood in 2006.

A Working Definition of Spirituality:

The Canadian scholar David B. Perrin, former President (2005–2006) of the Society for the Study of Christian Spirituality, cites Sandra Schneiders' definition of "spirituality" from the *New Westminster Dictionary of Christian Spirituality*: a "conscious involvement in the project of life integration through self-transcendence toward the ultimate value one perceives."[500] However, German Protestant scholar Jorg Schneider considers it inappropriate for any definition of "spirituality" to imply "humans making their way to reach or even to become God,"[501] as the term "self-transcendence" in the above definition implies. James Martin defines "spirituality" simply as "a way of living in relationship with God"; and he identifies this common

[499] "Kevin O'Brien," Santa Clara University, accessed 9/22/2017, https://www.scu.edu/jst/about/people-of-jst/deans-cabinet/obrien.html.

[500] David B Perrin, *Studying Christian Spirituality* (New York: Routledge, 2007), 20.

[501] Claire E. Wolfteich and Jorg Schneider, "A Comparative Research Conversation: American Catholic and German Protestant Spirituality Studies," *International Journal of Practical Theology* 17, no. 1 (2013), 113.

focus among spiritualities within the Christian tradition: "the desire for union with God, an emphasis on love and charity, and a belief in Jesus as the Son of God."[502]

Who is Ignatius of Loyola:

To explore Ignatian spirituality and practice for the evangelical Chinese American Christians, a brief introduction to Ignatius of Loyola is necessary. For evangelical Christians, especially his conversion experience and the historical context in which he (1491–1556) and his contemporary Martin Luther (1483–1546) operated are important pieces of information. These two men lived at a time of religious turmoil when most Roman Catholics felt that reformation of the church was needed, although there were different views as to how it should take place.[503] While those who broke away from the papacy in frustration such as Martin Luther were convinced that not only the "church political structures" needed reform, so also her "theology, liturgy, sacraments, and spirituality"; those who remained Catholic and led the way in spiritual reform—particularly those in Spain such as Ignatius of Loyola—opted for "educational reform for priests, correction of abuses by the bishops, and a more centralized administration of the church."[504] About the time when Luther was defending his theological teaching in Germany, Ignatius experienced a profound conversion. Joseph A. Tetlow, an expert on Ignatian spirituality, describes the life of Ignatius and the place of his conversion in it as follows:

[502] James Martin, *The Jesuit Guide to (Almost) Everything: A Spirituality for Real Life* (New York: HarperCollins Publishers, 2010), 2.

[503] Bradley P. Holt, *Thirsty for God: A Brief History of Christian Spirituality* (Minneapolis, MN: Augsburg Fortress, 1993), 69.

[504] Ibid.

His Conversion:[505] In 1521 when the French attacked the Spanish town of Pamplona, a cannon ball struck him at his right knee, and he was brought back to Loyola where he underwent surgeries and convalesced for seven months. In his boredom, he turned from daydreaming about romances to reading the *Life of Christ* by Ludolph of Saxony and the *Lives of the Saints* by Jacobus de Voragine. Ludolph calls Jesus Christ our "foundation," and Voragine describes Christ's life-and-death battle with the Enemy, which deeply impressed Inigo (Ignatius) and eventually led him to write this scene into his *Spiritual Exercises*. He was converted and acknowledged Christ as his Lord and identified sin as his defeat. He began keeping records of what touched him, a practice he kept for the rest of his life.

His Spiritual Experience:[506] When he recovered from his injuries, he determined to go to Jerusalem as a pilgrim, but made his first stop in the Benedictine monastery at Montserrat to make a complete confession of his life, then went on to Manresa, where he stayed for about a year. It was there that he began to develop an intimate relationship with Christ; he later confessed that he had learned more during this time than in the rest of his life together. He wrote down what had helped him spiritually, and here began his notes for the *Spiritual Exercises*, on which he continued to work from 1522 to 1540.

His Companions:[507] After spending a brief time in Jerusalem and returning to Spain, the time came for a ten-year period of theological studies in Paris, during which he became Ignatius of Loyola at age 37. In 1534, he formed a companion of six "friends in the Lord," who lived

[505] Joseph A. Tetlow, *Ignatius Loyola: Spiritual Exercises* (New York: The Crossroad Publishing Company, 1992), 18–20.

[506] Ibid., 21–23.

[507] Ibid., 23–26.

together for a month in a secluded room, where he directed them through the *Exercises*. On August 15, 1534, the Companions (soon to be called the Jesuits) made vows of poverty. A couple of years later, while in Venice waiting to make their pilgrimage to Jerusalem, they worked in hospitals and poor houses and started directing others in the *Exercises* and preaching in the churches. Ignatius and his six friends were ordained in 1537 by the bishop of Venice.

His Legacy:[508] They waited for a little more than a year and finally set sail for the Holy Land in 1537, and were received by Pope Paul III, who put them to work—teaching, giving the *Exercises*, helping the poor, launching an orphanage along with a home for prostitutes, a refuge for the persecuted Jews, and a school to teach everything from the alphabet to the humanities. In 1539, they joined in a vow to obey the Pope, and to elect one of them as superior under the pope. They drew up a statement of their plan of life, and the Society of Jesus as a religious order was given official approval by Pope Paul III on July 31, 1540. Ignatius was elected superior general and was commissioned by the Companions to compose the *Constitutions*, which he completed in six to seven years, and it is still alive today. From 1540 to his death in 1556, Ignatius received nearly a thousand men into the Society, commissioned Jesuits to Africa, India, and Japan, and initiated the missions to the Americas.

Major Characteristics of Ignatian Spirituality

A Spirituality for Real Life:

Ignatian Spirituality, as the subtitle of Martin's book *The Jesuit Guide to (Almost) Everything* reveals, is a "spirituality for real life"—a practical spirituality in contrast to a spirituality that focuses on personal mystical experiences, or on abstract theological doctrines

[508] Tetlow, *Ignatius Loyola*, 26–30.

of spirituality. In this book, Martin presents how Ignatian spirituality relates to real life in four regards.[509] First, it is about "finding God in all things," which means we can discover God in every important dimension of our lives, including our work, our sexuality, our family, our relationships, etc.[510] Second, it is about "becoming a contemplative in action," meaning that we are to "lead active lives" while adopting "a contemplative or meditative stance."[511] Third, it is "looking at the world in an incarnational way," which means believing that God is right here in the everyday events of our world.[512] And finally, it is about "seeking freedom and detachment," which means finding freedom in making good decisions by detachment—not being tied down by unimportant things in life.[513]

A Spirituality of Ministries:

It is a spirituality that is dedicated to the interrelated triad ministries of word-sacrament-works, of which "word" refers primarily to preaching, in a style that moves the listener both to emotional responses and to specific actions; "sacrament" refers to that of penance; and "works" involves the care of the poor, the sick, and the marginalized.[514] Of the three, paramount for Jesuits are their various ministries of the word, which includes the *Spiritual Exercises*—Ignatius' most significant contribution to the Church. The Exercises are meant to teach people the diverse range of prayers, meditations, and rules available to guide their contemplation on specific events in Christ's life: his birth, public life, death and

[509] Martin, 5–10.
[510] Ibid., 5, 10.
[511] Ibid., 7–8, 10.
[512] Ibid., 8, 10.
[513] Ibid., 9–10.
[514] Catherine M. Mooney, "Ignatian Spirituality, A Spirituality for Mission," *Mission Studies* 26 (2009), 198.

resurrection, drawn mainly from the synoptic Gospels.[515] Despite their commitment to scholarly preparation, the Jesuits are noted for their role as educators in the network of schools for the "education of children" and "unlettered persons in Christianity."[516] The Jesuits have been famous in running schools for boys from 10 to 16 years of age; but no college was established during the first decade after their vows in 1538; however, by the time Ignatius died in 1556 there were about 35 colleges, and by 1773 when the Jesuit order was suppressed by papal edict, there were about 800 educational institutions around the world.[517] While the Jesuit schools are secular in the sense that secular arts and sciences dominate their curriculum, and secular students are in the majority, they offer teaching in virtues, character formation, and in religious education with the intention of winning converts on the one hand and respecting diversity on the other, such as excusing Lutheran boys from reciting the Litany of the Saints.[518]

A Spirituality for Missions:

Jesuit Society's "apostolic mission" is also the Society's religious identity, as suggested by the title of Mooney's article, "Ignatian Spirituality, A Spirituality for Mission."[519] According to the Papal bull that gave formal approval to the Society of Jesus as a religious order in 1540, the purpose of the Jesuits is "the "propagation of the faith and the progress of souls in Christian life and doctrine."[520] The scope of this mission is to all people: both among schismatics, heretics, Jews, and Muslims inside Europe, as well as among non-Christians outside Europe.[521] To

[515] Mooney, 199.
[516] Ibid.
[517] Ibid.
[518] Ibid., 200.
[519] Ibid., 192.
[520] Mary Laven, *Mission to China: Matteo Ricci and the Jesuit Encounter with the East* (London: Faber and Faber, 2011), 4.
[521] Mooney, 197.

propagate among those inside Europe, the Jesuits included even the Lutherans of the Protestant reform movements, as an aspect of their willingness to be sent anywhere in the world to any group of people.[522] While the Jesuits were opposed to the Reformation movements, and were theologically prepared to engage in debates with the reformers, persuading or refuting the Protestants was not central to their calling, as evident by Ignatius' rare mention of the reformers in his almost 7,000 surviving letters, and by his conviction that "the conversion of the will and heart comes before the conversion of the intellect"[523] To propagate among those outside of Europe, as stated in the Society's *Constitutions*, the Jesuit's calling was "to travel through and to live in any part of the world where there is hope for greater service to God and of help to souls."[524] Inspired by the apostle Paul, many Jesuits became missionaries to Latin America, Africa, and Asia, the most notable being Matteo Ricci (1552–1610) to China.[525] By way of a summary, Catherine Mooney derives seven principles in Ignatian spirituality as a spirituality for mission as follows:[526]

First: "grace and prayer are prior to all mission." *Second:* having a "macro view," meaning that "God who bursts forth in creation, enters into it through the Incarnation, and continues the mission by acting through the lives of Christians" is not limited to what God does in Jesus," making it possible to have "a positive attitude to other religions and cultures." *Third:* "positively world-affirming," meaning to "embrace secular culture, believing it can be both a manifestation of and vehicle for God's grace." *Fourth:* "finding God in all things," or "seeking

[522] Mooney, 198.
[523] Ibid., 197–198.
[524] Laven, 5.
[525] Holt, 78.
[526] Mooney, 204–208.

God in all things," presupposing God to be active everywhere. *Fifth:* "go where we are needed," i.e. being ready "to travel anywhere" as well as "to work at home." *Sixth:* commit to "making people agents of their own growth," e.g. "The whole dynamic of the *Exercises* leads to making the one receiving them responsible…capable of responding to what the Lord wills and desires for him." *Seventh:* "the more universal the good is, the more is it divine" as articulated in their *Constitutions* and as connected to a well-known Jesuit motto "for the greater glory of God."

Centrality of Scripture in Ignatian Spirituality

Most evangelical Chinese American Christians are very skeptical about the "Catholic" tradition, perceiving its foundation as being laid on traditions rather than on Scripture. They have questions such as, "Doesn't the Catholic Church preach a different Gospel than we do?" "Don't Catholics worship Mary instead of Christ?" "Don't Catholics emphasize salvation by works instead of by grace?" "Wasn't Ignatius of Loyola opposed to Martin Luther, our Protestant reformer?" To introduce Ignatian spirituality to the evangelical Chinese American Church then, it is essential *first,* to demonstrate the centrality of Scripture in the Foundation Principles of the Ignatian *Spiritual Exercises*, which focus on contemplating and meditating on the life of Christ, along with various holistic and methodological prayer practices; *second,* to bring to these evangelicals' awareness the relevance of the Jesuits' long and reputable history of missions in China; and *third,* to demonstrate that the road to life transformation through Ignatian spirituality has the potential of filling the spiritual formation ministry gaps of the evangelical Chinese American Church.

Foundational Principles of the Spiritual Exercises:

Ignatius offers four foundational principles of the *Spiritual Exercises* that comprise the foundation for cultivating relationship with God for spiritual growth. Although biblical concepts and a lot of wisdom are conveyed through these principles, biblical references are not cited in support of them. His spirituality arose from his personal experience while still a layman for the sake of those who were busily involved in their daily activities.[527] Since his book was written and finished while he was "uninstructed in theology,"[528] as Joseph Tetlow puts it, some of the statements appear to be somewhat confusing, such as the traditional translation of his Foundation Principle 1: "Human beings are created to praise, reverence, and serve God our Lord, and by means of this to save their souls."[529] To understand what Ignatius meant by "to save their souls," Tetlow explains that it was in reference to Matthew 16:26, "For what is a man profited, if he shall gain the whole world, and lose his own soul? or what shall a man give in exchange for his soul?" (KJV),[530] or as the NRS version states it for the contemporary reader, "For what will it profit them if they gain the whole world but forfeit their life? Or what will they give in return for their life?" In other words, to worship (praise, reverence, and serve) the Lord God, the purpose for which human beings are created, saves them from losing their life in the pursuit of worldly gain. To make it easier for the contemporary readers, Tim Muldoon's contemporary translations of the second to the fourth Foundation Principles are stated below, following Ganss' traditional translations of the four Principles respectively.[531] Biblical references

[527] Joseph A. Tetlow, *Making Choices in Christ: The Foundations of Ignatian Spirituality* (Chicago, IL: Loyola Press, 2008), 3.

[528] Tetlow, *Ignatius Loyola*, 32.

[529] George E. Ganss, ed., with the collaboration of Parmananda R. Divarkar, Edward J. Malatesta, and Martin E. Palmer, *Ignatius of Loyola: The Spiritual Exercises and Selected Works* (New York: Paulist Press, 1991), 130.

[530] Tetlow, *Ignatius Loyola*, 50.

[531] Ganss, 130.

and explanations are given to demonstrate to evangelical Chinese American Christians of the centrality of Scripture for all four Foundation Principles.

Foundational Principle 1: Our Goal—to worship God

Human beings are created to praise, reverence, and serve God our Lord, and by means of this to save their souls.

Human beings are created in the image of God, as affirmed in Genesis 1:27: "So God created humankind in his image, in the image of God he created them; male and female he created them." Acknowledging God as our Creator, the Lord rightfully deserves our worship and praise, as Psalm 100 proclaims:

> Make a joyful noise to the Lord, all the earth. Worship the Lord with gladness; come into his presence with singing. Know that the Lord is God. It is he that made us, and we are his; we are his people, and the sheep of his pasture. Enter his gates with thanksgiving, and his courts with praise. Give thanks to him, bless his name. For the Lord is good; his steadfast love endures forever, and his faithfulness to all generations.

The apostle Paul also affirms that God's children are to glorify our Creator with thankful hearts in everything: "So, whether you eat or drink, or whatever you do, do everything for the glory of God" (1 Cor 10:31).

Foundational Principle 2: Our Means to the Goal—stewardship of all resources

> *The other things on…earth are created…to help them…toward the end for which they are created…. I should use these things to the extent that they help me toward my end; and rid myself of them to the extent that they hinder me.*
>
> *Everything in the world is to help us toward our eternal well-being. If something helps us, we should use it; and if it hinders us, we shouldn't.*[532]

[532] Tim Muldoon, *The Ignatian Workout: Daily Spiritual Exercises for a Healthy Faith* (Chicago, IL: Loyola Press, 2004), 73.

One of the means for God's image-bearers to glorify the Creator is through responsible stewardship of resources entrusted to our care, as expressed in Genesis 1:26: "Then God said, 'let us make humankind in our image, according to our likeness, and let them have dominion over the fish of the sea, and over the birds of the air, and over the cattle, and over all the wild animals of the earth...'," and in Genesis 2:15: "The Lord God took the man and put him in the Garden of Eden to till it and keep it." When applied to God's children in the New Testament, responsible stewardship includes the use of spiritual gifts to serve one another as exhorted in 1 Pet 4:10–11, "Like good stewards of the manifold grace of God, serve one another with whatever gift each of you has received…so that God may be glorified in all things through Jesus Christ. To him belong the glory and the power forever and ever. Amen." In the context of discussing what we should or should not do with our body to the glory of God, 1 Corinthians 6:12 says: "All things are lawful for me, but not all things are beneficial. All things are lawful for me, but I will not be dominated by anything."

Foundational Principle 3: Our Attitude in life—indifference to the externals

> *I must make myself indifferent to all crated things…. I ought not to seek health rather than sickness, wealth rather than poverty, honor rather than dishonor, a long life rather than a short one, etc.*
>
> *We must not care about external things, like health or sickness, wealth or poverty, fame or obscurity, a long life or a short one.*[533]

Our rightful attitude in life as God's children is to submit to the sovereignty of God regardless of the externals, as taught by the apostle Paul in Romans 14:8, "If we live, we live to the Lord, and if we die, we die to the Lord; so then, whether we live or whether we die, we are

[533] Muldoon, 75.

the Lord's"; and in Galatians 5:6, "For in Christ Jesus neither circumcision nor uncircumcision counts for anything; the only thing that counts is faith working through love." Therefore, we must be ready to let go of everything external to our eternal well-being, and to let God have His sovereign way with us.

Foundational Principle 4: Our "Election" (Choices)—only that which achieve our Goal

> *I ought to desire and elect only the thing which is more conducive to the end for which I am created.*
>
> *We should want only what we were created for.*[534]

The day-to-day choices as well as decisions in life as God's children are to be based on this goal of our eternal well-being to the glory of God, as affirmed in 1 Timothy 6:12, 17–19:

> Take hold of the eternal life to which you were called…. As for those in the present age are rich, command them not to be haughty, or to set their hopes on the uncertainty of riches, but rather on God who richly provides us with everything for our enjoyment. They are to do good, to be rich in good works, generous, and ready to share, thus storing up for themselves the treasure of a good foundation for the future, so that they may take hold of the life that really is life.

Since we are called to eternal life, we must seek first the kingdom of God and not worry about material things (Mt 6:30–33), so that we may lay up treasures for our eternal well-being to God's glory.

Central Aspects:

In addition to the Four Foundation Principles of Ignatian *Exercises*, Javier Melloni points out that the three central aspects of his *Exercises* also find support in Scripture: *first,* "devotion to the humanity of Christ"; *second,* "method of prayer" in praying through the *Exercises*; and

[534] Muldoon, 76.

third, "progression of the spiritual life" through the progression of the *Exercises*.[535] (The content of the four weeks of the *Spiritual Exercises* will be explained later under "How Ignatian Spirituality Works.")

Devotion to the humanity of Christ: Dedicating three of the four weeks to contemplating the gospel scenes of the life, passion, and resurrection of Christ reflects the centrality of the Gospel and the rootedness of the *Exercises* in Christ's Incarnation, so that retreatants may deepen into an 'interior knowledge' of Christ, which leads to loving and serving Him.[536] Scripture equates the knowledge of God and Christ with "eternal life" as follows: "And this is eternal life, that they may know you, the only true God, and Jesus Christ, whom you have sent" (Jn 17:3). However, since no one can know God apart from the incarnate Christ, "No one has ever seen God. It is God the only Son, who is close to the Father's heart, who has made him known" (Jn 1:18), for "He is the reflection of God's glory and the exact imprint of God's very being…" (He 1:3), an 'interior knowledge' of the humanity of Christ is essential for our eternal well-being to God's glory. The genius of the Ignatian *Exercises* lies in its bringing retreatants face to face with the Gospel stories, trusting the Holy Spirit to reveal God through contemplation of the person and work of Jesus Christ through the *Exercises*,[537] as affirmed in 2 Corinthians 3:18, "And all of us, with unveiled faces, seeing the glory of the Lord as though reflected in a mirror, are being transformed into the same image from one degree of glory to another; for this comes from the Lord, the Spirit."

[535] Javier Melloni, *The Exercises of St. Ignatius in the Western Tradition*, trans. Michael Ivens (Herefordshire: Gracewing Publishing, 2000), 15.

[536] Melloni, 18–19.

[537] Katherine Dyckman, Mary Garvin, and Elizabeth Liebert, *The Spiritual Exercises Reclaimed: Uncovering Liberating Possibilities FOR WOMEN* (New York: Paulist Press, 2001), 8.

Method of prayer: The prayer practices Ignatius uses are both contextual and spiritual: contextual in the sense that retreatants are led to interpret their own life-situation in the light of Scripture and to examine how their practice of faith should change; spiritual in the sense that retreatants may find their way to encounter God through interacting with the Spirit of truth in God's Word.[538] To be led by the Holy Spirit in encountering Christ through the Word of God is well attested in both the Hebrew Bible and the New Testament. For example, with reference to the former, Jesus says, "You search the Scriptures because you think that in them you have eternal life; and it is they that testify on my behalf"(Jn 5:39); and with reference to the latter, Jesus says, "When the Advocate comes, whom I will send to you from the Father, the Spirit of truth…will testify on my behalf" (Jn 15:26) and "When the Spirit of truth comes, he will guide you into all truth" (Jn 16:13).

Progression of the spiritual life: Patterned after the classical scheme of the three ways—the purgative, the illuminative, and the unitive—the Ignatian *Exercises* are also well supported by Scripture. Corresponding to the **First Week** of meditation on sin, general confession, and Examen of conscience, the purgative stage of confession of sin as a prerequisite to new birth in Christ can be supported by the apostle Peter's advice at the end of his first sermon on the Day of Pentecost: "Repent and be baptized every one of you in the name of Jesus Christ so that your sins may be forgiven; and you will receive the gift of the Holy Spirit" (Ac 2:38). Corresponding to the *Second Week* of elements that illuminate the 'interior knowledge' of Christ who became human so that one may better love and follow him, the illuminative work of the Holy Spirit on

[538] Helmut Gabel, "Ignatian Contemplation and Modern Biblical Studies," *The Way* 44, no. 2 (April 2005), 43–45.

the life of Christ is also testified to by Christ himself when he said: “But the Advocate, the Holy Spirit, whom the Father will send in my name, will teach you everything, and remind you of all that I have said to you” (Jn 14:26). Corresponding to the *Third and Fourth Weeks* of Ignatius’ ‘election’ of the unitive or union with God through attentive searching for and choosing in each moment to surrender oneself to God’s will for the transformation of the world[539] is Jesus’ own example through his prayer when He faced the cross: "Father, if you are willing, remove this cup from me; yet, not my will but yours be done” (Lk 22:42); then by his teaching his disciples to continually remaining in him, i.e. obeying his Word, "I am the vine, you are the branches. Those who abide in me, and I, in them bear much fruit, because apart from me you can do nothing. If you keep my commandments, you will abide in my love, just as I have kept my Father's commandments and abide in his love” (Jn 15:5, 10). By keeping Christ’s commandments and so accomplishing God’s will for their lives, the disciples will glorify God just as Jesus has glorified God by accomplishing God’s will for his life, as he affirms: “I glorified you on earth by finishing the work that you gave me to do” (Jn 17:4).

Relevance of the Jesuits to the Chinese People

The Jesuits’ Mission to China:

The sixteenth-century Jesuit priest Matteo Ricci, the first Catholic missionary to China, exemplifies the best approach to missions and attitude toward the Chinese culture, for he was well respected by the Chinese emperor of his day as well as by the Chinese government today. And so his story must be told. Born in 1552 in Macerata, Italy, he received his education at a Jesuit school, and later at a Roman College. Ricci was well-trained in the classics, philosophy,

[539] Melloni, 34, 50; Ganss, 51-53.

mathematics, astronomy, and theology.[540] When they arrived in Zhaoqing, China in 1583, Ricci and his Jesuit partner Ruggieri announced on their knees that "they were religious men, servants of God, from the furthest reaches of the west, come to witness the famed good government of China," and that their desire was "merely for a place to settle…where they might build a little house and church, and serve God until the end of their days"; and their requests were granted immediately.[541] They were the first missionaries since 1552 who were given permission to settle permanently in China, after 60 failed attempts by over 50 others, mostly Jesuit missionaries.[542]

Ricci reported within a little over two years that he was able to preach in Chinese, speak to people without an interpreter, and make about 20 converts; one of them allegedly even brought his idol and books to be burned, and on his knees begged to be made a Christian.[543] Originally persuaded to dress as a Buddhist monk, he re-identified himself a decade later in 1595 as a member of the literati by posing like a Confucian scholar for the last 16 years of his life. It was said that, "a distinctive pointed cap…an abundant beard, flowing robes, and capacious sleeves that conceal his hands in a gesture of respect, all signal his integration into Chinese elite society."[544] Recognizing the highly esteemed status of the literati, and for the role of "reason" in converting them, Ricci testified, "It will be easy to persuade the kingdom of the things of our holy faith, confirmed with so much evidence of reason, and when the most learned men agree with us, it will be easy to convert the rest."[545]

[540] Laven, 28-30.
[541] Ibid., 32.
[542] Ibid., 21.
[543] Ibid., 47, 53–54.
[544] Ibid., 19–20.
[545] Mooney, 197.

Ricci had devoted himself not only to a high level of competence in the Chinese language that enabled him to express clearly the Christian doctrines, and to master the Confucian philosophy so that he could translate into Latin Confucius' famous *Four Books*, but also to develop a high tolerance for the Confucian ancestral rites that eventually led to the Rites Controversy.[546]

Jesuits' Accommodation to the Chinese Culture:

> Ricci put into effective operation policies for future Jesuits as follows:[547]
>
> Accommodation and adaptation to Chinese culture; evangelization from the top down, addressing the literate elite, even emperor if possible; indirect evangelism by means of science and technology to convince the elite of the high level of European civilization; openness to and tolerance of Chinese moral values and some ritual practices.

Based on John and Evelyn Berthrong's understanding of Ricci's view, the reason for his tolerance of the Chinese ancestral rites in remembering their ancestors as well as great scholars of the past such as Confucius was that Ricci did not regard those behaviors as worship, but a form of civil veneration of the ancestors, similar to the Catholics' veneration of their saints.[548] An incident testifying to Ricci's view was his reaction to the Chinese people's behavior toward the painting of the Virgin and Child hung above the altar of the Jesuit church: "Everyone … adored that image of the Madonna and her Son … pausing at the threshold to … bow down before it"; but, worried that it might promote misunderstanding that the Virgin Mary was a goddess to be worshipped, the Jesuits replaced that painting with that of the Savior.[549]

[546] Mooney, 200, 239
[547] Laven, 21–22.
[548] Berthrong, 141.
[549] Laven, 48.

But because of Ricci's "accommodation policy" allowing the honoring of Confucius and ancestors; allowing mass to be said for the souls of non-Christian ancestors of Christians; and allowing Christians to participate in community festivals or entertainments in honor of non-Christian gods; etc., the Pope issued a decree in 1704 against the rites (reiterated in 1715 and 1742).[550] When the papal legate sent to China in 1705 brought along Charles Maigrot, a local champion of the rite-haters, to inform the Chinese emperor Kangxi of the decree, the latter became outraged by what he considered interference in his state and culture, especially given that Maigrot, who spoke no Chinese despite having been in China for over 20 years, presumed to tell him about Chinese rituals and practices.[551] Kangxi decreed in 1706 that all missionaries undergo an examination, by which only those who agreed with "the policies of Matteo Ricci" would be allowed to stay in China; those who disagreed would be deported.[552] When his son Yongzheng took the throne in 1723, he made Christianity illegal in 1724, labeling it an "evil cult…subversive of Chinese culture and values."[553]

Ricci's Lasting Impact:

In May, 1610, Ricci rested in the Lord, and the emperor accorded him a burial site. His success as a missionary is recorded in an inscription the Governor of Beijing sent to adorn his tomb, reading: "To he who came to China, attracted by our justice system, and to the author of so many books."[554] As Laven rightly states, "Ricci stands as the icon of the Jesuits' approach to mission."[555] According to Bays, there were no non-Jesuit missionaries in China until at least a

[550] Daniel H. Bays, *A New History of Christianity in China* (Malden, MA: Wiley-Blackwell, 2012), 28–29.
[551] Ibid., 29–30.
[552] Ibid., 30.
[553] Ibid.
[554] Mooney, 241–243.
[555] Laven, 19.

decade after Ricci's death, and almost all of the Jesuits from Ricci on to those in the seventeenth century had excellent language abilities, and followed his policies of cultural accommodation.[556] In 1701, there were estimated to be 200,000 converts and 153 clerics in China, including all 9 Chinese and 82 European Jesuit priests, who represent two thirds of the clergy in China, and contributed 80 percent of all Chinese Catholic writings.[557] The Jesuits were all aging and weakening by the time the Pope ordered the Society of the Jesus be dissolved in 1773, but when the papal bull of suppression was reversed in 1814, the Society recovered rapidly and sent missionaries to China again.[558] After 1949 when the Communists took over, all western missionaries were forced to leave China; but in 1954, when a school for party cadres was built on the site of Zhalan from which most graves were removed, Premier Zhou En-lai insisted on keeping the tombs of Ricci and other Jesuit missionaries as cultural monuments, thus saving them from the eventual violence of the Red Guards in the 1960s.[559] On the four hundredth anniversary of his death, Ricci's tombstone was re-polished, writings republished, and memory celebrated by the issuing of stamps in Taiwan (1983), Italy (2002), Macao (2006) where Ricci first landed before entering China, and by the four institutes bearing his name in Taipei, Macerata, San Francisco, and Macao, dedicating to Sino-western cultural exchanges and support scholarship on the Jesuit China Mission.[560]

The Road to Transformation

The Spiritual Exercises:

[556] Bays, 22.

[557] R. Po-Chia Hsia, *A Jesuit in the Forbidden City: Matteo Ricci 1552–1610* (Oxford: University Press, 2010), 296.

[558] Hsia, 298; Bays, 31.

[559] Hsia, 302–303.

[560] Ibid., 308.

The *Exercises* help people travel "the distance between the head and the heart," and inspire in them that "bold, holy desires for God's greater glory and the service of others."[561] The purpose of the *Exercises* is to help retreatants recognize their hunger for God, discover God's will for their lives, and respond to God who is always present and inviting them to a deeper relationship with Godself.[562] The goal of meditation as an event of grace and encounter between the Creator and the one meditating, as revealed in the Preparatory Prayer before starting the *Exercises* is that "all my intentions, actions and operations may be directed purely to the service and praise of His Divine Majesty."[563]

Acknowledging its foundation to the believer's faith, Scripture has a central place in the *Exercises*; however, Ignatius' focus is to pray with Scripture, allowing hearts to be moved and transformation to take place, rather than to study it.[564] The two primary forms of prayer are meditation and contemplation: the former uses the intellect by reading Scripture, praying over words, images and ideas, and engaging one's memory to appreciate God's activities in life; the latter, involving more with emotion than with intellect, uses imagination to place oneself in a setting from Scripture to pray and interact with God or Christ.[565] The *Exercises* were designed to be used as a manual for spiritual directors in a retreat setting, from which they may choose passages from Scripture based on the needs and progress of their retreatants.[566]

[561] O'Brien, 13.
[562] Ibid., xxvi.
[563] Gabel, 39.
[564] O'Brien, 15.
[565] Ibid., 14–15.
[566] Ibid., 14.

The *Exercises* are divided into four "Weeks"— not calendar weeks but phases or movements a retreatant feels within him or her while praying through the *Exercises*.[567] The spiritual director, in collaboration with the retreatant, decides when the latter is ready to move on to the next "Week."[568] To start the *Exercises* slowly and gently, a Preparation Week focusing on God's creation and unconditional love is added, so that retreatants may feel secure in their relationship with God before dealing with their sins in the First Week.[569] The core of *Exercises* from the Second to the Fourth Weeks is a set of contemplations on the life of Jesus, with the goal of gaining "an interior knowledge" of Christ, so that retreatants may love him more intensely and follow him more closely.[570] Originally intended for a thirty-day retreat, the *Exercises* can be adapted to be used for an eight-day or three-day weekend retreat, or even over an extended period of time, as a retreat in daily life at a home setting, while people continue their ordinary daily activities.[571]

In accordance with the movement of the *Exercises* in four Weeks and the Preparation Week, each focusing on a different aspect of Christian faith, a selection of biblical texts for meditation and contemplation, some especially relevant to the evangelical Chinese American Christians (in addition to those suggested by Ignatius as found in Tetlow's *Ignatius Loyola: Spiritual Exercises*) are presented as follows:

[567] O'Brien, 15.

[568] Moshe Sluhovsky, "St. Ignatius of Loyola's Spiritual Exercises and their Contribution to Modern Introspective Subjectivity," *Catholic Historical Review*, 99, no. 4 (2013), 661.

[569] O'Brien, 15.

[570] J. Matthew Ashley, "Ignacio Ellacuria and the Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius Loyola," *Theological Studies* 61, no. 1 (March 2000), 19.

[571] O'Brien, 19–20.

Preparation Week: Acknowledging God's continuous creation in the world and in each person, the retreatant prays for "a spirit of awe and gratitude for the gifts of God" to bring about "a deeply felt sense of God's unconditional love."[572] This meditation on God's unconditional love is especially important for Chinese Americans due to most parents' high expectation on their children's academic achievement as well as the traditional Chinese corrective rather than encouraging approach in education. Scripture passages conducive to meditation may include the following:

Psalm 32:6–10—a psalm that encourages retreatants to pray to the Lord, who is always found surrounding them with songs of deliverance and covenant steadfast love, teaching, and counseling with loving eyes upon them.

Psalm 139:1–18—a psalm that tells of the Creator God's wonderful creation, personal knowledge, and intimate concern over humankind created in God's own image.

Luke 15:11–31—a parable that Jesus teaches about the unconditional love of the heavenly Father toward wayward children who do not understand the compassion of the Father.

First Week: Pray over the meaning and condition of human existence,[573] attending to the reality and pattern of sin and the misuse of God's gift of freedom before the merciful God, who accepts retreatants as they are, that they may be grateful for God's deliverance, and be set free from anything that gets in the way of loving God, others, and themselves.[574] Scripture passages conducive to meditation may include the following:

[572] O'Brien, 15.
[573] Tetlow, *Making Choices*, 9.
[574] Ibid.

Psalm 32:1–5—a psalm that motivates retreatants to confess their sins to the Lord who is ready to forgive and bless them; otherwise, they may suffer the hand of the Lord's discipline.

Psalm 139:23–24—an earnest prayer for the Creator God who knows them personally and intimately to search their hearts, revealing to them their wicked ways and leading them in the everlasting way.

Psalm 51:1–4, 10—an appeal to God's steadfast love and God's mercy to forgive retreatants' sins and renew their spirit.

Luke 7:36–50—Jesus' parable of forgiven debts (vv. 41–43) for retreatants to reflect on how much or how frequently they have experienced their sins being forgiven by Jesus, the agent of God's forgiving love.[575]

Mark 9:33–50—a passage that motivates retreatants to reflect on their value system of greatness in comparison with Jesus' view on greatness through service,[576] which is especially relevant to Chinese Americans who eagerly seek high status through earthly achievements.

Second Week: Retreatants meditate and contemplate on Jesus the son of God coming in the flesh and living a human life as presented in the Gospels,[577] as a guide for knowing Christ more intimately, so that retreatants will love him more dearly, and choose to do God's will in their life.[578] As the retreatants contemplate on Jesus' life and how he lived to fulfill God's will, they may be motivated to seek and to respond to God's will in their lives, which requires a process of discernment, defined by Egan as "the prudent making of life-choices" as rooted in

[575] Kylie Crabbe, "A Sinner and a Pharisee: Challenge at Simon's Table in Luke 7:36–40," *Pacifica: Journal of the Melbourne College of Divinity* 24, no. 3 (Oct 2011), 261.

[576] Green, 74–79.

[577] O'Brien, 16.

[578] Muldoon, 138; O'Brien, 16.

the Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius.[579] Biblical texts on Jesus' life and teaching for meditation and contemplation may include the following:

Luke 2:40–52—a description on Jesus' holistic growth for reflection on Christian parenting, which is especially relevant to Chinese Americans who focus primarily on the academic.

Matthew 6:24–34—Jesus' teaching for reflection on faith and priority as opposed to anxiety over material needs, which is especially relevant to Chinese immigrants who worry about not having or saving enough for themselves and for their children.

Mark 8:27–38—Jesus' teaching for reflection on the high cost of discipleship—how retreatants must deny themselves, take up the cross and follow him, for it is not worth it to gain the whole world but forfeit their lives, about which many Chinese American Christians are at risk.

Mark 10:19–22—a challenge for retreatants like the rich young ruler to reflect on the temptation of wealth and greed, as analogous to those searching for the American dream.

Third Week: Deepen the retreatants' personal identification with Jesus' passion during his last days on earth by bringing their imagination into contemplating Christ's suffering unto death on the cross—the consummate expression of God's faithfulness and love, so that retreatants may participate in his suffering and death by seeking only to fulfill God's will in their lives.[580] The logic of Ignatius' perspective on finding God in the midst of suffering goes like this: "If I want to follow Jesus, then I will choose to become like him. And if becoming like Jesus means accepting hardships, then I will seek those things, assuming that this is not against God's will."[581] It is

[579] Anthony Egan, "Conscience, Spirit, Discernment: The Holy Spirit, the Spiritual Exercises and the Formation of Moral Conscience," *Journal of Theology for Southern Africa* 138 (Nov 2010), 65.

[580] Muldoon, 162; O'Brien, 16.

[581] Martin, 295.

during the third Week of the *Exercises* that retreatants are to imagine themselves following Jesus through the Last Supper, his prayer in the Garden of Gethsemane, his arrest, trial, and beating, his rejection by Peter, his crucifixion and suffering on the cross, and his death.[582] By meditating imaginatively on Christ's passion, retreatants can gain insights into what it means by surrendering to the future that which God has in store for us as Jesus did, and how God can bring new life out of the darkest moments of our lives as He did with Jesus' life.[583] Retreatants can learn to suffer with Jesus by our loving presence with suffering people around us, as Martin insightfully puts it: "There is nothing we can do. There is little we can say. But we can be there."[584]

Scripture passages for meditation and contemplation may be taken from the last section of all four gospels (Matthew 26–27, Mark 8–15, Luke 22–23, John 18–19): from Jesus' prediction of his suffering and death to his last Supper, prayer at Gethsemane, arrest, trial, death on the cross and burial. In addition, Isaiah 53 may also be selected as an important passage to meditate on Jesus' suffering and death on behalf of humankind.

Fourth Week: Retreatants contemplate Jesus' resurrection as well as on the joyful response to God's call for retreatants to pass through death to live the resurrected life, which means finding the presence of God in Christ in all things, as well as loving and serving God and others in concrete ways.[585] It is about living the resurrected life in Christ, which is choosing the simple life and downward mobility, which is contrary to the Chinese immigrants' traditional

[582] Martin, 295.
[583] Ibid., 297.
[584] Ibid., 298.
[585] Muldoon, 179; O'Brien, 16.

culture along with their American dream that both celebrate upward mobility, meaning particularly achieving high academic, professional, and socio-economic status, etc. As Martin points out, Jesus sees through the "one-thing lacking" that prevents the rich young ruler from growing close to God (Mk 10:17–22), of which Ignatius would call "disordered attachment," so Jesus advises him to get rid of it, then come, follow him.[586] This "one-thing lacking" or "disordered attachment" that Jesus wants us to give up may be "status," "success," "possession," or just anything that prevents us from following Christ, because the more we simplify our life, the freer we can be to follow Christ.[587] To free ourselves from disordered attachments, Ignatius proposes what he calls "The Three Ways of Being Humble" or "The Three Degrees of Humility: The First is to always live a moral life by obeying "the law of God;" the Second is to be "indifferent" to "the choice that brings wealth, honor, or a long life," which will set us free to accept the will of God as whatever life situations may bring; and the Third, the "most perfect" way, is to choose willingly the more humble way to be Christ-like, e.g. poverty or rejection, which will free us from a natural exaggerated self-interest.[588]

Biblical passages for meditation and contemplation (the last two on Social Gospel is especially relevant for Chinese Americans) may include the following:

Luke 24:1-10—a reflection on women being the first witnesses to the resurrection, sent by the risen Lord to announce the good news to other disciples.

John 21:1–19—a reflection on the restoration and sending of Peter who had three times denied Christ, and of his loving response to Christ's love.

[586] Martin, 180.
[587] Ibid.
[588] Ibid., 207–208.

Mark 10:19–22 (repeated from 2nd Week but with a different emphasis)—a challenge for retreatants to reflect on the "one-thing lacking" or "disordered attachment" that hinders them from responding positively to the risen Christ's calling for a renewed resurrected life in Christ.
John 20:1–18—a reflection on Mary Magdalen as the first witness to the resurrection, sent by the Risen Lord to other disciples to announce Christ's resurrection, because of which Jesus' Father is now also their Father, Jesus' God, their God.
Luke 4:18–19—a reflection on Christ's being sent by the Father on mission, a social Gospel that is often neglected by evangelical Chinese American Christians who are satisfied with following only the Great Commission of Matthew 28:19–20.
Matthew 25:31–46—a reflection on Christ's teaching on the social Gospel that is often neglected by evangelical Chinese American Christians.

Giving and Receiving the *Exercises*: The spiritual director is an administrator who assigns a couple of exercises or passages of Scripture for the retreatants to choose to meditate on according to their disposition, with the goal of helping them enter an interior disposition that allows for illumination and direction by God; hence, the Spiritual Directors must refrain from imposing their own will on the retreatants.[589] Once the exercises are assigned, spiritual directors are to leave the retreatants alone to practice them, remaining detached especially in transitional moments during the *Exercises* when the retreatants are discerning a vocation in life at the end of the Second week as well as the last two weeks, in order to create a space for God to work within the hearts of the retreatants.[590] When the retreatants report back at each

[589] Sluhovsky, 658–660.
[590] Ibid., 660–661.

direction session, the spiritual directors are to listen for their response to and the extent of achievement of the previously assigned exercise, and in collaboration with the Retreatants, analyze its impact on the latter's soul, then assign the next exercise.[591]

Methods of Prayer:

1) Lectio Divina: Patterned after Guigo II's description of Lectio Divina but reversing the last two stages,[592] Ignatius' holistic method of prayer for the *Exercises* toward knowing the incarnate Christ involves four steps. The first two steps—a careful *reading* of the Gospel and *meditating* on the reading, including intellectual meditation, imaginative meditation, and visible meditation, aim at penetrating into the interior and scrutinizing every detail of the Gospel passage.[593] Then Ignatius reverses the classical third and fourth steps of Guigo's Lectio Divina by having contemplation come before prayer: *contemplation* that involves a disposition of complete welcome and availability to the action of God and a response to God's revelation in wonder and absorption rather than in ecstasy (about which the evangelical Chinese American Christians are skeptical); and *prayer* that involves putting into words the desire to love and follow Christ and to offer oneself to serve Christ.[594]

The way Ignatius' method of prayer engages the people's intellect, emotion, will, and imagination is much needed for the evangelical Chinese American Christians who are used to studying the Bible that involves primarily the intellect. This holistic method is affirmed by Christ's way of engaging His disciples in getting to know Him. For example, He addresses his

[591] Sluhovsky, 657.
[592] Melloni, 31.
[593] Ibid., 25–26.
[594] Ibid., 30–33.

disciples' intellectual understanding of their experience with him by raising the questions, "Who do the crowds say that I am?" followed by "Who do you say that I am?" (Luke 9:18–19). He takes his disciples through an emotional experience of a stormy ride across the lake that they may know him as the sovereign Lord over nature (Luke 8:22–25). He challenges the will of His disciples to count the cost of disciple, in order to follow Him (Luke 14:25–31). And he makes use of parables such as the lost sheep, the lost coin, and the prodigal son (Luke 15) to engage the imaginations as well as the emotions of His audience to sense God's heart for the lost.

Since the Lectio Divina is employed throughout the whole retreat as retreatants meditate and contemplate on the life of Christ from the word of God, teaching, demonstrating, and practicing how to do the Lectio would be appropriate during the Preparation Day, before passages of Scripture are assigned by the spiritual director.

2) The Daily Examen: Ignatius considers the Examen the single most important exercise for a person to do every day, because it helps him or her to become more adept at listening to and working with God in building a good spiritual life.[595] Written into the Constitutions, the Examen of conscience is required of Jesuit priests twice a day.[596] There are two types of Examen: the traditional Daily Examen of Conscience and the contemporary Daily Examen of Consciousness. The primary focus of the traditional Examen of Conscience is on searching to the depths of our hearts and praying the words of the Psalmist, "Search me, O God, and know my heart; test me and know my thoughts. See if there is any wicked way in me, and lead me in

[595] Muldoon, 32.
[596] Ibid., 34

the way everlasting" (Ps 139:23–24).[597] As Foster insightfully points out, if we are the lone examiners of our heart, justifications will come up to declare our innocence, calling "evil good, and good evil," as Isaiah 5:20 warns us.[598] By inviting the Lord to search together with us, our natural tendency to justify or condemn our behaviors will be avoided, and we will be shown what we need to see about ourselves and our relationship with God, while prevented from seeing more than we are able to handle at one time; and this self-knowledge will lead us to a self-acceptance arising from God's acceptance and love toward us.[599] To some people, this prayer can become "a moralistic exercise in self-scrutiny,"[600] unless they are reassured of God's unconditional love for them. That is the reason in a retreat setting, retreatants are led to meditate on God's unconditional love during the Preparation Week before they start the First Week of the *Exercises*, when they will be led to pray the Examen of Conscience.

The original five-step Examen of Conscience is to be carried out at the end of the day or twice a day, as a way of daily finding God and letting God find us.[601] The second and the third steps of the traditional Examen of Conscience are insightfully reversed by Martin as listed below, for he thinks that it takes a good review before we can discover our own sins, then we can ask for forgiveness:[602] *1) Gratitude:* recall and give thanks to the good things that have happened to us during that day, for "savoring is an antidote to your increasingly rushed lives,"

[597] Richard J. Foster, *Prayer: Finding the Heart's True Home* (San Francisco, CA: HarperCollins Publishers, 1992), 29.

[598] Ibid.

[599] Muldoon, 34.

[600] Teresa Blythe, *50 Ways to Pray: Practices from Many Traditions and Times* (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 2006), 58.

[601] Martin, 86–88.

[602] Ibid., 97.

by which we can pause to enjoy your blessings of the day and deepen our gratitude to God.[603] *2) Review:* run through events of the day from rising till bedtime, recalling every moment with its sights and sounds, conversations, thoughts, deeds, as well as positive and negative feelings, including acceptance and resistance of God's invitation for us to grow in specific areas.[604] *3) Sorrow:* ask for the grace to hear the voice of conscience, and acknowledge sinfulness before God, which helps us not only to come closer to God, but also to become more loving people.[605] *4) Forgiveness:* ask for forgiveness of sins we have done is not a reminder on how bad we are but on how good God is, for God desires to "welcome us back" like the father in the parable of the Prodigal son; and decide if we want to reconcile with someone we have hurt.[606] *5) Grace:* ask for the grace of God's help for the following day, that we may see God's presence more clearly; then close with any prayer, such as the Lord's Prayer.[607]

While some people find examining the "conscience" has "narrow, moralistic overtones," with its focus on what we have done wrong or have not done right, the Examen of Consciousness focuses on what is being done to us: how we are being moved in our affective consciousness.[608] It is a prayer process in which we go through our memories of the day, paying attention to and journaling both positive and negative feelings, such as a high point, a low point; most joyful, most painful; most grateful, least grateful; closest to God, most distant from God; open to God's Spirit, blocked from God's Spirit, etc., and respond to God personally

[603] Martin, 88-89, 97.
[604] Ibid., 91–94, 97.
[605] Ibid., 89–90, 97.
[606] Ibid., 95–97.
[607] Ibid.
[608] Ronald Modras, *A Dynamic Spirituality for the 21st Century: Ignatian Humanism* (Chicago, IL: Loyola Press, 2004), 34–35.

through prayer and journaling.[609] Modras describes the prayer process as follows: *1) Light:* insight into the mystery of graced understanding of the Spirit's leading; *2) Positive Feelings:* with an "attitude of gratitude," count the gifts of the whole day; *3) Negative Feelings:* look not so much at "actions or failures" as "motives and reasons" for them; *4) Assessment:* of spontaneous feelings that expose who we are and what we may need to do; *5) Future:* a sense of determination and a resolve to try again.[610] The process helps us see God's presence in all of life's situations, so that over time, we will discover God's pattern of activities in our life, which motivates us to more eagerly look for and notice God's presence in our daily activities, that we will be more readily respond to God's invitation for spiritual growth in Christ.

Relatively speaking, the focus of the Examen of Conscience is on confession, and the focus of the Examen of Consciousness is on awareness of God's presence. Since both focuses are important as spiritual disciplines, but there are overlapping elements in the two processes that may create confusion for the retreatants who are beginners in such prayer practices, to better differentiate the two, it is important to simplify the steps to allow the differences to stand out, as proposed in the field test of this dissertation (see Spiritual Exercise 2 on pages 241-242 for the Examen of Consciousness and Spiritual Exercise 3 on page 243 for the Examen of Conscience in Chapter 6).

Humans' Desires and God's Desires:

As retreatants are in the process of choosing to do God's will, they are encouraged to discover, name, and express to God their "deepest desires" or longings in their hearts, which is

[609] Blythe, 60.
[610] Modras, 35–36.

a key part of Ignatian spirituality, because Ignatius is convinced that "our deepest desires help us know God's desires for us."[611] This concept of spirituality is evident in a couple of interactions between Jesus and those who seek his attention. On one occasion Jesus takes the initiative by posing the question to John the Baptist's two disciples, who immediately follow him upon John's introduction of him as the Lamb of God, "What are you seeking?" (Jn 1:36–38); and on another, he asks Bartimaeus, the blind beggar by the roadside, "What do you want me to do for you?" (Mt 20:32–34; Mk 10:51–52; and Lk 18:41–43). While the answers to his own questions are obvious to Jesus, he still wants the disciples to express the longing in their hearts openly.[612] In the first instance, the desire to establish a closer relationship with Jesus expressed by the followers, "Rabbi, where are you staying?" (Jn 1:38) is the very same desire Jesus has toward them, for he immediately invites them, "Come and see." So they go to see his place and spend that day with him there (John 1:39). Similarly, in the second instance, the desire that Bartimaeus expresses, "Lord, let me see again" is also the very same desire Jesus has for him, as evident from his response: "Receive your sight; your faith has healed you." Bartimaeus immediately receives his sight and follows him, giving glory and praise to Jesus along with those who witness the healing (Lk 18:42–43)!

Martin warns that the kind of "desires" that God wants us to discover and to name is different from "surface wants" such as "I want a new house"; but those deepest desires that "help us know who we are to become and what we are to do"; so that by expressing them to

[611] Martin, 59.
[612] Ibid., 58.

God as do Jesus' followers as well as Bartimaeus, we come to recognize God's desires for us, which is one of the key ways God's voice is heard in our lives.[613]

Discernment in Decision Making:

Ignatius' teaching on Discernment in decision making is well explained in Timothy M. Gallagher's book, *Discerning the Will of God: The Ignatian Guide to Christian Decision Making*, in which Ignatius' three modes of decision making are also included for reference in the section—"Complete Text of St. Ignatius" of his book.[614]

The key to the First Mode of Discernment is "Clarity beyond Doubting," which means that when a person faces choices between good options, s/he feels that God so moves and attracts the will that, without doubting or being able to doubt, the person follows what is shown to him/her, as St. Paul and St. Matthew did in following Christ, and acts upon the choice as a gift of clarity from God. [615] However, the person must reflect on the following relevant questions: "What specifically was shown to me?," "Was there a clear attraction and drawing of the will toward it?," "Was it truly impossible to doubt that it was of God?," "Have I spoken with a spiritual director about the experience?," and "Have I acted upon this gift?"[616] If God has not given the clarity beyond doubt in the First Mode, the person discerning should turn to the Second Mode of Discernment.

The key to the Second Mode of Discernment is "Attraction of the Heart," which means that through spiritual experience of "consolations and desolations" in the heart, the person

[613] Martin, 59, 63.

[614] Timothy M. Gallagher, *Discerning the Will of God: The Ignatian Guide to Christian Decision Making* (New York: The Crossroad Publishing Company, 2009), 141–144.

[615] Ibid., 70–71.

[616] Ibid., 81–82.

making the choice receives "sufficient clarity and understanding" of the one option among others that best conveys God's will.[617] Unlike the first mode, this second-mode discernment is an "over-time" process rather than a "one-moment" event; therefore, it requires attentive listening to God's "still small voice" speaking to the heart throughout the process, during which "confusing clash of attractions and resistances" eventually "gives way to spiritual clarity."[618] Therefore, it is important for the person discerning to record in writing their experience of consolations and desolations, review and reflect on them, notice repeated patterns, how s/he is drawn to a particular option, and be guided along by a spiritual director who is able to confirm whether or not God is giving "sufficient clarity and understanding" through the "experience of consolations and desolations."[619] If after a period of time the person does not find "sufficient clarity and understanding," Ignatius would encourage her/him to go on to the Third Mode of Discernment.[620]

The key to the Third Mode of Discernment is "A Preponderance of Reasons," which is based on considering "the advantages and disadvantages for God's service" of the various options, and to move toward choosing the one with the greatest weight of reasons.[621] The process of this mode of discernment consists of six steps: first, identify the issue about which to make a choice; second, focus on the objective of the end for which one is created, so that the person discerning be "indifferent, without any disordered attachment" to any one of the options; third, ask God to move the will toward choosing that which is pleasing to his will for his

[617] Gallagher, 86.
[618] Ibid., 100.
[619] Ibid., 84, 87, 101.
[620] Ibid., 101.
[621] Ibid., 102–103.

praise and glory; fourth, consider by way of reasoning the advantages and disadvantages of every aspect of each option; fifth, choose the option that reason inclines most; and sixth, pray and offer before God the choice to confirm whether or not "it is for his greater service and praise."[622] Aside from this approach, Ignatius also proposes another way to the Third Mode of Discernment, which consists of four rules and a note: first, the love that moves you to choose the option must be "solely for the sake of his Creator and Lord"; second, choose what you would tell a total stranger for whom you desire all the best, to choose for the greater glory of God and the greater perfection of his soul; third, make the decision in conformity with the choice you wish you had made when you come to your death bed; and fourth, consider on the day of judgment what decision you would wish you had made about the present issue; then, guided by these rules, make the choice according to the sixth point of the previous approach, which is to confirm it is for God's greater service and praise.[623]

To apply the above discernment in decision making in an Ignatian retreat setting, retreatants are asked to make decisions to do God's will as they follow Christ, beginning in the Second Week of the *Exercises*. They are reminded that the Ignatian way of discernment in decision making requires an attitude of "indifference," which means having the freedom to go one way or another, depending on God's will, with the purpose of the decision made serves to promote the establishment of God's reign.[624] To discern whether or not retreatants are moving in the direction of God's will through the decision-making process; and when the decision is made, whether or not it is fulfilling God's will, interior movements of "consolation" and

[622] Gallagher, 142–143.
[623] Ibid., 143–144.
[624] Martin, 68.

"desolation" must be explained to them.[625] Martin describes regarding Ignatius' conviction that if you act in accordance with God's desires or invitation for you, you will feel a sense of peace—an indication of being on the right path, which is spiritual "consolation"; but if you feel a sense of "disquiet from various agitations and temptations," it is an indication of being on the wrong path, which is spiritual "desolation."[626] Gallagher describes the nature of "Consolation" as "spiritual joy, love, hope in things of above, tears, and every interior movement which leaves the soul consoled in our Lord"; and that of "desolation," as "sadness, lack of confidence, lack of love, dryness, etc.," which must be explained to the person discerning.[627] The significance of choosing to do God's will can hardly be overstated, as God warns the Israelites: "I have set before you, life and death, blessings and curses. Choose life so that you and your descendants may live" (Dt 30:19), and as Jesus says, "I came that they may have life, and have it abundantly" (John 10:10).

Conclusion: Why Practice Ignatian Spirituality

To propose the practice of Ignatian spirituality for filling the spiritual formation ministry gaps of the evangelical Chinese American Church is a challenging task simply because of its distrust of the Catholic tradition. The content of this chapter has been specifically developed to establish the centrality of Scripture in Ignatian spirituality, the relevance of the Jesuits' mission to the Chinese people, and the road to transformation through their spiritual practices. However, there are other major obstacles that must be addressed before Ignatian spirituality

[625] Egan, 68.
[626] Martin, 308.
[627] Ibid., 86–87.

can be accepted to fill the spiritual formation ministry gaps of the evangelical Chinese American Church as presented below:

Community Perspective: Richard Foster, a well-respected Christian spiritual formation evangelical writer speaks of the various dimensions of the spiritual life in his book *Streams of Living Water: Essential Practices from the Six Great Traditions of Christian Faith*.[628] While he cites Jesus as the source of all streams of living water and the One who models all these dimensions most fully,[629] it is obvious that no one of these six traditions—Contemplative, Holiness, Charismatic, Social Justice, Evangelical, and Incarnational, can claim ownership of the whole truth about spirituality and spiritual practices for all people. In other words, the whole Christian community must respect the unique ways different people practice their faith, and to learn from one another to enrich one's own spirituality and spiritual practices toward Christlikeness.

Historical Perspective: The Catholic and Protestant Christians share a common heritage of spirituality and spiritual practices before the Protestant Reformers broke away from the Roman Catholic Church in the sixteenth century. For example, Michael Casey describes *Lectio divina*, the art of sacred reading, as "a way of spending time with God's revealed word: it involves reflection on the meaning of the text, application to our own situation and a willingness to be led into prayer."[630] The origin of the practice can be traced back to the desert fathers and mothers whose spirituality consisted primarily of prayerful meditation of biblical texts.[631] Later, in the

[628] Richard Foster, *Streams of Living Water: Essential Practices of the Six Great Traditions of Christian Faith* (New York: HarperCollins Publishers, 2001).

[629] Ibid., xvi.

[630] Michael Casey, *Sacred Reading: The Ancient Art of Lectio Divina* (Liguori, MS: Liguori/Triumph, 1995), 84.

[631] Sandra M. Schneiders, "Biblical Spirituality," *Interpretation* 56, no. 2 (2002), 139.

Benedictine monasteries, the practice was legislated and formalized as the Rule of Saint Benedict, and was finally supplied as a "method" for the practice by a twelfth-century Carthusian monk, Guigo II in his spiritual classic, *Ladder of Monks*, which has been adapted by contemporary spiritual teachers for our own times,[632] as widely used in the Ignatian *Spiritual Exercises*. Another significant common heritage is the "modern Devotion" movement founded by Geert Groote (1340–1384 CE) who, standing against the rising fascination of mysticism on the one hand and the speculative excess of scholastic theology on the other, encourages a renewal of Christian piety by focusing on the interior dimension rather than the external marks of religious life.[633] Similar to the approach of Augustine, he applies a simple, devotional use of the Bible as a source of meditation for Christian formation and as a sure vehicle of spiritual experience toward love of God and love of neighbor.[634] One important outcome of this movement is the devotional classic *The Imitation of Christ* by Thomas à Kempis,[635] which is highly regarded by Catholic and Protestant Christians alike.[636] Such a devotional use of the Bible with a focus on Christ is well-accepted by Protestant Christians, although in practice they tend to emphasize the mental aspect to the neglect of the emotional aspect as compared to the more balanced approach of Ignatian spirituality. These are treasures in our common spiritual heritage; it is unfortunate that Protestant Reformers have seemingly "thrown the baby out with the bath water" when they rejected most Catholic traditions.

[632] Schneiders, 139-140.

[633] Mark S. Burrows, "Devotio Moderna: Reforming Piety in the Later Middle Ages," in *Spiritual Traditions for the Contemporary Church*, ed. Robin Maas & Gabriel O' Donnell (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1990), 109–111.

[634] Burrows, 112.

[635] Ibid., 110.

[636] Ibid., 121.

Church Reform Perspective: Martin Luther and Ignatius of Loyola were living at a time of religious turmoil when most Roman Catholics felt that reformation was definitely needed, although there were different views as to how to achieve it.[637] While those who broke away from the papacy (such as Luther) were convinced that not only the "church political structures" needed reform, but also her "theology, liturgy, sacraments, and spirituality," those who remained Catholic and led the way in spiritual reform such as Ignatius opted for "educational reform for priests, correction of abuses by the bishops, and a more centralized administration of the church."[638] The evangelical Chinese American Church has experienced enough of "Church splits" to understand that some "good Christians" feel called by God to leave and start another church due to distrust of the leadership of their local church; while other "good Christians" feel called by God to stay in submission to authority and work with the leadership to reform from within the local church.

Reconciliation Perspective: Pope Francis, a former Jesuit priest, meeting the Church of Scotland delegation (Presbyterian Church) at the Vatican on October 26, 2017, just four days before celebrating Reformation Sunday that marks the five hundredth anniversary of Martin Luther posting his 95 theses on the door of the Wittenberg Castle Church that sparked the Protestant Reformation, said, "Let us thank the Lord for the great gift of being able to live this year in true fraternity, no longer as adversaries, after long centuries of estrangement and conflict." [639] In response to Pope Francis' words of reconciliation, "Now…Catholics and

[637] Bradley P. Holt. *Thirsty for God: A Brief History of Christian Spirituality*, (Minneapolis: Augsburg Fortress, 1993), 69.

[638] Ibid.

[639] Cindy Wooden, "Reformation at 500: Christians see they are brothers, sisters, pope says," Cruxnow, accessed 2/6/2019, https://cruxnow.com/vatican/2017/10/26/reformation-500-christians-see-brothers-sisters-pope-says/.

Protestants are pursuing the path of humble charity that leads to overcoming division and healing wounds…," Rev. Derek Browning, moderator of the Church of Scotland said, "We must speak the truth in love, but in the first place we must speak together. And so, not only in our words, but also in our actions, may truth and light and love be the things we exchange with each other."[640] Indeed, Jesus insists, "I give you a new commandment, that you love one another. Just as I have loved you, you also should love one another. By this everyone will know that you are my disciples, if you have love for one another" (Jn 13:34–35). Reconciliation between Catholic and Protestant Christianity is long overdue for the world to see that we are disciples of Christ.

Ministry Gap Perspective: Having presented the above perspectives to address the seemingly major obstacles for evangelical Chinese American Church to accept Ignatian spirituality, hopefully she will be more open to consider the following implications of how Ignatian spiritual practices may fill her spiritual formation ministry gaps.

First, the non-stop church ministry activities coupled with Chinese immigrant families' busy pursuit of the American dream make it difficult if not impossible for Christians to make time for solitude to reflect on their spiritual life. As Martin puts it, "Life becomes an endless series of tasks…. We become "human doings" instead of "human beings."[641] The Ignatian emphasis of the retreat setting with spiritual direction and prayer practices are antidotes to such a gap in her spiritual formation ministries.

[640] Cindy Wooden, "Reformation at 500: Christians see they are brothers, sisters, pope says," Cruxnow, accessed 2/6/2019, https://cruxnow.com/vatican/2017/10/26/reformation-500-christians-see-brothers-sisters-pope-says/.

[641] Martin, 89.

Second, the immigrant mentality and sense of insecurity, along with their cultural emphasis of academic success often prevent Chinese American Christians from setting priority on spiritual pursuits over earthly successes in life. Many practices of Ignatian spirituality, such as discernment in decision making, with its focus on Christ's life in total submission to God, will help to free them from their earthly bondage to seek and choose God's best in their lives.

Third, most faithful Chinese American Christians desiring to establish an intimate relationship with God tend to rely on expository preaching and inductive Bible Study to hear God's voice, and to rely on personal and corporate prayer to express their praises and needs to God. However, these practices tend to be one-way mental activities, with little connection between the two: the word of God that people learn from preaching or inductive Bible study often stays in the head, with little more than mental application of the truth; and prayer requests are often like grocery shopping lists that people utter without listening for or to God's response. Being properly taught and guided in Ignatian methods of prayer through meditating and contemplating on Scripture has the potential of filling the ministry gap by enhancing a holistic two-way experiential encounter with God in Christ through the Holy Spirit.

And *fourth,* evangelical Chinese American Christians tend to compartmentalize their spiritual life and their secular life, creating inconsistencies between faith and practice as reflected in the survey of their spiritual needs (B1 to B3). The practice of the Ignatian "finding God in all things," which heightens the awareness of God's presence through the movements of the Holy Spirit in the hearts will gradually help them to integrate their faith and practice in living out the authentic Christian life.

Chapter 6

A Field Test of the Dissertation

Introduction: A Course for Evangelical Chinese American Seminaries

The integration of this four-task interdisciplinary approach to practical theology culminates in the development of a seminary course *A Practical Theology of Spiritual Formation* to equip Chinese seminarians to lead their North American evangelical Chinese congregations to live out God's purpose in their lives for the blessing and building up of God's kingdom in the world.

A field test of this seminary course— consisting of a thirty-hour course of classroom instruction followed by a four-night-three-day silent retreat—has been preliminarily developed and conducted (3/12 to 3/19/2018) for the China Evangelical Seminary North America, one of four ATS accredited evangelical Chinese American seminaries in North America. The course was attended by seven students (four women and three men) and four auditors (one recent graduate of CESNA, one faculty of CESNA, one pastor, and one CEO of a Christian organization), who have all signed the consent forms to participate voluntarily in the research. During the retreat, the CESNA faculty, the pastor, and I served as spiritual directors to the seven current students and the graduate auditor, with the faculty of CESNA and I serving three directees each and the pastor, two. The pastor also led the two communion services; and one of the woman students led singing during worship. During classroom discussions, the seven students and the graduate auditor were equally divided into two groups of four persons each, with one student

in each group recording their discussions, and members staying in the same groups throughout the course.

The following is a presentation of the syllabus, the detailed schedule, content, and description of the classroom instructions and the silent retreat, and the student group discussions summarized by one student in each of the two groups for four of the five days of classroom instructions. Since the original documents were either written in Chinese or in both Chinese and English, only the English or English translations are presented below.

The Course Syllabus

Introduction:

This course follows Osmer's four-task approach to explore the issue of Christian spiritual formation of evangelical Chinese Christians in North America by answering the four questions: *First:* What are some major challenges the first-generation evangelical Chinese Christians in North America face in their lived experiences, and what do their responses reveal about the consistencies or inconsistencies between their faith and practice? *Second:* What are the reasons behind their responses, i.e. how the cultural, sociological, and Chinese evangelical heritage impact their practice of the Christian faith? *Third:* What does the Bible reveal about how the Triune God establishes covenant relationship with God's people and the latter's response to God through the ages, that they may be conformed to the image of Christ? *Fourth:* How does Ignatian spirituality provide biblically sound spiritual disciplines that promote their establishing a lifestyle that is consistent with their Christian faith?

The Outline:

1) Course introduction; 2) Major challenges that first-generation evangelical Chinese Christians face in their North American lived experience; 3) The Chinese culture, the North American society, and the evangelical heritage that impact believers' practice of the Christian faith; 4) Biblical revelation that helps disciples establish an authentic relationship with God in Christ; 5) Sound spiritual disciplines that help disciples of Christ establish a lifestyle that is consistent with their faith; and 6) Retreat reflections on retreatants' relationship with God and decision making in line with God's will.

Assignments and Grading:

Attendance, participation and reading—20 percent; two-page Personal Reflection paper on faith versus practice: consistencies of their faith and practice in everyday living—20 percent; 3-page Silent Retreat Spiritual Journal on an experiential encounter with God—20 percent; eight-page Practical Theology of Spiritual Formation Paper (consulting at least four books and four journal articles; and including a description of leading a one-day silent retreat for a small group of three to four persons)—40 percent.

Learning Objectives and Outcomes:

Learning objectives and learning outcomes and measures are stated as required by CESNA under each of the categories below:

1) *Biblical/Theological Knowledge*: Students understand biblical principles on spiritual formation; measured by classroom discussion and Practical Theology paper.
2) *Spiritual Formation:* Students begin to establish a lifestyle reflection consistent with their faith; measured by journaling at the four-day-three-night silent retreat on personal reflection and spiritual direction.

3) *Ministry Skills:* Students design and lead a one-day silent retreat (9 am to 4 pm); measured by the final Practical Theology of Spiritual Formation paper.
4) *Global Evangelism:* Students realize the goal of global evangelism is authentic discipleship; measured by class discussion on Day 1 and Practical Theology of Spiritual Formation paper.
5) *Religious Heritage*: Students realize the impact of religious heritage on their faith practice; measured by class and small group discussions on Day 3 and Practical Theology of Spiritual Formation paper.
6) *Cultural Sensitivity*: Students realize the impact of Chinese culture on their faith practice; measured by class and small group discussions on Day 3 and Practical Theology of Spiritual Formation paper.
7) *Multi-disciplines*: Students integrate Chinese culture, religious heritage, assimilation to North America, biblical studies, and spiritual disciplines into the achievement of course objective; measured by Class and small group discussions, and the Practical Theology of Spiritual Formation paper.

Textbooks & Required Readings: 1000 pages from the following:

Textbooks:

Osmer, Richard Robert. *Practical Theology: An Introduction*. Cambridge: Wm. B. Eerdmans, 2008 (required reading: "Introduction," pages 1-29).

Chua, Amy. *Battle Hymn of the Tiger Mother*. New York: Penguin Books, 2011.

Barry, William A. *Finding God in All Things: A Companion to the Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius*. Notre Dame, IN: Ave Maria Press, 2008.

And choose one from the following three books:

Hsu, Lily M. with Dana Roberts. *My Unforgettable Memories: Watchman Nee & Shanghai Local Church*. N.p.: Xulon Press, 2013.

Wang, Mingdao. *A Stone Made Smooth: Wong Ming-Dao*. Translated by Arthur Reynolds. Southampton, England: Mayflower Christian Books, 1981.

Wu, Silas 吳秀良. *余慈度：二十世紀中國教會復興的先驅* [Dora Yu—Harbinger of Chinese Church Revival in 20th Century China]. Boston, MA: Pishon River Publications, 2000.

References:

Bayer, Hans F. *A Theology of Mark: The Dynamic between Christology and Authentic Discipleship*. Phillipsburg, NJ: P & R Publishing, 2012.

Costigan, Catherine L., Josephine M. Hua, and Tina F. Su. "Living up to Expectations: The Strengths and Challenges Experienced by Chinese Canadian Students." *Canadian Journal of School Psychology* 25, no. 3 (2010): 223-245.

Garlington, Don. "Who is the Greatest?" *Journal of the Evangelical Society* 53, no. 2 (June 2010): 287–316.

Kinnear, Angus I. *Against the Tide: The Story of Watchman Nee*. Carol Streams, IL: Tyndale House Publishers, 1978.

Laven, Mary. *Mission to China: Matteo Ricci and the Jesuit Encounter with the East.* London: Faber and Faber, 2011.

Leong, Frederick T. L. and Mei Tang. "Career Barriers for Chinese Immigrants in the United States." *The Career Development Quarterly* 64 (2016): 259–271.

Martin, James. *The Jesuit Guide to (Almost) Everything: A Spirituality for Real Life*. New York: HarperCollins Publishers, 2010.

Peppard, Michael. "Torah for the Man Who Has Everything: 'Do Not Defraud' in Mark 10:19." *Journal of Biblical Literature* 134, no. 3 (2015): 595–604.

Qin, Desiree Baolian. "Doing Well vs. Feeling Well: Understanding Family Dynamics and the Psychological Adjustment of Chinese Immigrant Adolescents." *Journal of Youth Adolescence* 37 (2008): 22–35.

------. "Our Child Doesn't Talk to Us Anymore," *Anthropology & Education Quarterly* 37, no. 2 (2006): 162–179.

Tanner, Paul. "The Cost of Discipleship: Losing One's Life for Jesus' Sake." *Journal of Evangelical Theological Society* 56, no. 1 (2013): 43–61.

Yang, Fenggang and Joseph B. Tamney. "Exploring Mass Conversion to Christianity Among the Chinese: An Introduction." *Sociology of Religion* 67, no. 2 (2006): 125–129.

Classroom Instructions and Schedule

Date	Time	Topic	References
3/12/18	**12:30 – 5:30**	**Introduction—Chapter 1**	
Monday	12:30 – 1:00	Course and Research Requirements	
Day One	1:00 – 2:15	The Need: Mass Conversion vs Retention	Yang et al
	2:15 – 2:30	Break	
	2:30 – 3:15	The Strategy: Equipping of Pastors	
	3:15 – 4:00	Student Response: Small Group Discussion	
	4:00 – 4:15	Break	
	4:15 – 5:30	The Approach: Osmer's 4-task	Osmer
3/13/18	**12:30 – 5:30**	**Lived Experience of Immigrants—Chapter 2**	
Tuesday	12:30 – 2:15	Challenges and Responses in the Family	Chua & Qin
Day Two	2:15 – 2:30	Break	
	2:30 – 3:15	Gaps in Church Spiritual Formation Ministries	
	3:15 – 4:00	Student Response: Small Group Discussion	
	4:00 – 4:15	Break	
	4:15 – 5:30	Challenges and Responses in the Workplace	Leong & Tang
3/14/18	**12:30 – 5:30**	**Reasons Behind Immigrant Responses—Chapter 3**	
Wednesday	12:30 – 2:00	Cultural Difference & Assimilation	Costigan et al
Day Three	2:00 – 2:15	Break	
	2:15 – 4:00	Evangelical Chinese Church Heritage	Wu, Wang, Hsu

	4:00 – 4:15	Break	
	4:15 – 5:00	Student Response: Small Group Discussion	
	5:00 – 5:30	Gaps in Church Spiritual Formation Ministries	
3/15/18	**12:30 – 5:30**	**Biblical Foundation for Spiritual Formation—Chapter 4**	
Thursday	12:30 – 2:15	Discipleship in the Gospel of Mark	Mayer & Malbon
Day Four	2:15 – 2:30	Break	
	2:30 – 3:30	Union with Christ in the Gospel of John	Bayer
	3:30 – 4:15	Student Response: Small Group Discussion	
	4:15 – 5:00	Spiritual Renewal in Acts and Epistles	
3/16/18	**12:30 – 9:30**	**Spiritual Disciplines for Christian Growth—Chapter 5**	
Friday	12:30 – 2:30	Travel to Prince of Peace Abbey in San Diego	
Day Five	3:00 – 3:30	Ignatius & Ignatian Spirituality	Tetlow & Martin
	3:30 – 4:00	Biblical Foundation Principles	Laven
	4:00 – 4:30	Jesuit's Mission to China & Ignatian Retreat	Martin

Day One (Monday—3/12/2018):

The classroom instructions: Focus on chapter 1—on the need and approach of this dissertation, which includes the results of the ten-year follow-up research on the retention of Chinese immigrant baptismal candidates of one of the striving Chinese American churches in Southern California (Table 1 on page 12), which shows 39 percent of the 188 baptized members are still active in church attendance. The students were able to identify with the phenomenon of mass conversion on the one hand, and low retention of Chinese immigrants in their churches on the other.

The student group discussions: "How many years have you been a Christian, and what are some major factors that have contributed to your conversion to Christianity and to your subsequent spiritual formation?" The length of time students have been Christians ranges from 5 to 41 years, and averages around 22 years. Motivations for conversion to Christianity include the feeling of hopelessness due to parental conflicts; bankruptcy of father's business etc.; the good testimonies of one's own mother, colleagues, church leaders, and unconditional love of Christians; and the transformation of others who came to Christ prompted the realization that human beings could not rely on oneself for life change. Factors that contributed to spiritual formation include simple faith in following Christ; life examples and encouragement of spouse, and loving support of church community; God and the Holy Spirit working through life experiences, especially in times of sufferings and conflicts in human relationships. These led to prayer, Bible study, and worship, learning through communication, and growth toward love of God and neighbor, unity in Christ, submission to the leading of the Holy Spirit, etc.

Day Two (Tuesday—3/13/2018):

The classroom instructions: Focus on chapter 2— which asks the question: "What is going on?" (the descriptive-empirical task), which includes the lived experience of first-generation Chinese Americans both in the home and at work. Since not all the survey forms on the spiritual needs of adult immigrants in North America had been collected and the results tabulated by the time this field-test course was offered, the students did not get to see the inconsistencies between faith and practice of the first-generation Chinese Americans, which made the development of spiritual formation ministries less of a pressing concern than is likely to have been the case had the results been tabulated and presented to them.

The classroom discussions on Tiger Mom's parenting style generated enthusiastic discussions, with most of the students leaning toward understanding her approach, as they were brought up in a similar manner, although not quite to the same extent as she was. Most of the students who have children could identify with her style due to their perception of children's natural tendency to be "lazy," which they assume necessitates strict parental discipline. One of the students, who has highly achieving professionally adult children, reported that her children appreciated her encouragement and disciplines in hindsight, now that they have become parents themselves. Her attitude explains the deep-rooted Chinese culture and the perpetuation of the Tiger Mom mentality if not checked or critically evaluated. When the issue of Asian American adolescents being found to have the highest rates of depression and suicide in comparison to other ethnic groups among American adolescents was mentioned, the students did not seem to sense the urgency of the need to do something about this, because most of their children are still of elementary school age. But they were able to see the potential of the education issue of children becoming idolatry that would greatly impact their spiritual lives. They could also identify with the problem of discrimination in North American society, and how this gives parents additional incentives to push their children toward academic excellence and the selection of the STEM professional fields to compensate for their disadvantage of being Asians among mainstream white Americans.

The student group discussions: What do you think are other challenges in the lived experience of first-generation Chinese immigrants (apart from those discussed in lecture) that have affected their spiritual formation? For challenges in the Chinese immigrant family, Group 1 again brought up the separation of the fathers from their wives and children due to their return

home to continue their professions, while the wives stay in North America for the sake of their children getting better opportunities for academic study and future career advancements. This condition has created the phenomenon of “single parenting” in the host country, which calls for understanding and support from the church community toward the mothers and the children if they are to grow holistically. There is also the challenge in terms of expectations, for Chinese families expect mutual support among extended families, while Western families often expect mutual support, especially financially, only among members of the nuclear family. This condition affects their inter-family relationships with relatives who have been living in North America for a long time; and if the latter are Christians, it may result in poor Christian testimony from the perspective of the new immigrants. There is also a need to differentiate between the different groups of immigrants, e.g. foreign students and scholars, professionals, working class, adolescent foreign students (Junior or Senior High School), for they would face different challenges in life.

Group 2 brought out the challenges of career development due to the need for adjustment in identity, language, culture, education, finance, and family. Their reactions can be summarized as follows: 1) that they accept the overload in the workplace due to obstacles from identity and language, hoping things will become better by working harder; end up sacrificing church life and spiritual growth; 2) that academic achievement in the foreign country not being recognized and that not being able to develop expertise leads to emotional stress; cultural difference that makes assimilation into workplace and society difficult leads to self-pity and loss of motivation to become involved, reveal difficulties, or to get help, resulting in distancing themselves from church community and causing spiritual plateau; 3) discrimination in the

workplace that creates a “glass ceiling” to promotion at work may lead to Chinese-Americans compensating for the lack of power in the workplace by striving for authority and power in the church or in the family, resulting in conflicts and setting a poor example for the younger generation.

Day Three (Wednesday—3/14/2018):

The classroom instruction: focuses on the causes for the first-generation Chinese immigrants’ response to challenges in the host country, which includes differences between Chinese and Western culture, theories of assimilation to North American society, and the evangelical Chinese Christian heritage. The content offered for this course was at a preliminary stage with only the third section fully developed as presented in chapter 3 of this dissertation. Later material on Confucianism and assimilation theories was not covered in this course for field-testing. On cultural differences, eight aspects based on general knowledge, along with teaching from Scripture as a standard for the critique of both cultures were presented as follows:

1) Source of Value: Chinese culture—based on family image; Western culture—based on self-image; Scripture—based on humankind created in God’s image (Gen 1:26).

2) Family Unit: Chinese culture values extended family for mutual support; Western culture values nuclear family and independence; Scripture values church family (1 Cor 12).

3) Success: Chinese culture based on parental perspective; Western culture based on personal perspective; Scripture based on stewardship of God-given resources (Mt 25:14–30).

4) Leadership: Chinese culture values chain of command; Western culture values democracy; Scripture values servanthood (Mk 10:42–45).

5) Authority: Chinese culture—from family/social position; Western culture—from "earned" respect; Scripture—from God (Rom 13:1).

6) Discipline: Chinese culture—concerns about community pressure; Western culture emphasizes self-discipline; Scripture emphasizes Spirit-controlled (Rom 8:1–2).

7) Interpersonal Relationship: Chinese culture values mutuality and obligation; Western culture values rights and respect; Scripture values unconditional love (Mt 5:43–48).

8) Conflict Resolution: Chinese culture values avoidance to save "face"; Western culture values direct confrontation; Scripture values reflection and reconciliation (Mt 5:23–24).

The content of the above presentation in class was based on general common-sense knowledge, but did not deal with the more deep-rooted causes, such as Confucian philosophy that governs many of the traditional values that Chinese immigrants have brought along with them when they came to North America. Therefore, further research was carried out after field-testing of this course, which led to the inclusion of Confucianism under the first section on Cultural Tradition and Values of Chinese Immigrants in chapter 3 of this dissertation. The next section on Sociological Assimilation Theories in the North American Context was also at a preliminary stage when the course was taught, which covered three basic theories: the Classic Assimilation model that follows a "straight-line" convergence considers immigrants as becoming more and more similar to the mainstream overtime in norms, values, behaviors, and other characteristics; the Racial/Ethnic Disadvantage model that proposes the lingering discrimination and institutional barriers to employment and other opportunities for new immigrants block their complete assimilation; and the Segmented Assimilation model that suggests uneven patterns of convergence may be due to or result in downward mobility for the

disadvantaged immigrants who are blocked by structural barriers and discriminations; but may also be due to or result in selective acculturation by the advantaged immigrants who use their own traditional home-country attitudes to inspire their children to achieve.[642] The content of the last section that focuses on the Historical Spiritual Heritage of the Evangelical Chinese Church remains the same as presented in chapter 3.

The student group discussions: In your observation and experience, in what ways have your local church heritage and culture been impacted by one or more of the three spiritualities we have discussed in class lecture? Group 1 focused their discussion primarily on the effect of Watchman Nee, while Group 2 focused theirs on the combined impact of all three spiritualities on today's evangelical Chinese Church.

Group 1 found Watchman Nee to be the most influential in their local churches. His ministry philosophy and practices, even his terminologies on "spirituality" in Chinese have impacted almost every aspect of their church ministry and tradition. For example, his worship style that emphasizes the centrality of Bible teaching; the emphasis on believers' baptism and communion, on seeking God's will and spiritual growth, and on cultivating a spirituality as demonstrated in Jeanne Guyon's *Experiencing the Depths of Jesus Christ*, and in Brother Lawrence's *Practicing God's Presence*. However, if Christians are not transformed by such biblical teaching and have not experienced personal relationship with Jesus Christ, then there is a danger of falling into the trap of "hero-worship," idolizing human beings like Watchman Nee,

[642] Susan K. Brown and Frank D. Bean, "Assimilation Models, Old and New: Explaining a Long-Term Process," Migration Policy Institute, accessed October 11, 2016, http://www.migrationpolicy.org/article/assimilation-models-old-and-new-explaining-long-term-process.

such that when their idol's sinfulness is exposed, their faith without a solid foundation will inevitably crumble.

Group 2 focused on all three leaders acknowledged the positive impact that they made in terms of establishing intimate relationship with God through Bible study, and frequent "self-reflection" and "confession," which have become essentials for Christian growth as emphasized in the evangelical Chinese churches. But some found it necessary to reconsider their reservations or resistance on the charismatic aspect of spirituality; lest something essential and valuable to our spiritual growth would be neglected. The idea of "busy-ness" and productivity in ministry may have positive and negative effects: positive if the focus is set on transformation of life and serving according to spiritual gifts; negative if the focus is on ministry for the sake of ministry, disregarding transformation of life, spiritual gifts, or the needs of one's own family!

Day Four (Thursday—3/15/2018):

The classroom instruction: The focus on the Normative Task: What ought to be going on? Again, the content of this section as it now appears in this dissertation had only been preliminarily developed by the time this course was offered, so the course primarily focused on the middle section of Chapter 4 in the dissertation, which is Christ the Son of God and Son of Man's demands on discipleship. The first section of chapter 4 on God the Father's relationship with and transformation of Israel as well as the last section on the Holy Spirit's work on the spiritual formation of Christians were not included in the content of the course. The rest of the course covered abiding with Christ (Jn 15:5–10) and the indwelling of the Holy Spirit (Acts 1 and 2) as the secret of transformation of Christians; and closed with the Goal, the Implications, and the various Agents of transformation.

The goal of transformation, based on humankind's being made in the image of God in creation (Gn 1:26), conformed to the image of Christ in redemption (Rom 8:29), and ultimately to be like him when he comes again (1 Jn 3:2), is Christlikeness. This goal implies that Christians are to be like Christ in character as revealed in 2 Peter 1:3–4, which tells of the divine power of Christ having given Christians "everything needed for life and godliness" through the saving knowledge of Christ, and "the precious and great promise" of His coming again, so that the new humanity, having escaped the corruption and lustful desires in the world, can become "participants of the divine nature."[643] Another implication is to be Christlike in loving relationship with God and with people, as revealed in Christ's summary of the Ten Commandments, "'You shall love the Lord your God with all your heart, and with all your soul, and with all your mind.' This is the greatest and first commandment. And a second is like it: 'You shall love your neighbor as yourself'" (Mt 22:37–39); and as he promised, "If you keep my commandments, you will abide in my love, just as I have kept my Father's commandments and abide in his love (Jn 15:10)." And a third implication is to be Christlike in missions, as Jesus commanded his disciples, "As the Father has sent me, so I send you (Jn. 20:21b): "The Spirit of the Lord is upon me, because he has anointed me to bring good news to the poor. He has sent me to proclaim release to the captives and recovery of sight to the blind, to let the oppressed go free, to proclaim the year of the Lord's favor" (Lk 4:1819); and "Go therefore and make disciples of all nations, baptizing them in the name of the Father and of the Son and of the Holy Spirit, and teaching them to obey everything that I have commanded you. And remember, I am with you always, to the end of the age" (Mt 28:19–20).

[643] Douglas Harink, *1 & 2 Peter* (Grand Rapids: Brazos Press, 2009), 138.

The various agents of transformation including the Holy Spirit, the Word of God, the faith community, the mentors, sufferings, and the individual disciples, are mostly found in the Epistles. 2 Corinthians 3:18 reveals the Holy Spirit as the foremost agent who activates the process of transforming Christians toward Christlikeness: "And all of us, with unveiled faces, seeing the glory of the Lord as though reflected in a mirror, are being transformed into the same image from one degree of glory to another; for this comes from the Lord, the Spirit." As Mounce explains it, as the Holy Spirit leads Christians to continuously contemplate on the glory of God in Christ, they will gradually take on the family resemblance and be transformed into Christ's image.[644] Another important agent for Christian spiritual formation is the Word of God, as 1 Peter declares, "You have been born anew, not of perishable but of imperishable seed, through the living and enduring word of God" (1 Pe 1:23); and "Like newborn infants, long for the pure, spiritual milk, so that by it you may grow into salvation" (1 Pe 2:2). The next agent is the loving environment of the faith community, in which Christians are formed through each exercising one's spiritual gifts to build up one another, as revealed in Ephesians 4:11–13:

> The gifts he gave were that some would be apostles, some prophets, some evangelists, some pastors and teachers, to equip the saints for the work of ministry, for building up the body of Christ, until all of us come to the unity of the faith and of the knowledge of the Son of God, to maturity, to the measure of the full stature of Christ.

Another agent is the life example of mentors or leaders, as Paul explains of his own role to a couple of his congregations: "Be imitators of me, as I am of Christ" (1 Cor 11:1) and "But we were gentle among you, like a nurse tenderly caring for her own children…. We dealt with each one of you like a father with his children, urging and encouraging you and pleading that you

[644] Mounce, 239.

lead a life worthy of God, who calls you into his own kingdom and glory" (1 Th 2:7, 11–12). The following unexpected and perhaps unwelcomed agent is suffering—circumstances that tend to press Christian toward spiritual maturity, "whenever you face trials of any kind, consider it nothing but joy, because you know that the testing of your faith produces endurance; and let endurance have its full effect, so that you may be mature and complete, lacking in nothing" (Jas 1:2); and "In this you rejoice, even if now for a little while you have had to suffer various trials, so that the genuineness of your faith…may be found to result in praise and glory and honor when Jesus Christ is revealed" (1 Pe 1:6–7). Finally, God may use all of the above to work together for the spiritual nurture of his children, the Christian himself/herself must take responsibility for transformation to take place, as Paul exhorts them, "You were taught to put away your former way of life, your old self…and to be renewed in the spirit of your minds, and to clothe yourselves with the new self, created according to the likeness of God in true righteousness and holiness (Eph 4:22–24).

The student group discussions: In what ways are the discipleship or spiritual formation concepts discussed in class challenging yet helpful to you and your church people?

Group 1 brought out three concepts related to agents of transformation: 1) sufferings motivate reflection; while painful and challenging, they are beneficial because behind such experience God's sufficient grace is manifested; 2) spiritual mentors are hard to come by: pastors must exemplify godly character and the courage to share about their struggles and weaknesses; 3) meditating on the glory of God in Christ as led by the Holy Spirit certainly helps us establish personal relationship with Christ, which results in following his will; however, the

challenge is to break the habit of our routine day-to-day living, which often hinders us from seeking God, for we tend to compartmentalize our faith and our action.

Group 2 brought out five challenges to discipleship and three concepts on how meditation on Christ helps. The challenges of discipleship is great both for individuals and for the body of Christ, because 1) in times of complacency our passion and desire for God wanes; 2) in times of sufferings our faith is greatly tested; 3) without a clear concept of "discipleship" it is difficult to have the motivation to seek intimate relationship with or to serve God; 4) small group leaders who lack training in caring for people leads to low retention of group members; 5) without intentional effort to train up potential leaders, experienced leaders can hardly let go of control of their ministries, which leads to eventual leadership gaps. Meditation on Christ's life and ministry helps spiritual growth because 1) Christ is our role model for intimate relationship with God by always glorifying him by doing his will; 2) Christ sends the Holy Spirit as our advocate, so we can be transformed from the inside and live out Christ's lifestyle of self-denial; 3) Christ exemplifies for us to follow in character, in relationship with God and people, and in missions.

Day Five (Friday—3/16/2018):

The classroom instructions: The focus on the Pragmatic Task: How Might We Respond? All the contents of classroom instruction were taken from Chapter 5 of the dissertation. It took two hours to travel from CESNA campus in Los Angeles to Prince of Peace Abbey in San Diego for the four-day-three-night retreat, and to avoid office hour traffic, the class decided to take off at 12:30 pm, and the classroom instruction was held at the retreat site where a meeting room was available for us in the afternoon. Since the time for classroom instruction was

limited, as it did not start until 3:30 pm when everyone had arrived and a technical computer difficulty have been resolved, only three topics of 35 minutes each were covered, namely: 1) Ignatius and characteristics of Ignatian Spirituality, 2) The Ignatian Foundation Principles, and 3) Jesuits' Mission to China and the "Weeks" of the Ignatian Retreat, with no time left for student group discussions. Orientation to the retreat began around 5:15 pm to go over the retreat schedule and regulations of the facility before students checked in to their rooms.

Silent Retreat and Schedule

Date	**Time**	**Topic**
3/16/18	**5:15 – 10:00**	**Silent Retreat at Prince of Peace Abbey, San Diego**
Friday	5:15 – 5:45	Silent Retreat Orientation
	6:00 – 7:00	Dinner
	7:00 – 8:00	Worship and Communion
	8:15 – 9:00	Small Group Sharing (3 in 2 Groups; 2 in 1 Group)
	(9:00 – 9:45)	*Member A of each Group meets with Spiritual Director A
	10:00	Silence begins (cell phones collected by CESNA Teacher)
3/17/18	**7:30 – 10:00**	**Silent Retreat at Prince of Peace Abbey, San Diego**
Saturday	7:30 – 8:30	Breakfast
	(8:00 – 8:45)	*Member B of each Group meets with Spiritual Director B
	8:45 – 9:30	Worship: Unconditional Love of God ("Preparation Week")
	(9:30 – 10:15)	*Member C of each Group meets with Spiritual Director C
	10:00 – 11:45	Personal Meditation: God's Compassion on Me
	12:00 – 1:00	Lunch

	1:00 – 3:00	Rest: Personal Free Time
	3:00 – 3:45	Worship: Christ's Forgiveness ("1st Week")
	4:00 – 5:45	Personal Meditation: Confession of My Sins
	6:00 – 7:00	Dinner
	7:30 – 10:00	Personal Reflection and Journaling
	(7:00 – 7:45)	*Member A of each Group meets with Spiritual Director A
	(8:00 – 8:45)	*Member B of each Group meets with Spiritual Director B
	(9:00 – 9:45)	*Member C of each Group meets with Spiritual Director C
3/18/18	**7:30 – 10:00**	**Silent Retreat at Prince of Peace Abbey, San Diego**
Sunday	7:30 – 8:30	Breakfast
	8:45 – 9:30	Worship: Christ's Life and Discipleship ("2nd Week")
	9:45 – 11:45	Personal Meditation: The Challenge to be a Disciple
	12:00 – 1:00	Lunch
	1:00 – 3:00	Rest: Personal Free Time
	3:00 – 3:45	Worship: Christ's Passion ("3rd Week)
	4:00 – 5:45	Personal Meditation 4: Christ's Suffering and Me
	6:00 – 7:00	Dinner
	7:30 – 10:00	Personal Reflection and Journaling
	(7:00 – 7:45)	*Member A of each Group meets with Spiritual Director A
	(8:00 – 8:45)	*Member B of each Group meets with Spiritual Director B
	(9:00 – 9:45)	*Member C of each Group meets with Spiritual Director C
3/19/18	**7:30 – 2:30**	**Silent Retreat at Prince of Peace Abbey, San Diego**

Monday	7:30 – 8:30	Breakfast (Return room keys by 8:30)
	8:45 – 9:45	Worship and Communion: Christ Resurrection ("4th Week")
	10:00 – 11:45	Personal Meditation: The Risen Lord's Challenge for Me
	12:00 – 1:00	Lunch (Break Silence)
	1:15 – 2:15	Sharing and Evaluation (return form for cell phone)
	2:30 – 5:30	Depart Prince of Peace Abbey to return Home

The Retreat Content:

It was designed according to the Ignatian four-week retreat plus the Preparation Week. Each of the Ignatian "Weeks" was carried out for half a day at the retreat, beginning with a 45-minute of worship together, followed by a 1-hour-45-minute of individual personal reflection. On Friday evening, during the first gathering of the retreatants in worship, the Lectio Divina was introduced as a practice exercise, although six of the eight students had done it before in a previous spiritual formation course(s). The passage selected was Mark 8:22-25 on the healing of the blind man who needed a second touch, which was discussed the day before in class instruction, so that the retreatants could reflect on specific areas of their spiritual lives that might need a second touch during the retreat. It was followed by group sharing of the Holy Spirit's work in each person, so they would be motivated to long for more.

As practiced in contemporary Jesuit retreats (and also recommended by O'Brien), before the "First Week," a "Preparation Week" focusing on God's creation and unconditional love during worship and personal reflection on Saturday morning was carried out to assure students of God's love for them, so they could be free to deal with their sins during the "First Week," which focuses on Christ's forgiveness and confession of sins during worship and

personal reflection Saturday afternoon.[645] Similarly, the focus of the "Second Week" on Christ's life and discipleship was carried out Sunday morning during worship and personal reflection. The focus of the "Third Week" on Christ's passion and what it means for the retreatants was carried out during worship and personal reflection Sunday afternoon. Finally, the focus of the "Fourth Week" on Christ's resurrection and His challenge for the retreatants was carried out during worship and personal reflection Monday morning.

During one of the student group discussion sessions before the silent retreat, the retreat schedule and Table 4 below, followed by instructions, were given out and explained to the two spiritual directors working alongside the Researcher at the retreat:

Table 4: Themes for Worship & Meditation

Date & Time	Worship Theme	Spiritual Exercise during Worship	Passages for Personal meditation	Spiritual Direction Session
3/16/18 Friday pm	Celebration & Second Touch	Lectio Divina Mk 8:22–25		
3/17/18 Saturday am	God's Compassion	Examen of Consciousness Ps 32:7–8	Ps 139/Lk 15:11–31 God's Compassion on me	**#1**
3/17/18 Saturday pm	Christ's Forgiveness	Examen of Conscience Ps 139:23–24; Ps 51:1, 10	Lk 7:36–50/Mk 9:33–50 Confession of my sins	**#1**
3/18/18 Sunday am	Christ's Life & Discipleship	Lectio Divina: the The Lord's Challenge Mk 10:19–21	Mt 24-34/Mk 8:27-38 My Challenge as a Disciple of Christ	**#2**
3/18/18 Sunday pm	Christ's Passion	Lectio Divina: The Lord's Cup Mk 10:35-38	Mt 26:36–46/Is 53 Christ's Suffering and Me	**#2**
3/19/18 Monday am	Christ's Resurrection	Discernment: The Lord's Calling Mk 10:51; Lk 22:42	Jn 20:1–18/Jn 21:1–19 Answering the Risen The Lord's Calling for me	**#3**

[645] O'Brien, 15.

Instructions for Spiritual Directors:

During each spiritual direction session, students are to be given two sets of suggested Scripture passages for the following two personal meditation periods based on the themes of the worship and the personal meditation sessions. For example: in spiritual direction session #1, give students the two sets of passages on God's Compassion for me and Confession of my sins; in spiritual direction session #2, give them the two sets of passages on My challenge as a disciple of Christ and Christ's Suffering and me; and in spiritual direction session #3, give them the set of passages on Answering the Risen Lord's Calling for Me. But for every personal meditation session, students are free to choose one or both passages, and/or other passages as the Holy Spirit leads them.

Retreat Orientation (Friday):

It began at 5:15 pm when students were informed of the following:

1) They may talk with each other during the first dinner on Friday and the last lunch on Monday, and for the group sharing after worship the first day and the last sharing after lunch on the last day, but the rest of the time they were to remain silent, with cell phones collected by 10:00 pm on Friday and returned to them when they turned in their evaluation forms on the last day;
2) They would meet for spiritual direction three times for 45 minutes each, during which they would be given suggested passages to guide their meditation, and they could share with their spiritual directors about their encounters with God through Scripture meditation, nature walk, services provided by the Abbey, meditation at the

Stations of the Cross, personal prayer and journaling, or any other spiritual experiences;

3) They were shown the Abbey facilities: The Main Sanctuary, Small Chapel, Dining room, rooms for spiritual direction, lodging areas, etc.

Worship Service:

On Friday, the service began with a solo "Bless the Lord, O my Soul!"—a short praise sung once by the student worship leader, followed two more times as she led the rest of us, which set the tone as a call to worship each time when we gathered for worship. She led us in singing three other songs: "Because of the Love of the Cross," "Amazing Love of the Lord," and "Into My Heart," followed by prayer. At the end of her prayer, while eyes were still closed, I started reading slowly three times the main text(s) of the spiritual exercise, followed by my guided meditation as described on the handouts (see Spiritual Exercises 1–6 on pages 240 to 246), while the retreatants continued to have their eyes closed for meditation. When a retreatant has finished meditating, he/she could come to me to pick up a copy of the spiritual exercise handout for that session, on which he/she might record his/her meditation experience, then leave the worship place quietly as each retreatant has finished writing, except on the first and the last worship sessions when the meditation was followed by communion services.

The design or format of the handout, including the selection of texts of the spiritual exercises, are based on the theme of the worship and personal meditation of that session, as well as on the Ignatian methods of prayer as described in Chapter 4. Six spiritual exercises are designed to go along with the theme of the worship and the following personal meditation session: the Lection Divina on Friday evening for preparation, on Sunday morning for Jesus'

discipleship challenge, and Sunday afternoon for identifying with Jesus' passion; the Examen of Consciousness on Saturday morning to enhance awareness of God's loving presence; the Examen of Conscience on Saturday afternoon for Confession; and the Discernment for finding and responding to the Risen Lord's calling upon the retreatants' lives.

For the song selection for each worship, besides the first song, "Bless the Lord O My Soul!" that was repeated at the beginning of every worship session, the rest of the worship songs selected were as follows: Saturday morning on God's love—"Psalm 23," "Praise the Lord!" and "Alleluia!"; Saturday afternoon on Confession: "Search Me O God!" "An Evening Prayer," and "Jesus, Remember Me!"; Sunday morning on Jesus' Life—"Psalm 23," "Holy One of Israel!" and "The Greatest Thing"; Sunday afternoon on Jesus' Passion—"Because of the Love of the Cross," "Amazing Love of the Lord," "Into My Heart!" and "Jesus, Remember Me!"; Monday morning on Jesus' Resurrection—"Jesus, Remember Me!" "He is Lord!" "Alleluia!" and "Because He Lives!"

Spiritual Exercise 1: Lectio Divina[646]

Silence: prepare your heart to come into God's presence

Listening: watch for a word, phrase, scene, person or action that catches your attention

(Leader reads the following episode three times slowly)

They came to Bethsaida. Some people brought a blind man to him and begged him to touch him. He took the blind man by the hand and led him out of the village; and when he had put saliva on his eyes and laid his hands on him, he asked him, "Can you see anything?" And the man looked up and said, "I can see people, but they look like trees, walking." Then Jesus laid his hands on his eyes again; and he looked intently, and his sight was restored, and he saw everything clearly (Mk 8:22–25).

Meditation: *Intellectual*—ponder the personal meaning of the above word or phrase that has caught your attention, and questions you have regarding the episode:

Imaginative—the environment, atmosphere and interaction conveyed in the episode:

Visible—your interaction with Christ as you entered the scene as one of the characters in the episode, and how you felt about it:

Contemplation: savor whatever emotions aroused in your encounter with Christ

Prayer: Your response to Christ's invitation for you (including resistance or enthusiasm if any)

[646] Guigo II, *The Ladder of Monks and Twelve Meditations*, trans. with an introduction by Edmund College and James Walsh (New York: Image Books, 1978), 82–83; Melloni, 31, explanation on the last two stages being reversed for the Ignatian Lectio Divina format.

Spiritual Exercise 2: Daily Examen of Consciousness[647]

Silence: prepare your heart to come into God's presence

Listen: Gene Weingarten—Washington Post staff reported a true story on Sunday, April 8, 2007

"Pearls before Breakfast"

It was 7:51 a.m. on a January Friday morning. A violinist performed six classical pieces in 43 minutes when 1,097 people passed by. No one knew it, but the fiddler standing against a wall in an indoor arcade of a Metro station was one of the finest classical musicians in the world, playing some of the most elegant music ever written on one of the most valuable violins ever made ($3.5 million). His performance was arranged by the Washington Post as an experiment in context, perception and priorities.

Three days before, Joshua Bell had filled the house at Boston's Symphony Hall, where pretty good seats went for $100, and he made about $1,000 a minute. But here, in the 43 minutes that he played, only seven people stopped to listen for at least a minute. Twenty-seven gave a total of $32 and change. That leaves 1,070 people hurried by, few turning to look, some listening to iPods. The only exception: every child who walked by tried to stop and watch. And every time, a parent scooted the kid away.

There were six moments that Bell found particularly painful: right after each piece ended: no applause, no acknowledgment! Watching the video weeks later, Bell was mystified by one thing only: he understood why he was not drawing a crowd in the rush of a morning workday; but he said, "I'm surprised at the number of people who don't pay attention at all, because, you know what? I'm making a lot of noise!"

Similarly, Jesus has been surrounding you with his songs of deliverance today; are you aware of it? Listen to the Psalmist's conversation with God:

"You are my hiding place; you will protect me from trouble and surround me with songs of deliverance" (Ps 32:7)

"I will instruct you and teach you in the way you should go; I will counsel you and watch over you" (Ps 32:8)

Thanksgiving: How the Lord has been present with you today—protecting you, instructing, teaching, counseling, and/or watching over you!

[647] Blythe, 60–61; Modras, 35–36.

Daily Examen: I felt closest to God when… I felt most distant from God when…

Morning:

Afternoon:

Evening:

My Dialogue with God:

For the time I felt closest to God:

God's response to you:

For the time I felt most distant from God:

God's response to you:

Spiritual Exercise 3: Daily Examen of Conscience[648]

Silence: Prepare your heart to come into God's presence

Listening: The Psalmist's Prayer (leader to read the following prayers three times slowly)

> *"Search me, O God, and know my heart; test me and know my thoughts. See if there is any wicked way in me; and lead me in the way everlasting" (Ps 139:23–24).*
>
> *Have mercy upon me, O God, according to thy lovingkindness: according unto the multitude of thy tender mercies blot out my transgressions (Ps 51:1).*
>
> *Create in me a clean heart, O God; and renew a right spirit within me (Ps 51:10).*

Examen: Ask for grace to see myself as I am in light of God's love, and identify areas not in line with God's purpose

In Thoughts:

In Words:

In Deeds:

Ask God's forgiveness: for specific sins

Ask God' grace: for commitment to live out God's purpose

[648] Tetlow, *Ignatius Loyola*, 67–68; Martin, 88–97, Foster, *Heart's True Home,* 29.

Spiritual Exercise 4: Jesus' Challenge[649]

Silence: Prepare your heart to come into God's presence

Listening: Watch for aword, phrase, scene, person or action that catches your attention

(Leader read the following episode three times slowly)

(Jesus said to the man) "You know the commandments: 'You shall not commit adultery; You shall not steal; You shall not bear false witness; You shall not defraud; Honor your father and mother.'" He said to him, "Teacher, I have kept all these since my youth." Jesus, looking at him, loved him and said, "You lack one thing; go, sell what you own, and give the money to the poor, and you will have treasure in heaven; then come, follow me" (Mk 10:19–21).

Meditation: *Intellectual*—Ponder Jesus' challenge "You lack one thing": What is that "one thing" for you personally?

Imaginative—The environment, atmosphere, and interaction conveyed in the episode:

Visible—Your interaction with Christ as you enter the scene as man in the episode, and how you felt about this interaction:

Contemplation: Savor whatever emotions aroused in your encounter with Christ

Prayer: Your response to Christ's challenge to you (including resistance or enthusiasm if any)

[649] Melloni, 31; following the Ignatian Lectio Divina format.

Spiritual Exercise 5: Drinking the Cup of Christ[650]

Silence: Prepare your heart to come into God's presence

Listening: Watch for A word, phrase, scene, person, or action that catches your attention

(Leader read the following episode three times slowly; allow)

> *James and John, the sons of Zebedee, came forward to him and said to him, "Teacher, we want you to do for us whatever we ask of you." And he said to them, "What is it you want me to do for you?" And they said to him, "Grant us to sit, one at your right hand and one at your left, in your glory." But Jesus said to them, "You do not know what you are asking. Are you able to drink the cup that I drink…; the cup that I drink you will drink…." (Mk 10:35–39)*

Meditation: *Intellectual*—Ponder Jesus' question: "Are you able to drink the cup that I drink?" What does the cup that Jesus drinks mean to you personally?

Imaginative—the environment, atmosphere and interaction conveyed in the episode:

Visible—your interaction with Christ as you enter the scene as one of the disciples in the episode, and how you felt about this interaction:

Contemplation: Savor whatever emotions aroused in your encounter with Christ

Prayer: Your response to Christ's challenge to you (including resistance or enthusiasm if any)

[650] Melloni, 31; following the Ignatian Lectio Divina format.

Spiritual Exercise 6: Discernment on the Lord's Calling

Dedicate this time to the Lord: ask for the light of the Holy Spirit to discover your personal concerns; name them and express them accurately, then listen to the Lord's reply and give thanks.

"I have set before you life and death, blessings and curses. Now choose life, so that you…may live" (Dt 30:19).

My Discernment Question: _____

Desire:[651] *"What do you want me to do for you?" "Lord, I want to see," he replied. (Lk 18:41)*

What do I want, right at this moment? (Name one)

What is underneath this desire—the desire that is more basic than this:

Name and offer to God your deepest desire and honor it as central to who you are:

Memory:[652] *Then Samuel took a stone and set it up between Mizpah and Shen. He named it Ebenezer, saying, "Thus far has the Lord helped us" (1 Sam 7:12).*

Recall a parallel experience from memories of the past when the Lord had helped you:

Offer a prayer of gratitude and ask the Lord how it might relate to your deepest desire:

Listen to what the Lord has to say to you:

Indifference:[653] *"Father, if you are willing, take this cup from me; yet not my will, but yours be done" (Lk 22:42).*

Ask the Holy Spirit to help you understand what the risen Lord calls you to be and to do:

Ask the Lord to deepen in you the desire for what the Lord desires:

Listen to what the Lord desires; and when it becomes clear, choose it and give thanks:

[651] Martin, 95, 97; Liebert, 24–25.
[652] Liebert, 56.
[653] Ganss, 130; Liebert, 33–35.

Chapter 7

Results and Assessments

Introduction: The Students, the Course, and the Assessment Criteria

The Students:

Their background: There were seven students and a recent graduate auditing the course (considered one of the students below), and three other auditors involved for various reasons: one CESNA faculty and one pastor served as spiritual directors, and one CEO of an organization that is launching some spiritual formation ministries. The total number of participants in the course including the researcher was twelve—also the maximum number of retreatant rooms available for the class at the Prince of Peace Abbey in San Diego, where the Silent Retreat was held. Of the eight students—five women and three men—two women and three men came from Mainland China (one of the men being a Korean missionary to China), and three women from Taiwan. Most of them are from an evangelical church background, although one woman has experienced speaking in tongues and one man was formerly associated with the Local Church (founded by Watchman Nee) that stresses spiritual experience, and more recently with a church of charismatic tendencies.

Their Encounter with God at the Retreat: Their experience is as reported by spiritual directors and the students (including the recent graduate) themselves; but the numbering of the students below is different from that listed on Table 7 for the sake of anonymity.

Student #1: Was able to carry out very intimate dialogues with God in nature; had good personal reflections on Scripture passages, especially during a walk through the Stations of the

Cross; had a genuine confession of sins for having been preoccupied by seminary work to the neglect of relationship with God in recent years, but renewed the commitment to follow Christ made long ago, when the student first accepted Christ. The student wrote to the researcher after the retreat, “Personally, I have greatly benefited from spiritual direction and worship service: the former helped me see God’s leading more clearly; the latter made me sense in awe of God’s presence.”

Student #2: Was more used to the inductive Bible Study method that analyzes sections of Scripture, focusing more on information than on life transformation. On the last day, the student’s spiritual director invited her to choose one verse through which to interact with Jesus through her heart instead of via the head only. The result seemed better. The student wrote to the whole class a week later: “Praise the Lord for the blessed and fruitful class led by (name of the researcher) and supported by (names of the two other spiritual directors)! We are also very fortunate to have (name of the student) lead the worship by hymns and prayers. Thank the Lord for being with us; and appreciate the Holy spirit's guidance to help comprehending God's will upon each individual one of us.”

Student #3: Through the process of personal reflection recognized one’s own critical attitude toward others, and of the Holy Spirit’s leading in dealing with it.

Student #4: Came to the retreat with marital conflicts, and God revealed the student’s deeper issues in need of God’s healing.

Student #5: Has a gentle and sensitive heart to enjoy a meaningful interaction with God: experienced freedom in meditating outdoors; sensed the presence of God through nature; and gained insights relevant to the student’s current circumstances.

Student #6: Despite limited attendance at the retreat due to schedule conflicts with family needs and ordination preparation, the student experienced an outpouring of emotions during a nature walk when touched by the reassurance of the heavenly Father's provision for the family's material needs through seeing beautiful flowers of the field and birds of the air.

Student #7: Came to the retreat wondering about vocational calling and being anxious about the uncertainty of the future; the student was challenged to trust in God; but expressed frustration at the retreat not being able to meet expectations, because God seemed silent despite the student's eager anticipation of a deep encounter with God.

Student #8: Had a lengthy experience of speaking in tongues in the room without knowing what the words meant, but sensed joy and felt close to God's presence. Wrote to the researcher a couple of months later: "I did benefit a lot from spiritual direction. It's not like counseling, that I will be given clear instruction; rather, it feels like a journey. Through your spiritual direction, I was approaching the Throne bit by bit, and every step also helped to sort out my own thoughts. I liked the worship session: simple and quiet worship helped [me] to concentrate and make ready the soul to be with God."

The Course:

Since the field testing of the course was conducted in March of 2018, when this dissertation was only about half-way developed, much of what became significant in the dissertation's contents was not covered in the teaching of the course. For chapter 2 on the descriptive task of the lived experience of Chinese Americans, the results of the survey that reveals the inconsistencies between their faith and practice had not been tabulated by then. For chapter 3 on the Interpretive Task of the causes of Chinese immigrants' response to

challenges, the only part that had been developed was the historical spiritual heritage of the evangelical Chinese Church. When the course was taught, the cultural tradition and values of Confucianism was totally missing, and the sociological assimilation theories in North American context was only at a superficial and preliminary stage. For chapter 4 on the normative task of the biblical foundation of spiritual formation that meant to cover the Triune God's relation and transformation of people made in God's image, the only part developed was Christ's discipleship, while God the Father being with Israel and the Holy Spirit's work with Christians were missing from the course. For chapter 5 on the Pragmatic Task, while the content of Ignatian Spirituality as the road to transformation was quite well developed by then, some of the Scripture passages had not been selected to address the specific needs of Chinese immigrants in North American churches. And due to the lack of time, less than half of the content was presented. Fortunately, seven of the eight students had previously taken at least one spiritual formation course in which Lectio Divina had been practiced; and four students had taken another spiritual formation course in which the Examen of Consciousness, the Examen of Conscience, and Discernment had been practiced in addition to Lectio Divina.

Assessment Criteria:

1) Students' evaluation of Classroom Instructions (see Table 5 based on Appendix E; 2); students' evaluation of the Silent Retreat (see Table 6 based on Appendix F); 3) the researcher's assessment of student assignments that reveal how well they were able to apply the course material into their life and ministry; and finally; and 4) the researcher's assessment of the course, which was designed to meet the stated hypothesis of the dissertation, that it has the potential of "motivating and equipping seminarians in evangelical Chinese American seminaries

to develop more effective spiritual formation ministries by leading them through classroom instructions that explore the needs for spiritual formation of Chinese American Christians, and through a retreat to personally experience a taste of spiritual formation in their own lives."

Student Evaluation of Classroom Instructions

A total of ten forms were filled out by all retreatants except one of the auditors, and the results were tabulated in Table 5 (on the next page). The different parts of the overall evaluation reflect well the strengths and weaknesses of the classroom instruction. Part One: The fact that the survey results of the Chinese immigrants' lived experience had not been tabulated and presented made their spiritual needs for consistency between faith and practice less evident and convincing than it would have been; hence, these also seemed less helpful for their current and future ministry. It is also true that little attention had been given to the difference between new and old immigrants in terms of their current needs; however, their preoccupation with academic and career achievement for themselves and for their children seems to be quite similar. Part Two: As indicated by a couple of comments, there was not enough in-depth and academic sociological analysis as well as information on Chinese immigrant values and morality given as the causes that accounted for their responses to challenges in their lived experience, since the two sections on Sociological Theories and Confucianism had not been developed by the time the course was taught. Regarding the impact of the Chinese Christian leaders, most of the students had not been associated with Chinese churches in North America long enough to be able to feel and evaluate their impact, especially since they were not familiar with two of the three spiritualities. Part Three: They seemed to appreciate most the New Testament study on Christian spiritual formation, which is expected of

Table 5: Classroom Instruction Evaluation

Since no one check the column for "Strongly Disagree," it has been eliminated from the original five columns in Appendix E to fit i the standard page margins.

	Disagree	Agree	Strongly Agree	No Answer
Part One: Lived Experience of Chinese Immigrants in the US				
Content: significant and stimulating	____	3	7	____
Research: current, supported, stimulates further research	____	2	8	____
Instructor's Interpretation: convincing and insightful	____	3	7	____
Relevance: helpful for me and my current/future ministry	____	4	6	____

Comments: *need more open-ended questions; differentiate between new & old immigrants; good analyses; Tiger Mom discussion [needs to be] practical to see inconsistency between Christian faith & Chinese culture.*

Part Two: Chinese Christian Leaders' Spirituality and Impact				
Content: significant and stimulating	____	1	8	1
Research: current, supported, stimulates further research	____	3	7	____
Instructor's Interpretation: convincing and insightful	____	3	7	____
Relevance: helpful for me and my current/future ministry	____	2	7	1

Comments: *need more in-depth sociological analyses; Chinese immigrant values and morality need to be explored; good explanations; evangelical leaders need to be aware of the spiritual formation ministry gap.*

Part Three: NT Study on Christian Spiritual Formation				
Content: significant and stimulating	____	1	8	1
Research: current, supported, stimulates further research	____	2	8	____
Instructor's Interpretation: convincing and insightful	____	1	9	____
Relevance: helpful for me and my current/future ministry	____	1	8	1

Comments: *good selection of Scripture passages.*

Part Four: Ignatian Spirituality and Practice				
Content: significant and stimulating	____	____	8	1
Research: current, supported, stimulates further research	____	3	7	____
Instructor's Interpretation: convincing and insightful	____	2	7	1
Relevance: helpful for me and my current/future ministry	____	1	9	____

Comments: *helpful!*

Christians who value biblical studies and are better equipped to evaluate this section than the other three sections. Part Four: Although there was not enough time to cover even half of the material, it is significant that those attending found this section most helpful for them and for their current and future ministries.

Student Evaluation of the Silent Retreat

A total of ten forms were filled out by all retreatants except one of the auditors, and the results were tabulated in Table 6 on the next page. Overall, retreatants seemed to have had a fulfilling experience at the silent retreat emotionally, mentally, and spiritually. Regarding the Retreat Site, they all felt the serene environment was conducive to experiencing God's presence; many had also expressed verbally and in writing their appreciation of the rare opportunity to be close to nature and enjoy God's creation. The only less than positive assessment was the meals, probably especially for those who had lived in America for less than two years! Although the introduction to the "Weeks" of the Ignatian Spiritual Exercises in classroom instruction was brief at the retreat site, retreatants seemed able to get along well with their personal meditation on the selected Scripture passages; and they achieved the purpose for the individual "Weeks" of the exercises. Obviously, the biblical base of Ignatian spirituality works well with evangelical Christians, and the extended time for personal meditation at the retreat was beyond their expectation—a "spiritual luxury" amidst intense seminary studies. As one student remarked that instead of attending the retreat for a pragmatic reason (to design curriculum), it was a life-changing experience intended by God! The guided meditation during Consciousness and the Examen of Conscience were also well received; and they achieved their intended purposes of developing more personal and

Table 6: Silent Retreat Evaluation

Since no one checked the column for "Strongly Disagree," it has been eliminated (from the original five columns in Appendix F) to fit into the standard dissertation margins.

Retreat Site:	**Disagree**	**Agree**	**Strongly Agree**	**No Answer**
Environment: conducive to quiet connection with God	____	____	10	____
Meals: healthy and inviting	1	3	6	____
Lodging: nice and clean	____	1	9	____
Comments: *experienced God's presence in a serene environment; marveled at God's creation and nature.*				
Ignatian Spiritual Exercises:				
Preparation: I felt God's unconditional love for me	____	1	9	____
First Week: I confessed my sins and was set free	____	2	8	____
Second Week: I came to know Christ more intimately	____	1	9	____
Third Week: I came to feel Christ's passion more deeply	____	2	8	____
Fourth Week: I accepted the Risen Lord's invitation	____	2	8	____
Comments: *Original intention was to "design" a curriculum of spiritual formation for church, but God's invitation was to "design" my life instead; thank God for letting me see my weaknesses.*				
Ignatian Prayer Practices:				
The Lectio Divina: God's word became more personal	____	1	9	____
Examen of Consciousness: God's presence became more real	____	1	8	1
Examen of Consciousness: I became more aware of my sins in thoughts, words, and in actions	____	1	8	1
Comments: *Enjoyed the long quiet time for personal meditation; may God give me a pure heart, righteous spirit, and conform my will to His will!*				
Personal Reflections:				
I became more aware of the Holy Spirit's movements	____	____	10	____
Journaling helped me to express my true feelings to God	____	____	10	____
Discernment helped me to discover my desires, and recall and submit to God's leading	____	1	9	____
Comments: *Powerful presence of the Holy Spirit and my spiritual renewal were evident and beyond my expectation; thank God for giving me this opportunity to reflect on the challenging Scripture passages!*				
Small Group Sharing:				
Atmosphere: conducive to in-depth sharing	____	1	8	1
Time: adequate for everyone to share deeply	____	3	6	1
Goal: experienced intimacy with God and with each other	____	2	7	1
Comments: *Thanks for the retreatants' passionate sharing; wish for more time; deeply appreciate the retreat!*				

interactive relationship with God through worship services of the Ignatian Prayer Practices of the Lection Divina, the Examen of the Holy Spirit. The positive response to the "awareness of the Holy Spirit's movements," "expressing true feelings to God," and "discovering desires" in their Personal Reflections, exceeded the researcher's expectations, for these are seldom found in the vocabulary of evangelical Chinese Christians, revealing a break-through in that they were responding to God not just through their mental but their emotional faculties as well. However, being of the evangelical tradition, they gave credit to their meditation of Scripture for their break-through in responding to God, a practice which evangelical Christians always cherish. Finally, they expressed their wish that more time be given to Small Group Sharing, so that they might experience more in-depth and intimate fellowship with God and with each other.

The Researcher's Evaluation of Student Assignments

There were three major written assignments for the course: first, a two-page Personal Reflection paper that identifies inconsistencies between Christian faith and practice in the student' daily life; second, a three-page Retreat Journal that records the student's encounter with God at the Silent Retreat; and third, an eight-page Practical Theology paper that develops a topic relevant to the student's ministry following Osmer's four-task process, which includes leading a one-day retreat for two to three other retreatants as the fourth task. A summary of the contents of the three assignments submitted by the seven students is presented in Table 7 on the next page. The order of listing the students is from the least experienced to the most experienced in terms of the number of Spiritual Formation courses they have taken: one star * means that this is the first and only course the student has taken; two stars ** means that the student has taken one previous course in Spiritual Formation; three stars *** means that the

Table 7: Assessment of Student Assignments

Student	Faith vs Practice	Retreat Journal	Practical Theology
1 *	Good reflection on spiritual lessons learned; but not on faith vs practice	Experienced being filled with the Holy Spirit during worship; lots of spiritual experiences; lacked direct interaction with God	**Theology:** integrated the four tasks into Retreat; good discussion on the wife's role, weak in interpretation **Retreat:** a.m.: worship, discussion on the wife's challenges and causes; personal reflection; p.m.: worship, Bible teaching, personal reflection; group sharing
2 **	Judgmental of "good" Christian's inconsistency--faith vs practice; reflected on Jesus' compassion for sinners in Scripture	Good reflection on scripture; lots of one-way pleading with God for help; lacked direct interaction with God	**Theology:** integrated four tasks into Retreat; good discussion on spiritual discipline, creative exercises **Retreat:** two-day: first day worship, exercises to bring out needs & causes, & Bible teaching; second, worship & spiritual discernment process
3 **	Good reflection on spiritual lessons learned; but not on faith vs practice	Outpouring of emotions over God's provision in nature, leading to praise & trust in God for own needs; lacked direct interaction with God	**Theology:** topic follows this course on Chinese immigrants, with good analysis on new immigrants' needs and causes for them **Retreat:** good and realistic schedule: a.m.: worship, Lectio, personal reflection; p.m.: worship, Lectio, personal reflection, sharing
4 **	Fear of human relationships; knows Scripture teaching on the topic, but not able to live it	Emotional reflection on spiritual journey, but lacked direct interaction with God	**Theology:** good discussion on man's role and expectation in Christianity; unclear on the four tasks and transition from one to another **Retreat:** led retreatants to express emotions in the presence of God; no schedule reported
5 ***	Pride: perfectionist, cited concrete examples; grieved its persistency, but prayed for God's help; practiced spiritual disciplines, resulting in spiritual break-through	Very good reflection on spiritual journey, along with lots of emotional, intimate interactive dialogues with God	**Theology:** topic follows this course on Chinese immigrants, with additional personal studies and insights **Retreat:** good and realistic schedule: a.m.: worship, Lectio, personal meditation; p.m.: worship, Jesus' challenge, personal meditation, group sharing
6 ***	Poor response to crises; also temperamental; cited concrete examples. Sought deliverance through reflection on Scripture passages; but personal change not evident	Good analytical reflections on lots of Scripture passages; but lacked recording of emotions and direct interaction with God	**Theology:** discussion, content, and Scripture follow this course on Chinese immigrants, but without personal input or insights **Retreat:** good schedule: a.m.: worship, teaching on four-fold tasks, examen of conscience, group sharing; p.m.: worship; personal meditation, one-on-one meeting with retreatants for sharing personal meditation
7 ***	Pride: cited concrete examples of facing child's disobedience, spouse's help; reflected on others' needs, self-issue and God's loving patience	Lots of spiritual insights from nature: rabbit, wind, rain, falling leaves, eating; lacked direct response to God	**Theology:** topic and content follow this course on Chinese immigrants, with input; but lacked connection from one task to another Retreat: a.m.: worship, Lectio demo, Lectio, personal meditation; p.m.: worship, personal meditation, group sharing

student has taken two previous Spiritual Formation courses, in which case they have already been exposed to the practices of the Lectio Divina, the Examen of Consciousness, the Examen of Conscience, and the basic Discernment process. The purpose of listing the students in this order is to help the Researcher better assess how having previously practiced such spiritual disciplines might have impacted the experience of the student's learning and encounters with God in this course.

Faith vs Practice:

The purpose of the assignment was to encourage students to reflect on inconsistencies between their faith and practice, despite having been Christians or church leaders for so long, so that they can identify with Chinese immigrants' spiritual struggles in their congregations. Two students recorded good reflections on spiritual lessons learned, but they failed to relate them to areas found in their own life's inconsistencies between faith and practice as the assignments required. They probably needed my reiteration of the expectations for the various assignments, since I had explained everything only once while going through the course syllabus on the first day of classroom instructions. Five students did write good reflections on such inconsistencies, four of them even cited concrete examples of issues they were dealing with. Most students naturally drew on Scripture passages that address the issues, apparently a familiar evangelical attempt to rely on mental Bible knowledge for life-change. Some students addressed their issues also by considering others' needs, God's or Christ's patience and compassion for people, but without mentioning the effectiveness of these attempts for life transformation. Only one student recorded an incident showing a spontaneous break-through upon a period of intentional practice of the spiritual discipline of letting go of perfectionism and

accepting one's own limitations. What is also noticeably lacking is any mention of the Holy Spirit's role in transforming lives; this is common among evangelical Chinese Christians who tend to rely on Bible knowledge alone to the neglect of the indwelling Holy Spirit's power for transformation of life.

Retreat Journal: The purpose of the assignment was to encourage students to record their personal experience while they were having the extraordinary opportunity or "luxury" (the first time for most if not all of them) of an intentional setting aside of time for an intimate encounter with God in Christ. Most students recorded their emotional spiritual experiences during personal reflections on Scripture passages. While one of them sensed the filling of the Holy Spirit during worship, many of them also indicated that they felt God's presence in the many worship services. Two students recorded only analytical reflections on Scripture with few if any emotional expression, which is probably due to their professional training and church tradition of Bible study that rely more on their mental than on their emotional capacities. Two students expressed being in awe of and delight over God's marvelous creation, through which they were able to relate to God's work in their own lives; unfortunately, they did not journal their direct responses to God. The fact that only one student recorded a series of direct interactive dialogue with God convinced me that I had neglected to reiterate more clearly to the students at the beginning of the retreat the valuable practice of two-way communication with God and of journaling the encounter, since for many of them it was their very first time practicing such a spiritual discipline.

Practical Theology:

The final assignment of the course was for the students to select a topic relevant to the people in their current ministry, and to develop according to Osmer's four-task approach a practical theology of spiritual formation, which includes leading a one-day retreat for a small group of about three retreatants who are willing to participate. The purpose of this assignment was for the students to apply the principles and practices of this course to a specific ministry in their respective contexts: first, to identify an area of spiritual needs or challenges in terms of inconsistencies between their faith and practice; second, to discover the causes behind them; third, to identify biblical teachings that address the issue; and finally, to develop a spiritual formation process to begin to help them overcome such inconsistencies. Four of the seven students who are involved in local church ministries continued to follow this course's topic on Chinese immigrants, finding additional studies and insights on the issue, which reflects the relevance of this issue in their own churches. The only common weakness found in these students' assignments was the lack of explanation on the connection between one task and the next. The other three students, who happened to be newer students (two of them are not directly involved in church ministry) worked on other topics: two on gender roles and one on spiritual disciplines; and two of the three also creatively integrated Osmer's four-task approach of practical theology into the development of the Retreat. For example, in the case about gender roles of the wife, the first task involves leading the retreatants to brainstorm challenges in living out the role of a wife as a Chinese American; the second task involves discussing the causes of such challenges from the perspective of traditional Chinese culture and from the perspective of expectations in the evangelical Chinese American church; the third task involves teaching biblical principles on the issue; and the last task involves guiding retreatants for a time

of personal reflection on how to apply biblical principles into their daily lives in relationship with their husbands.

All students reported very good experience of the retreats they led; some of them even reported their retreatants being moved to tears. Most students led a one-day 9 a.m. to 4 p.m. retreat at a house, but one student spent two days with retreatants in a small cottage by a lake. All except one student also included in their reports a realistic schedule of activities patterned after the key contents of the silent retreat that they had experienced in this course: two sessions of worship, one in the morning and one in the afternoon; two of the spiritual exercises taught in this course such as the Lectio Divina, the Examen of Conscience, or Jesus' challenge; two sessions of a forty- to sixty-minute personal reflection on some suggested relevant passages; then closed with group sharing. Obviously, the two groups that integrated the four-task approach into the retreat had less time for the spiritual exercises and personal reflection; that was why one of them decided to conduct a two-day retreat instead. But even for the one-day retreat, twenty minutes were allotted to each of the two spiritual exercises and forty minutes for each session of the personal reflection, which reflects that the students themselves had found such exercises very significant and precious in establishing an intimate relationship with God.

The Researcher's Assessment of the Course

Based on the hypothesis of the dissertation, the assessment of the course concerns how well it has achieved the potential of "motivating and equipping seminarians in evangelical Chinese American seminaries to develop more effective spiritual formation ministries by leading them through classroom instructions that explore the need for spiritual formation of

Chinese American Christians, and through a retreat to experience personally a taste of spiritual formation in their own lives." Obviously, "potential" can hardly be measured in concrete terms, but the quality of the students' final assignment on Practical Theology of Spiritual Formation would be a good reflection of how well the objective of this dissertation has been achieved by the field testing of this course.

Given Osmer's methodologically "user-friendly" four-task approach to doing practical theology, and despite the incompleteness of my development of content of the course by the time of my field-testing in March 2018, the classroom instruction did appear to lead the students adequately step by step through Osmer's 4-task process, resulting in most students being able to apply the approach to developing a specific spiritual formation ministry on a chosen topic relevant to their respective contexts. Especially convincing regarding the transferability of the approach was the attempt by the two students who successfully applied it to the development of the topics "The Wife's Role" and "Spiritual Disciplines," which were different from that of this course on Chinese immigrants.

More encouraging were the various ways in which the students applied concepts and the process of the Silent Retreat into their development and leading of their one-day retreat. Judging from their very positive evaluation and deep appreciation of the Silent Retreat, they were brought to intimate encounters with God through the natural environment which they found to be conducive to meditation, the Ignatian spiritual exercises, the worship services, along with the prayer practices of the Lectio Divina, the Examen of Conscience, and the Examen of Consciousness, the abundant length of time for personal reflections, the spiritual direction,

the small group sharing, and their own nature walk and prayer walk through the Stations of the Cross.

However, despite the overwhelmingly positive feedback by the students on the Silent Retreat, which suggests that they personally experienced "a taste of spiritual formation in their own lives," it remains challenging for one seminary course to change the evangelical mentality and practice of relying on Bible knowledge to change life. As mentioned under the assessment of their assignment on Faith versus Practice above, noticeably lacking in their assignments was any mention of the Holy Spirit's role, though this omission is common among evangelical Chinese Christians who tend to rely on Bible knowledge alone to the neglect of the indwelling Holy Spirit's power for the transformation of life. Hopefully, the small "taste of spiritual formation in their own lives" through the experience of the Silent Retreat will continue to motivate them to make extended time for solitude, to practice the presence of God in their daily lives, and to be sensitive to the movements of the Holy Spirit for life transformation to take place.

Conclusion

This dissertation describes a journey from the discovery of a problem to the field-testing of a proposal to address an important aspect of that problem. Without repeating the description of the dissertation's scope and limitations stated in chapter 1, the following is a summary of this journey and my strategic plans for moving beyond the journey.

A Summary of the Journey:

Chapter 1 began by describing the discovery of the phenomenon of mass conversion of Chinese immigrants to Christianity in North America, but then noted their low retention in Chinese churches in the last three decades. Apparently, while churches and college campus ministries have been effective in evangelism, their spiritual formation ministries need to be strengthened. The proposal to address this problem was to develop a seminary course the better to equip potential pastors to lead their congregations toward spiritual maturity, which became the hypothesis of this dissertation: that "a seminary course on A Practical Theology of Christian Spiritual Formation that applies Richard Osmer's four-task approach to practical theology has the potential to motivate and equip evangelical Chinese American seminarians to develop more effective spiritual formation ministries by leading them through classroom instruction that explore Chinese American Christians' need for spiritual formation, and through a silent retreat to experience personally a taste of spiritual formation in their own lives."

Chapter 2 took up Osmer's question, "What is going on?" of the Descriptive-Empirical Task [654] that aims at understanding challenges that first-generation Chinese immigrants,

[654] Osmer, 4.

Christians included, are facing in their daily lives, and how responses to these challenges affect their Christian faith. The results from the researcher's observations, literature research, and a survey of one hundred Christians from seven evangelical Chinese American congregations confirmed the inconsistency between their professed Christian faith and the way they live it out in the home and in the workplace, especially in terms of their excessive control over their children's academic achievement, to the extent that their attitude, behavior, and value system border on idolatry. Such an inconsistency not only has a detrimental effect on their children, it has also become a major hindrance to their spiritual growth.

Chapter 3 explored the next question "Why is this going on?" of Osmer's Interpretive Task and aimed to draw from theories and research findings in interdisciplinary fields to understand some of the major root causes behind their problem. Three relevant fields explored were: first, the deep-rooted cultural tradition and values from the Confucian philosophy brought from their home countries; second, the sociological assimilation theories that explain the attitudes and behaviors of Chinese immigrants in pursuing the American dream in their present context; and third, the historical spiritual heritage of the evangelical Chinese Church as affected by the lives and ministries of three spiritualities in the ways the Church conducts her spiritual formation ministries. A preliminary understanding of these studies revealed that Chinese immigrants' misinterpretation and superficial application of the Confucian philosophy, along with their eager concern to assimilate into mainstream American society but their reality of being hindered by discrimination, may have led to their preoccupation with their children's academic achievements; and that the evangelical Chinese American Church does not provide the necessary church culture and spiritual formation ministries for discipling them.

Chapter 4 attempted to answer Osmer's question of the Normative task: "What ought to be going on?" by exploring the biblical foundation of Christian Spiritual Formation to discover how the Triune God—Father, Son, and Holy Spirit, has engaged in the process of spiritual formation of God's peoples through the ages. A preliminary study of this process demonstrated that despite Israel's rebelliousness and failure to live up to the covenant demands of obedience to and dependence on God for holy living, Yahweh remained faithful to the covenant, continued to be with them to nurture their faith, and through the prophets promised them future renewal of the covenant. Similarly, despite the failures of Christ's disciples to meet the high demands of discipleship, Jesus promised his continued presence through the Holy Spirit, empowering them to live out Christ's life and to carry out his mission to the ends of the world, which became a reality on the Day of Pentecost.

Chapter 5 answered the last of Osmer's question of the Pragmatic task: "How might we respond?" by exploring how the practice of Ignatian spirituality might fill the gaps of spiritual formation ministries in today's evangelical Chinese American Church. Since evangelicals have always distrusted the Catholic tradition, the historical context and major characteristics of Ignatian spirituality, the centrality of Scripture in the foundation principles and central aspects of its *Spiritual Exercises*, the Jesuits' historical relevance to the Chinese people, and its road to transformation of life were presented. The result of this preliminary study revealed that Ignatian spirituality's practice of solitude, its focus on the life of Christ, its holistic prayer practices through Scripture, and its emphasis on the presence of God in daily living have the potential to fill the gaps in the spiritual formation ministries of the evangelical Chinese American Church and to transform them into the image of Christ.

Chapter 6 gave a detailed description of the seminary course *A Practical Theology of Christian Spiritual Formation* as a field test of this dissertation. The course was the culmination of Osmer's four-task interdisciplinary and integrative approach to doing practical theology, and consisted of thirty hours of classroom instruction followed by a three-day, four-night silent retreat all held between March 12 and 19, 2018 at the China Evangelical Seminary North America.

Chapter 7 presented the results and assessments of this field test. Given Osmer's methodologically "user-friendly" four-task approach, the classroom instruction did adequately lead the students step by step through the four-task process despite the incompleteness of my development of content, as demonstrated by the students' ability to apply the approach to developing a spiritual formation lesson on a chosen topic relevant to their respective contexts. More encouraging were the various ways in which the students applied the concepts and experience of the Silent Retreat to developing and leading a one-day retreat. Their positive evaluation and appreciation of the Silent Retreat suggests they experienced "a taste of spiritual formation in their own lives," even though there remains the difficulty of changing the evangelical mentality and practice of relying on Bible knowledge alone for life transformation. Hopefully, the small "taste of spiritual formation in their own lives" will continue to motivate them to make extended time for solitude in their own lives, to practice the presence of God in daily living, and to be sensitive to the movements of the Holy Spirit for life transformation to take place.

Moving beyond the Journey:

The end of a journey is often also the beginning of the second mile or the launching of the next journey! In partnership with my colleagues at the China Evangelical Seminary North America (CESNA), I have been strategizing ways in which to encourage and engage pastors and leaders of the evangelical Chinese American Church for the further development of spiritual formation ministries. Currently, a couple of plans have already started moving in this direction, and a couple of others are awaiting the opportunity and resources to take off.

The first strategic plan is the calling together for a Spiritual Formation Summit (held on January 28–29, 2019) of a small group of pastors and scholars who are known to have invested their time, talent, and resources into spiritual formation ministries in the last decade or two for the spiritual well-being of the Chinese Christian community. The purpose as stated in the Summit document is "to explore with a small group of like-minded spiritual formation practitioners and scholars in the North American churches, effective Christian spiritual formation strategies to help North American Chinese churches cultivate mature, Christ-like disciples in the twenty-first-century North American context."

The second strategic plan, in collaboration with pastors and scholars of the Summit, is to offer spiritual formation retreats to seminarians, recent seminary graduates, and pastors for their own spiritual well-being as well as to equip them to lead spiritual formation ministries in their various contexts. A tentative plan for this year is to offer four such retreats under the auspices of CESNA; speakers and leaders are to be recruited at the Summit; and detailed plans are to be drafted by the responsible leaders after the Summit.

The last two strategic plans are still awaiting the opportune time and the resources to be realized. One of these plans is to conduct research on stories of parents whose value

systems are drastically changed after their children experience depression or panic attacks in college due to the tremendous pressure parents put on them for academic achievement. Last but not the least is my own plan of translating this dissertation into Chinese to be used as a textbook for this seminary course.

Bibliography

Achtemeier, Paul J. “And he followed him: Miracles and Discipleship in Mark 10:46-52.” *Semeia* 11 (1978): 115–145.

Alba, Richard and Victor Nee. *Remaking the American Mainstream: Assimilation and Contemporary Immigration*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2003.

Ashley, J. Matthew. “Ignacio Ellacuria and the Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius Loyola.” *Theological Studies* 61, no. 1 (March 2000).

Bayer, Hans F. A *Theology of Mark: The Dynamic between Christology and Authentic Discipleship*. Phillipsburg, NJ: P & R Publishing, 2012.

Bays, Daniel H. *A New History of Christianity in China*. Malden, MA: Wiley-Blackwell, 2012.

Berthrong, John H. and Evelyn N. Berthrong. *Confucianism: A Short Introduction*. 2000. Reprint, Oxford: Oneworld Publications, 2004.

Best, E. *Following Jesus: Discipleship in the Gospel of Mark*. Journal for the Study of the New Testament: Supplement Series 4. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1982.

Blenkinsopp, Joseph. “Abraham as Paradigm in the Priestly History in Genesis.” *Journal of Biblical Literature* 128, no. 2 (2009): 225–241.

Blythe, Teresa. *50 Ways to Pray: Practices from Many Traditions and Times*. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 2006.

Bock, Darrell L. *A Theology of Luke and Acts: Biblical Theology of the New Testament*. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2012.

Boice, James Montgomery. *Psalms*. 3 vols. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 1996.

Bowe, Barbara E. *Biblical Foundations of Spirituality: Touching a Finger to the Flame*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 2003.

Brueggemann, Walter. “Bounded by Obedience and Praise: The Psalms as Canon.” *Journal for the Study of the Old Testament* 50 (1991): 63–92.

Burrows, Mark S. “Devotio Moderna: Reforming Piety in the Later Middle Ages.” In *Spiritual Traditions for the Contemporary Church*, edited by Robin Maas & Gabriel O’ Donnell, O.P., 109–32. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1990.

Cannon, Mae Elise. *Just Spirituality: How Faith Practices Fuel Social Action*. Downers Grove, IL: IVP Books, 2013.

Cao, Nanlai. "The Church as a Surrogate Family for Working-Class Immigrant Chinese Youth: An Ethnography of Segmented Assimilation." *Sociology of Religion* 66, no. 2 (2005): 183–200.

Carney, Sheila. "God Damn God: A Reflection on Expressing Anger in Prayer." *Biblical Theology Bulletin* 13 (1983): 116–120.

Casey, Michael. *Sacred Reading: The Ancient Art of Lectio Divina*. Liguori, MO: Liguori/ Triumph, 1995.

Chen, Charles P. and Julie Wai Ling Hong. "Career Development of Chinese Canadian Professional Immigrants." *The Career Development Quarterly* 64 (2016): 272–286.

Chua, Amy. *Battle Hymn of the Tiger Mother*. New York: Penguin Books, 2011.

Costigan, Catherine L., Josephine M. Hua, and Tina F. Su. "Living up to Expectations: The Strengths and Challenges Experienced by Chinese Canadian Students." *Canadian Journal of School Psychology* 25, no. 3 (2010): 223–245.

Crabbe, Kylie. "A Sinner and a Pharisee: Challenge at Simon's Table in Luke 7:36–50." *Pacifica: Journal of the Melbourne College of Divinity* 24, no. 3 (October 2011): 247–266.

Dawsey, James M. *Peter's Last Sermon: Identity and Discipleship in the Gospel of Mark*. Macon, GA: Mercer University Press, 2010.

Derouchie, Jason S. "Counting Stars with Abraham and the Prophets: New Covenant Ecclesiology in Old Testament Perspective." *Journal of the Evangelical Theological Society* 58, no. 3 (2015): 445–485.

Dominic, A. P. "The Threefold Call." *Reformed Review* 40 (1981): 283–296.

Dyckman, Katherine, Mary Garvin, and Elizabeth Liebert. *The Spiritual Exercises Reclaimed: Uncovering Liberating Possibilities for Women*. New York: Paulist Press, 2001.

Egan, Anthony. "Conscience, Spirit, Discernment: The Holy Spirit, the Spiritual Exercises and the Formation of Moral Conscience." *Journal of Theology for Southern Africa* 138 (November 2010): 57–70.

Endres, John C. "Psalms and Spirituality in the 21st Century." *Interpretation* 56, no. 2 (April 2002): 143–154.

Fee, Gordon D. *Paul, the Spirit, and the People of God*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson Publishers, 1996.

Fleddermann, H. “The Discipleship Discourse (Mark 9:33–50).” *Catholic Biblical Quarterly* 43 (1981): 57–75.

Foster, Richard J. *Prayer: Finding the Heart’s True Home*. San Francisco: HarperCollins Publishers, 1992

_____. *Streams of Living Water: Essential Practices from the Six Great Traditions of Christian Faith*. New York: HarperCollins Publishers, 2001.

Freedman, David Noel, ed. *The Anchor Bible Dictionary*. 6 vols. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1992.

Gabel, Helmut. “Ignatian Contemplation and Modern Biblical Studies.” *The Way* 44, no. 2 (April 2005): 37–49.

Gallagher, Timothy. *Discerning the Will of God: The Ignatian Guide to Christian Decision Making*. New York: The Crossroad Publishing Company, 2017.

Ganss, George E., with the collaboration of Parmananda R. Divarkar, Edward J. Malatesta, and Martin E. Palmer. *Ignatius of Loyola: The Spiritual Exercises and Selected Works*. New York: Paulist Press, 1991.

Goldin, Paul R. *Confucianism*. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 2011.

Gordon, Milton M. *Assimilation in American Life: The Role of Race, Religion, and National Origins*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1964.

Green, Joel B. *The Way of the Cross: Following Jesus in the Gospel of Mark*. Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock Publisher, 2009.

Grenz, Stanley J. “Jesus as the Imago Dei: Image-of-God Christology and the Non-Linear Linearity of Theology. *Journal of the Evangelical Theological Society* 47, no. 4 (Dec 2004): 617–628.

Guigo II. *The Ladder of Monks and Twelve Meditations*. Translated with an introduction by Edmund College and James Walsh. New York: Image Books, 1978.

Guinan, Michael D. *The Pentateuch*. Message of Biblical Spirituality 1. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 1990.

Harink, Douglas. *1 & 2 Peter*. Grand Rapids: Brazos Press, 2009.

Harvey, Thomas Alan. *Acquainted with Grief: Wang Mindao’s Stand for the Persecuted Church in China*. Grand Rapids: Brazos Press, 2002.

Hengel, Martin. *The Charismatic Leader and His Followers*. Eugene, OR: Wipf and Stock Publishers, 2005.

Holt, Bradley P. *Thirsty for God: A Brief History of Christian Spirituality*. Minneapolis: Augsburg Fortress, 1993.

Hsia, R. Po-Chia. *A Jesuit in the Forbidden City: Matteo Ricci 1552–1610*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010.

Hsu, Lily M. with Dana Roberts. *My Unforgettable Memories: Watchman Nee & Shanghai Local Church*. Translated by Fanny Wang and Kathy Wang. N.p.: Xulon Press, 2013.

Hu, Linda and John X. Wang. *The Chinese-American Method: Raising Our Children with the Best of Both Worlds*. N.p.: Trafford Publishing, 2013.

Keener, Craig. *Gospel of John: A Commentary*. Vol. 2. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson Publishers, 2003.

Kim, ChangHwan and Arthur Sakamoto. "Have Asian American Men Achieved Labor Market Parity with White Men?" *American Sociological Review* 75, no. 6 (December 2010): 934–957.

Kinnear, Angus I. *Against the Tide: The Story of Watchman Nee*. Carol Stream, IL: Tyndale House Publishers, 1978.

Kline, Meredith G. *Kingdom Prologue: Genesis Foundations for a Covenantal Worldview*. Eugene, OR: Wipf and Stock Publishers, 2006.

Kostenberger, Andreas J. and Scott R. Swain. *Father, Son and Spirit*. New Studies in Biblical Theology 24. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 2008.

La Verdiere, Eugene. *The Beginning of the Gospel: Introducing the Gospel According to Mark*. 2 vols. Collegeville, MN: The Liturgical Press, 1999.

Laven, Mary. *Mission to China: Matteo Ricci and the Jesuit Encounter with the East.* London: Faber and Faber Ltd., 2011.

Lee, Wei-Ting. "Confucius or Mozart? Community Cultural Wealth and Upward Mobility Among Children of Chinese Immigrants." *Qualitative Sociology* 36, no. 3 (2013): 303–321.

Leong, Frederick T. L. and Mei Tang. "Career Barriers for Chinese Immigrants in the United States." *The Career Development Quarterly* 64 (2016): 259–271.

Leung, Kalun 梁家麟. *Huaren Chuandao yu Fenxing Budaojia 華人傳道與奮興佈道家* [Evangelists and Revivalists of Modern China]. Hong Kong: Christianity and Chinese Culture Research Center of Alliance Bible Seminary, 1999.

Lu, Tsun-En. “A special Training for Young Graduates and Professionals.” *Ambassadors Communique* 52, no. 2 (Winter, 2017): 17.

Lu, Wei-Ting. “Confucius or Mozart? Community Cultural Wealth and Upward Mobility Among Children of Chinese Immigrants.” *Qualitative Sociology* 36, no. 3 (2013): 303–321.

Ma, Christina A. Astorga. “Ignatian Discernment: A Critical Contemporary Reading for Christian Decision Making.” *Horizons* 32, no.1 (2005): 72–99

Mahoney, Jack. “Evolution, Altruism, and the Image of God.” *Theological Studies* 71, no. 3 (Sept 2010): 677–701.

Marshall, I. Howard. “Jesus—Example and Teacher of Prayer in the Synoptic Gospels.” In *Into God’s Presence: Prayer in the New Testament*, edited by Richard N. Longenecker, 113–131. Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2001.

Martin, James. *The Jesuit Guide to (Almost) Everything: A Spirituality for Real Life*. New York: HarperCollins Publishers, 2010.

Mays, James Luther. *Psalms*. Interpretation: A Bible Commentary for Teaching and Preaching. Louisville, KY: John Knox Press, 1994.

Melloni, Javier. *The Exercises of St. Ignatius in the Western Tradition*. Translated by Michael Ivens. Leominster, UK: Gracewing Publishing, 2000.

Modras, Roland. *A Dynamic Spirituality for the 21st Century: Ignatian Humanism*. Chicago: Loyola Press, 2004.

Moloney, Francis J. *Mark: Storyteller, Interpreter, Evangelist*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson Publishers, Inc., 2004.

_____. “The Vocation of the Disciples in the Gospel of Mark.” *Salesianum* 43 (1978): 487–516.

Mooney, Catherine M. “Ignatian Spirituality, A Spirituality for Mission.” *Mission Studies* 26 (2009): 192–213.

Mounce, William D. *Basics of Biblical Greek: Grammar*. Grand Rapids: Zondervan Publishing House, 1993.

Muldoon, Tim. *The Ignatian Workout: Daily Spiritual Exercises for a Healthy Faith*. Chicago: Loyola Press, 2004.

Niehaus, Jeffrey J. “Covenant: An Idea in the Mind of God.” *Journal of the Evangelical Theological Society* 52, no. 2 (Jun 2009): 225–246.

Noll, Mark A and Carolyn Nystrom. *Clouds of Witnesses: Christian Voices from Africa and Asia*. Downers Grove, IL: IVP Books, 2011.

Och, Bernard. "Creation and Redemption: Toward a Theology of Creation." *Judaism* 44, no. 2 (Spring 1995): 226–243.

Osmer, Richard Robert. *Practical Theology: An Introduction*. Cambridge: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing, 2008.

Parker, Margaret. "Exploring Four Persistent Prophetic Images." *Bible Review* 6, no. 5 (1990): 38–45.

Peacock, H. F. "Discipleship in the Gospel of Mark." *Review and Expositor* 75 (1978): 555–564.

Perrin, David B. *Studying Christian Spirituality*. New York: Routledge, 2007.

Qin, Desiree Baolian. "Doing Well vs. Feeling Well: Understanding Family Dynamics and the Psychological Adjustment of Chinese Immigrant Adolescents." *Journal of Youth Adolescence* 37 (2008): 22–35.

_____. "Our Child Doesn't Talk to Us Anymore." *Anthropology & Education Quarterly* 37, no. 2 (2006): 162–179.

Rhymer, David. "Jeremiah 31:31–34." *Interpretation* 59, no. 3 (July 2005): 294–296.

Roth, S. John. "Jesus the Pray-er." *Currents in Theology and Mission* 33, no. 6 (December 2006): 488–500.

Santos, Narry F. *Slave of All: The Paradox of Authority and Servanthood in the Gospel of Mark*. Journal for the Study of the New Testament Supplement Series 237. New York: Sheffield Academic Press, 2003.

Schneiders, Sandra M. "Biblical spirituality." *Interpretation* 56, no. 2 (2002): 133–142.

Sluhovsky, Moshe. "St. Ignatius of Loyola's Spiritual Exercises and their Contribution to Modern Introspective Subjectivity." *Catholic Historical Review* 99, no. 4 (2013): 649–674.

Southern California Los Angeles Area Chinese Churches, Parachurch Organizations, and Ministers Directory of 2015 – 2016. Los Angeles: Greater Los Angeles Chinese Ministerial Association, 2015.

Su, Edwin 蘇文峰. *Haiwai Zhongguo Xueren Shigong 海外中國學人事工* [Overseas Mainland Chinese Ministry]. Lomita, CA: Overseas Campus Magazine, 2001.

Suarez-Orozco, Carola and Marcelo Suarez-Orozco. *Children of Immigration*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2001.

Swartley, Willard M. “Jesus and Believers at Pray.” *Vision* (Fall, 2006): 10–19.

Tetlow, Joseph A. *Ignatius Loyola: Spiritual Exercises*. New York: The Crossroad Publishing, 1992.

_____. *Making Choices in Christ: The Foundations of Ignatian Spirituality.* Chicago, IL: Loyola Press, 2008.

von Wahlde, U. C. “Discipleship: The Authority that Serves.” *Biblische Zeitschrift* 29 (1985): 49–67.

Wang, Stephen. *The Long Road to Freedom: The Story of Wang Mingdao*. Kent, TN: Sovereign World, 2002.

Wang, Yuting. “More Than Evangelical and Ethnic: The Ecological Factor in Chinese Conversion to Christianity in the United States.” *Sociology of Religion* 67, no. 2 (2006): 179–192.

Westermann, Claus. *Prophetic Oracles of Salvation in the Old Testament*. Louisville, KY: Westminster/John Knox Press, 1991.

Wolfteich, Claire E. and Jorg Schneider. “A Comparative Research Conversation: American Catholic and German Protestant Spirituality Studies.” *International Journal of Practical Theology* 17, no. 1 (2013): 100–130.

Wong, Mingdao. *A Stone Made Smooth: Wong Ming-Dao*. Translated by Arthur Reynolds. Southampton, UK: Mayflower Christian Books, 1981.

Wright, N. T. “The Lord’s Prayer as a Paradigm of Christian Prayer.” In *Into God’s Presence: Prayer in the New Testament*, edited by Richard N. Longenecker, 132–54. Grand Rapids, MI: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2001.

Wu, Silas 吳秀良. Yuchidu: Ershi shiji zhongguo jiaohui fuxing de xianqu *余慈度：二十世紀中國教會復興的先驅* [Dora Yu—Harbinger of Chinese Church Revival in 20th Century China]. Boston, MA: Pishon River Publications, 2000.

Wu, Silas H. L. “Dora Yu (1873–1931): Foremost Female Evangelist in Twentieth-Century Chinese Revivalism.” In *Gospel Bearers, Gender Barriers*, edited by Dana Robert, 85–98. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2002.

Yang, Fenggang. *Chinese Christians in America: Conversion, Assimilation, and Adhesive Identities*. University Park, PA: the Pennsylvania State University Press, 1999.

_____. “Chinese Conversion to Evangelical Christianity: The Importance of Social and Cultural Contexts.” *Sociology of Religion* 59, no. 3 (1998): 237–257.

Yang, Fenggang and Helen Rose Ebaugh. “Religion and Ethnicity Among New Immigrants: The Impact of Majority/Minority Status in Home and Host Countries.” *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* 40, no. 3 (2001): 367–378.

------. “Transformations in New Immigrant Religions and their Global Implications.” *American Sociological Review* 66, no. 2 (Apr 2001): 269–288.

Yang, Fenggang and Joseph B. Tamney. “Exploring Mass Conversion to Christianity Among the Chinese: An Introduction.” *Sociology of Religion* 67, no. 2 (2006): 125–129.

Yao, Xinzhong. *An Introduction to Confucianism*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2000.

Appendix A: Follow-up Record on Church X Baptismal Candidates

(2006 Christmas – 2016 Summer)

No.	Gender		Attending Church X		Not Attending Church X						
					Moved Away			Attending church?	Sickness	Deceased	Unknown
	M	F	Active	Inactive	China	US	Others				
1											
2											
3											
4											
5											
6											
7											
8											
9											
10											
11											
12											
13											
14											
15											
16											
17											
18											
19											
20											
Total											

Note: Active—attending worship & at least one other ministry regularly; Inactive—attending worship/another ministry irregularly

Appendix B: Survey of Chinese Immigrants' Spiritual Needs

Objective: to discover the spiritual needs of first-generation Chinese immigrants, so that the Researcher may equip present and future pastors to develop better and more relevant ministries toward the spiritual formation of first-generation adult immigrants in their churches.

(Survey forms are to be voluntarily distributed by pastors or seminarians currently serving in Chinese churches in North America; to be filled out voluntarily by first-generation immigrant adult Christians; and tabulated, analyzed, and discarded after use by the Researcher, who will include the findings in an appendix of her dissertation)

Part A: to be filled out by a pastor or seminarian distributing the survey

Church Affiliation: __ Independent __ Denomination: _____

Regular Ministries: __ Worship __ Prayer __ Bible Study __ Fellowship
__ Foreign Missions __ Local Evangelism __ Youth __ Children

Immigrant Ministries: __ Help settling in __ Job referrals __ financial aid __ Childcare
__ Citizenship Class __ English tutoring __ Others: _____

Part B: to be filled out by an adult immigrant member who has become a Christian within the last 7 years
Please check items that apply to you, give additional comments on the back, or skip any section.

Gender: __ M __ F **Age Range:** __ 18-34 __ 35-64 __ 65 or above **Country of Origin:** __ China __ Other

My motivations for attending this Church:

__ Curiosity about Christianity __ My social/cultural needs are met: _____
__ Invitation by friends/relatives __ My material needs are met: _____
__ My sincere search for truth __ My spiritual needs are met: _____
__ Others: _____

I have become a Christian and was baptized in: _____ (Year)

Reasons: _____

I have left this Church: __ less than 2 years __ 2-4 years __ 5 years or more

Reasons: _____

I have attended this Church: __ less than 2 years __ 2-4 years __ 5 years or more

I have participated/served in the following ministries: **A** for attendance; **L** for leadership

Regular Ministries: __ Worship __ Prayer __ Bible Study __ Fellowship
__ Foreign Missions __ Local Evangelism __ Youth __ Children

Immigrant Ministries: __ Help settling in __ Job referrals __ financial aid __ Childcare
__ Citizenship Class __ English tutoring __ Others: _____

How well I am living out my faith in relationships: **G** Good; **F** Fair; **P** Poor

__ God __ Spouse __ Children __ Friends (church/non-church) __ Boss __ Subordinates

How well I am living out my faith in these contexts: **G** Good; **F** Fair; **P** Poor

__ By Myself __ At Home __ At Church __ At Work __ In Community/Society __ In the World

How well I am living out my faith in other aspects: **G** Good; **F** Fair; **P** Poor

__ Character __ Witness __ Social Justice Stewardship: __ of Time; __ of Money; __ of Talents

Appendix B1: A Comparison of Survey Responses on Spiritual Needs by Life Stages

Young Adult Part A

Objective: to discover the spiritual needs of first-generation Chinese immigrants, so that the Researcher may design seminary courses to train present and future pastors to develop better and more relevant ministries toward spiritual formation in their churches.

Part A: Church Affiliation & Ministries:	5 No Answer	30 Independent	19 Denomination: 5 Baptist	
General:	47 Worship	47 Prayer	47 Bible Study	47 Fellowship
	46 Foreign Missions	47 Local Evangelism	46 Youth	47 Children
Immigrant:	9 Help settling in	12 Job referrals	0 financial aid	23 Childcare
	0 Citizenship Class	30 English tutoring	0 Others:	

Ministry Responses: Gender: 26 M + 28 F = **54** **Age Range: 18-34** **Country of Origin:** 6 No Answer; **45 China**; 3 Other

I have been a Christian: 5 No Answer 14 less than 2 years 14 2-4 years 19 5-10 years 2 over 10 years

Participation in ministries: **A** for attendance—first number; **L** for leadership—second number

General:	28+7=35 Worship	27+4=31 Prayer	24+14=38 Bible Study	38+5=43 Fellowship
	2+0=2 Foreign Missions	0 Local Evangelism	3+1=4 Youth	4+1=5 Children
Immigrant:	1+0=1 Help settling in	1+0=1 Job referrals	0 financial aid	4+1=5 Childcare
	0+1=1 Citizenship Class	1+1=2 English tutoring	0 Others:	

Summary:

1) Church Affiliation: higher % attending independent than denomination churches (56% versus 35% of total 54).

2) Church Ministries: offering ministries common to evangelical churches; highest percentage (56%) provide immigrants is English tutoring, reflecting the perceived need for academic achievement; lowest in financial aids and citizenship classes.

3) Gender and Years as Christians: M/F almost even; a little more than half are new Christians four years and less.

4) Participation in Ministries: majority involved in ministries for their own spiritual growth: Fellowship (80%), Bible study (70%), Worship (65%), and Prayer (57%); very few involved in service ministries to others.

5) Ministry Leadership: Bible Study 25%, reflecting eagerness in learning Bible knowledge as young Christians; next in Worship, probably in Praise Team as generally observed.

Appendix B1: A Comparison of Survey Responses on Spiritual Needs by Life Stages

Young Adult Part B

Part B: My Faith Journey: **Gender:** 26 M + 28 F = **54** **Age Range: 18-34** **Country of Origin:** 6 No Answer; 45 China; 3 Other

I have been a Christian: 5 No Answer 14 less than 2 years 14 2-4 years 19 5-10 years 2 over 10 years

Attending this Church—Years & Motivations: 23 less than 2 years 18 2-4 years 11 5-10 years 2 No answer

13 Curiosity about Christianity 9 Meeting social/cultural needs 9 Invitation of friends/relatives 3 Meeting material needs

17 Sincere search for truth 8 Meeting spiritual needs 1 Others: family influence

Why I have left this Church: Total: 6—1 due to studies; 1 not fit; others no answer

Living out my faith in relationships: **G** Good; **F** Fair; **P** Poor

God: 28G;17F;2P **Spouse:** 12G;9F;2P **Children:** 3G;3F;0P **Friends:** 21G;24F;1P **Boss:** 7G;14F;5P **Subordinates:** 6G;4F;2P

Living out my faith in these contexts: **G** Good; **F** Fair; **P** Poor

Church: 32G;16F;1P **Solitude:** 27G;16F;2P **Home:** 18G;28F;1P **Work:** 12G;13F;6P **Society:** 16G;23F;1P **World:** 9G;23F;4P

Living out my faith in other aspects: **G** Good; **F** Fair; **P** Poor

Character: 26G;17F;2P; **Witness:** 16G;23F;8P; **Social Justice:** 9G;26F;5P;

Stewardship: **Time** 8G;25F;11P; **Money** 10G;25F;8P; **Talents** 12G;27F;2P

Summary: 1) Country of Origin: 83% China

2) Years as Christians: 26% less than 2; 26% 2-4; 39% 5-10; Attended Church: 43% less than 2; 33% 2-4; 20% 5-10

3) Motivation: highest 45% search for truth; 34% spiritual needs; 30% curiosity about faith; 24% by invitation; 19% social/cultural needs; least 11% material needs

4) Living Out Faith—Percentage based on total responses in each category:

Relationship: Best God 60%G, Spouse 52%G, 9%P; Children 50%G; Subordinates 50%G, 17%P; Worst Boss 27%G, 19%P

Context: Best Church 65%G, Solitude 60%G; Worst Work 39%G, 19%P; Home 38%G; and World 25%G, 11%P

Other Aspects: Best Character 58%G; Worst Money management 23%G, 19%P; and Social justice 23%G, 13%P

Appendix B1: A Comparison of Survey Responses on Spiritual Needs by Life Stages

Middle Adult Part A

Objective: to discover the spiritual needs of first-generation Chinese immigrants, so that the Researcher may design seminary courses to train present and future pastors to develop better and more relevant ministries toward spiritual formation in their churches.

Part A: Church Affiliation & Ministries: 3 No Answer | 24 Independent | 13 Denomination: Baptist

General: 35 Worship | 35 Prayer | 34 Bible Study | 36 Fellowship

34 Foreign Missions | 34 Local Evangelism | 34 Youth | 33 Children

Immigrant: 4 Help settling in | 9 Job referrals | 0 financial aid | 22 Childcare

0 Citizenship Class | 23 English tutoring | 1 Others: Host family

Ministry Responses: Gender: 19 M + 21 F = **40** **Age Range: 35-64** **Country of Origin:** 3 No Answer; 31 China; 4 Other: Taiwan

I have been a Christian: 1 No Answer | 7 less than 2 years | 10 2-4 years | 14 5-10 years | 8 over 10 years

Participation in ministries: **A** for attendance—first number; **L** for leadership—second number

General: 18+8=26 Worship | 17+6=23 Prayer | 16+8=24 Bible Study | 12+6=18 Fellowship

0+1=1 Foreign Missions | 0+1=1 Local Evangelism | 2+2=4 Youth | 3+3=6 Children

Immigrant: 0 Help settling in | 0 Job referrals | 0 financial aid | 2+0=2 Childcare

1+0=1 Citizenship Class | 1+0=1 English tutoring | 2+0=2 Others: Worship & Choir, Gospel Fellowship

Summary: 1) Church Affiliation: higher percentage attending independent than denomination churches (60% versus 33%).

2) Church Ministries: offering ministries common to evangelical churches; highest percentage (58%) provide immigrants with English tutoring, reflecting the perceived need for academic achievement; lowest in financial aids and citizenship classes.

3) Gender and Years as Christians: M/F almost even; a little more than half are five years and more, 20% over 10 years.

4) Participation in Ministries: majority involved in ministries for spiritual growth—Worship (65%), Bible Study (60%), Prayer (58%); Fellowship (45%)—much lower than young adults in Fellowship & Bible Study; still few in rendering services to others.

5) Ministry Leadership: a bit higher percentage of adults than young adults in leading Worship, Prayer, and Fellowship; but lower (5%) in leading Bible Study, reflecting perhaps their busier parenting life or decreasing interest for Bible knowledge.

Appendix B1: A Comparison of Survey Responses on Spiritual Needs by Life Stages

Middle Adult Part B

Part B: My Faith Journey: **Gender:** 19 M + 21 F = **40** **Age Range: 35-64** **Country of Origin:** 3 No Answer 31 China; 4 Other: Taiwan

I have been a Christian: 1 No Answer 7 less than 2 years 10 2-4 years 14 5-10 years 8 over 10 years

Attending this Church—Years & Motivations: 6 less than 2 years 15 2-4 years 16 5-10 years 3 no answer

15 Curiosity about Christianity 10 Meeting social/cultural needs 13 Invitation of friends/relatives 8 Meeting material needs

26 Sincere search for truth 22 Meeting spiritual needs ____ Others:

Reasons why I have left this Church: Total: 4; reason not given

Living out my faith in relationships: **G** Good; **F** Fair; **P** Poor

God: 19G;16F;0P **Spouse:** 18G;13F;1P **Children:** 14G;14F;2P **Friends:** 17G;15F;1P **Boss:** 10G;12F;2P **Subordinates:** 8G;8F;1P

Living out my faith in these contexts: **G** Good; **F** Fair; **P** Poor

Solitude: 17G;18F;1P **Home:** 18G;18F;0P **Church:** 26G;11F;0P **Work:** 11G;20F;1P **Society:** 10G;20F;3P **World:** 9G;20F;3P

Living out my faith in other aspects: **G** Good; **F** Fair; **P** Poor

Character: 20G;13F;1P; **Witness:** 11G;22F;3P; **Social Justice:** 6G;24F;3P;

Stewardship: **Time** 10G;21F;1P; **Money** 10G;21F;3P; **Talents** 7G;20F;3P

Summary: 1) Country of Origin: 78% China; 10% Taiwan

2) Years as Christians: 18% less than 2; 25% 2-4; 35% 5-10; 20% over 10; Attended Church: 15% less than 2; 38% 2-4; 40% 5-10

3) Motivation: Highest Search for truth 65%; Spiritual needs 55%; Least Material needs 20%

4) Living Out Faith—Percentage based on total responses in each category:
Relationship: Best Spouse 56%G; God 54%G; Friends 52%G; Worst Children 47%G 7%P; Boss 42%G, 8%P
Context: Best Church 70%G, 50%G Home; Worst Work 34%G; Society 30%G, 9%P; and World 28%G, 9%P
Other Aspects: Best Character 59%; Time 45%G; Money 29%G; Worst Talents 23%G, 10%P; and Social Justice 18%G, 9%P

Appendix B1: A Comparison of Survey Responses on Spiritual Needs by Life Stages

Senior Adult Part A

Objective: to discover the spiritual needs of first-generation Chinese immigrants, so that the Researcher may design seminary courses to train present and future pastors to develop better and more relevant ministries toward spiritual formation in their churches.

Part A: Church Affiliation & Ministries:	0 No Answer	3 Independent	3 Denomination: Baptist	
General:	6 Worship	6 Prayer	6 Bible Study	6 Fellowship
	6 Foreign Missions	6 Local Evangelism	6 Youth	6 Children
Immigrant:	0 Help settling in	0 Job referrals	0 financial aid	5 Childcare
	0 Citizenship Class	6 English tutoring	0 Others	

Ministry Responses: Gender: 2 M + 4 F = **6 Age Range: 65 and Above Country of Origin:** 0 No Answer; 5 China; 1 Other: Taiwan

I have been a Christian: 0 No Answer 0 less than 2 years 2 2-4 years 1 5-10 years 3 over 10 years

Participation in ministries: **A** for attendance—first number; **L** for leadership—second number

General:	2+2=4 Worship	2+2=4 Prayer	3+2=5 Bible Study	3+3=6 Fellowship
	0+1=1 Foreign Missions	0+1=1 Local Evangelism	0 Youth	0 Children
Immigrant:	0 Help settling in	0 Job referrals	0 financial aid	0+1=1 Childcare
	1+1=2 Citizenship Class	1+1=2 English tutoring	1 Others: Meal Service	

Summary: 1) Church Affiliation: Percentage split between attending independent and denomination churches (50/50%)

2) Church Ministries: offering ministries common to evangelical churches; only English tutoring is provided by all churches for immigrants, reflecting the perceived need for academic achievement; do not see importance in providing other services.

3) Gender and Years as Christians: twice as many F as M; half have been Christians for less than, other half over 10 years.

4) Participation in Ministries: all attend Fellowship; almost all, Bible Study; 33% in Citizenship and English tutoring, which is the highest among three age groups; 66% attend Worship and Prayer, percentage seems consistent in all three age groups.

5) Ministry Leadership: highest percentage involved in general and immigrant ministries—33% each in Worship, Prayer and Bible Study; 50% in Fellowship; high percentage involvement is probably due to abundance in time and life experience.

Appendix B1: A Comparison of Survey Responses on Spiritual Needs by Life Stages

Senior Adult Part B

Part B: My Faith Journey: **Gender:** 2 M + 4 F = **6** **Age Range: 65 & Above** **Country of Origin:** 0 No Answer; 5 China; 1 Other: Taiwan

I have been a Christian: 0 No Answer 0 less than 2 years 2 2-4 years 1 5-10 years 3 over 10 years

Attending this Church—Years & Motivations: ___ less than 2 years 2 2-4 years 1 5-10 years 3 over 10 years

2 Curiosity about Christianity ___ Meeting social/cultural needs 2 Invitation of friends/relatives 0 Meeting material needs

2 My sincere search for truth 4 Meeting spiritual needs ___ Others:

Why I have left this Church: None

Living out my faith in relationships:			**G** Good;	**F** Fair;	**P** Poor
5G God	4G Spouse	3G;1F Children	2G;1F Friends	2F Boss	2G Subordinates

Living out my faith in these contexts:			**G** Good;	**F** Fair;	**P** Poor
5G;1F Solitude	3G;2F Home	4G;2F Church	3G Work	4G;1F Society	3G;2F World

Living out my faith in other aspects:			**G** Good;	**F** Fair;	**P** Poor
4G;2F Character;	3G;3F Witness	4G;2F Social Justice	**Stewardship:** 3G;2F Time;	4G;1F Money;	3G;2F Talents

Summary: 1) Country of Origin: 83% China; 17% Taiwan

2) Years as Christians: 33% 2-4 years; 17% 5-10 years; 50% over 10 years

3) Motivation: Highest 67% Spiritual needs, 33% each for Curiosity about Christianity, Search for Truth, and by Invitation

4) Living Out Faith—Percentage based on 6 persons total:

Relationship: Best God 83%G, Spouse 67%G, Children 50%G, 17%P; Worst Boss 0%G, 33%F; Subordinates 33%G

Context: Best Solitude 83%G, Church & Society 67%G, Worst Work 50%G; Home and World 50%G, 33%P

Other Aspects: Best Money management 67%G, 17P; Character & Social Justice 67%G, 33%P; Witness 50%G, 50%P; Time 50%G, 33%P; and Talents 50%G, 17%P

Appendix B2: A Comparison of Survey Responses on Spiritual Needs by Years of Conversion

Part A: My Participation in ministries: **Conversion in 2016-17—Total**: **30**

General:	19+1=20 Worship 67%	18+2=20 Prayer 67%	16+3=19 Bible Study 63%	24+2=26 Fellowship 87%
	1+0=1 Foreign Missions	1+0=1 Local Evangelism	1+0=1 Youth	2+1=3 Children
Immigrant:	0 Help settling in	0 Job referrals	0 financial aid	1+0=1 Childcare
	0 Citizenship Class	0 English tutoring	0 Others:	

Part B: My Faith Journey: Living out my faith in the follow: First No.= **G** Good; Second No.= **F** Fair; Third No.= **P** Poor

Relationships: God: 19/6/2 ; **Spouse:** 11/5/1 ; **Children:** 4/4/0 ; **Friends:** 14/10/1 ; **Boss:** 8/7/2 ; **Subordinates:** 7/2/1 ;

Contexts: Church: 23/4/1 ; **Solitude:** 16/9/2 ; **Home:** 14/12/2 ; **Work:** 10/9/1 ; **Society:** 12/8/1 ; **World:** 6/11/3 ;

Others—Character: 21/56/0 ; **Witness:** 12/12/2 ; **Social Justice:** 5/16/3 ; **Stewardship: Time** 8/13/3 ; **Money** 8/14/3 ; **Talents** 10/12/1 ;

Summary: **Part A: Participation in Ministries**—Percentage based on total conversions in 2015-17 Total: **30**

Ministry Participation: Highest in Fellowship 87%; Worship and Prayer both 67%; Bible Study 63%

Service Ministries: 1 each in Foreign Missions, Local Evangelism, and Youth; 3 in Children; 1 in Childcare **(7 A count out of 30)**

Ministry Leadership: 1 in Worship, 2 each in Prayer & Fellowship, 3 in Bible Study **(8 L count out of 30)**

Part B: Living Out Faith—Percentage based on total responses in each category

1) Relationships—Best: God 70%G 7%P; Subordinate 70%G 10%P; Spouse 65%G

Worst: Boss 47%G 12%P; Children 50%G; Friends 56%

2) Contexts—Best: Church 82%G, much higher than Solitude 59%G 7%P; Society 57%G

Worst: World 30%G 10%P; Home 50%G 7%P; Work 50%G;

3) Other Aspects—Best: Character 78%G; Witness 54%G 8%P; Talents 43%G

Worst: Social Justice 21%G 13%P; Money 32%G 14%P; and Time 33%G

Appendix B2: A Comparison of Survey Responses on Spiritual Needs by Years of Conversion

Part A: My Participation in ministries: **Conversion in 2013-15—Total**: **24**

General:	14+3=17 Worship 67%	14+0=14 Prayer 58%	13+3=16 Bible Study 67%	16+4=20 Fellowship 83%
	0 Foreign Missions	1+0=1 Local Evangelism 4%	3+0=2 Youth 13%	1+0=1 Children 4%
Immigrant:	1+0=1 Help settling in 4%	1+0=1 Job referrals 4%	0 financial aid	2+0=2 Childcare 8%
	0 Citizenship Class	0 English tutoring	0 Others:	

Part B: My Faith Journey: Living out my faith in the follow: First No.= **G** Good; Second No.= **F** Fair; Third No.= **P** Poor

Relationships: God: 12/9/0 ; **Spouse:** 3/6/0 ; **Children:** 1/5/2 ; **Friends:** 9/11/1 ; **Boss:** 3/7/2 ; **Subordinates:** 4/0/1 ;

Contexts: Church: 13/9/0 ; **Solitude:** 10/9/0 ; **Home:** 8/13/0 ; **Work:** 6/9/1 ; **Society:** 6/15/0 ; **World:** 6/13/0 ;

Others—Character: 10/12/0 ; **Witness:** 5/13/4 ; S**ocial Justice:** 5/10/5 ; **Stewardship: Time** 6/9/5 ; **Money** 7/10/3 ; **Talents** 5/11/4 ;

Summary: **Part A: Participation in Ministries**—Percentage based on Christians 2008-12 Total: **24**

Ministry Participation: Highest Fellowship 83%; Worship & Bible Study 67%; and Prayer 58%G; similar, little lower than 1st stage;

Service Ministries: 3 in Youth; 1 each in Evangelism & Children; Immigrant Ministries: 1 each in Help settling in and Job referrals, and 2 in Childcare **(9 A count out of 24)**

Ministry Leadership: 3 each in Worship & Bible Study, and 4 in Fellowship **(10 L count out of 24)**

Part B: Living Out Faith—Percentage based on total responses in each category

1) Relationships—Best: Subordinate 80%G 20%P; God 57%G; Spouse 50%G; Friends 43%G; last 3 much lower than 1st stage

Worst: Boss 25%G 17%P; Children 25%G 13%P; both much lower than 1st stage

2) Contexts—Best: Church 59%G; Solitude 53%; both much lower than 1st stage

Worst: Society 29%G; World 32%G; Home & Work 38%G; all much lower than 1st stage, except same as World

3) Other Aspects—Best: Character 45%G; much lower than 1st stage; Money 35%G 15%P & Time 30%G 25%P

Worst: Witness 23%G 18%P; Talents 25%G 21%P; both much lower than 1st stage, except Social Justice 25%G 25%P

Appendix B2: A Comparison of Survey Responses on Spiritual Needs by Years of Conversion

Part A: My Participation in ministries: **Conversion in 2008-12—Total**: **27**

General:	13+6=19 Worship 70%	15+2=17 Prayer 63%	12+6=18 Bible Study 67%	20+2=22 Fellowship 81%
	2+0=2 Foreign Missions 7%	0 Local Evangelism	1+3=4 Youth 15%	5+2=7 Children 26%
Immigrant:	0 Help settling in	0 Job referrals	0 financial aid	3+1=4 Childcare 15%
	1+1=2 Citizenship Class 7%	0+1=1 English tutoring 4%	2 Others:	

Part B: My Faith Journey: Living out my faith in the follow: First No.= **G** Good; Second No.= **F** Fair; Third No.= **P** Poor

Relationships: God: 14/9/2 ; **Spouse:** 11/9/1 ; **Children:** 8/5/1 ; **Friends:** 12/10/1 ; **Boss:** 4/8/2 ; **Subordinates:** 3/5/1 ;

Contexts: Church: 14/10/1 ; **Solitude:** 14/10/1 ; **Home:** 13/12/0 ; **Work:** 8/8/4 ; **Society:** 9/10/12 ; **World:** 6/12/4 ;

Others—Character: 11/8/2 ; **Witness:** 9/10/3 ; **Social Justice:** 6/15/0 ; **Stewardship: Time** 4/16/3 ; **Money** 4/14/5 ; **Talents** 4/15/1 ;

Summary: **Part A: Participation in Ministries**—Percentage based on Christians 2008-11 Total: **27**

Ministry Participation: Fellowship 81%G; Worship 70%G; Bible Study 67%G; Prayer 63%G

Highest on Service Ministries: 2 in Foreign Missions, 4 in Youth, 7 in Children; Highest also in Immigrant Ministries: 4 in Childcare, 2 in Citizenship Class, and 1 in English Tutoring **(20 A count out of 27)**
Highest also on Ministry Leadership: 6 each in Worship & Bible Study, 2 each in Fellowship & Prayer; 3 in Youth, 2 in Children; 1 each in Childcare, Citizenship Class, and English Tutoring **(24 L count out of 27)**

Part B: Living Out Faith—Percentage based on total responses in each category

1) Relationships—Best: Children 57%G, better than 1st & 2nd stages; God 56%G 8%P, worse than 1st stage, consistent with 2nd stage; Spouse & Friends 52%G, worse than 1st stage & 2nd stages.

Worst: Boss 29%G 14%P; worse than 1st stage, but slightly better than 2nd stage; Subordinates 33%G

2) Contexts—Best: Church 56%G, worse than 1st & 2nd stages; Solitude 56%, consistent with previous stages; Home 52%G consistent with 1st stage but better than 2nd stage

Worst: World 24%G 12%P; Work 40%G 18%P, worse than both stages; Society 43%G 10%P, worse than 1st better than 2nd

3) Other Aspects—Best: Character 52%G 10%P & Witness 41%G 14%P; worse than 1st stage, but better than 2nd stage

Worst: Stewardship of Time, Money, & Talent 20%G or less, worse than both; Social Justice 29%G, better than both stages

Appendix B3: A Comparison of Survey Responses on Spiritual Needs by Gender

Male/Female Responses

Objective: to discover the spiritual needs of first-generation Chinese immigrants, so that the Researcher may design seminary courses to train present and future pastors to develop better and more relevant ministries toward spiritual formation in their churches.

Part A: Ministry Responses by Age Group:		**18-34:** 26/28 = **54**	**35-64:** 19/21 = **40**	**65 & over:** 2/4 = **6**	**Total:** 47/53 = **100**	
By Conversion Years:	**No Answer:** 2/4	**2 or less:** 14/7	**2-4:** 12/14	**5-10:** 14/20	**Over 10:** 5/8	**Total: 100**
	No Answer: 2/4	**3 or less:** 18/12	**3-5:** 11/13	**6-10:** 11/16	**Over 10:** 5/8	**Total: 100**
Country of Origin:	**No Answer:** 4/4	**China:** 37/46	**Taiwan:** 4/2	**Other:** 2/1		**Total: 100**

Tabulation of Results: Christians over 10 years 5M/8F are excluded = 42M/45F

Participation in Ministries:	**M / F**	**1st number Attendance + 2nd number Leadership**	
Worship: 25+4=29 / 20+6=26	**Prayer:** 25+3=28 / 21+2=23	**Bible Study:** 20+7=27 / 20+3=23	
Fellowship: 19+4=23 / 28+3=31	**Foreign Missions:** 1+0=1 / 2+0=2	**Local Evangelism:** 1+0=1 / 0	
Youth: 4+1=5 / 1+2=3	**Children:** 0 / 6+4=10	**Childcare:** 0 / 4+1=5	
Settling in: 1+0=1 / 0	**Job Referral:** 1+0=1 / 0	**Citizenship Class:** 1+0=1 / 0+1=1	
English tutoring: 1+0=1 / 1+1=2	**Others:** 1+0=1Gospel Fellowship / 2+0=2 Choir & Food service		

Summary:

1) Country of Origin: 37M out of 47M (79%) and 46F out of 53F (87%) are from China

2) Christians 10 years or younger (percentage based on 42M and 45F): 70%M / 58%F attend Worship (highest combined %); 55%M / 69%F attend Fellowship; 67%M / 51%F attend Prayer; 64%M / 51%F attend Bible Study

3) While about 12-16% more M than F attend Worship, Prayer, and Bible Study, 14% more F than M attend Fellowship

4) Most Christians 10 years or younger, both M and F, participate in ministries for spiritual growth; much less participate in ministries that aim at serving others

5) While 18M out of 19M count involving in leadership are in the public realm (versus 14F out of 23F count) for spiritual growth, e.g. Worship, Prayer, Bible Study, and Fellowship; 9F out of 23F count in leadership are in the private realm (versus 1M out of 19M count) for serving others, e.g. youth, children, childcare, settling in, job referral, citizenship class, and English tutoring.

Appendix B3: A Comparison of Survey Responses on Spiritual Needs by Gender

Male/Female Responses

Part B: Faith Journey M/F=42/45—Age Group: **18-34:** 26/28 = **54** **35-64:** 19/21 = **40** **65 & over:** 2/4 = **6** **Total:** 47/53 = **100**

I have been a Christian: **No Answer:** 2/4 **2 or less:** 14/7 **2-4:** 12/14 **5-10:** 14/20 **Over 10:** 5/8 **Total: 100**
No Answer: 2/4 **3 or less:** 18/12 **3-5:** 11/13 **6-10:** 11/16 **Over 10:** 5/8 **Total: 100**

Motivations to Faith: **Curiosity:** 16/11 **Social/cultural needs:** 10/8 **By Invitation:** 9/13 **Material Needs:** 7/6
Seeking Truth: 25/24 **Spiritual Needs:** 14/20 **Others:** 1 family/1 habit from childhood

Tabulation based on 42M/45F: Christians over 10 years—5M/8F excluded

Living out my faith in relationships M/F:	**G** Good	**F** Fair	**P** Poor
God: 25G 12F 1P / 20G 14F 1P	**Spouse:** 15G 6F 1P / 10G 14F 1P		**Children:** 6G 3F 2P / 7G 11F 1P
Friends: 18G 14F 2P / 16G 18F 0P	**Boss:** 10G 11F 4P / 5G 11F 2P		**Subordinates:** 8G 5F 2P / 6G 2F 1P

Living out my faith in these contexts M/F:	**G** Good	**F** Fair	**P** Poor
Church: 25G 10F 1P / 25G 13F 0P	**Solitude:** 22G 13F 11P / 19G 16F 1P		**Home:** 19G 17F 1P / 14G 20F 0P
Work: 13G 12F 4P / 10G 14F 2P	**Society:** 12G 17F 1P / 14G 19F 1P		**World:** 9G 16F 4P / 9G 22F 2P

Living out my faith in other aspects: M/F:	**G** Good	**F** Fair;	**P** Poor
Character: 23G 12F 1P / 19G 14F 1P	**Witness** 15G 16F 5P / 12G 22F 4P		**Social Justice:** 5G 21F 5P / 11G 21F 2P
Stewardship: **Time:** 5G 21F 6P / 13G 19F 4P	**Money:** 11G 25F 8P / 12G 17F 6P		**Talents:** 13G 27F 2P / 9G 22F 3P

Summary: **1) Best Relationship: God**—M66%G / F57%G; **Subordinate**—M53%G / F67%G; **Spouse**—M68%G / F34%G
Worst: **Boss**—M40%G 16%P / F28%G 11%P; **Children**—M55%G 18%P / F37%G; **Friends**—M53%G / F47%G

2) Best Context: Church—M60%G / F56%G; **Solitude**—M52%G, 26%P / F42%G; **Home**—M51%G / F41%G
Worst: World—M31%G 14P / F27%G 6%P; **Society**—M40%G / F41%G; **Work**—M45%G 14%P / F38%G 8%P

5) Best Others: Character—M64%G / F56%G; **Witness**—M42%G 14%P / F32%G 10%P; **Money**—M26%G 19%P / F34%G 17%P
Worst: Social Justice—M16%G 16%P / F32%G 6%P; **Time**—M16%G 19%P / F36%G 11%P; **Talent**—M31%G 5%P / F26%G 9%P

China Evangelical Seminary North America

Appendix C: Course Description

A Practical Theology of Christian Spiritual Formation

March 12-19, 2018

Adjunct Instructor: Dora Wang, DMin

Richard Osmer, an American practical theologian proposes a 4-task approach to doing practical theology by answering four questions.[1] What is going on (the descriptive-empirical task)? Why is this going on (the interpretive task)? What ought to be going on (the normative task)? How might we respond (the pragmatic task)?

This one-week intensive course *A Practical Theology of Christian Spiritual Formation* follows Osmer's four-task approach to explore the issue of Christian spiritual formation of evangelical Chinese Christians in North America by answering the four questions. First, the descriptive-empirical task of exploring the lived experience of evangelical Chinese Christians in North America, who are mostly first-generation immigrants from China, to understand the issues they are facing, and how their actions and reaction in response to these issues conflict with their Christian faith. Second, the interpretive task of identifying the reasons behind their actions and reactions by looking at how their cultural/historical/religious backgrounds have affected their practice of the Christian faith. Third, the normative task of exploring the biblical perspective that promotes consistency between their faith and practice. Fourth, the pragmatic task of proposing biblically sound spiritual disciplines to help them reflect on their inconsistencies and begin to establish a lifestyle that is consistent with their Christian faith.

This course is a part of the instructor's Ph.D. dissertation research. While not required for any degree program, the course can be taken as a substitute to one of the required courses in the Spiritual Formation curriculum. The class will meet from 12:30 to 5:30 p.m., March 12 to 16, Monday to Friday, to explore the above four tasks (3 units) in a classroom setting at China Evangelical Seminary North America, to be followed by a 4-day 3-night retreat (1 unit) to put the fourth task to practice, from March 16 Friday dinner to March 19 Monday lunch at the Prince of Peace Abbey in San Diego.

At the end of the retreat, students will be asked by the instructor to voluntarily fill out two evaluation forms for the classroom instruction as well as for the retreat respectively, in addition to the standard course evaluation requested by the seminary. While the course is a part of the instructor's research, students who take this course will still need to pay for the regular tuition of a 4-unit course, but without any additional cost for the retreat. Class enrollment will be limited to 10 students, who must register by November 10, 2017. If there is vacancy, those who have taken at least one Spiritual Formation course in the past may register by November 14, 2017 for the 1-unit, four-day three-night retreat at the Prince of Peace Abbey in San Diego.

[1] Richard Robert Osmer, *Practical Theology: An Introduction* (Cambridge: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing, 2008), 4.

A Practical Theology of Christian Spiritual Formation

Adjunct Instructor: Dora Wang, DMin

Appendix D: Classroom Group Sharing/Brainstorming/Discussion Notes

Taken by a Student Volunteer

Please jot down in simple note form without specifying personal names, churches, or organizations

Monday, March 12, 2018:

How many years have you been a Christian, and what are some major factors that have contributed to your conversion to Christianity and to your subsequent spiritual formation?

*

*

*

*

*

*

*

*

*

*

*

A Practical Theology of Christian Spiritual Formation

Adjunct Instructor: Dora Wang, DMin

Appendix D: Classroom Group Sharing/Brainstorming/Discussion Notes

Taken by a Student Volunteer

Please jot down in simple note form without specifying personal names, churches, or organizations

Tuesday, March 13, 2018:

What do you think are other challenges in the lived experience of first generation Chinese immigrants (apart from those discussed in lecture) that have affected their spiritual formation?

*

*

*

*

*

*

*

*

*

*

*

A Practical Theology of Christian Spiritual Formation

Adjunct Instructor: Dora Wang, DMin

Appendix D: Classroom Group Sharing/Brainstorming/Discussion Notes

Taken by a Student Volunteer

Please jot down in simple note form without specifying personal names, churches, or organizations

Wednesday, March 14, 2018:

In your observation and experience, in what ways have your local church heritage and culture been impacted by one or more of the three spiritualities we have discussed in class lecture:

*

*

*

*

*

*

*

*

*

*

*

A Practical Theology of Christian Spiritual Formation

Adjunct Instructor: Dora Wang, DMin

Appendix D: Classroom Group Sharing/Brainstorming/Discussion Notes

Taken by a Student Volunteer

Please jot down in simple note form without specifying personal names, churches, or organizations

Thursday, March 15, 2018:

In what ways the discipleship or spiritual formation concepts discussed in class are challenging, yet helpful to you and your church people?

*

*

*

*

*

*

*

*

*

*

*

A Practical Theology of Christian Spiritual Formation

Adjunct Instructor: Dora Wang, DMin

Appendix D: Classroom Group Sharing/Brainstorming/Discussion Notes

Taken by a Student Volunteer

Please jot down in simple note form without specifying personal names, churches, or organizations

Friday, March 16, 2018:

Identify and explain how certain Ignatian spiritual exercises or methods of prayer might help to fill the some of the gaps in your church's spiritual formation ministries:

*

*

*

*

*

*

*

*

*

*

*

A Practical Theology of Christian Spiritual Formation

Adjunct Instructor: Dora Wang, DMin

Appendix E: Classroom Instruction Evaluation by Student

	Strongly Disagree	Disagree	Agree	Strongly Agree	No Answer
Part One: Lived Experience of Chinese Immigrants in the US					
Content: significant and stimulating	____	____	____	____	____
Research: current, supported, stimulates further research	____	____	____	____	____
Instructor's Interpretation: convincing and insightful	____	____	____	____	____
Relevance: helpful for me and my current/future ministry	____	____	____	____	____
Other Comments: _____					
Part Two: Chinese Christian Leaders' Spirituality and Impact					
Content: significant and stimulating	____	____	____	____	____
Research: current, supported, stimulates further research	____	____	____	____	____
Instructor's Interpretation: convincing and insightful	____	____	____	____	____
Relevance: helpful for me and my current/future ministry	____	____	____	____	____
Other Comments: _____					
Part Three: NT Study on Christian Spiritual Formation					
Content: significant and stimulating	____	____	____	____	____
Research: current, supported, stimulates further research	____	____	____	____	____
Instructor's Interpretation: convincing and insightful	____	____	____	____	____
Relevance: helpful for me and my current/future ministry	____	____	____	____	____
Other Comments: _____					
Part Four: Ignatian Spirituality and Practice					
Content: significant and stimulating	____	____	____	____	____
Research: current, supported, stimulates further research	____	____	____	____	____
Instructor's Interpretation: convincing and insightful	____	____	____	____	____
Relevance: helpful for me and my current/future ministry	____	____	____	____	____
Other Comments: _____					

A Practical Theology of Christian Spiritual Formation

Adjunct Instructor: Dora Wang, DMin

Appendix F: Retreat Evaluation by Student

Retreat Site:	**Strongly Disagree**	**Disagree**	**Agree**	**Strongly Agree**	**No Answer**
Environment: conducive to quiet connection with God	____	____	____	____	____
Meals: healthy and inviting	____	____	____	____	____
Lodging: nice and clean	____	____	____	____	____

Other Comments: _____

Ignatian Spiritual Exercises:

Preparation: I felt God's unconditional love for me	____	____	____	____	____
First Week: I confessed my sins and was set free	____	____	____	____	____
Second Week: I came to know Christ more intimately	____	____	____	____	____
Third Week: I came to feel Christ's passion more deeply	____	____	____	____	____
Fourth Week: I accepted the Risen Lord's invitation	____	____	____	____	____

Other Comments: _____

Ignatian Prayer Practices:

The Lectio Divina: God's word became more personal	____	____	____	____	____
Examen of Consciousness: God's presence became more real	____	____	____	____	____
Examen of Conscience: I became more aware of my sins in thoughts, words, and in actions	____	____	____	____	____

Other Comments: _____

Personal Reflections:

I became more aware of the Holy Spirit's movements	____	____	____	____	____
Journaling helped me to express my true feelings to God	____	____	____	____	____
Discernment helped me to discover my desires, recall and submit to God's leading	____	____	____	____	____

Other Comments: _____

Small Group Sharing:

Atmosphere: conducive to in-depth sharing	____	____	____	____	____
Time: adequate for everyone to share deeply	____	____	____	____	____
Goal: experienced intimacy with God and with each other	____	____	____	____	____

Other Comments: _____

Oct 26, 2017 (1 day ago)

Email correspondence from IRB, Claremont

to me

Dear Dora,

You have fulfilled all requirements and have met all requests for clarification as well as brought by all necessary approvals for your two projects IRB# 2017-1001 and 2017-1001b. You have herewith obtained IRB exemption for both of these projects.

Best,

Roland Faber

Research Project Approval by Chair, IRB, CST

from: **Thomas Phillips** <tphillips@cst.edu>

to: Dora Wang <dora.wang@cst.edu>

cc: Institutional Review Board <irb@cst.edu>

date: Thu, Feb 23, 2017 at 11:25 AM

Bingo!
Congratulations. Because your proposal

- Carries no more than minimal risks;
- Collects no personal information; and
- Falls within academic activities

Your proposal is exempted from full IRB board review.
You can begin your research.
NOTE: If you change your research protocols or need to collect (but not analyze) data for more than 1 year from today, you will need to stop your research and resubmit your IRB proposal. Also, the IRB members have the authority to call for a full IRB review of your proposal at any point —although the likelihood of the IRB doing so is extremely, extremely remote.
Best wishes with your research.
Tp
PS THANKS for being so coachable on this process. Your coachability will serve you well in ministry and in life generally. :)

Thomas E. Phillips, Ph.D., MLS, M.Div.
Professor of Theological Bibliography & New Testament Dean of Library and Information Services
Director of Claremont Press Claremont School of Theology